re-Visions:

Proceedings of the New Zealand Musicological Society and the Musicological Society of Australia Joint Conference hosted by the University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand between 2nd and 4th December 2010.

Edited by Marian Poole
Acknowledgements

This publication is made possible through the assistance of New Zealand Music Industry Centre (NZMiC), in conjunction with the Department of Music, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand

The support of Professor Henry Johnson and Professor John Drummond and the Editorial Committee members Dr Shelley Brunt, Dr Rob Burns, and Dr Dan Bendrups is acknowledged.

Cover photograph: University of Otago Quadrangle

National Library of New Zealand Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Poole, Marian. Editor
Re-Visions: proceedings of the New Zealand Musicological Society and the Musicological Society Australia, University of Otago, Dunedin, 2-4 Dec. 2010
Publisher: New Zealand Music Industry Centre
Music Department, University of Otago, PO Box 56, Dunedin 9054
PDF
Publication Date: 5/2013
# Table of Contents

**Acknowledgements**

**Introduction: Marian Poole, Editor**

## Part 1: Interdependence; Audience, performer and composer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Revisiting musical reception – when an audience is not an audience. Richard Moyle.</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Keys from the past: Unlocking the power of eighteenth-century contrapuntal pedagogies. Jonathan Paget and Stewart Smith.</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The simplification of complex notation presented in aleatoric form, Scott McIntyre.</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Jazz polyrhythms: Unconventional phrase structures. Quentin Angus.</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Collaboration and creative processes in musical composition: Two autoethnographic case studies. Johanna Selleck.</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Nigel Butterley’s String Quartets: The composer’s re-Visions. Peter Watters-Cowan.</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Part 2: Presentation and reception in changing contexts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The musicology of Russian music in the twenty-first century. Gerald Ginther.</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>‘The Greatest Musical Event of its Generation’ or Exotic Diversion? The visit of The Sistine Chapel Choir to Australia in 1922. Ian Burk.</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Re-visioning the impact of missions on music in Papua New Guinea. Kirsty Gillespie.</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Sight or sound: Multiple texts and the interpretation of Nathan Milstein’s <em>Paganiniana</em>. Taliesin Coward, Imogen Coward and Leon Coward.</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Vision and revision: Gui of St Denis and MS Harley 281. Carol Williams.</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Dialogue in the flute works of Jean Françaix (1912-1997). Abby Fraser...</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>The rhetorical virtues of delivery and the performance of Italian recitative. Alan Maddox.</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 14. An extended European tradition: The ideology of Shinichi Suzuki and its reflection in his editorial decisions, with reference to the Australian Suzuki Violin context. Dr Imogen Coward and Dr Ann Coward. ..... 141

Part 3: Kindling and re-Kindling nationalistic sentiments ..... 150

Chapter 16. The band aboard HMAS Sydney. Anthea Skinner. ..... 151
Chapter 17. The notion of home: The Scottish Kennedy family’s concert tours in the late nineteenth century to Australia. Ruth Martin. ..... 161
Chapter 18. John Wilson and Scottish Song. Rosemary Richards. ..... 171
Chapter 19. Overwhelming love: A case study of memory construction through Ogasawara hula activities. Masaya Shishikura. ..... 186

Part 4: Re-visioning cultural identity ..... 196

Chapter 20. Neo-romantics and Jindyworobaks: The representation of Aboriginality in Australian Film Music, 1930 to 1970. Anthony Linden Jones. ..... 197
Chapter 22. Singing in between: Re-visioning intercultural community singing. Julie Rickwood. ..... 218

Part 5: Collaboration ..... 230

Chapter 23. Re-Viewing history through sound – fact or fiction? Helen English. ..... 231
Chapter 24. Spiritual transcendence and the *stile antico* of Antonio Lotti. Anne-Marie Forbes. ..... 238
Chapter 25. Play / Rewind / Watch / Revise: The practices of contemporary Australian and New Zealand film music composers. Natalie Lewandowski. ..... 246
Chapter 27. Family memories: Rebecca West and music. Susan Erickson. ..... 265
Chapter 28. A State of *Bliss*: Peter Carey’s novel as re-visioned through Ray Lawrence’s film and Brett Dean’s opera. Michael Halliwell. ..... 273
Chapter 29. The creation of symbolism and meaning in three symphonies by Anthony Ritchie. Anthony Ritchie. ..... 280
Introduction: Reviewing musics’ social role.

Marian Poole, Editor

This Proceedings is a selection of the papers presented at the Conference “re-Visions” the joint conference of the New Zealand Musicological Society (NZMS) and Musicological Society of Australia (MSA) hosted at University of Otago in December 2010. Presented as chapters, they have all undergone a process of double-blind peer review. These papers variously revisit musicological concepts and wisdoms in ways which reflect and inform the multiculturalism of the early 21st century. The two Musicological Societies of Australia and New Zealand - two countries with akin colonial histories and distinct Indigenous peoples - are perhaps uniquely placed to re-vision Western ways of thinking about music. The Conference and hence the Proceedings extends the current move beyond the music concepts of the long nineteenth century. Music is not heard or understood only as either high or low art but also through an ethnomusicological lens as vital and unique expressions of many varied yet parallel social contexts. Such re-visioning along eclectic lines facilitates mutual understanding and mutually advantageous ways forward for societies which seek cultural enrichment via inclusivity and via the challenge of diversity.

Though they cover a wide range of musicological research, each paper looks for a way in which music accommodates diversity, while preserving traditional practices and recognizing the distinct evolution of any societies’ cultural environment.

Central to re-visioning is the notion of collaboration and the success of such a hierarchical or non-hierarchical environment in composition, performance, presentation and reception of new and old works. Collaboration is central to events staged within Indigenous societies and at the fringes of Western and Indigenous societies. Collaboration is also central to events in which cultural practices are enacted either as the celebration of a pure cultural canon or as the celebration of changes which recognize societies’ fluidity and a cultural continuum.

Collaboration is also central to events which seek to meld diverse cultural medias such as film, theatre, opera and literature. Each element is crafted into something new as part of an interchange between creative artists for a multifaceted cultural society. Re-visioning music’s role and the intrinsic collaboration between performer and artist(s) obliges an investigation of the way in which music acts within a historic continuum to mark the values of the day. This sort of re-visioning understands music as a distinguishing mark of cultural identity and as a way in which those identities adapt to others’ musical visions.
The several parts of the “re-Visions” Proceedings recognize and trace the process of making and hearing and re-making and re-hearing music to highlight its changing significance within its social and cultural environment. They record the way in which music traces changes within cultural identity over time.

The Proceedings takes as its starting point Richard Moyle’s paper “Revisiting musical reception”. Moyle presents the Western musicological dialogue with perhaps its most challenging re-Visioning. He investigates the blurring the lines between performance and ritual. His observations are made in a society removed from Western systems and practices of belief, yet by focusing on a rite of passage common to all mankind, they illuminate music’s social function as pivotal to any society. The participation and mutual cooperation of audience as congregation and performers as celebrants are necessary to the event’s processes. The relationship becomes symbiotic and thus reinforces notions of community and its social context.

In order to remain viable and relevant such etiquette variously absorbs influences emanating from social context. Conversely perhaps, the act of making and of composing music can also act as a catalyst for change. The research presented in “re-Visions” documents the way in which music and music appreciation are contextualized, whether that be through adaptation or being preserved as cultural icons in a museum of works. Neither scenario can exist in a vacuum. Tradition though valuable, is a philosophical notion, a historical ideal and the subject of nostalgia. It is no coincidence perhaps that the current icons of western classical music were produced in a social context undergoing radical change. The re-visioning initiated by the reports of apparently vastly different worlds by such explorers as Captain Cook would impinge on the cultural identities of both worlds. Thus all re-visioning illuminates former and contemporary cultural practices and values. The melding of cultural societies continues. The music public’s familiarity with many contemporary genres such as film and opera, popular, jazz and rock and Indigenous and Western musics includes familiarity with the collaborative performance and audience etiquette pertinent to those events. It also includes the melding of those behaviours.

Moyle’s question provides a fourfold framework of the way in which the other papers in the Proceedings can be seen to contribute to the central theme of re-Visioning. It details a cooperative performance society which enables the composer, writer, artist and audience to receive new ideas; a known genre or music idiom which helps the audience understand a fictional character, or dramatic scenario; music practice of another era or another homeland
or of our own era and homeland is heard and finally it informs us of the importance of maintaining and preserving traditional practices as a sign of cultural identity and heritage. Importantly Moyle also highlights the importance of continued communication between musicology’s many disciples and hence the importance of such inclusive societies as NZMS and MSA, to keep us all from the dangers of conferring in cupboards and talking only to ourselves.

This Proceedings of the Joint Conference of the NZMS and MSA 2010 traces the processes of making a music event by acknowledging in Part 1 the interdependence of audience, performer and composer. Jonathan Paget & Stewart Smith explore the way in which a pedagogically received set of notational symbols facilitated improvisation and highlight the lack of such a device in contemporary Western art music. Scott McIntyre investigates firstly the problems of notating new music which challenges conventional devices. McIntyre discusses the creation of a new notation which can be readily understood without compromising the composer’s or the performer’s integrity while allowing both degrees of expressive flexibility via improvisation. Quentin Angus documents improvisational structures to reveal how jazz is re-visited through performance and the adhoc collaboration of artists working without the direction of a composer. Johanna Selleck re-Visions the collaborative process as a social practice. Here the notion of one inspired creator is replaced with that of the importance of mutual trust and respect between artists and the product of the creative community. Peter Watters-Cowan inspects composer Nigel Butterley’s ongoing interaction with his Quartets and his understanding of their revisions as part of their identity as organic entities. The composer is no longer an inspired genius aloof from the world but a sensitive agent reflecting his social context.

Part 2 of the Proceedings looks at presentation and reception in changing contexts and their implications for the impact of the here-and-now on historic perceptions. Gerald Ginther examines the new musicological approach to Russian music. He reveals how others’ preconceptions of Russia’s political history have coloured the reception and evaluation of its music. Ian Burk examines the changes in cultural attitudes wrought by geographical transportation to highlight the extent to which a colonial European society continues to revere that of its former homeland. What happens when the sanctified music of the non-Indigenous is incorporated into Indigenous secular music making to empower Indigenous political concerns informs Kirsty Gillespie’s paper. Conversely, Taliesin Coward, Imogen Coward and Leon Coward find that maintaining a museum of musical works and thus preserving old
styles in contemporary society informs the observer of former values and compositional priorities and can re-vision a museum of musical works. Carol Williams’ exploration of an ancient manuscript exposes the way in which works have from the earliest times been re- visioned to suit the purposes of a later society. Abby Fraser looks at the Neo-classical revisioning of eighteenth-century dance forms, for example, speak to a twentieth-century audience. Alan Maddox furthers this debate by highlighting problems in establishing what could stand as a true rendition where the original manuscript is sketchy and the work not necessarily originally intended for posterity. Imogen Coward and Ann Coward investigate the ideology of Shinichi Suzuki as reflected in his editorial decisions and in the Australia Suzuki Violin context, which they argue do not sit well with received pedagogical wisdom. Thus the composers’ manuscript maintains of record of the style of a particular era, while its interpretations over time create a history of changing aesthetic values.

Part 3 investigates the way music is heard and the importance the listener places on the effects of music to, for example, raise the spirits by rekindling and thus perpetuating nationalistic allegiances. Anthea Skinner outlines the different acknowledgement and importance given to military bands in wartime and in peacetime. Two papers explore the popularization of a nationalistic voice and its re-kindling and re-visioning of cultural allegiances and nostalgia in colonial Australia. Ruth Martin and Rosemary Richards recount the role of touring music groups and soloists in bridging the gap between hame and home among colonial pioneers. Masaya Shishikura observes a society in decline through emigration working to keep its distinct character and historical cultural allegiances alive through a ceremony of farewell. Those who remain and those who leave receive community’s purposefully constructed identity as real and valuable.

Part 4 looks at the way in which Indigenous music making acts firstly to re-in force or undermine traditional cultural identities and secondly to diffuse cultural barriers by assimilating others’ cultural and aesthetic notions. Anthony Linden Jones looks at the Australian film industry’s post war representation of Aboriginality. In the nationalistic spirit of the time the Australian film industry’s portrayal of Australian Aborigines emulated the American film industry’s portrayal of Indigenous Americans, but also created a forum for increased understanding. Marking the increased understanding of Aboriginal culture Robin Ryan investigates the subtle distinctions in sound produced from different varieties of Eucalyptus leaves. She suggests that the complexity of what otherwise might appear to be the simplest of instruments is comparable to that of a Stradivarius violin. Investigating points of cultural contact between Indigenous and non-Indigenous peoples, Julie Rickwood looks at
some twenty years during which community choirs have evolved by negotiating cross-cultural understanding of aesthetics and representation.

Part 5 explores the way in which the act of collaboration is re-visioned in a non-hierarchical cultural environment and through other media. Helen English examines the way in which the narration of historic events is re-visioned through sound and ways in which that re-visioning can be re-presented. Anne-Marie Forbes explains how aesthetic innovations enhance the otherwise diverse sacred and secular worlds. Natalie Lewandowski looks at the threats to a film composer’s artistic autonomy in the otherwise non-hierarchical artistic community of film-makers. Chris DeGroot illustrates his new scoring techniques for silent cinema in which he re-visions known idioms to variously comment on the context and the plot. Susan Erickson looks at the influence of music on the structure and character development in the autobiographical novels of Rebecca West. Michael Halliwell traces the re-visioning of a novel through film and opera to reveal the way in which opera can be reinvented in the twentieth-first century. The final paper in the Proceedings by Anthony Ritchie recounts how themes from a novel are used to create symbolic imaginative landscapes, in a way which extends the tradition established by Mahler and Shostakovich.

This publication presents a wide variety of different perspectives on musicology. It reveals that musicology’s ambit is enriched by its willingness to be culturally inclusive of other peoples’ ways of thinking and of the challenges and opportunities presented by incorporating other medias. It covers facets of music from its inspiration to its performance, from the social context of its creation to that of its performance; from the composers’ intentions to the way it is received, from the notion of a museum of works to free improvisation, to the relationship between the performers and the audience, and to the blurring of all those points in the perception of a music event as a ritual in which all participants – creators, performers and audience – are contributors. Finally the Proceedings marks the way in which thinking about music invites us to re-vision the social role it plays as reflective and illuminary.
Part 1. Interdependence:

Audience, performer and composer
Chapter 1. Revisiting musical reception – when an audience is not an audience. Richard Moyle.

Generalizations and conclusions about entire Polynesian societies are certainly very useful, but it is sometimes also constructive to break up any holistic idea of a unified culture so we can understand how individual persons group themselves with others on certain occasions, and differentiate themselves from others in different contexts. In this paper, I focus on one society, the Polynesian-speaking atoll of Takū in Papua New Guinea, whose size (c.400 residents) facilitates such a focus. Takū is distinguished among the several Polynesian-speaking islands at Papua New Guinea’s north-easternmost boundary, for several reasons. In the late 19th century, the atoll was inadvertently sold to a Samoan-American entrepreneur who held the local population, then reduced to a mere 13 following an epidemic, in virtual confinement until the late 1920s, when a court case cleared the way for them to buy their island back. For reasons still unclear, Takū was given administrative protection from casual visitors during the period of Australian governance of the then New Guinea (1918-1975), which effectively shielded them from much foreign contact and influence, and permitted traditional forms of social authority to be maintained in large part. And a 1970s community ban on Christian missionaries and churches resulted in Takū being arguably the last remaining Polynesian culture still formally, openly and routinely practising its traditional religion. Before examining two religious rituals in which musical performance is prominent, however, I present an overview of indigenous belief.

Takū identify eight named categories of spirit living on and around the atoll, all of them considered active and most of them believed contactable by humans through invocation, dream and the agency of a spirit medium. Within a religious system distinctly the domain of men, those spirits considered benign – all of which are ancestors – are invoked either by individual men for their personal benefit, or by a patriline elder on behalf of his patriline, or in extreme instances by the ariki ‘paramount chief’ on behalf of the entire community. A few

---

1 As, indeed, I myself have done in Polynesia for Samoa (1988), Tonga (1987) and Takū (2007).
2 My 20 months residence on the small and remote atoll, resulting originally from a community request for an enduring record of their culture, was spread over eight research seasons between 1993 and 2010, and to date has resulted in a bilingual collection of oral tradition (2004), an annotated CD (2005), a music ethnography (2007), and a bilingual dictionary (2012); a volume on ritual and belief is in preparation.
other spirits, all founding ancestors from the mythological era, are considered of uncertain temperament or potentially dangerous, and are warded off by the invocation of sentient ancestors into amulets placed on the body or elsewhere. Takū believe that the human spirit itself is contactable after death as a result of an initiative by either party. On the one hand, at the tukumai grief-ending ritual enacted several months after a local death, family members select and then quiz a medium about conditions in the patriline’s afterworld, but usually with little in the way of unequivocal responses. On the other hand, a dead resident may contact a medium and announce that he/she has created a dance song for introduction to the community following a specially-convened gathering of patriline adults to hear and memorize the newsong at the medium’s sole rendition of it while in trance.³

To contextualize the events examined here, I first provide a brief outline of the social circumstances in which such activities occur. Takū society is founded on five ranked patriline each headed by a male elder. The elders of the two top-ranking patriline additionally have responsibility for aspects of community-wide activities: one, the ariki, is the paramount religious leader, and the other, the pure, exercises authority over “economic or maintenance activities undertaken by the community for the public good”. (Moir 1989, 95)⁴

In accordance with a mythological distribution of authority and resources, the patriline practise a system of inter-related resource-sharing and mutual obligations which combine to sustain, on the one hand, an enduring sense of communitas and, on the other, a demonstrably secure basis for survival in a physical environment particularly vulnerable to natural disasters.⁵

Since buying back their own atoll in the 1930s and resettling on Nukutoa Island, Takū have focused their large-scale rituals on the marae, an unnamed, unbounded clearway between the second and third of the ten rows of thatched houses that constitute the village. This flat, rectangular area, some 15 m by 30 m, becomes sacred space when the ariki, always the first person to arrive, carries his chair there and sits, and it remains sacred until he formally announces “Tuku! ē!” “Desist!” At all other times, the area is indistinguishable from

³ This séance event, called tānakī, ceased in 1962 amid the social turmoil following the unprecedented death off-island of the ariki. More than 20 dance songs brought from the dead before 1962 remain in the active performance repertoire.
⁴ Such a balance between ritual and political power, achieved by dividing the chieftainship roles between two persons – between ‘divine passivity and worldly but effective activity’ (Autio 2010:86) – is reported elsewhere in Polynesia: in Samoa (Shore 1982:241-249) and Hawai’i (Valeri 1982:10-11).
⁵ A case in point is the tidal inundation of part of Nukutoa Island, location of the community, in 2008, dramatically portrayed in the documentary There Once was an Island (On the Level Productions, 2010).
surrounding clear spaces and is available for domestic use. During any performance on the marae, members of the spirit world hear the sound of singing and drumming, and arrive, unseen, to witness the proceedings. Takū make two responses to this believed reality: on behalf of their patrilines, elders and spirit mediums wear amulets as protection against possible malicious attack, and everyone else wears bright coloured shirts and laplaps to appease any and all spirits in attendance so, together, those spirits will continue to exercise their sentient responsibilities of guardianship of the community at large. However, any spirits in the vicinity do not constitute an audience in the sense that the performance is intended for their benefit or, indeed, that are they present or known or welcome; rather, their presence is believed to be incidental, unnecessary and potentially harmful. What, then about Takū’s human audiences?

Within Takū society, and perhaps universally also, there are broadly shared clusters of habits that influence most aspects of individual selves, e.g. shared life experiences, a common language, continuation of domestic activities of older generations, submission to the authority of hereditary leaders, and acceptance of responsibility of care for younger siblings. Individuals use these shared habits as the basis for group formation, because individuals identify with others in such circumstances. Singing and dancing are two of these kinds of group formations. But, still, it appears that the group formation called audience lies somehow outside, prompting the question: are the commonly used labels of performer and audience really applicable here? These are concepts which are often assumed in both musical ethnographies and smaller-focused studies. I examine two kinds of performance event on Takū, with a particular focus on the ‘audiences’. These events relate to rituals forming part of the complex of mortuary practices which, directly or indirectly, impact on the adult community at large.

Case No 1. Singing the llū

When someone dies on the island, the marae ritual arena is immediately deemed to be closed and is opened some days later by a nocturnal performance of llū songs. These songs, whose arrival in the repertoire predates European contact, relate one or more episodes from the mythical past from the perspective of a character in the narrative who is none other than the composer. The narrative content of poetry of a few of these songs is considered as providing the precedent for specific forms of social action, whereas others relate the origin of natural elements, such as the east and west winds. Because the mythical characters are believed to be the putative ancestors of patrilines now constituting the community, the songs are considered the inherited property of those patrilines and are sung only by them (although a few musically
knowledgeable men and women from other patrilines may assist if numbers are small or the particular songs chosen are not well known). In darkness over two or more hours, adults sit in a circle by patriline groups and sing one or more llū from their own patriline repertoire, usually songs relating to a mythological episode – e.g. the death of a man, or woman, or child – that parallels the present circumstances. The proportion of singers to audience is the smallest of the whole communal repertoire – perhaps 100 attending but fewer than 10 singing – with not all patriline members present knowing the songs and all other adults sitting silently. In some rare, extreme instances, only one person may be singing. Llū performance is distinguished structurally in that it is the only occasion which requires communal verbal approval for the singing to proceed from one verse to the next, such is the technical perfection required, in order to avoid supernatural sanctions. Like humans, ancestral spirits have expectations about the need for perfect performances, and are believed to punish with illness or bad luck any faulty performer on the arena. The overall mood is sombre and intense.

Key performance features:

- **the notionally ‘entire’ able-bodied adult community makes up the ‘audience’; their presence en masse attests the shared significance of the event.** In Takū society, there is a direct link between the social significance of an event and the number of adult attendees. (There are no rituals for children nor are children expected or encouraged to show any interest in the affairs of adults.)

- **on one level of understanding, the audience’s shared grief is the initial reason for performance.** On a structuralist level, however, a broader incentive is the need to re-establish and express verbally the ongoing links between what is present, living and human and what is past, dead and spirit.

- **the audience’s acknowledgement of spirits in attendance is the reason behind the desire for performance perfection.** All formal events on the marae assume the presence of spirits having the potential to influence the future course of events on the atoll and the future wellbeing of its individual inhabitants.

- **performing songs from the ancestral era acknowledges both the island’s origin and ongoing dependence on supernatural beneficence.** The act of singing is the link with the mythological past because the sound attracts unseen spirits from that era; their believed presence prompts both placatory and protective mechanisms to ensure ongoing support in time of need.

- **the absence of conversation or other noise during the event, and the nocturnal performance in which singers and audience members cannot even see each other, and**
which also cloaks the entire event, symbolizes the community-wide state of ritual death, a state which can be changed only by a ritual act – singing. General silence and stillness are the normal responses to any confrontation with the artifacts of religious belief and the personnel administering them on behalf of the patriline or community.

- the act of singing about events that the singers did not witness but believe happened to their own spirit ancestors in the distant past – events that parallel the bereavement event which brought the singers together in the first place – helps make the ancient event relevant and brings that past into the present, and in a way that stimulates high emotions which are given expression in the form of weeping. This situation accords with Small’s (1998:96) comment that the inducement of high emotion is not the purpose of a ritual event, but merely the evidence that the ritual is being enacted.

- the poetry of llū songs is not received critically; unfamiliar words and references are believed merely to confirm the antiquity and spirit origin of each composition. The element of mystery which is fundamental to religious belief generally is manifest in the contents of much of llū poetry; indeed, even singers may on occasion say they have no precise understanding of what they are singing. However, cultural belief in the noumenal overshadows linguistic comprehension.

From a functionalist perspective, performance in this particular context concentrates on the conscious creation of continuity through time.

However, what appears to be the passivity of the audience can be misleading, since sound, in context, can be a symptom of high emotion, but then again, silence, in context, may also be a symptom of high emotion. On first glance, the Takū performance is what Torino (2008, 61-65) calls presentational: one group is singing and all others are silent, but this is an illusion on Takū because at least some of those not singing, directly control the flow from one verse to the next by calling out “Āē” as the end of each verse is reached. The non-singers’ verbal approval of each sung verse thus actively incorporates them into the performance proper, so these people do not constitute an audience in the sense of a passive group to and for whom singing is being undertaken. Those of their number qualified to make the call are in reality arbiters, and the rest are non-singing supporters since performance is considered as coming from the community as a whole, and the concept of a separate and passive audience is foreign in this context.

Spirit-given songs themselves are accepted without question, as are their words and references not understood by singers. The supernatural origin lends credibility to the overall product, bolstered perhaps by the knowledge that spirits of the dead are contactable and they
retain the ability to influence the health and wellbeing of the living. These kinds of songs are intended to impress both the living and the dead, not just by their pedigree but via their pedigree to their unchanging and – in local thinking – everlasting source: in other words, their constancy through time.

**Case No 2. Entertaining the Invisible**

After a local death, close relatives enter a period of formal seclusion, spending their daylight hours in a house hastily cleared out, where they remain for around six months. The mourners are socially invisible, with no duties of care for other family members, and no name: individual mourners are referred to indirectly, as, for example, “the mother of X”, “the brother of Y”. They are also physically invisible, spending all day in silent seclusion, slipping back home under cover of darkness but returning to seclusion before morning. Their social and physical invisibility is symptomatic of their further status: they are ritually dead because they are, in a ritual sense, a corporate manifestation of their recently dead relative.

During that six-month period, families related by marriage organize for the mourners an afternoon of singing and dancing called hāunu ‘drinkie’. Because the mourners consist of both men and women, two locations host them; the two village sections, Tāloki and Sialeva, each have adjacent men’s and women’s meeting houses, and the mourners are led there silently and in single file. The musical programme for each hāunu consists of men’s tuki songs composed by members of the mourner’s patriline in honour of past residents’ achievements in pelagic fishing, and include those intended for singing alone and others for dancing. For their part, women usually choose series of sau dance songs. All singing is in unison and all dancing is synchronized, which allows for considerable flexibility in the constitution and numbers of the groups in each house. The two groups proceed independent of each other, with predictable cacophony.

The official mourners remain totally aloof at a hāunu even though the event is staged for their benefit and is intended to delight. During their months of seclusion, mourners are not allowed to talk, or walk about freely, or make eye contact with other residents, or wash or shave or dress in anything but old, dirty clothes. Although ritually dead, it is hoped that they can be temporarily energized during the hāunu organized explicitly for their entertainment. This is Takū’s only performance occasion when one visually identifiable group of people is expected to change their status, from an ostensible audience member to a dancer. Despite being given new laplaps, wearing coloured headbands and having perfume and powder applied to their faces and necks, the mourners sit silent with heads bowed for 30 minutes or more (Photo 1), until the start of a men’s song reflecting their patriline’s or their family’s fishing success, or a
women’s dance song having particular relevance to the female mourners; then a relative shoulder-taps each individually and says “Masike” “Stand up”. Frequent swallows of coconut toddy thoughtfully supplied by the hosts help the transformation to competent, if not fully enthusiastic, participation in the dancing (Photo 2). These same people, however, revert to their inert status between period of dancing and at the end of the event are led silently back to their mourning houses, there to spend the remainder of their months of isolation. The multiple levels of significance of personal identity, status and action are particularly clear.

**Photo 1. Women dance in lines before a group of seated mourners sitting with heads bowed.**

**Photo 2. When mourners are eventually persuaded to stand and dance, general relief and delight are apparent.**
Just as a corpse is dressed in new clothes and painted with turmeric before enshroudment and burial to enhance his/her chances of being welcomed into the afterworld, so too the mourners are given new laplaps and shirts and daubed with talcum powder and perfume for their own brief daytime appearance in the village. Just as Takū are fearful of making eye contact with any apparition they believe may be a spirit, lest they become mesmerized, so too the ritually dead mourners maintain a downcast stance to avoid any accidental eye contact with their hosts. Just as the dead spend much of their time in the afterworld engaged in dancing (and, until the séance was abandoned in 1962, then announced their well-being in songs sent back to the living), so too the hāunu encourages the ritually dead to dance and be happy. And just as the community of spirits in each patriline afterworld welcomes a new arrival with singing and dancing, so too the real-life community (represented by the host patriline) organizes the hāunu and welcomes the mourners.

Key performance features:

- **The mourners make up the audience.** This may be an initial impression based on the mourners’ relative inactivity, but there is an expectation that they will, albeit briefly, become active.

- **Their distressed circumstances are the reason for performance.** Although their physical appearance may well be one of emotional distress, this is an assumed attitude consistent with their status as ritually dead.

- **The choice of songs relates specifically to their patriline identity so as to encourage them, temporarily, back to the world of the living.** But it is not the existence of such songs that is important, but that they are performed on this occasion. The mourners are acting out, in visible form, the belief that the invisible dead hear and are entertained by singing.

- **The choice of their own patriline songs for dancing is based on the euphoria that dancers experience while performing lyrics they identify with.** In life, the act of dancing is one of self-proclamation as a patriline member; in death, as evidenced in explicit song poetry, the social structure is maintained, making it entirely appropriate for the ritually dead to dance.

- **The lyrics themselves are not received critically, since they are already known and established within the community’s active repertoire.** The underlying emphasis is not on a move away from the norm intended to delight and surprise, but a foretaste of a return to the norm intended to reassure and reunite.

- **This ritual affirms egalitarianism in a visible way because it explicitly seeks to temporarily remove the social difference separating mourners from the rest of the community.** This is
the manifestation of a deeper reality, a form of sympathetic magic in which the successful enactment of a ritual process will bring about success when that process is transferred to another environment – in this case, getting the mourners to dance will help ensure the spirit of the dead family member will likewise dance in the afterworld, be happy and thus amenable to any future calls on his/her assistance.

There is also in operation here a process of reciprocal stimulation reminiscent of other findings from Papua New Guinea (e.g. Schieffelin 1977, Feld 1982), in that singing by others moves people to tears, and tears from others move people to singing. This is more than a process – this is a spiraling transformation which after a particularly exuberant period of dancing, is followed immediately by the laughter and wide-eyed shouts of people in near-ecstasy.

At first glance, the performance is presentational, in that not everybody attending is either singing or dancing. Although, in theory, it is possible to have a totally participatory performance, the hāunu exists because of an audience, but uniquely the event is held to be successful only if that audience ceases to exist during the event and everyone present is transformed into a singer or a dancer. Performance is a ritual, and one of ritual’s functions is transformation. (Small 1998. Chapter 2)

Performance in this context concentrates on the conscious creation of change.

In these two case studies, transformed within the context of performance, are the two poles of the continuum of time, which equates to existence – that is, continuity and change. Performance is able to manipulate time along that continuum if, following Christopher Small’s (1998) theory of musicking, we consider performance as a ritual during which real time is somehow suspended. The authenticity of many events in the song lyrics, and the accuracy of their reporting, may never be capable of verification, but, for as long as the events described are believed, or half-believed, or even wished to be true, the ritual retains its power, and the suspension of real time is accepted.

In the two contexts I describe here, which feature locally composed material by both the living and the dead, the notion of an audience is illusory, since all attendees are considered participants. To categorize some as singers, others as dancers and still others are mere attendees does not reflect Takū thinking. All locally-composed songs, whether created by the living or the recent dead or the ancestral dead, are intended for performances which reflect relationships in an idealized world, and in such an idealized world, everyone is a performance participant. Takū have no private songs or solo songs, and there are no private or solo dances. The performing arts constitute a form of corporate social proclamation which is explicitly
inclusive in both the language of the poetry and the participatory expectations of the community itself. For all songs composed by Takū themselves, the people brought together at a performance are expected to be willing and competent participants in the broad sense of the term: they sing or they dance. Part of being a cultural adult is to learn the expressive repertoire of one’s own patriline and to be prepared to join with fellow-patriline members when items from that repertoire are performed. To decline to participate, for reasons of ignorance or incompetence or one’s alternative (i.e. Christian) beliefs is to invite criticism and occasional ridicule. As one man worded it, “Arā tama e hua, arā tama e anu, arā tama vvare e nnoho koi” “Some people sing, others dance, but ignoramuses just attend”. Applied to their own creative outputs, the concept of one or more persons for whom other people sing and dance is thus foreign to Takū thinking.6

Acknowledgements

The initial visit to Takū occurred as a project under the Unesco-funded Territorial Survey of Oceanic Music programme, organized through the Archive of Maori and Pacific Music at the University of Auckland. Subsequent visits were funded by a research grant from the University itself, the Marsden Fund, Television New Zealand’s Tagata Pasifika programme and the University’s Centre for Pacific Studies. To all these agencies I am most grateful.

On Takū, my residence could not have occurred without the approval and practical assistance of the ariki Avo and the Community Council, and it could not have succeeded without the support and patience of the community itself. I also acknowledge the very significant contributions of my two research assistants, Natan Nake and Tekaso Laroteone.

References

6 Takū have a small and constantly changing repertoire of dances and songs of foreign origin. At the annual school concert and also at the rituals ending formal periods of mourning, such items are usually performed. These introduced songs are typically learnt by residents while off-island, and the intention is to entertain through novelty of sound and spectacle; performance is normally not repeated. The division between performers and audience is sharp, and is heightened by rehearsals held in secret. Performances of these foreign origin songs tend to privilege the entertainment function over that of poetic communication applicable to local compositions. Secret preparations and the absence of any spoken explanations intensify the novelty factor, together with unusual costuming, imported instruments and unintelligible lyrics. One general reaction to such artistic novelty is pleasure, sometimes intensified to the level of pure delight as revealed in spontaneous shrieks of laughter. On Takū, these kinds of songs are intended to impress a local audience primarily by their novelty, that is, by their difference. Performance concentrates on the conscious creation of changing surprise in a celebration of anticipated difference.


———, in preparation. *Takū Ritual and Belief*.


Introduction
How did eighteenth-century musicians learn to compose, and how were they able to produce musical works with such comparative ease and fluency? What were the strategies at play that enabled even the most workman-like of composers to produce vast amounts of competent music, and how was it possible for almost any professional keyboard player to improvise a passable fugue? It is only recently that scholars have sought the answers to such questions. Groundbreaking work by Gjerdingen (1988; 2007a), Porter (2000; 2002), Renwick (1995), and others, provides a fascinating glimpse of the working methods of eighteenth-century musicians, and also offers implications for contemporary music theory teaching. Historically, training musicians in the art of composition has been one of theory’s primary goals, and it could be argued that the ability to replicate a musical style is a true litmus test of deep understanding. Theory instruction in Australia, however, often falls short in this regard, confining itself instead to drilling rudiments, basic voice-leading tasks, and superficial analysis such as labeling chords. This paper aims to show how theory teaching can be re-envisioned to include style composition as a pedagogically powerful and rewarding activity. It also highlights the key usefulness of eighteenth-century pedagogies in unlocking windows into the common-practice idiom.

Three aspects of eighteenth-century pedagogy will be highlighted: (1) the significance of learning a vocabulary of musical schemata, (2) the importance of middle-ground scaffolding, and (3) the relationship between improvisation and composition. Point No.1: A central claim of this paper is that learning a vocabulary of musical schemata is a key missing ingredient in learning to compose in historical styles. Schemata are prototype musical clichés that have both a contrapuntal and harmonic component. In a similar way that contemporary Jazz musicians study chord-shell voicings for common progressions, eighteenth-century musicians learnt many schemata, committed them to memory, and used them for improvisation and
composition. Such schemata include cadence formulas, sequence patterns, contrapuntal expansion formulas, subject-answer paradigms, and stretto formulas.\(^1\) Point No. 2: Contemporary theory training too often focuses on either minutiae or macrostructure, neglecting to fill in the middle-ground. Point No.3: Composition and keyboard improvisation were often one and the same in the eighteenth-century (Porter 2000). Ideally, schemata should be learnt at the keyboard, felt under the fingers, and thereafter absorbed internally. Recently, music theory has achieved a new historical consciousness, and publications such as *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory* (Christensen 2002) offer new ways by which to analyze, and create music of the past. One particularly fruitful avenue of enquiry lies in the Italian *partimento* tradition. In *Music in the Galant Style*, Robert Gjerdingen (2007a) clearly explains the workings of the Neapolitan *partimento* tradition and, by extension, we are invited to walk in the footsteps of a typical eighteenth-century composer. Gjerdingen (2007b) relates Charles Burney’s vivid description of the cacophonous din made by a group of young men simultaneously playing on seven or eight harpsichords at one of Naples’ most prestigious eighteenth-century conservatories in 1770. But where Burney only heard “jargon and continued dissonance”, (Burney 1773, 337) Gjerdingen—surely correctly—postulates that real learning was going on, and that the boys were simply “pounding out *partimenti*”. (Gjerdingen 2007b, 188) This phrase—“pounding out *partimenti*”—well describes the manner by which eighteenth century musicians learned the entwined arts of keyboard performance, thoroughbass, counterpoint, free composition and improvisation. Students underwent a rigorous apprenticeship of eight years and daily played from a series of instructional bass lines in which were encoded various musical schemata and clichés. For example, **Figure 1** shows part of a *partimento* bass by Mattei in which a sequence pattern (a variant of the *Romanesca*) is evident.

**Figure 1. A partimento bass by Mattei ca. 1880s, with the right-hand part realized by Gjerdingen, demonstrating an implied Romanesca sequence**

\(^1\) See Gjerdingen (2007) for an overview of some of the most common schemata. See Dodds (2006) and Santa Maria (1565) for instructions on how to improvise fugal stretti.
In completing the solution to this exercise, students would have had to realize the upper parts in a manner similar to that given here, and by so doing would internalize the mechanics of the *Romanesca* pattern.

Some schemata acted as opening gambits, some were used in development sections, some were used in ascending sequences, and some in descending ones. Repetition ensured that these schemata were internalized, and were able to be reproduced either *ex tempore* at the keyboard, or with absolute ease on paper. Typically, these bass lines also had implied counterpoints that had to be taken into account in any realization. Thus, the very material that these students were internalizing was a type of middle-ground scaffolding that could easily be decorated to form, say, an instrumental sonata, or the first movement of a concerted mass or perhaps an operatic aria. Significantly, many fugues were also created in this manner.

**Case Study No 1. Fugue**

Composing a fugue, let alone improvising one, has often been the *ne plus ultra* of the musician’s training. Famously, the Paris conservatoire fostered an enduring tradition of writing fugues—the so-called *fugues d’ecole*, which were so complicated they defied being improvised. The fact that at the same time whole generations of French organists were skilled fugal improvisers points to the existence of a rival system, one that enabled fugue to be worked out and carried in the head. Significantly, the system practised by these French improvisers has its roots in the eighteenth-century *partimento* tradition.

It was to the Italians and Germans of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries that we find fugue being conceptualized as the logical outcome of thoroughbass theory. (Renwick 1995, 2001) In the same way that the Neapolitan *partimento* tradition allowed minuets, sonatas and concertos to be imagined in the head (*alla mente*) and realized at the keyboard, so too were these *partimento* basses used to teach the composition and improvisation of fugue. There is strong evidence that at least some genres of fugue were conceived in this way in both the circles of Bach and Handel. (Gingrass 2008) Indeed, Handel has left us with a graded series of thoroughbass exercises—written for Princess Anne, the eldest daughter of George II (modern edition in Ledbetter 1990). Here, a series of six *partimento* fugues logically follows on from a series of exercises in thoroughbass.

Part of the fourth fugue from the set will serve as an example of the genre (see Figure 2). As can be seen, Handel gives us several clues to its realization: (1) a figured bass; (2) the

---

2 For the classic exposition of the form see Gédalge (1904).
countersubject at bar three; (3) a system whereby clefs are used to indicate the entries of different voices; and (4) pitch indications giving the starting notes of entries. From these slight materials, Handel encodes a complete fugue. Ever the master teacher, through these partimento fugues Handel offers a carefully graded sequence of techniques for the student to practice and to internalize.

Figure 2. Fugue exercise No.4 by Handel, with editorial realization

While space prevents more detailed description, we are able to summarize how Handel’s teaching can inform the budding fuguist, based on practical experience teaching this material to undergraduates at the Western Australian Academy of Performing Arts: (1) sequences are meticulously drilled; not only do students learn how episodes can be created from sequences but they also learn how fugue subjects themselves can be imbedded within sequences; (2) a

3 There are few clues to the realization of partimento fugues (Moelants 2010; Gingras 2008) but what seems to have been prevalent was a certain sparseness of texture and often a somewhat cavalier attitude to assigning subjects and countersubjects to their “correct” position. My realisation (printed in small type) reflects this practice. In b. 6 for example, the alto should correctly carry the countersubject and the soprano should correctly sit above it in free counterpoint. The fact that my realisation maintains a polarity between the countersubject/subject pair in the outermost voices is a particular feature of improvised partimento fugues.
variety of subject/answer paradigms are taught, and the student is instructed in the importance of holding both the subject and the answer in the head at all times; (3) the invertible counterpoint given for some of the double fugues, when internalized, can be used as generators of sequences in new improvised fugues; (4) the student is taught to realize the relationship between the order of voices in a fugal exposition and its effect upon the ensuing counterpoint; (5) through studying Handel’s fugues as a whole, much can be learned about the architectural ground plan of small-scale fugues; and finally (6) those students who take time to work through these fugues at the keyboard actually experience the physical and tactile sensation of counterpoint growing out of harmony.

It is testament to the power of partimento fugue that even the weakest students manage a passable solution. The step from realizing a partimento fugue to improvising, or fluently writing one from scratch, is not as great as it would first appear. Keyboard playing was improvisation; improvisation was composition; and both improvisation and composition were crafts to be learned.

**Case Study No 2. Minuet**

Composing a minuet in a late eighteenth-century style is a useful pedagogical task as it employs a rounded binary form that is essentially a sonata form in miniature. As Riepel states, “a minuet, as far as its working-out is concerned, is nothing other than a concerto, an aria, or a symphony.” (Strunk and Treitler 1998, 750) Minuet composition is adopted as a key-learning tool by multiple modern authors. (see Budday 1983; Gauldin 1988; Eckert 2005; Parker 2006)

Eighteenth-century and early nineteenth-century sources give us many clues as to how to approach composing a minuet. Such information includes (1) the harmonic architecture, (2) periods and phrase structures, and (3) the use of relevant schemata. These contemporaneous sources (such as Riepel 1752; Koch 1782-93; Galeazzi 1791-96; de Momigny 1803-05, 1821; Reicha 1814) are particularly striking in their attention to aspects of middle-ground structure.

The classical minuet had such a normative harmonic structure that numerous late eighteenth-century sources describe methods whereby the uneducated person can compose one by such numerical chance procedures as a dice game.4 I have attempted to summarize the normative structure of a classical minuet in **Figure 3**, which should be taught carefully and systematically. Notable features include the following: (1) the consequent phrase of section A

---

4 See Tatlow 2001; and also Kirnberger 1757; Hoegi 1770; and attributions to Haydn 1793 and Mozart 1793;Tatlow (2001) notes, “At least 20 different methods of composing music by numbers were published between 1757 and 1812.”
modulates to the dominant; (2) the B section commences with a sequence; (3) the reprise is preceded by a retransition, consisting of a dominant pedal and pause; (4) the reprise begins with a “double-return”, the simultaneous return of the original key and thematic material; and (5) the consequent phrase of the reprise must be re-composed so that it stays in the tonic.

**Figure 3. Rounded binary form and nested phrase structures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A section</th>
<th>B section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section</strong></td>
<td>A Progressive Period</td>
<td>Sequence, Digression, or Quasi-dev.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Phrases &amp; Themes</strong></td>
<td>Antecedent (a)</td>
<td>(derived from themes of A section)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consequent (a’ or b)</td>
<td>Antecedent (a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Harmonic Scheme</strong></td>
<td>Tonic</td>
<td>Dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unstable</td>
<td>cad. on chord V, often big V pedal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tonic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A variety of schemata are useful in minuets, including opening gambits, cadential formulas, and sequences. By practicing and memorizing these schemata students are equipped to use them as the basis of elaboration and composition. A large number of schemata is outlined by Gjerdingen (2007), some extracted from eighteenth-century sources, others theorized through empirical observation of the partimento tradition. Many of these are simple opening gambits consisting of contrapuntal expansions of a tonic triad, as illustrated in Figure 4 (overleaf), which classifies them according to the motion of the outer voices.

Riepel (1752) outlines three typical formulas appearing at the opening of the B section of a minuet: the *fonte*, the *monte*, and the *ponte* (Strunk and Treitler 1998, 749-62; Gauldin 1988, 92). Three of Reipel’s examples are replicated in Figure 5. (overleaf: from Gjerdingen 2007, 456, 458, and 461) The *fonte* and *monte* are key sequence prototypes, while the *ponte* is a dominant prolongation intended as an abbreviated retransition. It could be noted that in some
twentieth-century theory texts sequences are either omitted or misunderstood as exclusively melodic phenomenon.\(^5\)

**Figure 4. The contrapuntal uses of chords**

Riepel (1752) outlines three typical formulas appearing at the opening of the B section of a minuet: the *fonte*, the *monte*, and the *ponte* (Strunk and Treitler 1998, 749-62; Gauldin 1988, 92). Three of Reipel’s examples are replicated in **Figure 5**. (Gjerdingen 2007, 456, 458, and 461) The *fonte* and *monte* are key sequence prototypes, while the *ponte* is a dominant prolongation intended as an abbreviated retransition. It could be noted that in some twentieth-century theory texts sequences are either omitted or misunderstood as exclusively melodic phenomenon.\(^6\)

**Figure 5. Three contrapuntal formulas as given by Riepel: fonte, monte, and ponte**

**1) Fonte**

\(^5\) See, for example, Warburton 1959, 56 and 1967, 65. An exceptional text is Tunley (1978), which describes sequences as exclusively harmonic phenomenon.

\(^6\) See, for example, Warburton 1959, 56 and 1967, 65; an exceptional text is Tunley (1978), which describes sequences as exclusively harmonic phenomenon.
However (as shown in Figure 6), a corrective to this is seen in recent US textbooks that trace all sequences to four principal prototypes, which can then be subjected to alteration, mutation, and elaboration. (Aldwell and Schachter 1978; Gauldin 1988; Laitz 2003) Sequences are a perfect illustration of the pedagogical reach of learning schemata. They are one of the golden keys to eighteenth-century style composition and underpin the modulations of every episode in fugues and concertos, not to mention the developments in every classical sonata form, whether symphony or sonata.

**Figure 6. Classifying and labeling sequences**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fonte</td>
<td>Second down</td>
<td>D2 (A4/D5 or D5/A4)</td>
<td>Fonte</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Second up</td>
<td>A2 (A4/D5 or D5/A4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monte</td>
<td>Second up</td>
<td>A2 (D3/A4)</td>
<td>Monte</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Third down</td>
<td>D3 (D4/A2)</td>
<td>Romanesca</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We employ additional teaching strategies in the form of compositional tasks designed to provide helpful middle-ground scaffolding. For instance, a two-voice contrapuntal framework of a model minuet (such as Figure 7 overleaf) can be used as the basis for improvisation and composition, as well as to illustrate the various schemata employed. Similarly, a “ill-in-the-gaps” exercise can be useful in focusing attention on particular structural components, aspects of the structure. For instance, students can be asked to complete a missing *fonte*
sequence based on previously occurring musical material, and/or to recompose the consequent phrase of the reprise (such that it doesn’t modulate).

**Figure 7. A two-voice contrapuntal framework for a minuet**

---

**What Happened to the Partimento Tradition?**

Arguably, the growing complexity of musical composition in the nineteenth century made the pedagogy of schemata increasingly redundant. And by the twentieth century, it is almost forgotten. For instance, there is very little evidence in early twentieth-century English harmony texts that sophisticated knowledge of tonal composition was widely disseminated. Many texts (such as Kitson 1914; Morris 1925; 1946; Andrews 1950; Hollinrake 1954 and Lovelock 1956) give sparse guidelines on compositional tasks; their coverage is largely restricted to rudiments, chord functions, dissonances, and basic chorale harmonization. Modern US texts, by contrast, typically provide more systematic coverage of the musical middle-ground—including phrase structures, sequences, and harmonic architecture. (see, for instance, Piston 1941; Schoenberg 1954; Aldwell and Schachter 1978) Aldwell and Schachter, in particular, demonstrate the influence of Schenkerian thinking (Schenker 1935) in their practice of systematically detailing the contrapuntal functions of chords. Reforming the pedagogy of composition was one of Schenker’s principal goals, although (ironically) the power of his theories in this regard has only recently been rediscovered.7 Several recent texts (such as Gauldin 1988 and Laitz 2003) not only employ Schenkerian concepts, they have also

---

7 Graphing techniques can be used to provide scaffolding at the middleground level, a harmonic framework around which a tonal composition can be constructed.
rediscovered the value of style composition and revitalized the pedagogical value of learning schemata at the keyboard.

**Conclusion**

In conclusion, this paper has described a number of eighteenth-century pedagogies, pointing out the ways that they differ from traditional theory instruction. Three key strategies have been highlighted, extracted from eighteenth-century practice; (1) the use of a repertoire of schemata for memorization; (2) the inclusion of information on middle-ground structure; and (3) the importance of composing at the keyboard. More than passing historical curiosities, we believe that these pedagogical approaches can fruitfully be applied in the classroom. In providing students the “keys” to successful composition in an eighteenth-century style, the relevance of harmony becomes suddenly clear; leading to greater understanding and enjoyment.

**References**


Eckert, Stefan. 2005. ““So, you want to write a Minuet?”: Historical perspectives in teaching theory” in Music Theory Online 11/2 <http://mto.societymusictheory.org/issues/mto.05.11.2/mto.05.11.2.eckert.html>


Hoegi, Pierre. 1770. A tabular system whereby the art of composing minuets is made so easy that any person, without the least knowledge of musick, may compose ten thousand, all different, and in the most pleasing and correct manner. London.
Incorporates compositional training, keyboard harmony, detailed descriptions of middle-ground structure, chromatic harmony, and so on.


———. *The Langloz manuscript: Fugal improvisation through figured bass*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Riepel, J. 1752/54. *Anfangsgründe zur musikalischen Setzkunst, i: De Rhythmopoeia*. Regensburg


Sancta Maria, Thomas de 1565. *Libro llamado el arte de tañer fantasia*. Valladolid.


The 3rd volume in his *Neue musikalische Theorien und Phantasie*, normally translated as *Free Composition*, meaning composing in the common-practice tonal style, not the sixteenth-century style otherwise known as strict counterpoint.


Chapter 3. The simplification of complex notation presented in aleatoric form. Scott McIntyre.

“A trait of Western music has been the pursuit of complexity and the underlying axiom that “given X, assume the possibility of X+1.” (Toop 1993, 43) Many composers have concerned themselves with complex music for as long music has been notated, the act of my own musical composition has been about complexity and solving the problems it can create but is complex music too complicated? Does complex music need to be notated in a complicated fashion? Is complexity a good thing? What do we mean when we say “complex music”? Do we in fact mean “complicated”? The notation of the music is not readily apparent to the listening audience; the perception of complexity is often mistaken for a complicated set of instructions to the performers. As Toop points out audiences do not really use words like complex or complicated to describe what they have heard. Adjectives usually used describe emotional or aesthetic reactions to the music. (Toop 1993, 43) As in my own music, structural complexity becomes important in the pursuit of musical clarity. Juxtaposing seemingly incongruous material into a coherent musical narrative requires a complex skeleton. For me the notating of musical ideas is the basis of compositional problem solving and it requires the successful communication of ideas to the page and ultimately the performer. Composition is about dictating a set of instruction to performer but the clarity of the notation is crucial to successful performance. Why then does much of the music of the twentieth century utilize complicated notation? Further to Toop’s X+1 could be “Given X, consider what not-X might have to offer.” (Toop 1993, 43) Rather than composing complexity for complexity’s sake, this pursuit may be for a richer discourse in musical language.

To come back to the meaning of complexity we often confuse structural complexity with complicated notation. The more traditional approach to music history has been to imply that music started in simple forms and as the centuries progressed it became more complex. No one would question that Beethoven’s *Grosse Fuge* is musically complex but it could not be said that it contains complex notation. Notation itself experienced a radical shift in the twentieth century. The moves towards more complicated sets of musical instructions were needed to convey increasingly complex ideas that couldn’t be conveyed by existing notation.
Ultimately the intention of the score is to guide a performance and sometimes these instructions can become overtly complicated. Also the divergence of composer from performer during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries paved the way to explore composition as a theoretical construct separated from performance concerns. More often or not the performer is expected to solve the problems notation presents. In my own music I used to use very complex notation to attain a complex aural outcome. I have always enjoyed working with complex sonorities and my intentions have often yielded complicated results but I have experienced difficulty many times when it comes to performers and their ability to realize the score.

My orchestral work *Infinity Has No God* 1993 was built on a complex structure and subsequently required a level of complicated notation to realize my ideas. (Figure 1 overleaf) Originally written for a weeklong workshop, the difficulties presented to the orchestral personnel as well as the conductor did not help the rehearsals and the performance. Performers can be hostile when presented with unfamiliar fare. Despite the meticulous attention to detail, the score needed a certain amount of aleatory in order to be realized. Complicated rhythms and synchronization of the orchestra relied on factors of chance, indeterminacy and aleatory. (Toop 1993) The vertical placement of the notes was altered in a way that defied the initial crafting and exactitude of the score.

I have had many conversations with composers on how much of the notated score is actually realized in performance and at what point the percentage of correctly performed notes could alter the piece, rendering it different from the written score. Can the listener also adequately perceive complexity and if not, why is it there? Rust examined how the listener perceived complexity in Witold Lutosławski’s Symphony No.2 (1967) and how the listener has difficulty in counting more than three or four voices in musical texture (Rust 2004, 193) yet the most extreme examples of complex music contain many times that number of voices. Many composers are faced with a choice of addressing the level of complexity in their music, I like complexity but do we compromise and write simpler music to obtain easier performances or is there another way? Does limited-aleatory and the flexibility that it brings to a score, allow the notation to be more “friendly”? Certainly the blurring of rhythmic attacks and the resulting ambiguities from altering the coincidence of musical matter can diminish the intimidating look of a score. I use the word intimidating deliberately because, to a performer who has spent hundreds, if not thousands of hours perfecting their technique, many new music scores can demand a serious amount of time to learn so as not to make
catastrophic mistakes in front of an audience. Performers want to sound good and display their abilities and deservedly so.

Figure 1. McIntyre Infinity Has No God (1993)
My goal is to reduce the level of complexity (or level of complication) in my notation through employing techniques of limited-aleatory, complicated rhythmic sub-divisions are simply not needed when an asynchronios element is introduced to the score. It is in the limited–aleatoric techniques of Witold Lutosławski (1913-1994) that I found models that could successfully communicate complexity within simpler forms of musical notation. The music of Lutosławski sounds rich and complex yet while it utilizes markedly different looking scores, it contains relatively simple rhythmic subdivisions. This approach to notation could work for my own composition. With the use of limited-aleatory I can build up notational complexity but present these ideas with simpler notation. If a certain amount aleatory becomes necessary to solve certain performance outcomes, then using aleatory as a notational device can secure the performance outcomes I desire.

Charles Ives, largely due to his financially independent circumstances, was able to experiment and evolve notation in a way very few before him had done. His Symphony No.4 contains so much information and rhythmic complexity that the performer would need to “fake it” in much of the minutiae. Performers, let alone conductors are not human metronomes and at some point aleatoric decisions are needed. Works like these often rely on catching up or resetting delays at rehearsal figures or fermatas in order to represent his desire for a form of aleatory.

Lutosławski used ad libitum sections in his compositions; the conductor would give a downbeat for these sections and, depending on the instructions in the score, wait for the players to “run through” their parts unsynchronized or trigger another ad libitum section. (Lutosławski 1967, ii) These sections often relied on these catch up devices to ensure the music flowed seamlessly.

The very concept of collective ad libitum can be considered a reaction of composer-performer to the often absurd demands which some composers have made of performers in the last few years…I understand music not only as a series of sound phenomena but also as an activity which is carried out by a group of human beings. (Klein 1995, 102)

We could imply Lutosławski sought to respect the performers’ contribution in the collaborative process. After all music in its composition and performance is a collaborative art form. Complex notation can often be an excuse for works not to be performed and often the notation can be unnecessarily complicated. The composer Brian Ferneyhough developed a musical language deliberately designed to be hyper-complex, to over burden the performer
through exact detailing of the physical and artistic possibilities of the instrument. (Custodis 2011; Griffiths n.d.) An extra level of excitement is added to the score with the performer barely “hanging on” to the notation but the notation challenges the performer to solve the score in an aleatoric context. I merely cite Ferneyhough as an example of the extremes to which complexity in notation can achieve. It is not my intention to support an argument for the level of complexity on notation but to merely offer alternatives for my own work, ideas postulated by other composers in solving problems of complexity and performability. The use of aleatory in music is not an exclusively twentieth century concept. Mozart experimented with musical dice games (the word aleator from the Latin, dice player). (Griffiths 2007) The word aleatory also employs chance, unexpected outcomes and randomness. Birdcalls often employed by Gustav Mahler, particularly his Symphony No.3, contained performance instructions to disregard the current tempo. It was in Henry Cowell’s String Quartets that the rhythms Ives tinkered with gained even more complexity. The String Quartet No.1 (1916), Seven Paragraphs (1925) and Quartet Romantic, 1925 contained extreme rhythmic complexity and the use of polytempo or polymeter. Innovative notational devices, including graphic notation, semi-improvised music and the investigation of new structural possibilities, helped push Cowell’s music into more elastic forms. (Nicholls 2007) John Cage studied with Cowell and these ideas made an impression on him. His own work used chance and indeterminacy and continued to explore new ideas within this framework. It was through a chance encounter on the radio in 1960 that Lutosławski was introduced to these ideas. A broadcast of John Cage’s Piano Concerto No.1 presented him with a solution he had been looking for a way to organize his new ideas and Cage’s ideas of chance, to a certain extent, appealed to him.

I am not interested in regarding the chance factor as the leading one to determine the form of a composition, or the element of surprise in regard to the listener. In my composition the composer still remains the leading factor, and the introduction of the chance element in a strictly fixed range is merely a way of proceeding and not an end to itself. (Klein 1995, 98) Lutosławski’s aleatory is a controlled aleatory, pitch, rhythm, structure are all notated, the ambiguity lies in the interpretation. He is very careful to arrange events or aggregates into performance strategies that interact without any chance of structural collapse. Overall two different performances of the same work will only subtly deviate from the
score, the encompassing structure of his work remains intact. There are deliberate devices introduced into the score to stagger and blur the traditional arrangement of a vertically read score. My aleatory counterpoint is a subtle thing…different performances may differ from one another in some particulars…however [it] does not change the very face of [the] music. (Nikolska 1994, 138)

The result allows interactions of the ensemble to create complex composite rhythms without imparting to his scores inordinate difficulty of coordinating complex rhythmic patterns. Many of the rhythms of the individual parts are often quite simple (Klein 1995, 102), groupings of quintuplets are the most complex patterns encountered in his scores. These techniques or timbres have occasionally shelved Lutoslawski into the ‘sound-mass’ category occupied by Penderecki and others interested in clusters or groups or texture but Lutoslawski’s limited-aleatory technique consists of carefully detailed rhythm and pitch procedures rather than graphic representations of timbral effects. In effect not a lot is actually left to chance but without the element of chance his concepts could not be as successful.

If we look at rhythmic patterns that form Lutoslawski’s limited-aleatory techniques then we can see they were utilized to transform very simple rhythmic patterns into more complex outcomes. The following two examples are from his Symphony No.2 (1967).

**Figure 2. Lutoslawski Symphony No.2 (1967)**

At first glance the rhythmic patterns appear quite simple. Despite the groupings and different metronome marking for each player, the pulse in this section is 0.4 seconds for each crotchet.
The use of the arrow on the rehearsal figure is an *ad libitum* section. The preface to most of Lutosławski’s later scores contain these words;

> In the *ad libitum* sections all the rhythmic values are approximate.
> In consequence, the placing of the notes one above the other in the score does not necessarily mean that they are played simultaneously. (Lutosławski 1967)

The effect upon the written score is a subtle allowance by the performer to deviate from the conducted tempo there by creating new interactions of rhythmic complexity. The 31 semi-quaver attacks (marked with the small black triangle below) in this sections still remain 31 but the entry of each semi-quaver shifts to create new occurrences. The triangles (rhythmic attacks) shift subtly shift forming more complex subdivisions than otherwise written.

**Figure 3. Lutoslawski Symphony No.2 (1967)**

This works very well for small punctuated attacks and Lutosławski has been very careful not to fragment the run of semi-quavers through each part with the strategic placement of rests. These techniques are also employed in sections with longer rhythmic sustains and over longer periods. (Figure 4 overleaf) The use of the crotchets and longer rests stretches out the space between the attacks and over a longer duration the entries of instruments become more displaced. At cue 10 the semibreve rest becomes an arbitrary duration and the horns and the harp continue oblivious to each other. *Ad libitum* sections first appeared in *Jeux Venetians* (1960) and while Lutosławski continued to expand and develop his ideas through his middle period (1960-1976) the techniques he developed retained a notational consistency for the rest of his output. In the Second Symphony and the works surrounding it, in the *ad libitum* sections all the rhythmic values are approximate. This Symphony is divided into two parts, Part One consists mostly of small statements in limited instrumental cells building briefly but never drawing on the resources of the full orchestra. The string section is mostly silent in this part only uttering the occasional pizzicato chord. Part Two grows into an *ad libitum* crescendo before leaping into extended conducted passages. This Symphony is typical of this
middle period, usually *ad libitum* and conducted sections are kept separate from the conducted passages.

**Figure 4. Lutosławski Symphony No.2 (1967)**

The twentieth century appeared to be a period where composers sought to shun the use of repeated material in their pursuit of complexity. For Lutosławski the use of the repeat was crucial in sustaining his ideas over a long period of time. Whereas serialism had compressed music into ever shorter attacks and forms (i.e. Webern) Lutosławski’s serialism required a slower moving canvas and repetition provided a solution.

The excerpt (Figure 5 overleaf) from Symphony No.3 demonstrates the use of repetition. The clarinet parts at cue 15 indicate the players are to repeat everything between the repeat bars until indicated to top at the 3/2 bar. The solid line is employed to indicate the desired duration of these repeated sections. The effect is continuous repetitions of the harmony through a blurred, un-synchronized repeat. It became an effective way for Lutosławski to sustain his backdrop of serialism through controlled aleatory.
Another type of repeat was a use of staggered entries or changes. This excerpt from his Livre pour Orchestre (1968) (Figure. 6 overleaf) shows a repeat followed by a wavy line. This device sought to control the level of chaos that could be achieved through the limited-aleatory technique. As before the passages between the repeats are to continue until indicated however this time the wavy line indicates that the section already in progress is to be finished before moving onto the new material (or stopping) regardless of how far through the passage the performer is. The preface in the score reads, “Repeat until the conductor’s downbeat and then play up to the repeat sign. As a result the instruments do not finish their phrases at the same time.” (Lutoslawski, Livre pour Orchestre 1968, preface) Now the score and the aural outcome differ, the blurring of changes and entries creates a new complexity that exists outside of the page. “In the ad libitum sections all the rhythmic values are approximate. In
consequence, the placing of the notes one above the other in the score does not necessarily mean that they are played simultaneously.” (Lutosławski, Livre pour Orchestre 1968, preface)

As Lutosławski reminds us, the conventions of score layout have now been subverted to accommodate his techniques. The results of these techniques (Figure 7 overleaf) show how staggered entries create controlled chaos between the groups of the ensemble. Lutosławski had no interest in improvisational input from the performer so he sought to clearly construct mechanisms that allowed a level of indeterminacy into an otherwise controlled serial structure.

Figure 6. Lutosławski Livre pour Orchestre (1968)
Figure 7. Lutosławski *Livre pour Orchestre* (1968)
The complexity achieved through repetition and non-synchronization, constructed from mathematical aggregates ensured no blank spaces would occur accidentally. As the composer acknowledges, these techniques do not radically alter the score from performance to performance. These are merely subtleties to sustain the harmonic structure with a complexity that does not resort to difficult or unplayable notation.

Lutosławski’s use of limited-aleatory is unique because of its precision and attention to detail. The careful manipulation of ‘accidents’ in the structure demonstrates his deep understanding of complexity and its effect both on the performer and listener. Adaptations of these techniques have helped guide my own composition through the issue of how to present complexity. However these techniques will not work for all types of composition. One of the key structural components of Lutosławski’s music is his harmonic structure. These structures tend to unfold over long periods of time despite containing much movement and aural complexity. Experiments in my own music have allowed me to replace complicated rhythms with limited-aleatory; the result has been a simpler musical language that manages to retain my previous levels of complexity. It is in these types of aleatory that complicated notation and rhythmic subdivisions can make way for simpler rhythms. The indeterminacy of how they coincide gives the same result as music with hyper-complex notation. Notating my own music utilizing a foundation of Lutosławski-like limited-aleatory will allow me to create richer harmonic and rhythmic complexity by relying on chance and the well-placed judgement of experienced musicians.

References


Preface:
Jazz is an intricate language spoken with many different dialects all around the world. Jazz musicians ‘speak’ this language to each other and have conversations over familiar backdrops known as ‘jazz standards’. Usually 12 or 32 bars long, these symmetrical structures serve as vehicles for jazz musicians to explore melodic, harmonic and rhythmic material throughout their improvisations, and since the days of Louis Armstrong, players have sought different techniques in order to create extended improvisations which do not sound predictable or adhere to this static symmetrical structure. (Waters 1996, 19)

In recent years there have been profound developments and players have been exploring new and interesting ways of obscuring this symmetrical structure inherent in jazz standards, and other repertoire. To demonstrate this, the research paper provides original transcription and analysis to reveal various improvisatory processes in this regard, focusing on of two contemporary jazz guitarists, namely, John Abercrombie and Gilad Hekselman.

As previously mentioned, this paper provides a snapshot of a far larger research project and therefore, only topics related to rhythm and polyrhythm will be discussed herein.

Introductory Background to Polyrhythm:
Although there is not an abundance of literature on the subject of rhythm in jazz improvisations (especially in comparison to other topics of jazz improvisation), polyrhythmic vocabulary has become one of the most important aspects of jazz improvisation in recent years.

The second great Miles Davis Quintet (1963-1968) was one of the first groups to really develop an advanced rhythmic ‘vocabulary’ to communicate with each other during performance. (Hoenig, Weidenmueller 2009, 35) Since then, polyrhythmic vocabulary has become more and more advanced, and an essential part of jazz performance. Some examples of this include artists such as Ari Hoenig, Wynton Marsalis (in particular his Standard Time albums), Kenny Werner and Jochen Rueckert.

Providing a detailed background on the particular artists and groups who founded the advanced polyrhythmic vocabulary used today is beyond the scope of this research paper. The following case study will focus specifically on Abercrombie and Hekselman, exploring
their approaches to polyrhythm and the application of various rhythmic devices in their improvisations.

**Case Study of Rhythmic Devices/ Polyrhythm:**

**Syncopation/ Beat Displacement**

The first example (**Figure 1**) is two four bar excerpts of Hekselman playing the melody of a jazz standard. When comparing these two A sections you can clearly see that when it comes to the third repeat of the melody’s A section (after the bridge), Hekselman displaces his phrasing of the melody two beats earlier than expected, so beat 3 becomes the beginning of the phrase.

**Figure 1. Comparing A Sections of The Way You Look Tonight, Phrase Displacement by two beats**

There is no clear line between unconventional phrase structures (a topic not covered in this paper) and polyrhythm, so this particular displacement is being included as a ‘polyrhythmic’ example, because of the way the rhythm section interacts with the displacement, which is explained on the following pages.

He continues this idea over the rest of the form and, as shown in **Figure 2** overleaf; both the bass player and drummer pick up on the two beat displacement and go with it. In bar 72 Hekselman displaces his phrase by two beats (as in the previous example). In bars 73 and 74 (the top of the 3rd A section), the bass player and drummer are still accentuating beat 1.
Hekselman continues this idea, and the bass player stops playing for one and a half bars, while the drummer signals with an obvious downbeat on beat 3, lining up with the resolution of Hekselman’s displaced phrase. By bar 76, the bass player has picked up on the displacement and all players (guitar, bass and drums) continue like this for the remainder of the form (as if beat 3 has become beat one).

**Figure 3. Remainder of the form of The Way You Look Tonight, Guitar, Bass and Drums. bars 77-92**
The remainder of the form is shown in the transcription (Figure 3). It should be noted that all players know exactly where beat one is; they are just interacting with Hekselman’s displacement. This is evident as when it comes to the interlude melody (bar 85, also included at the beginning of the work), all players come out in the exact right place - accentuating once again beat one as the downbeat.

It should be noted that all players know exactly where beat one is; they are just interacting with Hekselman’s displacement. This is evident as when it comes to the interlude melody (bar 85, also included at the beginning of the work), all players come out in the exact right place - accentuating once again beat one as the downbeat.

**Composite Rhythms**

In Figure 4, beginning in bar 54, Hekselman accentuates another beat that goes against the natural strong and weak beats inherent in 4/4 timing, this time, all of the ‘off’ beats. The drummer provides a complimentary polyrhythm superimposed at the same time as Hekselman’s “off” beats. He plays a repeated dotted crotchet hemiola rhythm starting on beat 4 of bar 56 (notated above the stave), giving a very interesting sound when combined with Hekselman’s off beat idea. Cynthia Folio in her article *An Analysis of Polyrhythm in Selected Improvised Jazz Solos* (1995) discusses what she describes as a ‘composite rhythm’, her definition of a composite rhythm being the rhythm that is created by the underlying pulse and the superimposed polyrhythm. (Folio 1995, 106)

**Figure 4. Gilad Hekselman ‘off beats’, Hello Who is it?**
Taking this concept further, rather than comparing either Hekselman or Hoenig’s polyrhythmic figures to the underlying pulse to create a composite rhythm, Hekselman and Hoenig’s rhythms can be combined together to create a composite rhythm of their own, (which is a hemiola with largely off beats, notated in **Figure 5**):

**Figure 5. Composite Rhythm of Guitar (Hekselman) and Drums (Hoenig) bars 56- 59**

Taking the off beat idea in another direction again, Hekselman explores a 5/4 polyrhythm while simultaneously using the off beat displacement device. The example below, taken from the same improvisation, shows the ‘off’ beat idea grouped into distinct groups of 5.

**Figure 6 Hello Who is it? ‘off beats’ grouped in 5**

**Hemiola (3/4 polyrhythm)**

A ‘Hemiola’, for the purpose of my research, is simply a 3/4 polyrhythm (e.g. a repeating 3/4 phrase in 4/4 timing). The hemiola is one of the most common rhythmic devices used in the jazz idiom and has been used extensively in jazz since the days of Louis Armstrong. The Hemiola is still used throughout many jazz improvisations today, and through my research I have compiled a list of some of the hemiola rhythms used by Abercrombie and Hekselman.
Interestingly, in Jerry Bergonzi’s book *Melodic Rhythms* (2006) he includes several examples of hemiola rhythms, and two of them are exactly the same as Hekselman and Abercrombie’s examples, only displaced by an eighth note.

**Figure 8. Comparison to Bergonzi Hemiola Patterns**

I have pointed out that the hemiola rhythm has permeated the improvisations of jazz for many years now, so finding the hemiola in the improvisations of Hekselman and Abercrombie is not a new discovery, however, it has been beneficial to see Hekselman and Abercrombie’s particular approaches to the hemiola rhythm, as each artist seems to deal with the metric superimposition in different ways.

Through my research I have found a very interesting and innovative approach to the hemiola rhythm, found in the playing of Hekselman, again in the form of beat displacement. In the following example, (Figure 9 overleaf), Hekselman plays a hemiola pattern, but, where he starts the hemiola pattern is the interesting part. Rather than beginning the hemiola rhythm at the start of a four bar phrase, on an obvious structural downbeat, or on a strong beat within a
bar, Hekselman begins the hemiola pattern on a weak beat (beat 4 of the bar). This gives an extremely characteristic sound and shows an interesting application of the hemiola rhythm.

**Figure 9. Hello Who is it? Hemiola starting on beat 4**

![Hemiola starting on a weak beat, beat 4.](image)

**Implying other meters (other than the Hemiola)**

Since exploring such polyrhythmic devices as the hemiola, jazz musicians have slowly developed more complex polyrhythmic ideas. One such idea is the superimposition of meters other than 3/4 juxtaposed in 4/4 timing, as is evident in **Figure 10**. In this example we can clearly see that Hekselman is playing an idea based in 5/4 over the 4/4 pulse (the 5/4 bars have been marked with lines in the transcription).

**Figure 10. The Way You Look Tonight, 5/4 polyrhythm**

![The Way You Look Tonight, 5/4 polyrhythm](image)

What is interesting about this particular example, and connects nicely to the next point of discussion, is the fact that not only is Hekselman playing in 5/4, he is also phrasing in 3 bar segments. This is more obvious in the annotated transcription below (**Figure 11**). If you draw your attention to the superimposed harmony, included in brackets above the underlying harmony, you will notice a repeating three bar pattern of F, Eb and Db.
The author has coined this rhythmic device a “hierarchical hemiola”, as there is a polyrhythm at a larger hierarchical structure than the individual beats. In the case of this example, the larger structure is grouped three bar segments.

Note groupings
Perhaps a more sophisticated way of implying polyrhythm is in the shape of the improvised line itself.
This has a lot to do with note groupings and there are many examples that can be found in the playing of Hekselman and Abercrombie, such as 16th notes grouped in 6 from Hekselman’s solo on *New York Angels:*

**Figure 12. New York Angels, 16th notes in groups of 6**

Or Abercrombie grouping 8th notes into groups of 7 and 5 over *Bessie’s Blues:*

**Figure 13. Bessie’s Blues, 8th notes in groups of 7 and 5**

**Augmentation and Diminution**
An excellent example of Augmentation can be found in an improvisation of Hekselman’s over *The Way You Look Tonight.* This example of augmentation is interesting and unique as
it is not an exact rhythmical augmentation of the original phrase. Hekselman has taken each note of the four bar phrase, and augmented it to the duration of a dotted crotchet.

**Figure 14. The Way You Look Tonight, Phrase Augmentation**

Abercrombie on the other hand, tends towards diminution, as shown in **Figure 15** which is an excerpt from his improvisation over the jazz standard *There is no Greater Love*.

**Figure 15. There is no Greater Love, Motif Diminution**

In this example Abercrombie starts a three-note motif in 8th notes and continues the idea for 5 bars before the diminution of the three-note motif into 16th notes. As with the previous example of Hekselman, this is not an exact rhythmical diminution of the original melodic idea, there is still one crotchet duration in between each three-note group. Interestingly, as the crotchet duration is kept with the diminution to 16th notes, this results in a hemiola pattern.

**Figure 16. Resultant Hemiola Pattern from Motif Diminution**
Conclusion
This paper has shown a brief snapshot of a larger research project (PhD, the University of Adelaide), which is being undertaken by the current author. The aim of this paper was to shed light on some of the devices used in contemporary jazz improvisation today, with particular reference to John Abercrombie, Gilad Hekselman and their approaches to polyrhythm. The end product of the research will be several transcriptions to be published (such as the one example included in appendix A), a list of various devices to be used as improvisatory concepts, and also to create a personal approach to this playing style (none of which was covered in this paper).

The author also feels that it is important for the reader to understand that jazz has always been a response to and a reflection of the world around us. Since the evolution of be-bop in the Second World War, it has been a frantic world to mimic artistically. Considering the impact of rapid advances in technology, globalization and multiculturalism, new styles of music and culture are evolving at an astonishing rate.

As jazz continually traverses new sonic and rhythmic ground in response to this ever changing social, political and cultural backdrop, one might ask; what does the complexity of this music say about the demographic it attracts? Although this is a question for another research project, it is an important one to keep in mind while researching such a specific topic.

References
Dahlke, A. 2003. An analysis of Joe Lovano’s tenor saxophone improvisation on
“Misterioso” by Thelonious Monk: An exercise in multidimensional thematicism. DMA, University of North Texas.


Vuust, P. 2000. “Polyrhythm and metre in modern jazz—a study of the Miles Davis’ quintet of the 1930s (Danish).” *Royal Academy of Music, Aarhus, Denmark*.


———. 2006. "It don't mean a thing… Keeping the rhythm during polyrhythmic tension, activates language areas (BA47)." *Neuroimage* 31 (2): 832-841.


**Appendix A: Transcription**

This is one example of the many transcriptions that the current author has completed, the example chosen being *Hello Who Is It*, by Gilad Hekselman.
Hello Who Is It?

Transcribed- Quentin Angus
Gilad Hekselman

Copyright © 2010
Starts playing all off beats-

Drums provide another rhythm (a Hemiola)

(drum fill to change back to 4/4)

Suggesting off beats-----

Group of 5

Group of 5

Johanna Selleck.

Our endlessly repeated and varied self-creating is the precondition for any artifact whatever. Mozart is made possible only by millennia of inventive stamping and barking. (Robin Grove, in McKechnie and Grove 2000, 11)

The striking image of a “millennia of inventive stamping and barking” leading up to the genius of Mozart highlights the notion of creative thought as the outcome of a gradual and shared process of evolution, rather than a moment of divine inspiration on the part of an exceptional individual. In the present day, the romantic myth of the lone genius has given way to ideas about creativity occurring within the context of social groups, and nowhere is this dynamic more beautifully exemplified than in the act of making music. This paper examines notions of collaboration and creativity both in theory (through the work of researchers such as Vera John-Steiner and Shirley McKechnie) and in practice (through my own work as a composer) in an attempt to identify and test models of the creative process, explore the possible scope of their application, and suggest future directions for research.

The Art of Collaboration

Vera John-Steiner’s groundbreaking research into the nature of creativity and collaboration focuses on influential partnerships in science and the arts. Twenty-four cases are examined in her book, Creative Collaborations, including Marie and Pierre Curie, Albert Einstein and Marcel Grossman, Picasso and Braque, and Aaron Copland and Leonard Bernstein. From these case studies, John-Steiner identifies four patterns of reciprocal relationships amongst collaborators, designated as Distributed, Complementarity, Family, and Integrative collaborations. Distributed collaborations are defined as widespread patterns occurring amongst informal groups of collaborators or friends. Complementarity may include contrasting or opposing viewpoints and involves a clear division of labour. Family collaborations are characterized by flexible roles that change over time. Integrative collaborations require long periods of commitment and frequently hinge upon a suspension of difference, often resulting in strong bonding between the partners and radical transformations.
of the field. The dynamics of individual partnerships can move fluidly between these different models and may involve more than one model simultaneously.

Illustrating the way in which these models transcend social domains, John-Steiner argues that the concept of Complimentarity can be applied to any social phenomena which incorporate seemingly contradictory elements. This can be observed in the case of scientists who criticize each other’s work: “[They] are in conflict, but they are also partners, just as opponents in chess or tennis are partners”. (2000, 54) John-Steiner emphasizes the broad social application of such collaborative dynamics and the advantages of these processes whereby partners are forced to challenge their own beliefs and “each partner’s individual capacities are deepened at the same time that participants discover the benefits of reciprocity”. (John-Steiner 2000, 204)

Increasingly, scholars are “rethinking thought” and describing it in terms of “social practice”, according to John-Steiner. (2000, 192) They are part of a movement which challenges the status and glorification of the individual creator and instead uses terms such as group mind, socially shared or distributed cognition, and thought communities. This is illustrated in dance-scholar Shirley McKechnie’s research into choreography (entitled *Unspoken Knowledges*), which led her to describe the dance studio process as “a community of creative minds” where “cooperation and teamwork are essential elements of discovery and innovation”. As part of her research, McKechnie employed a cognitive psychologist to observe the psychological processes associated with creating, performing, and responding to contemporary dance. As a result of this multi-disciplinary approach, McKechnie was able to posit “choreographic cognition” as a new field of study. (McKechnie 2009, 93–95)

The work of John-Steiner and McKechnie provides the critical context, rationale, and inspiration for an autoethnographic exploration of two case studies drawn from my own work as a composer. The first of these case studies involves a collaboration with the American blues harmonica player Corky Siegel, and the second is a work in progress: an opera based on Euripides’s play, *The Children of Herakles*.

**Case Study One: The Siegel–Selleck Project**

Born in Chicago in 1943, Corky Siegel is celebrated as one of the world's great blues harmonica players. Crossing the barriers between blues and classical, he has performed with some of the most respected blues masters as well as internationally renowned symphony orchestras. Corky was the featured soloist on the prize-winning Deutsche Grammophon release of William Russo's *Street Music* with the San Francisco Symphony conducted by Seiji Ozawa.
Corky and I began our collaborative journey in the summer of 2007 while Corky was visiting family in Melbourne. After becoming acquainted with each other’s music, we were sufficiently inspired and trusting in each other to plan the creation of a new work together: a concerto for blues harmonica and chamber orchestra. Whereas Corky’s background is based in the blues, my own training is in classical and avant-garde composition and performance. As artists, we were both concerned that the new work would maintain artistic integrity and not appear as a diluted or contrived response to either classical or blues styles. As a pioneer of the Third Stream genre known as symphonic blues, Corky had considerable insight into how the two styles could interact productively. As the piece progressed it became clear that we had differing perceptions of the sound world we were creating. From my perspective, the piece sounded tonal and bluesy, yet Corky described it as being avant-garde. Providing a connection between the two styles, Corky asked rhetorically, “Where do you go from avant-garde?” and answered “you go to the blues”. (Skype, 30 March 2010)

The creative phase of the project took place over three months from January to March 2010. As each section of the score was completed, I emailed an electronic file to Corky. Using Skype as our main method of communication, we discussed ways in which the harmonica part would work best within the orchestral context that I had created. I provided brief outlines of melodic, harmonic, or rhythmic material, suggestions such “rhythmic stabs” or “answer staccato”, and some extended sections and riffs allowing free improvisation. Other sections of the harmonica part were left blank. Thus, the intention was to allow space for Corky to respond in his own way to the notated orchestral score.

Corky relished moments where he could fall into a natural groove rather than wrestling with my changing harmonies, which often did not map easily over traditional blues progressions, nor sound like them due to the use of extended chords. He sought out the more overtly tonal and rhythmic material that formed clearly identifiable patterns over which he could improvise and made suggestions based on this:

In the first movement … there is a three bar section that for me has a very nice and unique groove and is tonal enough that the mode I naturally play in when I improvise would fit, and I might be able to perform a more interesting, spontaneous, and possibly exciting solo without changing anything else in the piece. (email 1 April 2010)

Consequently, we took the four bar riff and inserted it later in the movement, extending it into a twelve bar progression and allowing space for it to be repeated ad lib.
This interaction with Corky led me into areas of composition that had not previously formed part of my compositional language. Our discussions added immensely to my understanding of the capabilities of the harmonica and its potential use within the setting of a chamber orchestra as well as giving me valuable insight into methods of incorporating improvisation within the parameters of classical form.

The concerto was work shopped and performed by Corky and the Raga Dolls Salon Orchestra at the Victorian College of the Arts in Melbourne on 22nd April 2010. Renowned Australian jazz musician Joe Chindamo on accordion joined the orchestra and was able to elaborate creatively on the written part and engage in some extraordinary improvisatory dialogue with Corky. As such, the final realization of the piece became a group effort, involving Corky, Joe and myself, rather than a predetermined and strictly-notated product of a single composer.

My collaboration with Corky Siegel supports John-Steiner’s findings regarding collaborative partnerships. John-Steiner argues that one of the key ingredients in this type of collaboration is a ‘suspension of difference’ out of which arises the possibility of new knowledge. The potential for transformation in such a collaboration suggests an Integrative model; however, the collaboration may also be seen as fitting the Complementarity model in the manner in which it incorporated contrasting and potentially conflicting elements.

In Creative Collaborations, John-Steiner identifies a number of important characteristics of successful collaborations, all of which became apparent in the Siegel-Selleck collaboration. These include:

- An increased sense of security that encourages risk taking, thereby opening up intellectual and artistic possibilities
- The opportunity to ‘bounce’ ideas off each other, thereby arriving at new solutions
- The need for trust, honesty and patience
- The ability to deal with the dynamics of conflict
- The benefits of criticism and debate
- The ability to compromise
- The importance of mutual support
- A fierce belief in the work of the ‘other’ and a feeling of engagement in each other’s work
- Collaboration as a mirror to the individual, aiding self knowledge
- New personal insights and expanded individual capacities opening up new directions for solo work post-collaboration
This list of characteristics has profound implications because it can be applied beyond the realm of music to a diverse range of human activity. My next case study, The Herakles Project, raises questions about these more far-reaching, socio-cultural implications and how they might be addressed in the context of practice-based research.

**The Herakles Project**

The play, *The Children of Herakles*, is an Athenian tragedy by Euripides, first performed in circa 430 BCE. The plot centres on the plight of Herakles’s children, who have fled persecution and seek refuge at the altar of Zeus in Marathon. Based on this play, the Herakles Project aims to bring together a team of artists in a series of experimental workshops out of which a multimedia opera will be created. The creative process will be observed and documented by a cognitive psychologist.

This project is currently in the development stages. My main collaborator is Sue Tweg, a recently retired Senior Lecturer in English, Drama and Theatre Studies at Monash University in Melbourne. Our relationship as friends and collaborators extends back to 1998 when we worked together on an opera, *The Quickening*, based on a libretto by the Australian playwright, Dymphna Cusack. Of our relationship, Sue writes:

> Jo and I share interests in, and ideas about, making new performance work across different media, combining language structures, music and sound, and visual/spatial forms. We also share thought about social, political and ethical issues that concern us both deeply: indeed, these wider concerns for us, as artists in the world, underpin much of what we talk about and consider as material for possible development. We continue to look for ideas in many places. (Tweg 2010,1)

Our approach to *The Children of Herakles* is strongly influenced by the ethical and humanitarian discourse that lies at the heart of the play, tapping into wider views that shape our daily lives. Our shared interest in these themes creates a bond between Sue and myself as artistic collaborators. This emotional connection, as well as the long-term aspects of our collaboration and friendship, places our work in the category designated as Family by John-Steiner. The question arises here as to how the dominant collaborative model influences the final work of art. Would our multimedia opera have a different outcome if our relationship were modeled more on Integrative rather than Family patterns of collaboration?
A unique aspect of the Herakles Project is the manner in which the creative and collaborative processes under examination mirror the same processes of human interaction that form the subject matter of the play itself. For example, the use of compositional techniques drawing upon Ancient Greek modes in conjunction with contemporary techniques emphasizes the interconnectedness of humanity across time and place; interconnectedness is also a theme of the play. Thus, the creation of the opera becomes a self-reflective process, operating on many different levels, creating layers of meaning, which can be explored both internally (within the play) and externally (as research about the play). Furthermore, it can be argued that the play represents a microcosm of world structure. This creates the potential to extrapolate findings to ever increasing, broader realms i.e. from the play to the opera, to the team of creators of the opera, to the social context in which creators of the opera are working. McKechnie (2009, 93) makes a similar point in relation to dance when she states, “the dance ensemble is a microcosm of world structure, related in important ways to the larger concern of societies and cultures”. Hence, research into these ‘microcosms’ can have important implications for the societies in which they occur and may even be able to offer solutions to social problems through the application of creative thinking techniques discovered in the process of researching the creative act itself, just as McKechnie’s study of dance choreography led to new findings in the sphere of psychology.

By documenting and analyzing the process of creation, the Herakles Project aims to:

- Increase our understanding of the origins and processes of creative thought and techniques of collaboration and conflict resolution
- To test, explore, and add to the newly-emerging body of research on creativity and collaboration, as represented here in the work of Vera John-Steiner and Shirley McKechnie
- To suggest ways of applying this knowledge of creative problem solving and collaborative technique across a broad range socio-cultural contexts

An extensive body of research exists to demonstrate the importance of understanding creativity and collaboration, as is evidenced in Robert Sternberg’s book, *Handbook of Creativity*. Although there appears to be a general acceptance amongst such writers of the importance that creativity plays in every aspect of society, the topic of how creativity operates across social domains is much more contentious. This paper has attempted to address this by suggesting a research context in which knowledge about creativity in the production of a work of art might be applied to broader social contexts. The creation of new
musical work provides a rich and comparatively untapped research environment in which to study the phenomena of creative thought and to test models such as those proposed by John-Steiner.

In an article entitled *Collective Creativity: A Complex Solution for the Complex Problem of the State of our Planet*, the author, Gilla Family, argues that the problems faced by contemporary society are simply too big for a single creative genius to solve. Therefore, we need a collective effort, at the global level, to solve our problems. (Family 2003, 83–90)

The meeting of minds that occurs during this process of “collective effort”, whether in creating a work of art or finding a political solution to an urgent social problem, is a precious and symbolic act and one that touches to the core of our humanity.

**References**


Siegel, Corky and Johanna Selleck. 30 March 2010. Unpublished data (Skype).


Chapter 6. Nigel Butterley’s String Quartets: The composer’s re-Visions. Peter Watters-Cowan.

Introduction

Nigel (Henry) Butterley b.1935 is widely recognized as “one of Australia’s foremost [contemporary] composers” (Mackerras 1996). His earliest compositions date from 1954 and he continues to accept commissions. Butterley is involved in other musical activities including performance and the teaching of composition. Numerous genres are represented in his output including chamber music, opera, and works for solo instruments, radio and symphony. The string quartets, all of which were commissioned, were composed at regular intervals throughout his career and span the years 1965 to 2001. These works are used to exemplify Butterley’s compositional process, providing a consistent genre for examination of his compositional method.

Butterley has evolved distinctive and consistent compositional practices in response to two main requirements which relate firstly to his speed of composition and secondly, to his workload.

In an interview with the current author in September 2007, Butterley commented that he is a relatively slow composer and that throughout his career, various commitments detract from his time and singular-focus for composition. In response to these issues, he makes extensive notes, notational fragments and annotations throughout the course of composition. For

---

1 The quartets are: String Quartet (1965), String Quartet No. II (1974), String Quartet No. 3 (1980), String Quartet No. IV (1995) and Bagatelle for string quartet (2001). The quartets will be identified as using Butterley’s specific titles with the exception of his first quartet, which does not include the numeral “1”. This work will be identified as String Quartet (1965): the date being the year of completion for the work. Therefore the works are cited as String Quartet (1965), String Quartet No. II, String Quartet No. 3, String Quartet No. IV and Bagatelle for string quartet.
2 His opera is Lawrence Hargrave Flying Alone (James McDonald, librettist, 1988) and is about 90 minutes in duration.
3 Some examples of these include: solo piano compositions Arioso (1960), Uttering Joyous Leaves (1981) and Il Gubbo (1987), Forest I (1990) for viola and piano and Forest II (1993) for trumpet and piano.
4 In the Head the Fire (1966) is one of these works and was awarded the Italia Prize.
5 Symphony (1980) is approximately 18 minutes and From Sorrowing Earth (1991) for symphonic orchestra is approximately 23 minutes.
6 String Quartet (1965) was commissioned by the Austral Quartet and String Quartet No. II was commissioned by the Adelaide String Quartet. String Quartet Nos. 3 and IV were commissioned by Musica Viva, as was the Bagatelle for string quartet.
7 Used with permission. Also, in a previous interview Butterley states, “I work pretty slowly”. (Watters-Cowan 1995, 63)

example, there are 27 pages of material for his third quartet as well as a working draft of the work’s second and third movements. (Watters-Cowan 2009) These workings are constantly open to “re-vision” by him. He tends to retain all the materials he creates during the course of composing a work.

The primary sources to be examined in this paper include musical sketches, relevant writings by Butterley including written notes, fragments, numerical tables, draft copies, holograph scores and post-composition comments (generally to performers) for these quartets. For easy identification, I have labelled the works as follows: SQ1:01 signifies the first page of String Quartet No. 1, with r and v indicating recto and verso respectively. Where further letters have been used, these indicate that the sample is a larger page that has been folded to create a number of leaves, for example, SQ1:01a/b/c.

Butterley’s procedural approach to composition can be traced through his sketches. He maintains a comprehensive record of compositional plans. An examination of his preliminary sketches for the genesis of each of the quartets demonstrates similar procedures which subsequently impact on the full spectrum of his compositional process.

I will demonstrate Butterley’s revision process during the several phases of composition. Stage 1 is inspiration, Stage 2 is concerned with structural design, Stage 3 is characterised by decisions relating to the notation and finally, Stage 4 consists of the concerns raised post-completion.

Working and Re-vision of Stage 1: Inspiration

Butterley’s sketches show that he continually revises his plans by accepting or discounting possibilities for these works. For example, in a preliminary sketch for Butterley’s String Quartet No. 3 (SQ3:19), we can see his conceptualisation of initial sounds using words like “lyrical and improvisatory” (Figure 1). He nominates composers and individual works to examine including “Graeme Skinner, Elliott Carter, Circles, the Penderecki Quartet and Le Marteau” as music for inspiration and also a reference book to address the notational issues

---

8 The sketches were first labelled by the current author where a more detailed method of classification is described. The same labels are used in this paper. (Watters-Cowan 2009, 49)

9 Butterley intends to archive his preliminary workings and sketches of most of his compositions with the National Library of Australia, Canberra.

10 It seems that the works to which Butterley refers are: Luciano Berio’s Circles for female voice, harpsichord and 2 percussion (1960) and Pierre Boulez’ Le Marteau sans maître for flute, guitar, vibraphone, xylorimba, percussion and viola (1953–5). It is unknown whether Butterley refers to Krzysztof Penderecki’s String Quartet No. 1 (1960) or String Quartet No 2 (1968). The final work is a text entitled Notation. (Karkoshka 1972) Butterley wrote to me, “I think the ‘notation book’ would have been one around at the time called, I think, ‘Notation,’ by Karkoshka. I would have been looking towards that and those three works for help in seeing how to notate the ideas I had in mind. I knew the...
he perceives. Significantly, Butterley returns to this sketch and rejects some aspects (no) and accepts (ticks) others.

In his first two string quartets Butterley uses prose to provide inspiration and for the organisation and construction of his work. In program notes scribed by the composer for the première performance, Butterley wrote: “The Quartet derives its structure, as well as its whole idea of feeling, from the poem The Revival by Henry Vaughan.” At the conclusion of the score for the second quartet, Butterley has written two lines of prose from Walt Whitman’s One Hour to Madness and Joy.

**Figure 1. One of the earlier sketches for Butterley’s String Quartet No. 3 (SQ3:19). It shows Butterley’s conceptualisation of initial sounds, music for inspiration and a reference book.**

---

**Working and Re-vision of Stage 2: Structural design**

In the subsequent level of planning Butterley creates a complete and coherent plan of the work, (see **Figure 2, SQ3:17r**). Although not the first of these types of plans for this work, this sample is the first to show such detail.

Butterley returns to this sketch on at least four occasions: these re-visions are attested to by different writing mediums. The significance of the re-visions can be gauged by the degree of

---

*Figure 1 reads: 3rd Quartet
Begin with vla solo- elaborated by other Insts (muted). Lyrical. Perhaps proportional Notation’s (each inst has a part and relates to it, some more improvisatory, freer than others). NO Ref Graeme Skinner. Possibly use accel superimposed on rall (ref Elliott Carter). NO Make use of similarity of colour. (tick) More Simple, straightforward work than no.s 1 and 2. (tick) Look at Circles, Penderecki quartet, Le Marteau, notation book etc.*
detail added by the composer. The kind of insertions and the physical size of writing instrument used attest to his return to the material at different times.

**Figure 2. Overall plan of String Quartet No. 3 (SQ3:17r), describing in detail the movements, their constituent sections and the contents.**

Re-visions in this sketch include added details, rejections of some compositional possibilities seen in his crossing out of material and confirmed by his comment “No” (for example, Figure 2, column 1, section C). Butterley scribes question marks to demarcate material with which he has reservations (see Figure 2, column 3, section C). Sometimes he writes self-reminders like “still quite fast” (Figure 2, column 2, section C). It can also be seen in this sketch that Butterley is considering *tempi* markings - both in words and metronome markings as well as exploring the dynamics.

The sketch in **Figure 2** provides an overview of the entire work and the structure upon which the composer writes further detailed plans. It outlines the quartet in three movements with each movement comprising four sections - A, B, C and D. The individual characteristics of these sections is planned within this sketch. Even during the writing process Butterley returns to this preliminary sketch. Significantly, Butterley updates this sketch to keep it aligned with the actual notational process in the writing of the quartet. An example of these additions is seen in his writing the anticipated durations of each movement at the bottom of each column.
Figure 2 also shows that Butterley’s formative stages of this work were ‘word’ (rather than notationally) based. Notated ideas appear to have not been formulated at this point and seem to have been a subsequent addition in his compositional process.

Butterley’s planning style illustrated here is not restricted to this quartet: a similar approach to hierarchical organisation of ideas is demonstrated in Butterley’s sketches of the first string quartet.

Figure 3. (SQ3:15) A plan of the second movement of String Quartet No. 3 showing sections by letters with the corresponding tempi (SQ3:15r). Details are included for the writing of each of the sections in this movement where special planning and consideration is necessary.

This shows Butterley’s planning of the third string quartet in greater detail and this is evidenced in more comprehensive planning and considerations of the global structure of the
work. Again these sketches are hallmarked by Butterley’s re-visions evidenced in the crossing-out of material and self-posed questions with their subsequent resolutions.

By this stage Butterley has scribed his notational material and is working up the draft copy. As he works on the draft, Butterley cites the numbers of the measures he will re-use in later similar passages. Butterley’s reference to specific measure numbers on this sketch provide the evidence for establishing the timeframe of this re-vision as well as underscoring his continued engagement with the draft as the work is being notated.

Butterley’s compositional process is characterised by his composition of music in relatively small sections, possibly because of time constraints, which he is then able to combine, re-order and vary as necessary. Figure 2 above illustrated a plan wherein each movement contained sections A, B, C and D. The more extensive plan of the second movement in Figure 3 above details the ordering of these shorter passages, some with variation - for example A then AX. Butterley writes in detail special features about these passages, how they differ in their re-ocurrence and his means of joining the passages. In the last part of this sketch Butterley describes his proposed variation for a later repetition of the passage AX. As can be seen, for this later statement he decides to alter the passage by omission and addition of measures, change of octaves and arco instead of pizzicato in some of the ‘cello part.

Butterley also anticipates the lengths of these short passages. This is quite a practical sketch as it details for the composer precise occurrences within this movement and how he is to organise his notated material.

Figure 4. Sketch for String Quartet No. 3 (SQ3:15r) showing section lettering, their tempi, re-classification of lettering and their corresponding measures in the score.
Figure 4 is an enlarged extract from this plan (SQ3:15r) showing the differing sections matched (by the current author) with the measures in the finished score. This was to direct the listener (as it was played as an example) to the sectional nature of the music and the variance within the repeated passages. Butterley has re-classified his lettering system for describing passages. A possible reason for this is to help define recognition of passages in conjunction with tempi markings by using both AX and B.

Working and Re-vision of Stage 3: Notation

Figure 5. Sketch for String Quartet (1965), SQ1:01c. (SQ1:01c)

This figure shows Butterley’s notational sketch for his first String Quartet. The type of sketched material as well as the differing writing implements suggest that this sketch was created over a period of time. Here it can be seen that the composer refers to “line three page two” indicating that he re-visited this sketch throughout the writing and that he did in fact add to it during the drafting of the work. The types of notation created include short cells in one

12 The score and recording may be obtained from the Australian Music Centre String Quartet No. 3. CD and cassette, Australian Music Centre, Library numbers CD 51, C 1495 and C 1637.
part - including rhythm, lengthier unfolding cells in four parts - also with rhythm, tone rows and melodic shapes used from the opening.

Butterley often creates motives and cells and, on re-vision, chooses not to use this music. An example of this is in Figure 5: the “important Figure Movt. I and Movt. II” are not used in this quartet. This shows four musical figures. The first is the *Important figure*; next is the *unfolding figure* which is prominent to both movements; underneath there is a note-row and its permutations; lastly, there is a line of music headed *from opening*.

**Figure 6. Sketch for String Quartet No. 3.** This portion of SQ3:13r shows the passage from measure 86 to the conclusion of the first movement.

![Sketch for String Quartet No. 3](image)

This figure shows the concluding passage of the first movement of String Quartet No. 3. Again, Butterely’s hierarchical conception of musical elements is revealed. Characteristically, Butterley has included annotations utilising different writing mediums. In this sketch Butterley refines pitch properties, chords and their density, as well as creating rhythm and adding bar-lines. Concepts of *tempi* and dynamics are also addressed prior to their incorporation in the work. Butterley marks the location of this passage which occurs on page 6 of the draft. Each X indicates the commencement of a new system in the score. Again, he is updating the sketch to keep in tandem with his draft.

As stated earlier - Butterley works in small sections. This sketch is an example of a small passage that is composed, revised and later added into the draft.
Working and Re-vision of Stage 4: Post-completion

The facsimile from performers of String Quartet No. IV shown in Figure 7 (overleaf) is dated 24 February 1995 (a few weeks following the completion of the work). In this, we can see the questions posed by the performers and the composer’s responses.

Figure 7. Facsimile from performers of String Quartet No. IV (SQ4:12) regarding the score with questions for Butterley. His responses are shown as ticks and in darker ink.

Generally the queries relate to notational clarification and performance related aspects of this quartet. The pencil and darker pen annotations would suggest that Butterley re-visited the score at least twice.

Following the “completion” of the score, Butterley has added a “Note for the performers”. This note (Figure 8, SQ4:15, overleaf) demonstrates Butterley’s advice on performance practices and considerations which lay outside the scope of the score and was intended for the performers in the Goldner String Quartet who premiered the work.
Figure 8 SQ4:15. A note to performers after completion of the score that refines performance details for String Quartet No. IV.

The annotations include the direction: “Bars 202-3 muting can be changed to 205-6” and a request that the phrase played by the ‘cello in measures 280-282 be performed on the ‘D’ string. Unfortunately, the composer’s performance alterations and enhancements are not included in the published score despite having a significant impact on timbre and ensemble considerations. In the absence of the primary source, these alternative performance instruction are lost and Butterley’s modifications related to this section are generally unknown even though post-composition notes have a significant impact on the performance of the work.

**Conclusion**

Nigel Butterley’s approach to composition is underpinned by his use of drafts and sketches which are open to constant re-visions throughout the compositional process. Butterley’s re-visions impact on his pre-compositional planning, his compositional stimuli, the intended structures, the interaction of instruments and details within the music. While planning in detail, he re-visits the sketches and elaborates upon them. A selective process is also demonstrated. Such a process enables him to effect adjustment at all stages of the composition.

Butterley’s compositional process evolves relatively slowly.\(^\text{13}\) Therefore, documenting each composition’s progress enables him to pause and re-commence the work as time permits. The sketches of String Quartet (1965) and String Quartet No. 3 are undated, whereas the sketches

\(^{13}\) String Quartet (1965) was composed in six months, String Quartet No. II was composed in eighteen months, String Quartet No. 3 in seven months and String Quartet No. IV in eleven months.
of String Quartet No. IV bear dates. The type of information and methods of planning are similar in String Quartet (1965) and String Quartet No. 3 and again String Quartet No. IV’s sketches contain different types of plans. Butterley had retired from full-time employment by the time of embarking on his String Quartet No. IV. His method of composition has also developed to accommodate time constraints. Progress in writing the work is recorded in the sketches.

Butterley’s sketches permit him to re-visit sections of music of his original design to determine their usefulness in terms of the emerging work. Re-vision also follows the completion of a composition as he refines final aspects of his works.

The study of sketches adds a further dimension not only to our understanding of these string quartets for both study and performance purposes but also to the processes which contributed to these works’ composition.

The sketch material and scores examined in this paper illustrate that Butterley’s compositional process is hallmarked by an interactive relationship with the written material music he is composing. Butterley’s manipulation of his written material enables an organic approach to the development of the work which strengthens and enhances the musical result.

References
Watters-Cowan, Peter. 2009. “Nigel Butterley’s String Quartets: Compositional processes from sketch to score.” PhD Diss., University of New South Wales.
Part 2. Presentation and reception in changing contexts

The importance of Russian and Soviet music to the western concert repertoire of the twenty-first century is unquestionable. This is borne out by two extensive surveys conducted by Belgian musicologist Frans Lemaire and British historian Donald Sassoon. In 2005 Lemaire quoted a survey of 100,000 concerts in Germany from 1993 to 2003 where the twentieth century composers most often played were Shostakovich, Prokofiev and Stravinsky. This was statistical evidence that Russian/Soviet music was established in the central European repertoire. (Lemaire, Frans C. 2005, 10)

Sassoon in The Culture of the Europeans surveying a greater range of countries independently corroborated Lemaire’s survey with Shostakovich, Prokofiev and Stravinsky and added three French composers – Ravel, Debussy and Poulenc, one German – Richard Strauss, and one Hungarian – Bartók. Sassoon did not state his sources but the similarity of results regarding the three Russian composers is revealing. (Sassoon D. 2006, 1120)

In ballet Russia dominated the repertoire. Of the four “all-time great classics” mentioned by Sassoon, three were Russian - the three Tchaikovsky ballets - Swan Lake, Sleeping Beauty, and Nutcracker. Giselle was the non-Russian ballet in the core of the classical repertoire. (Sassoon 2006) Twentieth-century ballet is even more Russian dominated with Stravinsky’s three early ballets – Firebird, Petrushka and Rite of Spring - together with Prokofiev’s Romeo and Juliet leading the way. The Ballet Russe with its marketing and publicity helped to launch Stravinsky’s career in the West and he was not disadvantaged by living in the Soviet Union as Shostakovich was. Ironically Prokofiev initially left the USSR but returned when he did not achieve the success that he expected. The socialist realist works of his late career (Romeo and Juliet, Peter and the Wolf) became more popular than his earlier modernist works. Considering the importance of Russian music to the western repertoire, the literature written about Russian music that is available in English has been limited and it is important to ask why. Historian Rosamund Bartlett commented “it is perhaps surprising how little documented the history of Russian music still is”. (Bartlett R. 2006, 689)
The impenetrable nature of the Russian language (particularly its academic writing) has proven to be a considerable barrier for Anglophone writers to collect enough sources to write with authority on Russian music in English. Although non-Russian speaking writers could access music as a primary source for analysis, they were at a major disadvantage with secondary sources and background material as they were exclusively reliant on the few Russian books which had been translated into English. The general problem is that comparatively few books from other languages are translated into English. Sassoon quoted statistics which showed that only 2.5% of book titles in the UK were translations. This contrasted with France – 17.6% and Germany – 14%. (Sassoon 2006. 1294) These statistics help to explain why the numbers of Russian books on music translated into English were and are comparatively low. (Sassoon 2006. 463)

Russian apologist Vladimir Stasov, Diaghilev and the prose writings of Stravinsky caused further problems in the perception of Russian music. Another writer Leonid Sabaneev, presented his own idiosyncratic opinions in one of the few works in English written about Soviet composers available. (Sabaneev 1927)

Since World War Two English and American writers tended to concentrate on the Mighty Handful, particularly Mussorgsky and later Tchaikovsky (at the expense of other contemporaries particularly Rubinstein and Rimsky-Korsakov. The Belyaev circle of Russian composers which quickly superseded *Kuchka* (Mighty Handful) was barely covered at all in Western literature. Due to the efforts of Diaghilev and the *Ballet Russe*, the talents of Stravinsky and Prokofiev were showcased to a Western audience in Paris. Stravinsky left Russia in 1909 and Prokofiev also spent considerable time in Europe and the USA before returning to the Soviet Union. Shostakovich had always been of interest to Western musicologists since his humiliation at the hands of *Pravda* in 1936 and the controversy of his *Babi Yar* symphony in 1962. Even though biographies on Glinka, Mussorgsky, Tchaikovsky and Stravinsky had been written in English before the 1990s, there had been problems with lack of objectivity and over-simplification. ¹

The problems that faced the reception of Russian music in the West were summed up thus:

> It is a myth of otherness…From without Russian music was (and is) often pre-emptively despised and condescended to, … though

just as often it has been the subject of intense fascination and of occasional cults and crazes. (Taruskin 1997, xiv)

Having spent a year in Brezhnev’s Soviet Union and having completed his PhD on Vladimir Stasov, the propagandist for the so-called Mighty Handful, Richard Taruskin, was well placed to analyze the historiography of Russian music. In 1996 Taruskin’s two-volume epic *Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions* set a new standard for the genre. The book was ostensibly about Stravinsky but the author’s comprehensive knowledge of Russian music history ensured that other Russian composers, particularly his teacher Rimsky-Korsakov, received almost as much coverage as Stravinsky himself. The book therefore was invaluable as a source of information for the *Kuchka* and the Belyaev Circle which formed the background to Stravinsky’s works.

Taruskin did not adopt Stravinsky’s world-view; on the contrary, he tended to be critical of the composer’s prose writings and was aware of the ambiguities which previous biographers had not questioned. Taruskin’s meticulous research proved that Stravinsky’s first balletic success, *Firebird*, owed far more to Rimsky-Korsakov, than was previously thought. (Taruskin 1996, 629) Also revealed was the revelation that the controversial primitivist ballet *Rite of Spring* which caused a riot in Paris in 1913, was based on a Polish-published collection of pagan Lithuanian wedding songs which Stravinsky had procured. As the composer had carefully concealed his sources for the ballet, the Lithuanian links were unknown until Lawrence Morton, a confidante of Stravinsky in California, discovered them. (Taruskin 1996, 883)

Following on from his Stravinsky book Taruskin collected some of his previous articles and lectures on Russian music. *Defining Russia Musically* aimed to dismantle many of the myths that had been created by previous generations of writers on Russian music. He was particularly critical of the ‘radical essentialism’ of English musicologists David Brown and Edward Garden who had been influenced by writers Rosa Newmarch (an acquaintance of Stasov) and Montagu Montagu-Nathan. (Taruskin 1987, xiv)

In *Defining Russia Musically* Taruskin linked Gerald Abraham back to the myths of Stasov and Cui who sought to marginalize Rubinstein and Tchaikovsky in favour of the *Kuchka*. Taruskin believed that the myth lived on through Abraham and his successors. There must have been some ambivalence however as in *On Russian Music*, Taruskin paid tribute to Abraham for actually correcting many of the myths concocted about Russian music:

> When he discovered Russian music at the age of twenty, there was practically no literature in English on the subject and what little
there was, chiefly by Montagu-Nathan and Rosa Newmarch was riddled with errors. (Taruskin 2009, 2)

Assumptions about Russian culture and thinking as different came into play with the writing of English musicologist David Brown. Taruskin defined the problem in ‘P.I. Tchaikovsky and the Ghetto’ where he singled out a passage from Brown’s Tchaikovsky biography as a typical misrepresentation of Tchaikovsky:

His was a Russian mind forced to find its expression through techniques and forms that had been evolved by generations of alien Western creators, and, this being so, it would be unreasonable to expect stylistic consistency or uniform quality. (Taruskin 1997, 50)

Inevitably Taruskin drew criticism from English reviewers who questioned his combative style and defended their colleagues’ books. The younger generation of British academics were able to accept Taruskin’s research with little qualification. David Fanning and Pauline Fairclough are prepared to cast a critical gaze on their predecessors. Not so Michael Russ who opined:

Taruskin's views on the social responsibilities of the humanities scholar lead him to write with a rare passion. In this volume he continues his sustained attack against British musicology which he regards as guilty of racial prejudice and colonialism. Edward Garden and David Brown are accused of continuing Victorian 'radical essentialism' in which Tchaikovsky's style was 'innate, biologically determined and there was simply nothing the poor man could do about it' (pp. 50-51). Brown's views of Glinka are described as 'admiration laced with condescension'. Taruskin has made his point before, and there seems little to be gained by continuing the attack; he has engendered a dramatic revision, but there is much of value in the British volumes, much that is not 'myth', and we should not burn them just yet. (Russ 1999, 307)

Russ was accusing Taruskin in football parlance of 'playing the man not the ball’ but there were issues to be addressed in Brown’s writing which could be edited in future. Taruskin was persuasive in his questioning of Brown’s assumptions however:
from the very beginning the focus is less on the music than the man that made it, toward whom a typical attitude of condescension is adopted. (Taruskin 2009, 50)

It was not only Taruskin who was critical of Brown’s writing. In 1848 Mikhail Glinka composed an orchestral piece *Kamarinskaya* which used two Russian folk tunes in variation form. It became a very significant work for Balakirev and Tchaikovsky but Brown exaggerated its influence: “In this slight orchestral piece lay the origins of the entire Russian symphonic school”. (Brown 1978, 267) Brown maintained that Russian composers were not able to master sonata form and used variation technique derived from folksong instead adding: “To think in terms of variation is one of the most deeply rooted instincts of Russian musical creativity”. (Brown 1978, 189)

Marina Frolova-Walker retorted:

As for David Brown’s suggestion that there is something essentially Russian about changing-background variations, he seems to ignore certain awkward facts … the defining characteristics of Glinka’s changing-background variations were re-harmonization and re-orchestration, and these have no counterpart in Russian folk music. (Frolova-Walker 2007, 114)

Cambridge-based Frolova-Walker, who studied at the Moscow Conservatoire, is an example of a Russian academic who was determined to correct Western myths about Russian music:

Russian classical music is now a ubiquitous presence in the world’s concert halls, and with increasing frequency in the opera houses. The mystique of the music’s “Russianness” is a powerful selling point, now as much as ever. For more than ten years, as a Russian in the West, I have attempted to speak and write about Russian music without taking advantage of this mystique; indeed, on the contrary, I have frequently discussed the process of mystification in the open, in order to undermine its hold on the musical public, and even on surprisingly many musicologists. This book is a summation of these efforts. (Frolova-Walker 2007, vii)

Frolova-Walker has been able to strike the balance between Soviet-style hagiographies on the one hand against predominantly modernist-influenced Western perspectives on the other hand.

In a parallel to Taruskin’s thorough research on Russian music, German musicologist Dorothea Redepenning’s encyclopaedic *Geschichte der russischen und der sowjetischen*
Musik (1994) [History of Russian and Soviet Music] covered up to the end of the nineteenth century. Geschichte der russischen und der sowjetischen Musik Band 2 das 20. Jahrhundert, the sequel (in two volumes) which covered the twentieth century, appeared in 2008. Alas Redepenning’s thorough and incisive work on Russian and Soviet music is not likely to be translated into English.

A new generation of academics first in the US and later in the UK, have been inspired by the work of Chicago-based Sheila Fitzpatrick in the 1970s who was critical of the limitations of conventional Sovietology and recommended a change from the traditional totalitarian top-down approach followed by conservative historians such as Robert Conquest and Richard Pipes. This was difficult to achieve without access to archived materials but since the glasnost era in the late 1980s these materials have become increasingly available. In 2006 Kiril Tomoff put forward some revelatory material, particularly about the 1948 Zhdanov affair, in a book about the Soviet Composers’ Association. Having had access to official Soviet archives, Tomoff’s research has been thorough and informative. He analyzed articles in Sovetskaia muzyka using quantitative and qualitative methods producing a new interpretation of the events of 1948. According to Tomoff, the affair was an outcome between a struggle between populist and highbrow factions in the Composers’ Union. (Tomoff 2006,122) The populists led by Dunaevsky resented the resources paid to the top tier of composers including Shostakovich and Prokofiev and engineered the crisis to curtail this.

In Russia Leonid Maximenkov had employed archives to produce important work about Shostakovich and his first major clash with authority in Sumbur vmeesto muzyki [Muddle without Music] (1996) but the book has remained untranslated into English. The Lady Macbeth of Mtsensk affair was reinterpreted as a struggle between competing bureaucracies and theatres. The anti-Shostakovich articles “Muddle not Music” and “Ballet Falsehood” printed in Pravda, were not initiated by Stalin but by skilled apparatchiks such as Platon Kerzhentsev who managed to manipulate Stalin into implementing his agenda. Contact between the leadership and artists was minimal – the bureaucrats were the intermediaries. An article documenting the number of times that Stalin and Shostakovich met revealed that a total of two contacts were made. ‘Stalin and Shostakovich: “Letters to a Friend”’ appeared in Shostakovich and his World in 2004. (Maximenkov L “Letters to a Friend” in Shostakovich and his World ed. by Laurel Fay 2004, Princeton University Press).

In 2006 Russian/Israeli scholar Maria Ritzarev published a book on Russian music in the eighteenth century. This was the first of its type in English. Ritzarev placed her subject in full historical context. She included a full description how the polonaise became a favourite of
Russian royalty during the era of Catherine the Great. This extended to political manipulation in the twentieth-century Soviet Union when Stalin used the Polish versus Russian elements in Glinka’s *Ivan Susanin* to support the invasion of Poland in 1938. (Ritzarev 2006) Other books that have appeared recently from American authors are Amy Nelson’s *Music for the Revolution* (2004) and a valuable study of the Russian Music Society by Lynn Sargeant entitled *Harmony and Discord* (2011).

The future of Russian musicology in English has greatly improved since the advent of Taruskin and the newer generation of scholars: David Fanning, Pauline Fairclough, Marina Frolova-Walker and Marina Ritzarev. Gone are the stereotypes of older scholarship – such attitudes are now immediately challenged. The irony is that such re-visioning has largely not taken place in Russia itself yet.

References


The visit of the Sistine Chapel Choir to Australia in 1922 was eagerly anticipated, its scheduled departure from Naples on 5 March having been reported in February that year. (Argus 15 February 1922, 12; Sydney Morning Herald 15 February 1922, 13) Organized by the impresario Thomas Quinlan in association with the theatrical entrepreneurs Edward and Daniel Carroll, the tour was to last almost three months. Visits by international concert artists to Australia were certainly not uncommon at the time and, judging from newspaper reports and reviews, their concerts were generally well attended. The visit of the Sistine Choir however captured the imagination of the Australian public, King Edward VII having already described the choir as “the glory of Italy and the envy of the world”.1

At a time when a certain aura, created by distance, surrounded the Pope, who remained in the Vatican, the visit of the choir with its close connections to the papacy and to the Sistine Chapel no doubt excited many Australians, especially Catholics. Not only might they have expected an exemplary sacred music repertoire approved by the Vatican but also performances which met the highest international standards. Newspaper reports suggest that the choir and its conductor were held in awe. The progress of the choir and the occasional personal drama connected with it was reported at every opportunity. The theft of some medals belonging to the conductor was one example. (Argus 26 April 1922, 10)2

The arrival of the 65-voice choir in Fremantle in Western Australia on 2 April was reported in the Melbourne, Sydney and Brisbane press. (Argus 4 April 1922, 6; Sydney Morning Herald 4 April 1922, 10) The Melbourne Argus hailed the visit as “The greatest musical

---

1 This quotation appeared on the front page of the printed programs.
2 ‘Medals and Papers Returned’. When Monsignor Rella, conductor of the Sistine Choir, found on Saturday that his room at the Victoria Coffee Palace, Collins Street, had been broken into and most of his property stolen, he made it known that his numerous medals of honour and his papers were to him the most treasured portion of the booty obtained by the thief, and that he was less concerned about the loss of his money, although, he had been robbed of 6,000 Italian lire and £85 in English notes. Sentiment and perhaps respect for religious tokens must have moved the perpetrator of the robbery to respond to Monsignor Rella’s appeal. Yesterday a message was received by telephone at Raheen, the residence of Archbishop Mannix, Studley Park Road, Kew, that somebody had been seen throwing parcels over the fence. An inspection of the grounds was made, and 12 parcels in brown paper were found. These contained the medals, papers, and other articles stolen from Monsignor Rella’s room. No money was returned, but practically all the other articles were accounted for. Archbishop Mannix immediately communicated with the owner of the property and with the police.
event of its generation”, *(Argus 15 April 1922, 20)* while the *Sydney Morning Herald* was more restrained, describing it as “one of the great events of the musical year”. *(Sydney Morning Herald 29 April 1922, 14)*

Performing before packed houses (“Sistine choir”, *Sydney Morning Herald* 13 June 1922, 10), the choir gave seasons in Melbourne and Sydney, returning to Melbourne for another season by public demand. It then travelled to Brisbane for a short season, including a visit to Toowoomba, followed by a five-concert season in Adelaide, and a final concert in Perth, before returning to Italy. On the way from Melbourne to Sydney the choir performed in the provincial towns of Albury, Wagga, and Goulburn. According to one report, many hundreds of people were turned away from each concert in Melbourne. (“Sistine choir”, *Sydney Morning Herald* 6 May 1922, 14) The following table shows the progress of the choir.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dates</th>
<th>Place</th>
<th>Number of Concerts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15-29 April</td>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-27 May</td>
<td>Sydney</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-17 June</td>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-24 June</td>
<td>Brisbane</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 June–1 July</td>
<td>Adelaide</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 July</td>
<td>Perth</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Under the direction of Monsignor Antonio Rella, the choir presented two seasons of concerts in Melbourne, the first for a period of two weeks beginning on 15 April and the second for two weeks beginning on 3 June. The second season was extended from one to two weeks due to public demand. The first season consisted of fourteen concerts and took place in the Melbourne Town Hall. The second season was presented in the Princess Theatre, where the choir “occupied the stage which was set as a chapel”. (“The Sistine Chapel at the Princess Theatre”, *Table Talk* 8 June 1922, 37) This may well have been in response to earlier comment that the Town Hall was not the ideal surrounding for sacred music. (“Sistine Choir”, *Age* 17 April 1922, 9) No doubt the “pseudo-Gothic scenery” which included “a window with very remarkable tracery” at the Princess Theatre lent a certain authenticity to the music and to the choir itself. (“Sistine Choir”, *Argus* 5 June 1922, 8) As one critic observed in a review of the very first concert at the Town Hall, the fact that the choir wore vestments - purple [maroon] cassocks and white surplices - added to “the religious mood”. (“The Sistine Choir”, *Age* 17 April 1922, 9) In fact, the same critic seemed uncertain whether
the performances were concerts or religious observances, commenting that “such music should of course be heard in its true surroundings, that is, a church, to be fully understood” adding later that “the religious mood was at times marred by applause”. (“The Sistine Choir”, Age 17 April 1922, 9)

The choir also performed to a packed congregation at Vespers in St Patrick’s Cathedral on Sunday, 11 June, but the fact that the concerts took place in the neutrality of the secular venues probably meant that they attracted a wider audience than they would have done had they taken place in a church. At the time Protestants were loath to, or even nervous about entering Catholic churches. By the same token the Catholic Church positively discouraged, if not forbade, its own adherents from entering Protestant churches. There was no public broadcasting at this time, so any promulgation of music was largely by means of live concerts. In Sydney the choir performed at the Town Hall and at the Hippodrome, in Adelaide at the Exhibition Hall and in Brisbane at the Exhibition Building Concert Hall. (Pixley 1976, 19-20)

Controversy arose immediately upon the choir’s arrival when it was announced by the promoter that the choir would present first and foremost compositions from the ecclesiastical repertoire but might also include operatic and lighter forms of music in the second half of each program. (Argus 4 April 1922, 6) This had been foreshadowed in a press article on 24 February where it was stated that the “programmes will be of an attractive variety, including joyous madrigals and merry national airs, up to the impressive Te Deums and beatitudes of which Palestrina composed such brilliant examples”. (Argus 24 February 1922, 4) In fact the Advocate, the Catholic weekly newspaper in Melbourne announced that the choir and soloists would perform solos, duets, and choruses from operas by Wagner, Puccini, Bizet, Gounod, Lalo, Verdi, Massenet, and Ponchielli. (Advocate 30 March 1922, 5)³ Due to public outcry or pressure from Catholic circles, the printed programs reveal that the programs consisted entirely of sacred music, with the exception of a curious work by the Italian composer and priest, Licinio Refice (1883–1954) entitled Greetings to the Australian People, specially composed for the tour and sung at the beginning of every concert.⁴ The reviewer of the opening concert in the Australasian commented that even though the opening program was

³ It should be pointed out that of the men of the choir, all of whom were professional singers, several had had operatic training. A group of nine, known as the Sistine choir soloists, made an extended tour of Australasia singing such repertoire three years later in 1925. A group of ten had already returned to Australia to give concerts in 1923.

⁴ A selection of printed programs from the Melbourne and Sydney seasons are contained in the National Library of Australia, Canberra.
less varied than advance notices had led the public to expect, the large audience which had assembled to greet the choir was not a whit perturbed. ("Sistine Choir", *Australasian* 22 April 1922, 727)

In the press article of 4 April heralding the arrival of the choir in Fremantle, it was revealed that, of the Australian public which had put forward requests for inclusion in the program, 40 per cent had suggested Palestrina’s *Missa Papae Marcelli*. ("Sistine Choir", *Australasian* 22 April 1922, 727) It is not clear how or by whom this information was solicited. It is interesting to speculate on why it was such a popular choice and how the work was familiar to Australians. No record of earlier performances of this work in Australia has come to light. In the event, the printed programs reveal that the work was performed in its entirety in the Fifth Program on 20 April in Melbourne. Kyrie and Credo from the Mass were subsequently performed during the second Melbourne Season on 9 June. There was a change of program each time the choir performed. This may well have encouraged people to attend more than one performance. Apart from works by Palestrina, Vittoria, and occasionally Viadana, Anerio and Marenzio, works of Lorenzo Perosi, a composer of note and an authority on Church Music at the time dominated the programs. In addition he held the post of Perpetual Director of the Sistine Choir from 1898 until his death in 1956. Due to indisposition, Perosi’s assistant, Monsignor Antonio Rella, conducted the choir on the Australian tour. The concerts given in Sydney, Brisbane, Adelaide and Perth drew on the same repertoire that was presented at the Melbourne concerts.

The concerts in Melbourne possibly gave many their first opportunity of hearing early polyphonic music from the Latin repertoire. English music of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries and a few works from the Latin repertoire adapted to English words had been staple fare at St Paul’s Anglican Cathedral in Melbourne since it opened in 1891. It was promoted to a wider audience by the organist A. E. Floyd in 1917 when he began a series of public concerts featuring this music which continued up until the mid 1930s. In spite of occasional protestation in the press and other public forums, the *motu proprio*, issued by Pope Pius X in 1903 was largely ignored in Melbourne and Sydney. This decree advocated the use of Gregorian Chant and music in the style of Palestrina as being the most appropriate type of

---

music to be performed in church services. In Melbourne there was generally a dearth of choirs, especially of those capable of performing polyphony. Despite many salutary efforts, there appears to have been a lack of willingness to perform this type of music on the part of choirs that had the adequate resources, such as those at St Patrick’s Cathedral and St Francis’s Church, and on the part of their conductors. Judging from the repertories of these two choirs, and that of Mary’s Cathedral, Sydney, for that matter, they appear to have preferred the more immediate musical gratification or emotional response provided by the Victorian Romantic composers and the Classical composers, with which they were familiar, rather than the more austere and unfamiliar style of Renaissance composers. (Bryne 1995, 99-101; O’Farrell 1971, 171)

Visits by international concert artists to Australia were common and subjected to lively and sometimes severe criticism. Take the contralto Marguerite D’Alvarez for instance, better known as Madame D’Alvarez, who was famous in Europe and America. She undertook a tour of Australia and New Zealand in 1922, the same year as the Sistine Choir. Her great reputation having preceded her, Australians flocked to her concerts. It was reported in the press that people were queuing before daylight at the Melbourne Town Hall waiting for her concert that afternoon. In spite of her fame, she received the following review of one of her concerts in Melbourne.

People who are inclined to be bigoted about such things as beauty of tone, accuracy of intonation (otherwise known as singing in tune), intelligent phrasing (otherwise known as taking a breath in the right place), and so on, know by this time that Madame D’Alvarez sometimes (though not by any means always) takes very liberal views thereupon. (Argus 25 September 1922)

This is hardly a good review. It would appear that on this occasion, her personality and not necessarily her musicality was what enthralled or captivated her audiences.

The stage presence of the Sistine Choir seemed to produce a similar response from audiences. However, actual criticism of the choir and the performances was to a certain extent somewhat muted and in some cases excused. No one, it seems, wanted to upset the illustrious visitors!

In Sydney, the opening concert on 6 May was accorded an extensive report in the Sydney Morning Herald two days later. (“Sistine Choir: Choral Enchantment”, Sydney Morning Herald 8 May 1992, 7) It consisted mainly of a description of the mood and content of the concert, theatrical and musical. It also commented on the choir’s and the conductor’s attire, drawing attention to the white lace-edged surplices of the choir and to the exquisite Venetian
point lace of the surplice worn by the conductor. On the musical side, the reviewer stated that although the music was all unaccompanied, interest was sustained by “the sweetness, power, and certainty with which they take up the contrapuntal passages, and unite in a quite unrivalled harmony of ensemble”. By contrast, the observation was also made that “occasionally the tone of the male voices was momentarily harsh, due to forcing the tone in order to obtain a maximum resonance”. The reviewer concluded that “this seems to be the Italian vocal style, whether on the stage or in the church”. The Brisbane season opened on 20 June. The following day the *Brisbane Courier* reported that the Sistine Chapel Choir opened its season with “great éclat” before an immense audience at the Exhibition Concert Hall. (“Sistine Choir Concert”, *Brisbane Courier* 21 June 1922, 15) Having summarily dismissed the choir and its performance with this accolade, the remainder of the report consisted of an extremely long list of presumably very important people who attended the concert. So much for music criticism in the *Brisbane Courier* at the time! In fact, this very newspaper was more interested in the choir’s reaction to the kind of food it was given to eat during its stay in Toowoomba than in what and how it sang there. (“Choir’s Meal Complaint”, *Brisbane Courier* 22 June 1922, 4) *The Queenslander* however gave a long and detailed account of the concert. (“The Sistine Choir”, *Queenslander* 1 July 1922, 18-19) The reviewer noted that the singing, remarkable as it was, proved to be flawless, neither from the point of view of good tone and that of intonation. In fortissimo passages there was a tendency on the part of the tenors to dominate the situation to the consequential detriment of blend, tone, and balance. The reviewer then went on to intimate that these were insignificant criticisms in the context of the overall effect and the overwhelming positive reaction of the audience. In Melbourne, both seasons were widely reported and extensively reviewed in the press, including the three major daily newspapers and two weekly journals. The performances were enthusiastically received. The reviewers praised the expressiveness and the rhythmic and vocal vitality of the choir, at the same time revealing that the interpretations were somewhat Romantic in style. However, the choir’s intonation was criticized by three of the reviewers; one held that it was “not their strong point” (“The Sistine Choir”, *Age* 17 April 1922, 9) and another that it “was sometimes far from true”. (“Sistine Choir’s Harmony Again Heard”, *Herald* (evening ed.) 5 June 1922, 16) The *Tribune*, a journal of Catholic information and literature, perhaps not surprisingly, commented that “the work of this choir cannot be judged
by any standard set hitherto in Melbourne”. ("The Sistine Choir”, *Tribune* 20 April 1922, 5) This was potentially an explosive comment, given that by this time the choir at St Paul’s Cathedral enjoyed an international reputation for excellence. If A.E. Floyd who was in charge of the music at St Paul’s and concurrently the music critic of the *Argus* took exception to this, he got his own back when he reviewed the first concert of the second season.

The points wherein this choir might by some be thought to compare unfavourably with a typical English cathedral choir, such as that of the Roman Catholic Cathedral at Westminster, would be the intonation and the tone quality. However, he concluded with a show of charity, perhaps tinged with a characteristic drop of acid, adding, “but into that question would enter of necessity the consideration of differing national ideals and predispositions”. ("Sistine Choir”, *Argus* 5 June 1922, 8) 6

This was not the first time a comparison had been made with an English cathedral choir. The reviewer of the very first concert of the tour in the *Age* observed that “those who looked for beauty of tone were probably disappointed”, pointing out that the choir did not produce the “soft fluty tone so much favoured in English cathedrals”. (*Age* 17 April 1922. 9) The critic of the *Australasian* also pointed out that one should not expect the “same qualities as one finds in the choirs of the English Church among these singers”, but gave no reason for the statement. ("Sistine Choir”, *Australasian* 22 April 1922, 727) The Sydney Morning Herald critic noted that “every school has its faults, that of our English cathedrals sometimes erring on the side of over-reserve”. However, the reviewer in Melbourne’s *Table Talk* maintained that although it was not the kind of singing to which the audience was accustomed, it had a great “soul-stirring quality”. (”The Sistine Choir”, *Table Talk* 20 April 1922, 14) In spite of any shortcomings, the choir’s performances captured the imagination of the critics and the audiences and served to further promote the appreciation of sixteenth-century music. The critic of the *Australasian* even ventured to hope that the choir’s visit might help raise the standard of choral singing in the choirs of the Roman Catholic Church. (”Sistine Choir”, *Australasian* 22 April 1922, 727) In the review of the opening concert in the *Australasian* the writer commented:

Presumably there were in the audience many singers of the music of the Roman Catholic Church with ears to hear and intelligence to

---

6 According to the scrapbook containing the newspaper cuttings of Floyd’s reviews, Floyd began as music critic for the *Argus* on 4 May 1922, so presumably he wrote the review. See ‘An Organist’s Life’, and scrapbook containing Floyd’s *Argus* reviews for 1922. Floyd: GM.
take to heart the lessons of the choir’s singing, so that it is not too much to hope that the choir’s visit may help to raise the standard of choral singing in the choirs of that great denomination.

During the visit, Antonio Rella went to hear the choir of St Paul’s Cathedral under Floyd. Unlike many of his fellow believers in Australia, Rella appeared to have had no fear of the temporal or eternal consequences of entering a Protestant cathedral. In an article published in the *Australian Musical News* Rella is reported to have spoken of the boys’ singing there in a most laudatory fashion: ‘Those boys are trained on the right lines; their singing is sweet and pure, and Dr Floyd knows his job” (Young, July 1922, 515-519) was his summing up. The consequences of his comments as a result of this visit were two-fold. They further enhanced Floyd’s success at St Paul’s in recovering and promoting the early music heritage of the Anglican tradition and at the same time indirectly highlighted a deficiency in the Catholic Church, which had not been successful in promoting theirs. Also, after the Australian visit, in an article in the *Tribune*, reprinted in the Melbourne *Advocate*, Rella deplored the state of Catholic church music in Melbourne, particularly attacking the use of women singers in choirs. (*Advocate* 6 July 1922, 3)

The point was not lost on those in the Catholic Church who were agitating for something similar at St Patrick’s Cathedral to what obtained at St Paul’s Cathedral. However, it was not until the 1930s that concrete efforts were made to raise the profile of music, in particular music of the polyphonic school, in the Catholic Church in Melbourne.

In conclusion, judging from the serious and informed reviews of the concerts, what the performances by the choir lacked in finesse, beauty of tone, and true intonation, they made up for in emotional fervour bordering on the operatic. Given this, a musical spectacle it may have been, but not necessarily “the greatest musical event of its generation”. (*Argus* 15 April 1922, 20)

The visit of the choir was however a cultural success, providing Australia with a musical diversion. The choir’s performances brought an Italian flavour to a repertoire, albeit an ecclesiastical one, both of which were generally foreign to a largely Anglo-Irish population.

---

7 The event took place on Friday 16 June 1922 and was reported in the evening edition of the *Herald* on that day in an article entitled “Boy Choristers Impress”.

8 As previously mentioned, the *motu proprio*, instruction on the content and performance of sacred music issued by Pope Pius X in 1903 was largely ignored in Melbourne. This document had been prepared with considerable input from Perosi, the chief conductor of the Sistine Choir, and his deputy Rella. It is therefore not surprising that Rella spoke his mind on the matter of Catholic sacred music in Melbourne, albeit after he had left Australian soil.
Coupled with this, and perhaps the most significant benefit of the visit was that it provided impetus for musical reform within the Catholic Church, particularly in Melbourne.

References


Newspapers:

Advocate (Melbourne)

Age (Melbourne)

Argus (Melbourne)

Australian Musical News

Australasian

Brisbane Courier

Herald (Melbourne)

Queenslander

Sydney Morning Herald

Introduction

It is commonly perceived by onlookers that the introduction of Christianity into the lives of indigenous peoples in Papua New Guinea and the wider Pacific has had a negative impact on indigenous culture and music-making. While it is widely true that many missions were active in dissuading the performance of some ancestral musical styles, the encounter between missionaries and indigenous peoples is far more complex than a simple one-sided takeover. Indigenous peoples in Papua New Guinea have themselves acted as agents in adopting and reshaping the new musical forms that were used to convey Christian teachings. This paper considers the transmission of one Christian song form from the coast to the Highlands of Papua New Guinea in the 1970s, and which now forms the basis of many songs composed in vernacular languages, both within the church and outside of it.

Taking the music of the Duna people of the Southern Highlands Province as a case study, this paper looks in particular at Duna women’s use of this song form as a vehicle for the expression of their personal and community concerns. Women’s compositional creativity within the musical framework of this song form both represents a new mode of expression, and one that is contiguous with ancestral musical life. The paper reflects on the possibility that this new musical voice may contribute to a more empowered position for Duna women today, and in doing so radically re-visions the outsider’s perception of the Christian musical experience in Papua New Guinea.

The Duna and Christianity

The Duna people, a language and ethnic group of approximately 25,000 people, (Haley 2002,11) are based in north-west corner of the Southern Highlands Province of PNG. Lake Kopiago is a key hub for the area, and is located at the very end of the infamous Hailans Haiwe (though by the time the road reaches Kopiago it is a mere dirt track, and vehicles are very rarely seen). Duna people are primarily subsistence farmers, and until the 1960s lived without regular contact with foreigners. It was not until the late 1950s that the Australian Administration set up a station at Lake Kopiago, and the area remained classified as restricted (that is, only to be accessed by Administration personnel) until 1964, when missions flooded

¹ Some of the material presented in this paper was first published in Gillespie 2010a, which is held under copyright by Equinox Publishing.
into the area in what has been described as “a gold rush for souls”. (David Hook, personal communication, 22 November 2007)

The first missions to arrive were the Lutheran Church, and the Christian Missions in Many Lands (CMML), but by 1967 there were at least six different denominations in the Kopiago area. (Stürzenhofecker 1998, 21) During 2004-2007, the years when fieldwork for this paper was undertaken, the largest and most active churches in the Kopiago area were the Catholic, Seventh Day Adventists (SDA) and the Apostolic Church (and its offshoot church the Christian Apostolic Fellowship (CAF). Church attendance across the churches consisted predominantly of women. Men in attendance at Duna church services in general belonged to two strikingly polarised groups: either they were very old men, nearing the end of their lives, who had converted from their indigenous religious beliefs, or teenage boys and young men, taking advantage of the church setting to learn how to play the guitar. It appears to be the trend that after learning the guitar in this setting, these young men would take these musical skills and apply them to secular music. This connection between Christianity and what is known as stringband music is important, and will be discussed shortly. But first, let us consider the history of Christian music in this area of the world.

**The origins of the Christian song form**

Jacqueline Pugh-Kitingan conducted research on Huli music in the 1970s, around the time of a Christian revivalist movement in the area. The Huli are a large language group neighbouring the Duna, and can be described as a cultural cognate. Pugh-Kitingan describes one non-indigenous Christian song form, or ‘template’, that came to the Huli via the neighbouring Foe people, and that this template was used to compose “thousands” of songs in indigenous languages. (Pugh-Kitingan 1984, 109) A transcription of it appears in her dissertation as Transcription 74. (1981, 585) This transcription is reproduced in Gillespie 2010b, 69. Musically, the song template Pugh-Kitingan describes in her transcription is made up of two phrases: the first is marked by an opening rise from the tonal centre to the fifth degree, a brief visit to the sixth degree, and then a descent to the tonal centre; the second phrase briefly visits the sixth degree before landing back on the fifth, and again making a descent to the tonal centre.

The song template circulated the Highlands region, and the Duna did the same as the Foe and the Huli people, creating many songs in their own language with this one song template, accompanying themselves on the guitars that formed an integral part of worship in church. Here is an example of one of the Duna Christian songs. In terms of the text, the fundamental
characteristics are line repetition and word substitution. This song structure is responsible for much Duna Christian and secular song composition today.

Ngote hakaka, Ngote hakaka
God’s talk, God’s talk
Ngote hakaka, Ngote hakaka
God’s talk, God’s talk
Ngote hakaka ipa mo waye keinia
God’s talk is like water, it keeps coming
Nane laip senis nganda waye keinia
Boy’s life change keeps coming
Imane laip senis nganda waye keinia
Girl’s life change keeps coming
Ngote hakaka ipa mo waye keinia
God’s talk is like water, it keeps coming

The Christian song form as secular tool
The cross-fertilisation between Christian songs and popular music of the time is facilitated in a large part by the fact that both performance settings involve a multiplicity of guitars, the core of a stringband group (see for example Webb 1993, Crowdy 2005). Because of this blurring of musical boundaries, the Christian song template easily moved out of the realm of worship and into the homes and the daily lives of people in the region. The Daulo Teacher’s College songbook compiled in Tari and printed in 1980 features this song template in the Huli language. (Fearon 1980, 47, reproduced in Gillespie 2010a, 12 and 2010b, 70) The translation given describes it as a love song where a boy, after realising a girl he has befriended has died, cuts off part of his finger. Such self mutilation as a response to grief is common in the Highlands of Papua New Guinea. (see Gillespie 2010b, 176-177) More recently, Duna people have used the template to create songs of protest. But they are not alone in putting Christian song forms learnt in a church context to political use. Abby McLeod describes the women of Simbu Province doing the same. During campaigning, Simbu women “composed a plethora of songs with extensive narrative texts in a choral style emulating modern church compositions”. (McLeod 2002, 36)

Contemporary women’s songs in an introduced style
Let us turn to the secular songs composed by Highland women in this introduced musical style. The below is part of a song originally composed on the Christian song form template but to sing of politics. The core lyrics are:

mamba pi nakaya
we do not have a Member [of Parliament] either
haiwe pi naraya
we do not have a highway either
eke konera las kopiago
truly the edge las Køpiago
eke konera
truly the edge

The composers of the song (originally men) sing that they do not have a Member of Parliament to represent them, they do not have a highway to bring services – Kopiago is truly at the edge of civilisation, the last place on earth. The song was originally used to promote a parliamentary candidate. Subsequent versions were later composed: one that denigrated this candidate for not spending time in the community; one that promoted another man who worked as a community liaison officer at a gold mine as a person who would be able to channel funds from that mine into the community, and finally, a version that promoted God as the solution to the community’s problems. All versions used the above text as the core text of their song. The lack of Member and highway were the key features describing Kopiago.

In a version of this song performed by a group of women, the above core text is used. However, as well as complaining about the lack of a Member of Parliament and the lack of a Highway, the women add that they do not have a good hospital and they do not have a good school. By adding the condition of the hospital and the school to the list of the things that concern them about their community, the women have been able to express what is important to them. According to one study, in PNG in the year 2000, the leading causes of all deaths were pneumonia (15%) and peri-natal conditions (13%), with “more women and children dying during birthing, than dying of malaria”. (Giris and Rynkiewich 2005, 5) And in the Southern Highlands Province, where the Duna people live, during the election-related violence of 2002, the province was left with just one doctor and no hospitals (Giris and Rynkiewich 2005, 4) – that is for a population of approximately 500,000. (Haley and May 2007, 5) 25% of PNG women die before they turn 40, compared with 20% of males. (Giris and Rynkiewich 2005, 3) Adequate health care is a concern for all people living in remote
areas of Papua New Guinea, but it is arguably of a heightened concern for women and children, hence the women’s introduction of these issues into this song. Education is generally regarded as a way out of such hardship (providing an immediate passage out of Kopiago) and so naturally follows as the word substitution in the next line.

Many other examples exist of Duna women using the Christian song style to sing about the boyfriends they desire, and domestic problems, such as unfaithful husbands. It seems then that for women in particular, this new song form offers a new form of expression for them. However, it is not all new… in the case of most creative work, these songs a built on what has gone before.

**Continuity with – and variation from - ancestral traditions**

For the Duna at least, the manipulation of this Christian song template for secular purposes is contiguous with ancestral musical practices in a number of ways. The act of creating new song texts to fit a standard melody is the way in which Duna songs of the past have been created. Duna ancestral song genres are defined by a set melody, and it is the expert use of poetics to create new texts, and therefore new songs, that is most valued. The textual features of line repetition and word substitution within this repetition are also key features of ancestral songs. And as we have seen today, these are the key features of the introduced Christian song form, too. The common aspects of these musical expressions may in part account for the readiness in which the Christian song form was taken up by the Duna and their neighbours (though it is difficult to tell how influential ancestral musical practice actually was on the Christian song form as it was adopted).

However, there are a number of ways in which this newer form of song composition is a significant departure from the past, and some of this lies in the performance context. Both men and women can sing these songs either independently or together, which is quite different to the ancestral forms of musical practice for the Duna which are characterised largely by gender segregation. And as the genders often sing in unison in these songs, there is a sense of musical equality (though women are rarely seen playing guitar accompaniment to these songs in the company of men). It is more acceptable for Duna women to compose new material for this introduced song form – in the past, it was only really acceptable for women to compose new texts that were laments, as many other song forms had a courting function, and it was deemed inappropriate for a woman to compose such a text as she would be seen to be making advances towards a man. So the function and context for musical performance has shifted with these new song compositions. Another particular difference is the use of register in the text; while Duna ancestral song forms greatly valued the poetic use of devices such as
metaphor to identify people, places and issues, the Christian song template is explicit in the way it names God, Heaven and salvation as the topics. Similarly, secular songs composed in this template are also explicit in naming people such as politicians, and lovers, the locations of where people are and would like to be, and the many problems that people are facing and the ideals they would like to achieve. Such directness in song is highly effective for protest.

**Conclusion**

Musical expression is continually subject to change and new contexts. This paper offers an alternative reading to the mission encounter in the Highlands of PNG, and its effect on music. Scholars of music have often focused on the detrimental aspects of the mission experience on music, and I myself have pointed out that a number of Duna musical genres, and importantly the ritual contexts for their performance, were banned by the early missions in the area (Gillespie 2007a and 2010b, 61), having a devastating effect on traditional performance practice. As a contrasting point of view, this paper reveals indigenous agency in the actual appropriation of Christian song forms by Duna people for their own purposes: purposes of expression and of protest. It is particularly effective as a tool for younger to middle-aged Duna women who are composing on these song templates – traditional song composition being the domain of men and older women. In the process of obtaining such a voice and such a forum for expression, Duna women obtain an additional means of communication which may see them adopt a more empowered position in their community and society more generally. In addition, examining the songs of Duna women as this paper has done not only provides an understanding of the shifts in women’s expressive repertoire, but provides a unique and timely description of the current social climate in the Highlands of Papua New Guinea.

**References**


Chapter 10. Sight or sound: Multiple texts and the interpretation of Nathan Milstein’s *Paganiniana*. Taliesin Coward, Imogen Coward and Leon Coward.

One of the most widely known compositions of the 20th century virtuoso violinist, Nathan Milstein (1904-1992), is *Paganiniana* (Milstein 1954); a theme and variations showpiece for solo violin based upon the works of Paganini, including his 24 *Caprices* Op.1, and *Violin Concerto No. 2 in B minor: rondo “La Campanella”* Op.7. This paper explores Milstein’s own performances of this work and his attitudes, contrasting them with three performances of *Paganiniana* by 20th century virtuosos Hilary Hahn (b.1979), Gidon Kremer (b.1947) and Salvatore Accardo (b.1941). It outlines Milstein’s characteristic use of gesture (as a physical theatrical display) in the performances before exploring in detail his approach to interpreting the work and focussing on if/how the overall structure, bowing and phrasing are bound to the score - gesture and technique being understood as interlinked. (Leech-Wilkinson 2009, Ch. 8; AHRC Research Centre for Musical Performance as Creative Practice 2011; Clarke 2002, 66-69) In so doing, it highlights the fact that the score is only one of several documents Milstein left concerning his *Paganiniana*, the range of which includes print-based documents (i.e. score and books) as well as audio and audio-visual recordings. This is in keeping with the view, taken by McAdams, Depalle and Clarke, and Leech-Wilkinson, that sound documents offer important insights which cannot be easily discerned from a score alone. (Clarke and Cook 2004, 157; Leech-Wilkinson 2009, Ch 1.1:15, 1.2:16) The paper begins with an overview of the principal data sources.

This study draws heavily upon recordings (audio/audio-visual) by Milstein, Hahn, Kremer and Accardo. However, as Milsom has observed, recordings are not entirely free of problems. (Milsom 2003, 199) With regard to this study, the recordings used are of a relatively high quality and they arguably show each performer in the prime of his/her career. Nathan Mironovich Milstein’s performing career spanned some 73 years. During his last recital, given when he was 82 years old, Milstein was still performing the virtuosic works of Sarasate, Paganini, Bach and Beethoven with the same level of skill and proficiency as he had demonstrated more than 40 years earlier. (Nupen 2007) Fortunately, recordings of Milstein, both audio and audio-visual, exist from the first half of the 20th century onwards. As
well as a filmed documentary, (Nupen 2007) there is also his autobiography, From Russia to the West: The Musical Memoirs and Reminiscences of Nathan Milstein, published in 1990. (Milstein and Volkov 1990) Whilst there is controversy over the veracity of Volkov’s writings regarding Shostakovich’s memoirs (Lebrecht 2004), a large amount of the information presented in Milstein’s memoirs was verified by Milstein himself in later interviews. (Nupen 2007)

Milstein is noted for his interpretations of the Romantic violin concerti and Bach’s Sonatas and Partitas for solo violin. He is also noted for his transcriptions, arrangements and compositions for violin. Chronologically and stylistically, he may be firmly situated within an extended 19th century tradition of virtuoso composer-performers as identified by Hamilton, Samson and Milsom. According to Hamilton, many of the Romantic virtuosi regarded composition as an integral part of performance, and the performer’s personality as a composer would inevitably permeate a performance and turn it into a fairly free re-creation rather than interpretation. (Hamilton 2008, 181-182) In keeping with this understanding, Milstein’s attitudes towards notation, interpretation and the overtly creative role of the performer permeated every facet of his artistic output. This is displayed not only in his compositions, transcriptions and performances, but also in his own cadenzas for Mozart and Beethoven concerti.

Whilst Milstein was not as well known to the wider public as his 20th century contemporaries such as Heifetz, Oistrakh, and Kreisler, he did earn the respect of his contemporaries, (Milstein and Volkov 1990, 168-178, 199, 206-239) being referred to as “the violinists” violinist’ and ‘the most impeccable and elegant virtuoso of his time’ (Foil 1993, 8-9). Tully Potter sums up Milstein’s noted qualities of impeccability and elegance, characterised by an economy of motion in performance and freedom of expression musically, as follows: [if] one strand of his [Milstein’s] immaculately sleeked-back hair was dislodged, it was a sign that he was extending himself. Most of the time he made it all look easy, with the art that concealed art. (Potter 2006, 4)

In contrast to the economy of motion displayed by Milstein in his audio-visual recordings of Paganiniana (Nathan Milstein DVD 2004), the three different performances (recorded “live”) by Hilary Hahn, Gidon Kremer and Salvatore Accardo each display virtuosic technical ability but the effort of playing is not concealed and is perhaps even exaggerated through the addition of musically non-essential but ‘theatrical’ techniques such as flying staccato. With regards to
violinists and virtuosi, Milstein believed that while one always has to practice, he/she will only make headway when not opposed by difficulty, and this, therefore, requires one to be inventive (Nupen 2007) musically and technically. This accounts for his free attitude towards fingering and bowing. Milstein was known for making radical changes, sometimes during a performance, regard to how the piece is bowed and with what fingers and strings, for example. This attitude, Milstein observed, was an issue of comfort, rather than one of artistic quality, though being comfortable would only serve to help in this respect. (Nupen 2007) It would appear that this attitude lies behind his apparently effortless elegance as a performer. In addition, Milstein’s general attitudes on artistic freedom of the performer and whether they should play a substantial creative role in music making are firmly spelt out in his autobiography:

> Stravinsky, in my experience didn’t understand at all how his music should be played. Few composers do! Even Beethoven didn’t understand how his music should be presented. Composers don’t know how to make their own music sound good. That’s why they need cooperation, not confrontation, with performers.

(Milstein and Volkov, 1990, 130)

This should not be taken as an indication that he in any way had a disdain for the written score. He has noted that what the composer indicates on a score should be used, for example, to settle disputes between ensemble players as to which part carries the main voice. (Milstein and Volkov 1990, 53)

With regards to his own compositions, Milstein demonstrates a large amount of freedom and variation in his performances regarding what notes were to be played as well as how they were to be played. This is particularly the case with *Paganiniana*. In terms of stylistic character and historical origins of the work, *Paganiniana* may be viewed as an extension of the 19th century tradition of virtuoso theme and variations, styled along the lines of a caprice, as characterised not only by the 24 *Caprices* Op. 1 by Paganini upon which Milstein’s work draws heavily, but also by works such as the *Caprice-Etudes* Op. 18 of Wieniawski and Beethoven’s variations on *Bei Männern* WOO46. However, when the published score of Milstein’s *Paganiniana* variations is compared to Milstein’s publically released recordings from 1946, the late 1950s, 1968 and 1984, it is evident than none of the performances conform strictly to his score. (Milstein 1954; 1996; 1998; 2005; 2006)
In each of the recordings, Milstein made significant changes in performance including the exclusion of variations, changes to the order of variations and writing or improvising new extended passages. Variation one, for example, is habitually altered in varying ways which include extensive re-writing whilst retaining the rhythmic content and the basic melodic contour of the published score (1984), re-writing the final bar with this changing on each repeat (1950s), and re-working chords as arpeggios (1946). In addition, in the 1946 recording the location of variation one is moved so that it comes between variations two and three, while in the 1968 recording variation one is cut in its entirety. Variation seven, the final variation which is composed in several texturally distinct sections, is substantially altered through extensive re-writing including the use of transposition (e.g. bb.1-9 in the 1968 recording) and the addition of a second contrapuntal voice below the published melody (bb.1-5 in the 1968 recording). A particularly noticeable example of extensive re-writing of this variation is found throughout the 1946 recording made during Milstein’s Library of Congress recital. This 1946 recording is not an exception, however, but rather is indicative of Milstein’s general treatment of the work overall, with a substantial amount of new material being added between the second-last and last sections of variation seven in each of the recorded performances surveyed.

Milstein’s interpretation of markings appearing on his quite detailed published score of Paganiniana reveal a relaxed approach in his performances. For example, although slurs may be interpreted in violin works as bowing indications, for Milstein they appear to indicate more specifically phrasing marks and serve as optional suggestions rather than strict directions to a performer. While a slur marking generally indicates that the notes it covers should be played legato, in his 1946 recording of Paganiniana, Milstein plays the first section of variation two legato, as marked in the score, but plays b.9-12 of variation two (following the repeat) with a bouncing, spiccato articulation, although the score indicates a combination of legato and staccato articulation. The recordings, therefore, enable one to gain an awareness of Milstein’s free treatment of phrasing and articulation markings in his performances of Paganiniana, as well as his treatment of combinations of markings which might otherwise imply specific bowing techniques, such as flying staccato or ricochet. Hahn, Kremer and to a lesser extent Accardo are likely to have had access not only to the written score, but also to Milstein’s audio and audio-visual recordings of this work. However, in contrast to Milstein’s own performances, a feature of Hahn’s and Kremer’s performances of Paganiniana is the close adherence to Milstein’s published score, although alterations including re-arrangement, addition and excision are all evident in each of the performances.
by Hahn, Accardo and, to a lesser degree, Kremer. The theme and variation form is very open to re-arrangement, addition and excision. Rachmaninoff, for example, cut variations out of his Variations on a Theme by Corelli Op. 42 whenever audiences started to cough too much. (Way 2000) Hilary Hahn’s changes include minimal re-writing of some bars in Paganiniana and swapping of the order of variation six and the first section of variation seven. Otherwise, her performance closely follows the score with minimal changes to implied bowing and ornamentation. Of the performances surveyed, it is Gidon Kremer’s that most closely follows Milstein’s published score. Kremer’s departures from this score amount, at most, to minor changes such as bowing, the cutting of two repeats and the inclusion of two instances of the showy bowing technique of ricochet. In comparison, Salvatore Accardo’s performance of Paganiniana shows extensive departures from the published score. Though Accardo tends to follow the basic melodic and structural outline of Milstein’s piece, his changes include shortening of variations four and seven, the cutting of three whole variations (variations two, five and six), transposing of part of the first section of variation seven, extending variations three and seven with new material and adding virtuosic runs and showy ‘tricks’ such as ricochet and left hand pizzicato. Of particular interest is the tendency by Hilary Hahn, Gidon Kremer and, at times, Salvatore Accardo, to regard the slurs on the published score as not only phrasing marks, but also bowing marks. Such an approach may add to performance’s technical difficulty, though not necessarily its artistic merit, but this appears contrary to Milstein’s own notational practices and the intended meaning of slurs in his works.

The contrast between the apparent level of musical freedom demonstrated by Milstein in his performances of Paganiniana, with the performances of Hahn, Kremer and Accardo, reveals a difference in individual attitudes of the performers, but is also indicative of the existence of a number of influential factors that need to be taken into account. One factor is the nature of the music itself. As already noted, the fact that Paganiniana draws heavily upon the works of Paganini, in particular his 24 Caprices, when coupled with Milstein’s own performances, suggests that Paganiniana may be closer in spirit to a caprice, that is a work according to the fancy of the performer. (Kennedy and Kennedy 2007, 129) Thus, in many senses it would perhaps be nearer the mark to regard this work as improvisatory in nature. As such, the score, to use Bruno Nettl’s term, serves as a rough frame-work supplying the melodic, rhythmic, structural and textural ‘building blocks’ of the work; (Nettl 1974, 1-9) an understanding which is inherent both in Milstein’s performances and, interestingly, to a degree also in Salvatore Accardo’s performance of Paganiniana. Another obvious factor is that Milstein, as
both composer and performer of *Paganiniana*, was in a position to treat his work with a greater sense of freedom. (Hamilton 2008, 181-182) As composer-performer he could claim the authority of the composer to legitimise any changes he made, though it is perhaps unlikely he would have felt such a need, given the performance tradition in which he belonged, his expressed attitudes and the historical concept of the virtuoso. (Samson 2003, 72)

As already noted, Milstein is regarded as a virtuoso composer-performer, with modern virtuosity as we know, indicating a performer displaying both technical and artistic mastery. (Kennedy and Kennedy 2007, 793) This concept rose to prominence in Paris during the late 18th to 19th centuries (Metzner 1998, 9-12) and is linked to the performer’s quest for autonomy, with a true virtuoso also possessing an artistic freedom and ability which, while demonstrating a respect for the musical score does not imply subservience to it. (Samson 2003, 73-77) These concepts all find reflection in both Milstein’s expressed attitudes and his recordings of *Paganiniana*. Although Accardo demonstrates a greater degree of freedom of interpretation than the others, all three - Hahn, Kremer, and Accardo - unlike Milstein, were born after 1940 into an era which, according to Hamilton, has the notable feature of an obsession with textual fidelity. (Hamilton 2008, 188)

The treatment of the composition, *Paganiniana*, as it is performed by Milstein, Hahn, Kremer and Accardo, illustrate Milstein’s attitudes and practices and points towards a fundamental difference between his sense of freedom and those of the other performers. While there are a number of factors which may account for this, Milstein clearly believed in and desired the freedom of the performer to blur the lines between performer and composer, and the necessity for them to play to their own strengths in every way possible, as he says, “to find a better way”. (Nupen 2007)

References


Monsaingeon, B. (Director), *The art of the violin* (DVD), Germany, 2001

Nathan Milstein Italian Sonatas, Nathan Milstein - violin (1998) EMI Classics 7243 5 66873
2 5.


Nupen, C. (Director), Nathan Milstein in portrait (Some memories of a quiet magician), (DVD), UK, 2007.


Chapter 11. Vision and revision: Gui of St Denis and MS Harley 281

Carol Williams.

Gui of St Denis

Gui’s dates are uncertain but this Benedictine music theorist flourished in the late 13th and early 14th centuries. He was a monk of St Denis and has been identified by the Monash research group as Guy de Châtres, the Abbot of St Denis either between 1294 and 1310 (Chevalier 1905, 2013) or 1326 and 1342. (Omont 1926, 150) Though Michel Huglo argues against this, (Huglo 2011) there is enough circumstantial evidence to at least mount an interesting case in support of his identity and thus his authorship of not only the Tractatus de tonis, the main issue of interest here, but also the glamorous Sanctilogium a kind of liturgical year book for the use of the monks of St Denis. The Tractatus de tonis provides certainty about his name, Guido, since it is in an acrostic formed by the initial letters of the introduction and the four sections of the work. Just in case the reader missed this, the introduction is prefaced with an injunction: “You who read the name of the author from the five first letters of the painter, pray for this to be written in heaven.” The treatise ends with a little further information: “Here ends the tract concerning the tones compiled by brother Guido, monk of the monastery of Saint-Denis in France.”

MS Harley 281

The British Library’s manuscript Harley 281 (Waesberghe 1961, IV: 74-78) provides a carefully structured anthology of texts, copied by a single hand, all about the theory of music as interpreted in Paris in the early fourteenth century. It stands as testament to the intellectual vigour of the scholastic Ars Antiqua of Paris at the close of the 13th century and provides a fusion of old and new traditions. The main scribe worked with a second individual, who

---

1 This research has been partly supported by ARC Discovery project grant DP0555959 at Monash University, Australia.
2 Constant Mews, Catherine Jeffreys, Carol Williams and John Crossley work collaboratively in the broad area of late 13th and early 14th century Parisian scholarship. With Leigh McKinnon assisting, the group has completed an edition and translation of Johannes de Grocheio’s Ars musica (forthcoming) and with Tomas Zahora, an edition and translation of Gui of St Denis’ Tractatus de tonis is nearing completion.
3 Preserved as BL, Royal MS. 13.D.IX.
4 That is - the artist who created the illuminated letters.
5 “Qui legis auctoris nomen per quinque priora. Gramata pictoris. hoc scribi celitus ora.” MS H281 fr.58v.
6 “Explicit tractatus de tonis a fratre guidone monacho monasterii sancti dyonisii in francia compilatus.” MS H281 f.96r.
writing in what we may term the scholar’s hand, was responsible for both minor corrections throughout the manuscript and major extensive corrections to the *Tractatus de tonis* of Gui of Saint-Denis. More will be said of this below.

The first of its two sections (ff. 5r–38v) opens with what is presented as three distinct books of Guido of Arezzo: the *Micrologus* (Palisca and Babb 1978, 49-83), the *Trocaicus* (a synthesis of various Guidonian texts, primarily the *Regule rythmice*), (Pesce 1999, 328-403) and a third book on music in the form of a dialogue, in reality the anonymous *Dialogus de musica* once attributed to Odo. (Huglo & Brockett 2011) These three books are expanded by additional material and followed by a fourth text, the so-called *Tonale Beati Bernardi*, (Meyer 2003, 77-86) an anonymous tonary that provides a Cistercian interpretation of plainchant performance concerns. The second section of the manuscript (ff. 39r–96v) contains three more recent texts. The first of these is the *Ars musicæ* of Johannes de Grocheio, (Seay 1973) presented here (ff. 39r–52r) without identification of its author. No other copies are known of the two final works in the anthology, the relatively short *Tractatus de tonis* (ff. 52v–58r) (Harbinson 1978) by Petrus de Cruce, cantor of Amiens cathedral in the late thirteenth century, and the much more elaborate *Tractatus de tonis* (ff. 58v–96r) (Klundert 1998) of Gui of Saint-Denis. This latter treatise, makes significant use of Grocheio’s *Ars musicæ* and the writings of Guido of Arezzo, and refers positively to the activities of Petrus de Cruce.

**The connection between Gui of St Denis and MS Harley 281**

The fact that Gui’s *Tractatus de tonis* is the last work included is the foremost connection between the music theorist and the manuscript Harley 281. The connection is much deeper however, and it is proposed here that it was Gui who commissioned the collection and took editorial control of the project. (Mews et al. 2008) The contents of the manuscript as a whole reflects the same concerns found in Gui’s *Tractatus de tonis*, namely how traditional monastic teaching about music could creatively interact with much more contemporary perspectives while remaining focused on plainchant theory. The opening work of the second section of the manuscript, Johannes de Grocheio’s *Ars musicæ* might seem out of place in this anthology, as unlike all the other works in the manuscript, the discussion of *musica* therein is not confined to plainchant theory. Nonetheless, in the *Tractatus de tonis*, Gui of Saint-Denis quotes Grocheio, though he does not identify him. That Gui is the only theorist known to cite Grocheio hints at the possibility that he knew its author personally. Gui also intimates that he
was familiar with the practice of Petrus de Cruce, the other relatively contemporary author presented in the second part of the manuscript. Apart from his own *Tractatus*, the second part of this anthology comprises the work of theorists with whom Gui of Saint-Denis is likely to have had some personal connection.

Whereas much Parisian book production during this period was typically directed by a *libraire*, who oversaw all aspects of manuscript preparation including engaging scribes, the musical illustrations of Harley 281 appear to have been added not by a professional scribe but by our scholar. There are several elements that point towards the identity of this scholar. Marginalia in the scholar’s hand, usually rendered on the right-hand side of the half-folio, were penned by an individual with an advanced understanding of music theory. Most corrections made by this individual are minor; major corrections, such as the rewriting of whole sentences and the deletion of an entire paragraph on f. 67r, are confined to the *Tractatus de tonis* by Gui of Saint-Denis.

The changes made by the scholar’s hand to Gui’s treatise are more than simply scribal corrections: they appear to improve upon what the author wanted to say. This level of editorial interference bears the hallmarks of an apograph, a copy directed by an author who actively engages in an editorial capacity with his or her text. That Gui of Saint-Denis collaborated with a *pictor* in the preparation of Harley 281 has already been discussed and the evidence of the acrostic and the *explicit* draws the net around Gui a little closer. As the copy of Gui’s *Tractatus de tonis* in Harley 281 was certainly undertaken by a single scribe under the author’s direction, it can be concluded with reasonable confidence that the scholar who made corrections throughout the manuscript was Gui of Saint-Denis. This leads to the conclusion that it is more than likely that he was also the driving force behind the compilation and completion of this music theory anthology.

**Gui’s vision of MS Harley 281**

If indeed Gui of St Denis was responsible for the Harley anthology as a whole, what was the reasoning behind this synthesis that brings together both traditional and some aspects of more contemporary thinking about music current in Paris in the late thirteenth century? I say “some aspects of more contemporary music thinking” as there is a studied absence in this anthology of any theoretical discussion of *musica mensurata*, the central issue of *Ars Antiqua*. True, Grocheio makes passing reference to the rhythmic modes of Franco and the raging fashion

---

7 In the discussion concerning responsories in Book II of Gui’s *Tractatus de tonis* he refers to Petrus de Cruce: “The church of Amiens, however, according to the tones of Master Petrus de Cruce and the examples which he puts there and ourselves, seems to be adapted to our use and that of other monks.”
for the motet, but he does so in a kind of social history frame, considering musical fashion in the Paris of his day. He studiously avoids tangling with arcane matters of, for example, how the rhythmic modes are rendered notatable using the ligature patterns. The central concern of this anthology and of Gui’s own work is the pedagogy of plainchant theory with a very sharp focus on the history, theory and practice of the tones. We propose that Gui commissioned and then corrected the manuscript Harley 281 so that it could serve students at the College of Saint-Denis, established in Paris in the thirteenth century to enable an elite group of monks to pursue university studies. The compilation provides a comprehensive manual of writings on the tones, all of which influence Gui in one way or another.

Levels of revision in MS Harley 281

The first level of revision to be examined here is that effected by Gui on the work of Guido of Arezzo. There are minor corrections made reflecting a careful eye on the main scribe’s copying work, as well as Gui’s more reflective inserted comments. More significant than these, however, is Gui’s construction of transition passages, some quite extensive, which are used to provide bridge passages between the sections of the Aretine oeuvre found in this manuscript. These passages are unique but their value here is founded less on their originality than on the purpose they seem to serve in subtly re-orienting this fundamental 11th century material for a 14th century readership. A good example is the “alis prologus” (another prologue) found on f.5v. It directly precedes Guido of Arezzo’s Micrologus and follows the standard dedicatory letter to Bishop Theodaldus and prologue, opening


---

8 See for example f.12r (Guido of Arezzo’s Micrologus, chapter 15) where Gui inserts a supralinear “se” omitted by the scribe thus “...quia in omnibus Λ haec ars...” and on the same folio where he strikes through an incorrect word and adds the correction in the margin thus “...ut tamen (right margin addition) tantum neumae neumis...”

9 See for example right margin f.8v (Guido of Arezzo’s Micrologus, chapter 8) where Gui confirms Guido’s description of the affinity between the pitches E and a, since “you may descend from each by two tones and a semitone”. He also adds the reminder that this affinity may be extended further than Guido took it, into the super-acute register.

10 Incipit ‘Sepe et multum graviter…’ . For the full text of this and all other unique bridge passages by Gui of St Denis refer to Mews, C. J., C. Jeffreys, et al. (2008) "Guy of Saint-Denis and the Compilation of Texts about Music in London, British Library, Harl. MS. 281."
13th century renaissance of ancient learning was felt in most areas of scholarship, it was barely noticeable in treatises of music theory, particularly those with pedagogic intent, as here.

Gui selects Boethius as better for showing what must be understood about the tones and consonances than the many other theorists he has examined. He warns, however, that since Boethius “strives to reach philosophers alone” he is often “contrary and difficult”. After a virtuosic (and puzzling) reference to Ptolemy’s astronomy and further, to the “number, weight and measure” of the Old Testament Wisdom of Solomon, he comes to his main point. Gui, eager to remind the reader of his own erudition, though speaking in the voice of Guido of Arezzo, explains that for the pedagogic purpose already submitted, he has rejected philosophy in order to explain the rules of the art of music clearly and briefly. This brief, “Alius Prologus” displays Gui’s extraordinary depth of scholarship and serves to direct the reader’s attention from the specific works of the 11th century Guido of Arezzo to the broader aim of the anthology, the study of the tones within the intellectual environment of early 14th century Paris.

The same levels of revision are apparent in the presentation of his own work, the Tractatus de tonis. Thus we see minor corrections to the main scribe’s work as well as more significant recrafting of the initial expression. A more subtle process of revision can be seen in Gui’s citation method. When Gui incorporates the work of others into his own writing he adopts a number of approaches, the most interesting of which might be called the “top and tail” method where the opening of a quote from an authority is given, and then a kind of paraphrase and gloss is given by Gui who finally concludes with a return to the original quote. The result of this is that while Gui crafts the quote to suit his purpose exactly, he subtly revises the meaning of it. This revisionary method is best explained by example, focusing on Gui’s use of Boethius’ De institutione musice (Bower 1989).

The following passage is taken from Gui’s Tractatus de tonis book I, chapter 1, with bold type indicating the cited reference to book I, chapter 3, of Boethius De institutione musice.

Motuum vero localium alii sunt tardiores alii velociores. et eorum quidam sunt rariores / quidam vero spissiores. Si igitur ut

---

11 See for example f.70r where Gui has scored through the scribe’s incorrect “fecerint” and inserted the correct “steterint” in the right margin.
12 See for example f.70r where the right margin holds the insertion “ita quod si sequitur apprehensionem sub ratione boni convenientis cum delectation movetur si autem sub ratione disconvenientis” which seems to have been left out of the master from which the main scribe was copying. The result, whatever the cause, of incorporating the insertion is absolute clarity within a very difficult passage.
dicit boecius. **rarior aut tardior fuerit motus / gravem sonum efficit.** nam sicut tarditas proxima est stationi ita gravitas contigua est taciturnitati. **Si vero spissus aut celer vel velox fuerit motus / sonum acutum reddit.** Et ideo si corda alicuius instrumenti musici intenditur / sonum acutiorum reddi. Si vero remittitur / graviorem. **quando enim corda est tensione velociorem pulsum reddit celeriusque revertitur et frequentius ac spissius aerem percutit. quando vero laxior est / pulsus tardiores et raros efficit. ipsaque imbecillitate feriendi non diutius tremit.** [Gui TdT I/1]

Motuum vero alii sunt velociiores, alii tardiore, eorumdemque motuum alii rariores sunt alii spissiores...Et si tardus quidem fuerit ac rarior motus, graves necesse est sonos effici ipsa tarditate et raritate pellendi. Si vero sint motus celeres ac spissi, acutos necesse est reddi sonos. Idcirco enim idem nervus, si intendatur amplius, acutum sonat, si remittatur, grave. Quando enim tension est, velociorem pulsum reddit celeriusque revertitur et frequentius ac spissius aerem ferit. Qui vero laxior est, solutos ac tardos pulsus effert rariosque ipsa inbecillitate feriendi, nec diutius tremit.

[Boethius DIM I/3]

Translation:
But of the local motions, some are slower, some swifter, and certain of them are sparser, while some are denser. If, therefore, as Boethius says, the motion is sparser or slower, it makes a low sound. For just as slowness is nearest to a stop, so lowness borders on silence. But if motion is dense or swift or speedy, it makes a high sound. And therefore, if the string of any musical instrument is stretched, it produces a higher sound. But if it is slackened, it produces a lower one. For when a string is more taut, it returns a more rapid pulse more swiftly and strikes the air more frequently and densely. But when it is slacker, it produces slower and thinner pulses and it does not vibrate longer on account of the weakness of the beating. [Gui TdT I/1]
Some motions are faster, others slower; some motions are less frequent, others more frequent. If someone regards an uninterrupted motion he will necessarily observe in it either speed or slowness; moreover, if someone moves his hand, he will move it in either a frequent or less frequent motion. If motion is slow and less frequent, low sounds are necessarily produced by the very slowness and infrequency of striking. But if motions are fast and more frequent, high sounds are necessarily produced. For this reason if the same string is made tighter, it sounds high, if loosened, low. For when it is tighter, it produces faster pulsation, recurs more quickly and strikes the air more frequently and densely. The string that is looser brings about lax and slow pulsations and being less frequent because of this very weakness of striking does not vibrate very long. [Boethius DIM I/3]

While Gui’s text here seems to be patterned pretty closely on Boethius, he introduces a very interesting idea that is not found in this passage of Boethius when he says “for just as slowness is nearest to a stop, so lowness borders on silence”. Though much of this passage seems to be reliant on the interpreting voice of Peter of Auvergne13 in his *Quodlibet* no. 614, (Hentschel 2000) this particular idea is not to be found there either. This connection is worth a brief digression as Peter’s *Quodlibet* 6 was a commentary on the 8th book of Aristotle’s *Politics*, so, as in the “Alius Prologus” discussed above, Gui is introducing ancient learning and philosophical content that was vigorously in debate in early 14th century Paris. In fact this is a virtuosic display of scholarship on the part of Gui, who perhaps as a scholar particularly versed in music learning, had a more thorough understanding of the source materials for music theory than did Peter of Auvergne, for this sentence is taken verbatim from Boethius *De institutione musica* Book IV chapter 1. This subtle weaving together of the work of ancient and contemporary scholars within his own theoretical agenda is testament to Guy’s masterly scholarship. He demonstrates considerable skill in the revision of the works

---

13 Peter of Auvergne was a French philosopher and theologian contemporary of Gui’s. The quodlibets were long, possibly extempore discussions after the manner of St Thomas Aquinas, Peter’s teacher.  
of others, fitting them into his own vision for his own work and that of the anthology of Harley 281.

The process of revision, just as it is today, is a mark of esteem. The old is not rejected but reworked and refashioned. I think the revision of early medieval authorities such as Boethius was close to a revolutionary process in the late 13th century and Guy demonstrates very clearly the degree of sophistication he could bring to bear on the topic.

References


Bubenreuth, Germany: Hurricane Publishers.


The concept that music can communicate and evoke an emotional response through its expression has long been accepted and parallels have been drawn between musical syntax and that of language. The dialogue evident in the music of Jean Françaix is such that the music appears to effectively convey conversations between instruments. This paper will suggest an original interpretation of the dialogue in several of Françaix’s flute works, from flute solo to wind quintet, the crafting of these conversations and the execution of them in performance.

Conversation in the music of Jean Françaix is an important characteristic of his style, as is a neoclassical inspiration for eighteenth-century dance forms and simplistic melodies, spiced with inventive harmonies and complex rhythms, which deem his music distinctly ‘modern’. Each characteristic highlights Françaix’s aim to create musique pour faire plaisir (music for pleasure). This resolution seems present in the musical aesthetic of many French composers, such as Debussy, who believed:

> Music should seek to please . . . extreme complications are contrary to art. Beauty must appeal to the senses, must provide us with immediate enjoyment, must impress or insinuate itself into us without any effort on our part. (Cooper 1961, 136)

Similarly, Françaix’s aimed:

> To do something that can be called ‘Français’, both with an S and an X, that is, to be jolly most of the time - even comical… To avoid the premeditated wrong note and boredom like the plague. (Bellier 2001, 139)

Dialogue is overt in Françaix’s music; whether happily in agreement, hastily interruptive or reflective and melancholy, there is often a verbal exchange to be communicated amongst the performers. Different types of dialogue identified in Françaix’s music include casual conversation, heated arguments, sad cries and excited whispers, which reflect his aim to evoke an emotional response from the audience.

The idea of music expressing particular emotions originated from the Greek philosophy that the function of music was to imitate the human affects, and the passions and arousal of the temperaments and that these affects should be awakened in the listener through music. (Lister
If this is indeed the true purpose of music then Françaix succeeds for the most part in imitating the more positive of the human emotions, such as happiness and love. Françaix’s father, Alfred, once wrote to his son’s composition teacher Nadia Boulanger describing how he composed with such happiness:

Jean will arrive on the 9th of January delirious with joy at the thought of showing you his concerto. If only you could see him laugh as he is writing it! (Bellier 1999, 29)

This is an example of Stephen Davies’ expression theory, which states that

The audience’s emotional response to the expressiveness of a musical work is a response to that work as expressing emotions felt by its composer at the time of creation. (Davies 1994, 170)

In Françaix’s case, it is undeniable that he was mostly a joyous composer. American bassoonist James Jeter said that he learned much about Françaix’s music simply by meeting him. At a rehearsal of Françaix’s *Divertissement pour Basson et Quintette à Cordes*, Jeter found the composer to be “quite witty and sharp-minded, very straightforward and without formality”. (Jeter, 2008) There is also evidence that Françaix composed with certain characters in mind, describing characters and their conversations throughout the music in rehearsals. Françaix commented that the first violin solo in the bassoon *Divertissement* “must literally sound like a chanteuse with a definite flavor of a French nightclub (lots of vibrato and sliding around)”. (Jeter, 2008) At the time of Jeter’s rehearsal with Françaix, the composer was working on a piece titled “The Aristocrat and the Peasant,” contrasting the elegance of the harp with the boisterous nature of the double bass.

The means by which Françaix expresses ideas of conversation are through his use of instrumentation and compositional devices such as dynamic contrasts, melody and harmony and the comic timing of gestures.¹ Françaix often juxtaposes a humorous style of writing with a more tender lyricism. Dynamic contrasts often change suddenly and reflect shouting or whispering voices while dissonances suggest disagreement and consonances show affection between the voices. Comic timing is achieved through call and response patterns between voices and often it is the silences between notes that are of most effect. The more voices

¹. There are other compositional means by which conversation can be seen in Françaix’s compositions, such as bi-tonal aspects of the harmony and the use of modes and manufactured scales in the melodies, though these will not be discussed in this paper. For more in depth analysis on theoretical techniques employed by Françaix in his flute works, see “Form and tonality as elements of neoclassicism in two works of Jean Françaix: *Divertimento pour flûte et piano* (1955) and *Suite pour flûte seule* (1963)” by Elizabeth Ambler Ruppe, (DMA, University of North Texas, May 1996).
involved, the more difficult to discern the dialogue so intricately written in Françaix’s flute works, so it is logical to begin identifying dialogue in his *Suite* for solo flute.

In his *Suite* for solo flute of 1962, Françaix successfully shows that only one instrument is needed to create dialogue. Classed as ‘chamber music’ in a catalogue of his works, this *Suite* is challenging from a performance perspective, as the soloist must carry the conversation throughout, alone. Differing tonal colours and frequent dynamic contrasts can denote different voices, which are suggested by Françaix’s specific markings. Two voices are most evident in the *Menuet* movement, which is written as two separate lines, giving the impression that the flute is accompanying itself, as seen in Figure 1.

**Figure 1. Jean Françaix 1962, *Suite pour Flûte Seule* Menuet bars 1-8, Mainz: Schott**

In this example two separate lines are denoted in the upper and lower registers, further distinguished by the opposing note stems, which is also a common trait in the flute works of J.S. Bach and his son C.P.E. Bach, showing Françaix’s admiration for musical styles of the past. The first movement of C.P.E. Bach’s *Sonate* for solo flute shows these similarities, the first eight bars of which are shown in Figure 2.

**Figure 2. C.P.E. Bach 1747, *Sonate A-Moll für Flöte Solo* Poco adagio bars 1-8, Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag**

In both examples the bass note defines the harmony, and the upper voice contains the melodic interest. Each phrase holds a conversation between two distinct voices, although it is only played by one instrument, displaying a rhetorical element.
Of the flute duets by Françaix, two in particular typify Françaix’s conversational writing and use of instrumentation for comic purposes. These are Françaix’s *Sept Impromptus* for flute and bassoon (1977) and *Le Colloque des Deux Perruches* for flute and alto flute (1989). Each have very conversational qualities, either directly referred to in the title, (*Le Colloque des Deux Perruches* literally translating as ‘the conversation between two parrots’) or implied through instrumentation, such as the bassoon and flute in the *Impromptus*, which can be seen to represent male and female voices.

In *Le Colloque des Deux Perruches* the C flute and alto flute very effectively sound like two parrots conversing. The *Allegrissimo* opening shows them mumbling in idle chit chat, but this is the calm before the storm, as the middle section displays extremes in registers of both instruments, almost like the C flute has an angry outburst at the alto flute from bar 68, seen in Figure 3.

**Figure 3.** Jean Françaix 1989, *Le Colloque des Deux Perruches* Allegrissimo bars 59-72, Mainz: Schott

Sadness is prevalent in the first *Larghetto* movement, denoted by its minor key. After a climactic sequence of rising figures, the resolution to the major key is effective in lightening the mood, as seen after the fermata between bars 36 and 37, shown in Figure 4 overleaf.
This movement is effective in showing Françaix’s more tender, lyrical form of expression and his classical admiration for resolve. Also effective in this duet is Françaix’s use of contrary motion, echoes and the contrast in dynamics at end of the final Allegro, as seen in Figure 5.

Here the pianississimo sections can be likened to excited whispers, and the fortississimo sections to shouting. The final pianississimo grace note figure is atypical of Françaix’s writing, showing his comic timing of gestures in its anticlimactic ending.

The instrumentation of Françaix’s Sept Impromptus for flute and bassoon can give the impression of a male and female voice, the bassoon representing the masculine and the flute, feminine, although this is sometimes exchanged between parts in mocking tones. Françaix does not limit his writing to what is comfortable for each instrumentalist however; in fact the bassoon and flute often play higher or lower than is usual. This assists in the portrayal of male and female voices, extending their range to the limit and imitating each other to express
a point as it might naturally occur in conversation. Dialogue is established from the very first bar of the opening *Allegretto con spirito* with a bold, declamatory statement from the flute, which is answered by the bassoon in a rising dynamic. Following this ironic opening is a sprightly, well-articulated melody in the flute accompanied by the bassoon, shown in Figure 6.

**Figure 6. Jean Françaix 1977, *Sept Impromptus* Allegretto con spirito bars 1-3, Mainz: Schott**

![Allegretto con spirito](image)

This jovial opening is followed by a lyrical *Grave* movement, which holds much opportunity for tonal colouration and expressive playing to portray a conversation of a more poignant nature. The instruments are written in close canon throughout most of the movement, possibly indicating that the voices are in agreement. The pensive dialogue is littered with interesting accents that can be read as swells or ‘sighs’ in the music, becoming more insistent towards the end of the movement, and contradicted by the diminishing dynamic level throughout. These accents are commonly found on the first of a triplet, as seen in Figure 7.

**Figure 7. Jean Françaix *Sept Impromptus* Grave, bars 19-22**

![Grave](image)

Although this section is marked at the dynamic level of *pianissimo*, the accents provide direction to the phrases in which they occur, highlighting each voice as it encounters this unusual marking. Throughout this movement the bassoon takes on a most expressive, singing quality due to its unusually high pitching, while the flute is written in its comfortable, though naturally softer, lower range.

Françaix’s wind quartet (1933) and quintet (1948) show many moments of rhetoric, with instruments answering each other in short comic gestures. Dynamics are employed for a sudden, surprise element, changing every few bars, almost as though the voices are declaiming wildly one moment and whispering the next. The playful gestures together with
this exaggerated expression create a humorous effect, as can be seen from bar 58 of the opening Allegro of his wind quartet in Figure 8.

Figure 8. Françaix 1933, Quatuor à Vents Allegro, 58-64

In Françaix’s wind quintet each part has been written to emphasize the distinct qualities of each instrument. This can be seen in the flute and oboe’s bird-like gestures in their upper registers, the sinuous melodies of the clarinet, the bassoon’s characteristic staccato accompaniment providing a secure downbeat, and the horn’s juxtaposition of serious, stately themes with muted and flutter tongued sections that are reminiscent of the laughter of a naughty school boy. In the final movement, titled Tempo di Marcia francese, the flute and clarinet establish the harmonic basis with a constant, rapid semiquaver triplet motif over which the oboe and horn share a rather disjointed melody, seen in Figure 9.

Figure 9. Françaix 1948, Quintette à Vent No. 1 Tempo di Marcia francese, 1-8.
Many question and answer phrases between voices can be seen toward the end of the wind quintet as shown in Figure 10. The semiquaver triplet motif that features predominantly throughout the final movement transforms into a final *pianississimo* utterance to end the piece, perfectly illustrating Françaix’s comic timing of gestures.

These examples show that the interplay of voices is an important aspect to be considered when performing Françaix’s flute works. The interpretation of the individual, yet simultaneously co-dependent line, is important in effectively portraying the character of Françaix’s music. In a neoclassical sense, Françaix is returning to classical contrapuntal technique through his constant interaction between voices, creating the effect of a conversation. However, problems arise in expressing this dialogue clearly throughout Françaix’s music.

**Figure 10. Françaix Quintette à Vent No. 1 Tempo di Marcia francese, 249-end**
Françaix’s scores are highly detailed, which can be visually daunting to the performer. His compositions are littered with specific dynamic markings which often change suddenly, every type of accent imaginable, placed on or off the beat for the desired effect, and frequent changes in mood and tempo. Wilson Coker has identified similarities between the criteria for a linguistic system and a musical composition. He supports the notion that both comprise of a complex set of symbols which can be interpreted by members of the linguistic community and that both possess a syntax ordering, connecting and combining complex symbol structures. (Coker 1972, 127) With this assumption, it is simply a matter of becoming intimately acquainted with Françaix’s scores to fully understand his often-exaggerated musical language. These examples show Françaix’s compositional devices in portraying conversation between instruments and the mostly humorous nature of this dialogue.

A quarter of Françaix’s compositions were written for wind instruments. Over forty of these involve the flute, either as a prominent solo instrument or in a chamber music setting. Geoffrey Thomason writes in sleeve notes to a recording of Françaix’s *Quintette à Vent No 1*.

> In a country where writing for wind instruments is virtually a national pastime, Françaix has been more generous than most French composers in contributing to their repertoire. (Thomason 1993)

What is surprising is that Françaix was himself a pianist. His idiomatic writing for each instrument he composed for, to which his flute repertoire attests, shows his immense versatility and craftsmanship as a composer.

The interpretation of rhetoric in Françaix’s writing heightens the emotions expressed in his music, which are perpetuated by virtual conversations between instruments. It is important to highlight individual voices for the effect of rhetoric, and emphasize the constantly changing moods of melancholy and humour evident in Françaix’s music. Taking these ideas into account allows the performer to apply new and different interpretations than perhaps might have been adopted in the first instance. The performance of Françaix’s music ultimately assists with the act of conversing with one’s instrument, giving the ability to communicate and evoke an emotional response from the audience.

References


Ruppe, Elizabeth Ambler. May 1996. “Form and tonality as elements of Neo-classicism in two works of Jean Françaix: Divertimento pour flûte et piano (1955) and Suite pour flûte seule (1963) with three recitals of selected works of Mozart, Widor, Feld, Muczynski and others.” DMA, University of North Texas.


Of all the musical genres in the Western tradition, few are as sketchily captured in notation as Italian recitativo semplice (simple, or ‘secco’ recitative) of the late seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Singers approaching this repertoire face significant challenges in interpreting the written pitches and rhythms, but even more in dealing with the essential elements of vocal performance that are not directly indicated in the surviving scores at all, including dynamic, articulation and timbre. There is also strikingly little concrete guidance on these topics in contemporary Italian treatises on singing, of which the most thoroughgoing and influential were those of Pier Francesco Tosi (1654-1732) and Giambattista Mancini (1714-1800). (Tosi 1723; Mancini 1777) It may therefore seem reasonable to assume that the vocal performance practice of recitative is of necessity largely a matter of intuition and personal interpretation, based on the pitch contours, rhythms and harmonies notated in the score. It is, however, both constraining and, paradoxically, liberating to realize that there are general principles in the early modern literature that make it possible to go beyond the musical notation alone, and suggest what the broader parameters of appropriate recitative performance practice were understood to be.

As I have argued elsewhere (Maddox 2005, 2009), principles for applying all of these ‘intangible’ elements of delivery in performance are to be found in the tradition of classical rhetoric, which was central to grammar school education throughout early modern Europe. These principles were governed by the “Virtues of Delivery”, codified by the late Roman rhetorician Quintilian in the eighth book of his Institutio oratoria, (Quintilian 1920-2, XIII.i-iii) on the model of the four virtues of rhetorical style identified by Cicero in his De Oratore: puritas (correctness), perspicuitas (clarity or lucidity), habilitas or decorum (appropriateness) and ornatus (speaking with distinction). These categories, or variants of them, were also adopted by early modern rhetoricians such as the influential Jesuit pedagogue Cypriano

1 Some theorists included a fifth virtue of style called enargia (Greek) or evidentia (Latin) meaning ‘vividness’, or the quality of ‘bringing before the eyes’, especially emotionally. Quintilian includes this quality under ornatus: see VIII. iii. 61.
2 Cicero’s formulation is mentioned first in passing in De oratore at I. 144, and set out in detail at III. 37b-55. I have here used the English equivalents for Cicero’s Latin terms suggested by James May and Jakob Wisse in their annotated translation of De oratore (Cicero 2001), as more accurately conveying the sense of Cicero’s Latin in modern English than do terms such as purity, perspicuity, ornateness and aptness which are used in many older translations.
Soarez (1524–1593), whose De arte rhetorica was widely used as a text book throughout Catholic Europe for over a century. (Soarez 1569)

The virtues of purity, clarity and ornateness are fundamental for good declamation, but the main focus of this paper is on the most important virtue of all: decorum, or appropriateness. The quality of appropriateness is a key consideration in delivery as it is in rhetoric as a whole, since it provides the fundamental principles which underpin the other Virtues.

The Virtues of Delivery were transmitted in early modern rhetorics, and are also reflected in early modern writing about performance generally, and about recitative delivery in particular. They thus provide a framework for understanding the qualities of good recitative delivery – including the management of its unnotated elements – as they were understood in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries; not in the sense of setting down definitive rules about how fast, slow, loud, soft, harsh or sweet the voice should sound, but rather by providing a set of flexible general principles that governed what good delivery was understood to be. To clarify how this works, let us first review some of the key discussions of decorum in classical and early modern literature on oratory, acting and singing, and then evaluate their implications for recitative performance practice.

**Decorum**

Broadly, decorum deals with the orator’s adaptation of all aspects of a speech to take into account the context in which it is given, including the subject and purpose of the speech, as well as the character of the speaker and of the audience. As a virtue of delivery, decorum is expressed primarily through the principal of variety of expression. It is no coincidence that the distinguished singing teacher Mancini praised the great singers of the previous generation by saying that they were distinguished by “their varied, tasteful and appropriate styles”. (Mancini 1777)³ In declamation, it is decorum which determines the way the parameters of vocal delivery – rhythm, dynamic, timbre and pitch – are to be varied in order to convey the drama tastefully, expressively and movingly.

Appropriateness also demands that the performer adapt his or her delivery to the role being played, and convey both the nature of the character and their responses to the circumstances of the plot. The audience being addressed must be taken into account at two levels: there are the other characters to whom the performer’s speeches are addressed on the stage, but also

---

³ My translation. Where possible, I have used published English translations if they accurately convey the meaning of the original. Where necessary, I have adapted a translation, or newly translated a passage to clarify the meaning of a particular term or concept in its context. Materials for which I have not located a published translation are newly translated.
the real audience in the auditorium, whose expectations will depend on a whole range of factors, each of which may affect aspects of delivery. For example, is the performance for a court or a commercial theatre? Is the King present? How large or small is the theatre, the orchestra, the audience? Then there is the ‘audience’ addressed by the character on the stage: Who is the character being addressed? In what time & place? And what way of speaking will be most convincing to him or her?

A constant equality

A corollary of adapting delivery appropriately to the circumstances and subject matter, though, is that there should be a degree of consistency of delivery within a given passage unless a change is called for by the meaning of the words. Quintilian thus begins his discussion of the virtues of delivery by setting out the requirement for evenness (aequalitas).

(Quintilian 1920–2) This general principle would appear to be as valid for recitative as it is for spoken oratory. Within any one passage which maintains a similar mood and dramatic function, there should not be sudden changes of pace, volume or vocal tone unless for a specific expressive purpose which clearly arises from the words. Thus, while variety was highly valued, incongruous or excessive variation was considered a distraction which detracts from expression rather than enhancing it. It is thus inappropriate and lacking in decorum.

Delivery adapted to the circumstances

What, then, constitutes appropriate delivery? Just as the audience must be taken into account at two levels – both on the stage and in the auditorium – the same applies to the singer-actor, who must exhibit decorum in delivery at two levels: as the character portrayed, but also in their own person as the actor playing a role. Since the characters in dramma per musica (musical drama, or serious opera) are almost exclusively of the nobility, people who, in the idealized world of artistic imitatio, always behave appropriately to their station, the appropriate and thus verisimilar way to impersonate them is to demonstrate princely decorum in one’s stage delivery. Decorum is thus central to Tosi’s definition of the theatrical style, which being always accompanied with Action by the Singer, the Master is obliged to teach the Scholar a certain natural Imitation, which cannot be beautiful, if not expressed with that Decorum with which Princes speak, or those who know how to speak to Princes. (Tosi 1743)

Mancini reminded aspiring opera singers that this kind of decorous delivery consists in convincingly uniting voice and stage action, which in turn depends on understanding the poetry and the character being portrayed.
So that the action be well adapted to the words and person, the actor ought to understand to the bottom [a fondo] everything he says, and should understand the very particular character of the personage he represents, otherwise he may make errors which will be embarrassing. (Mancini 1967)

What these embarrassing breaches of decorum might look like was sharply captured by the satirical pen of Benedetto Marcello (1686-1739):

If the part of the cantatrice [singer] requires her to have some other character put in chains while she is singing an aria addressed to him expressing disdain or fury, she should use the preceding ritornello to chat with her victim, to giggle, and to point out to him some friends in one of the boxes. …For the words “dearest”, “my own”, or “my life”, she will turn towards the prompter, the bear, or some extra. (Marcello 1948)

A pleasing variety of pronunciation, according to the diversity of the subject

Having taken into account the intrinsic and extrinsic circumstances of the performance, the character being portrayed and the dramatic situation, decorum next requires the singer-actor to adapt his or her delivery aptly to the specific subject matter of the poetry, a subject which occupies almost all of Tosi’s chapter on recitative. Just as Quintilian specified in relation to oratory, the most basic step in performing recitative is to understand what the words are about, and to identify the overall mood of the passage correctly. As Tosi famously advised singing masters,

If you know not that the Recitatives … require those instructions relative to the Force of the Words, … your Scholars will … be made a Sacrifice to Ignorance and, not knowing how to distinguish the Lively from the Pathetick, or the Vehement from the Tender, it will be no wonder if you see them stupid on the Stage, and senseless in a Chamber. (Tosi 1743)

The voice will ring as passion strikes its chords.

Variety was valued in a general sense for its ability to engage the flagging spirits of both audience and performer and avoid monotony, and for its value in delineating the circumstances and subject matter of the recitation, but its ultimate value is expressive. The intimate connection between vocal variation and apt expression of the words and the thoughts and emotions (concetti and affetti) they contain is evident throughout the rhetorical, theatrical
and musical literature of classical antiquity and of the early modern period. It is a recurring theme for Quintilian:

> appropriate delivery \([\text{apta pronuntiatio}]\) … lies in the adaptation of the delivery to the subjects on which we are speaking. This quality is, in the main, supplied by the emotions themselves, and the voice will ring as passion strikes its chords. (Quintilian 1920-2)

The ability of the speaker to stir up the emotions of the audience thus depends on his ability to conjure them up in his own voice. Doing this requires the orator to cultivate a wide expressive range.

> [The orator] will speak gravely, severely, sharply, with vehemence, energy, fullness, bitterness, or geniality, quietly, simply, flatteringly, gently, sweetly, briefly or wittily … Thus the purpose for which oratory was above all designed will be secured, that is to say, he will speak with profit and with power to effect his aim. (Quintilian 1920-2)

The indebtedness of early modern rhetoric to its classical models is clearly reflected in the treatment of affective delivery, particularly with the rise of the emotive, ‘operational’ style of baroque rhetoric (Conley 1990). The Neapolitan corago Andrea Perrucci (1651-1704), for example, required that in acting

> the voice must not always be the same, but must change according to the movements and passions of the soul … [W]ith various sounds one seeks to move the affections of the audience. (Perrucci 1961)

This was clearly also Tosi’s position in relation to recitative, although he unfortunately set out no detailed instructions about how good text expression is to be done, focusing instead on the transgressions against those principles that are to be heard in the theatre. Some singers, he says,

> through trying too hard make a barking sound; some [sing it] as if telling a secret … some do not understand it, and some do not make it understood: some as if begging, some disdainful; some speak it dopily, and some devour it: Some sing it through the teeth,

---

4 “Non deve la Voce esser sempre la stessa, ma bisogna mutarla, secondo i moti, e passioni dell’animo.”
and others with affectation; some do not pronounce it, and some do not express it; some laugh it, and some cry it; some speak it, and some hiss it; some shriek, some shout … (Tosi 1723) (My translation based on. (Tosi 1743)

The overriding issue which connects all of these faulty ways of performing recitative is their inappropriateness – their undermining of decorum in theatrical delivery through inept expression of the words, or through the use of sounds that go outside the norms of artistic declamation. What Tosi considers those norms to be may be inferred from their opposite faults: Declaim neither so loudly that the voice is strained nor too softly to be heard; enunciate clearly and express the meaning and affective content of the words with a range of sounds varied enough to maintain interest but not extending to ugliness of tone.

The influence of the affections is also fundamental to Mancini’s concept of recitative. Recitative, he says, should be composed in such a way as to “perfectly imitate a natural discourse” with all of its punctuation and expression. Delivery reinforces the affective expression written in by the poet and composer on the model of the orator, who varies his voice “according to the various passions that he wishes to stir in the listener.”(Mancini 1777)

Decorum thus had a pervasive influence on the way recitativo semplice was conceived as both composition and performance. In fact, it is ultimately this rhetorical principle – of apt expression of the subject matter and its conceptual and affective content – which underlies the preoccupation in seventeenth and eighteenth-century music with the expression of the affections as both a defining element of style in composition and as a virtue of delivery. The detailed translation of this expressive variety into the specific sound parameters of recitative vocalization – rhythm, dynamic, timbre and pitch – represents the practical application of the general principles set out here, but the overriding principle which governs all expression in recitative is that of decorum.5

Conclusions

There is substantial agreement between classical and early modern sources on oratory, acting and singing about the nature of decorum, which was understood as appropriate adaptation of delivery to the circumstances, particularly of character (of the actor and the character played), audience (both real and in the drama) and dramatic situation. In practice this means that voice and action should be varied, both to avoid monotony and for expression of the drama and its affective states, as dictated by the words. Variety of voice includes variation of pacing,

5 For an analysis of recitative delivery on rhetorical principles in a scene from Handel’s Tamerlano, see (Maddox 2012)
inflection, stress, articulation, volume and timbre. At the same time, variety is to be
counterbalanced by evenness (fluency, avoidance of exaggeration and incongruous effects),
and the requirement to avoid anything distasteful. Voice and action must also be aptly
matched.
At first glance these guidelines may seem like mere common sense: make sure you
understand the meaning of the words and express them. But what is the most appropriate way
to express the words? If we follow Mancini in understanding recitative as declamation, rather
than song, appropriately expressive variety becomes easier to conceptualize. The voice can
be thought of as being used with subtle flexibility, as a dramatic actor would do, with the
balance more towards variety and less towards evenness than is usual in artistic singing
today, whether in the ‘mainstream’ operatic tradition or amongst singers trained in
historically informed performance practice.
At the same time, the overall boundaries of variety in seventeenth and eighteenth-century
recitative declamation may well have been no wider than those often heard in performances
today, but within that range, the evidence suggests that delivery was more nuanced. That is,
in delivering recitative, good singers probably did not take as their starting point a default
setting of beautiful sung sound, occasionally interrupted with harsh timbre or dynamic
contrast as a special effect, but rather, spontaneously drew on the full range of tasteful
timbres, dynamics, articulations and variations of pace that were also used in spoken
declamation, applying them with microsecond-to-microsecond responsiveness to the
interaction of the words, the dramatic situation and the musical prosody of the basso
continuo. This is not to suggest that the recitative delivery of all singers today is deficient or
misguided, indeed many perform with considerable expression and decorum; however the
guidelines provided by the rhetorical tradition, and in particular by Quintilian’s concept of
the Virtues of Delivery, offer some more systematic criteria which can inform this endeavour.
It is also worth noting that to achieve this subtle flexibility of delivery while maintaining
projection and stamina, good recitative performance requires a vocal technique in some
respects sounder than that required for ordinary singing. This makes it daunting to learn and
challenging to teach, but nevertheless a worthy challenge. Although commentators such as
Marcello and Tosi made it clear that decorum was often honoured as much in the breach as in
the observance, the principles advocated in the early modern period can be equally useful in
making sense of this repertoire for modern audiences by building an internally coherent
musico-dramatic world.
References

This paper focuses on the work of Shinichi Suzuki as a music editor, and is concerned with the connection between his editing and the work and attitudes of several 19th and early 20th century virtuoso violinist-editors. It draws upon James Grier’s observation that the circumstances and background under which an editor (Grier 1996, 20) or performer-editor operates “are sure to be reflected in the editions they will prepare”. (Grier 1996, 152) Sources for this investigation include Suzuki’s editions as well as attitudes recorded in his commentaries on the editions, his semi-autobiographical works and research undertaken by third parties into the Suzuki Violin Method. The latter texts are not entirely free of problems whether, as David Blum notes, they stem from issues of translation, (Blum 1989, 1066-1071) or as Murray Perkins implies, and Margaret Mehl notes, from a certain determination by some researchers, critics and historians to emphasize the non-Western features of the Suzuki Violin Method, rather than a willingness to acknowledge the Western musical inheritance which underpins the Method and its repertoire. (Murray Perkins 1995, 41-46; Mehl 2009) Today, while Shinichi Suzuki (1898-1998) is regarded first and foremost as a music educator, his work is perhaps most widely known within music circles through his output as a music-editor in compiling, editing and revising the ten volumes of *Suzuki Violin School*. These ten volumes include, for example, Mozart’s Violin Concerto in D major (K.218) and Violin Concerto in A major (K.219), Bach’s violin concerto in A minor (BWV 1041), Vivaldi’s violin concerti in A minor (RV 356) and G minor (RV 317), several sonatas by Handel, Veracini’s Sonata in E minor (Op.2 No.8) and Corelli’s *La Folia* Op.5 No.12. Suzuki’s editions generate a certain amount of controversy. While they attract interest from performers and educators for their ‘teaching points’, to date they have received little scholarly discussion in relation to musical and editorial style in particular, beyond occasional derision (Behrend 1998, 32, 33, 36) regardless of whether the appraisals have come from outside or within the Suzuki Method movement itself. For example, Adrian Eales in the *Cambridge Companion to the Violin*, protests that in Suzuki’s editions “every bar...is ponderously edited”. (Eales 2004, 117) Louise Behrend, an American who holds a high profile position within the Suzuki
Method worldwide, suggests that Suzuki’s editions are ‘okay’ until volume four, but that the pieces in later volumes are widely available in other, ‘better’ editions, though the criteria for Behrend’s designation of an edition as better is unclear. (Behrend 1998, 32, 33, 36) While the pedagogical imperative is an obvious and often discussed factor in Suzuki’s editorial practices, Suzuki’s editions go far beyond what is required for the technical development of students. Most notably, Suzuki’s editions provided a high level of detail regarding performance intentions throughout all works, as well as detailed editing indications and notes (including the historical background for many of his editorial choices). This is most prominent with regard to advanced-level works such as Mozart’s violin concerti and Mendelssohn’s violin concerto for which it is expected that students will exercise artistic freedom to interpret and make, in effect, editorial choices regarding their interpretation. Suzuki’s editions have also been variously challenged and defended both internationally and within the Suzuki Method movement in Australia, specifically on whether or not they reflect historically informed performance practices, and/or represent the composers’ wishes as embodied in an authoritative score. (Coward 2010, 74-75) Particular examples are Vivaldi’s Concerto in A minor (RV 356) and Concerto in G minor (RV 317) where more critical readings of the works are widely available and perhaps more accepted. The evaluations of Suzuki’s editions, however, differ widely. Alfred Garson, a high-profile member of the Suzuki Method movement in the U.S.A., for example, criticizing the edition of Vivaldi’s Concerto in A minor RV 356 in the *Suzuki Violin School* on the basis that “it’s not the original Concerto as Vivaldi wrote it”. (Garson 2001, 77) In contrast, Kerstin Wartberg, the Director of the Deutsche Suzuki Institut, defends the version as “one example of how violinists can realize this concerto”. (Wartberg 2007) Wartberg notes that some degree of realization is an inescapable aspect of studying and performing these works. (Wartberg 2007) To an extent, the desire for fidelity to composers’ wishes evident in these criticisms is supported by Suzuki’s own writings and instructions for the revision of the *Suzuki Violin School* volumes 1-10, (Suzuki Association of the Americas, 2008). It should not be assumed, however, that Suzuki generally believed that an editor should follow the composer’s instructions as contained in a score, or as implied in historically informed performance practices. Nor should it be assumed that Suzuki felt that the editor should even necessarily give preference to the composer’s intentions over those of other members of the creative process such as performers and editors. Alfred Garson expresses an apparent frustration that while Suzuki espoused respect for the composer, it did not necessarily translate into his editorial willingness to closely follow the composer’s work or to adopt findings from recent
scholarship into a composers’ works into his editions, even when pressure to do so came from within the Suzuki Method movement. (Garson 2001, 77)

Unlike critical editions where the primary aim is, according to scholar James Grier, to “transmit the text that best represents the historical evidence of the sources,” (Grier 1996, 151) Suzuki’s editions may be seen, rather, to belong firmly within the tradition of interpretative editions. (Grier 1996, 10, 151-155) According to Grier, interpretative editions are “repositories of information about the performance and interpretation of the work,” (Grier 1996, 151) often recording aspects of performing style of important performers and communicating this to students and to the performer-editor’s peers and colleagues. (Grier 1996, 151)

Suzuki’s own background as a violinist provides insights into factors that influenced Suzuki’s attitudes towards editing, his connection to 19th and early 20th century violin practice and in particular the virtuoso violinist, editor and pedagogue Joseph Joachim (1831-1907). Shinichi Suzuki was born in Nagoya, Japan, on 17 October 1898, into the increasingly Western influenced environment of early modern Japan. His father, Masakichi, had founded the Suzuki Violin Factory in Nagoya in 1900, and Shinichi Suzuki grew up surrounded by violins. Although it had not been Suzuki’s initial intention to become a musician, (Suzuki 1978, 38) after four years of self-guided study during his late teens (Landers 1984, 1) Suzuki travelled to Tokyo and studied violin with Ko Ando (1878-1963) who was a former student of the 19th century violin virtuoso and pedagogue, Joseph Joachim. (Landers 1984, 1)

Suzuki’s own musical journey reflected the historical connections between Japan and Germany in the late 19th and early 20th centuries, when he travelled to Germany in 1921 to further his study. (Mehl 2009) He remained in Germany for eight years, studying violin under the respected performer Karl Klingler (1879-1970) who, like Ko Ando, was also a former pupil of Joseph Joachim. (Oliver and Borchard 2001, 127, 128; Garson 2001, 154) With Klingler, who was first and foremost a performer, the initial four years of Suzuki’s violin studies were devoted to concertos and sonatas, and the next (and final) four years to chamber music. (Suzuki 1978, 84) Klingler, says Suzuki, did not teach him so much about technique, but rather about interpretation and the real essence of music... He would look for the roots underlying a man and his art... I learned from Klingler the essence of what art truly is. (Suzuki 1978, 82-84)

In Berlin, in 1928, Suzuki recorded with the pianist Manfred Gurlitt, Franck’s Sonata in A major for violin and piano; the UK’s Symposium label recently re-released this recording on
CD, in conjunction with three other recordings made in 1928 by the virtuoso violinists Enesco, Thibaud and Francescati. (Franck 1928) Also in 1928, Suzuki returned to Japan to perform as a violin soloist, and formed the Suzuki Quartet (a string quartet) with his three younger brothers in 1929. (Hermann 1981, 19) Alongside Suzuki’s ongoing activities as a performer and recording artist, the 1930s saw the beginning of Suzuki’s teaching career, in Japan at the Imperial Conservatory, (Hermann 1981, 19) and the start of him developing the Suzuki Violin Method for which he became internationally known in the 1960s and 1970s in particular.

Suzuki passed away in 1998, a few months before his 100th birthday. Although we are perhaps prone, therefore, to think of him as a violinist of our times he should, one may suggest, be more properly thought of as a violinist and pedagogue with his artistic lineage and editorial roots and attitudes firmly rooted in European violin history and the work and performance practices of 19th and early 20th century violinists. Suzuki himself reinforces the importance of this lineage, saying “we should always appreciate and carefully study what has been recommended by Joachim, a great musician of profound and varied attainments.” (Suzuki, 1975, 40)

This 19th and early 20th century period is, as scholar David Milsom has illustrated, associated with virtuoso performers playing an overtly creative, and often compositional role in the process of music making (within which one may include editing). (Milsom 2003) Joseph Joachim, for example, said that the intentions of the composer should be respected but he also qualified this by condemning parrot-like slavishness to the letter of the score; (Milsom 2003, 199) a view which finds resonance in Suzuki’s own attitudes towards editing.

On a practical level, a marked connection to 19th and early 20th century violin practice and the work of virtuoso performer-editors of this period in Suzuki’s attitude towards editing, may be seen for example in relation to the aforementioned Vivaldi’s Concerto in A minor (RV 356), Vivaldi’s Concerto in G minor (RV 317) and Corelli’s La Folia Op.5 No.12. Significantly, these pieces provide insights into Suzuki’s attitudes towards editing relatively unencumbered by influences such as the need to accommodate a different instrument’s capabilities (i.e. transcriptions) or a discrepancy between the original work and the technical ability of students.

In the Suzuki Violin School edition of Vivaldi’s Concerto in A minor (RV 356) and Concerto in G minor (RV 317) Suzuki presents the version for violin and piano realized by Hungarian virtuoso violinist Tivadar Nachez (1829-1930), a student of Joseph Joachim. A comparison between Suzuki’s and Nachez’s (original) 1912 Schott publications (Vivaldi “Tividar” 1912;
Vivaldi “Vivaldi”, 1912) indicates on a compositional level that Suzuki adopted Nachez’s version without change, and made minimal changes to interpretational elements such as bowing and fingering. As such, in keeping with Nachez’s edition, the solo violin lines are significantly re-worked and the orchestral lines of each Concerti transformed into the respective piano accompaniments with the accompaniments centred not on the reduction, nor mere harmonic realization of the score _per se_. Rather, as Nachez says, like the solo violin part itself the accompaniment is “freely treated from old Manuscripts and constitutes an original work”. (B. Schott’s Sohne. 1912, 1) Comprehensive and extensive examples of liberal editorial treatment are readily observable in a comparison between Nachez/Suzuki’s editions and both the recent authoritative editions published by Ricordi and, with regard to RV 356, the first edition of the Concerto published in 1711.

Regardless of whether the impetus to use Nachez’s edition came from Klingler’s use of this version to instruct Suzuki, as Garson suggests, it appears doubtful that Suzuki would have retained this edition in the _Suzuki Violin School_ on this basis alone. Indeed, Suzuki maintained his decision to use Nachez’s edition despite pressure, often from within the Suzuki Method movement, to update the editions to be more ‘accurate’ with regard to modern scholarship on Vivaldi’s works; (Garson 2001, 77) a choice which suggests that, in keeping with 19th and early 20th century violin practices, Suzuki believed that the performer and/or editor could/should play a major creative and compositional role, alongside the composer.

Support for this understanding is apparent throughout the _Suzuki Violin School_ editions, and in particular in the edition of Corelli’s _La Folia_ Op.5 No.12 upon which Suzuki places his own name as arranger, alongside Corelli’s as composer. In comparison to the 1710 edition published by Rogers in Amsterdam, which contains Corelli’s own ornaments, (Corelli 1710) _La Folia_, as it is presented in the _Suzuki Violin School_ edition, differs significantly from the original version. It has been extensively re-arranged and edited by Suzuki for violin and pianoforte. Suzuki’s editorial decisions operate on three principal levels: realization of the piano accompaniment, re-structuring of Corelli’s original layout of the sections, and interpretational aspects of dynamics, articulation and ornamentation.

Most obviously, Suzuki’s sections largely follow the order of the Rogers edition with some re-ordering, omissions and new variations. However, the layout of sections created by Corelli’s theme and variations form on a ground is edited by Suzuki from the original twenty-four sections (comprising the theme and 23 variations) found in the 1710 Rogers edition, down to a total fourteen sections (comprising the theme and 13 variations) in the _Suzuki_
Violin School edition (compared on the basis of the violin line) [see Table 1].

Table 1: La Folia: correlation between the Suzuki Violin School and Estienne Rogers editions (violin part)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Suzuki Violin School Vol.6</th>
<th>Corelli (Amsterdam, Estienne Rogers, c.1710)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1(^1) (violin) / 8 (bass line)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Ferdinand David addition-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>24 with Hubert Leonard’s alternative finale replacing the violin line</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Regarding the connection between Suzuki’s editorial practices and the work of nineteenth and early twentieth century virtuoso violinist-editors, Suzuki’s sections 9 and 14 are of particular note. These appear to be absent from Corelli’s original work (Rogers edition). However, Suzuki’s section 9 corresponds to bb.190-198 of a Breitkopf and Härtel edition arranged and edited by the nineteenth-century virtuoso, Ferdinand David, while Suzuki’s final variation (section 14) in the Suzuki Violin School appears as a “cadenza for the concert stage” (Corelli 1931, 5) in Hubert Leonard’s arrangement of La Folia, published c.1931 by C.F. Peters and edited by Max Jacobsen. It is unclear whether these features are the result of Suzuki borrowing directly from these performers or, for example, the editions of both Suzuki and these performers derive from a common earlier edition.

\(^1\) The violin is a modified repeat section 1 while the violoncello of section 8 is the basis of the piano part
The attitude towards editing demonstrated in the preceding examples, the connection to the work of nineteenth and early twentieth-century virtuoso violinist-editors and the historically associated attitude towards performer-editors playing an overtly creative and often compositional role appear to have been a consistent feature of Suzuki’s editions, and informed his views as an editor as well as performer and pedagogue. Suzuki says,  

Virtuosos’ brilliant performances are the result of many years’ persevering efforts...one of the surest ways to improve is to study excellent performances... by constantly studying virtuosos’ recordings. (Suzuki 1976)

On a more personal level Suzuki himself cites numerous performers and pedagogues of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries as influencing him as a performer, teacher and editor. Suzuki notes, for example, three performers of the early twentieth century, Fritz Kreisler, Jacques Thibaud and Pablo Casals as having a marked influence upon him. Kreisler holds pride of place for Suzuki. Suzuki also cites, particularly in relation to his editions of Mozart’s Concerti in D major (K.218) and A major (K.219), the violinist-editor-pedagogues Joseph Joachim, Pierre Rode (1774-1830) and, as one may expect, Suzuki’s teacher Karl Klingler, as major influences. (Suzuki 1975; Suzuki 1976) Suzuki also provides explanations of the connection between his own editing decisions and the performances, editions and scholarly work of these earlier performers and pedagogues, including an appraisal of the merits of aspects such as their recommended fingering. (Suzuki 1975; Suzuki 1976)

As already noted, despite Suzuki’s extensive work in compiling and editing violin repertoire, little scholarly attention has been paid to this aspect, to date. By building upon current and ongoing research into the Suzuki Method it is hoped that a more detailed study of the relationship between Suzuki as a violinist-performer and his role as an interpretative editor will add to a reappraisal of Suzuki’s editions.

References


Part 3. Kindling and re-Kindling nationalistic sentiments

Introduction
The HMAS Sydney II was the pride of the Royal Australian Navy’s (RAN) fleet at the start of World War II. She disappeared with all hands off the coast of Western Australia in November 1941. The fate of the ship and her 645 crewmen became one of Australia’s greatest maritime mysteries. On board the Sydney were 12 RAN musicians. Little is known about this band, other than the member’s names, ranks and serial numbers. This paper aims to explore the work of these musicians. It focuses on the RAN’s recruiting policies towards HMAS Sydney’s band, and how the experiences of bandsmen in the lead up to and during World War II bought about changes in these policies.

The band aboard HMAS Sydney II was a 12-piece Royal Australian Navy (RAN) ensemble capable of performing as a wind band, string ensemble and dance band. Although membership of the band changed over time, it served from the ship’s commission in 1935 until it sank in 1941. The band performed at a range of functions, both onboard ship and in port, including church and military ceremonies, parades, concerts, dances and diplomatic functions. The band also played informal concerts below deck, aimed at entertaining sailors and improving morale during long weeks at sea.

The 1930s was a period of rapid expansion in RAN bands. In 1930 the RAN had just two bands, one on the flagship HMAS Australia and one at Flinders Naval Depot (FND, now HMAS Cerberus outside Melbourne). By 1939 this increased to six fulltime plus seven Naval Reserve Bands as the number of ships was increased in the lead up to war (RAN 1938). Work in RAN bands provided steady, fulltime-performing work for musicians. Despite this and the fact that Sydney’s band was recruited at the height of the depression, the RAN struggled to find recruits for these positions. This study focuses on how the RAN’s band recruiting policies for the Sydney discouraged musicians from joining or staying in the service and how the experiences of this and other RAN bands led to a change in these policies after World War II.

Background
HMAS Sydney II was a Leander Class Light Cruiser. (Mearns 2009, 4) At the outbreak of war in 1939 she was stationed in the Mediterranean as part of the British fleet. During the early period of World War II she became the pride of the Australian fleet after defeating
much larger ships. In January 1941 the Sydney was recalled to Australia in response to fears of war in the Pacific. (Mearns 2009, 18) The Sydney’s crew returned to a hero’s welcome and spent the year convoying troops and supplies around Australia, Indonesia and the Pacific. Compared to the battles they had fought in the Mediterranean, it was safe, easy work. (Olson 2002, 30)

In November 1941 the Sydney, with 645 crewmembers onboard, was on a routine mission from the Sunda Strait to Fremantle. They were maintaining radio silence and were behind schedule, so when they failed to return, no alarm was raised. Soon German sailors from the raider Kormoran began to wash up on the Western Australian coast, claiming to have fought the Sydney. (Mearns 2009, 45) They had last seen the Sydney on the horizon, low in the water. A search was commenced, but her crew was never heard from again.

The Kormoran was small enough to be disguised as a Dutch merchant vessel. It seemed inconceivable to the Australian public that this small ship could sink the pride of the nation’s fleet. Conspiracy theories abounded (Samuels 2005): Were the crew shipwrecked somewhere on an island? Was there a larger German vessel nearby, or a Japanese submarine? Had Japan secretly declared war? Had survivors been taken prisoner or shot in the water? These questions went unanswered until the wrecks of both the Sydney and Kormoran was found more than 60 years later in 2008. (Mearns 2009, Blenkin 2009, Dodd 2009) The disappearance of the Sydney brought the realities of war to the Australian home front. For the first time Australians realized their isolation did not protect them. Eighteen days later, Japan attacked Pearl Harbour and the War in the Pacific had begun in earnest.

Among the 645 men killed on the Sydney was an ensemble of 12 musicians. Little is known about them, other than names, ranks and serial numbers. (Figure 1)

Figure 1. The HMAS Sydney Band Members (Finding Sydney Foundation 2008).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Serial Number</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Desmond Henry Lewis</td>
<td>Bandsman</td>
<td>22904</td>
<td>NSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angas Campbell McAulay</td>
<td>Band Corporal</td>
<td>17244</td>
<td>NSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percy E V Melandri</td>
<td>Bandsman</td>
<td>8899</td>
<td>NSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Dillon Mulhall</td>
<td>Bandsman</td>
<td>19624</td>
<td>NSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leslie Warburton Partington</td>
<td>Bandsman</td>
<td>22696</td>
<td>NSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fredrick Charles Pelham</td>
<td>Bandsman</td>
<td>21822</td>
<td>TAS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alfred Herbert Wesley Pople</td>
<td>Band Corporal</td>
<td>16119</td>
<td>NSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George William Sawbridge</td>
<td>Bandsman</td>
<td>20640</td>
<td>NSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ernest Victor Lloyd Stear</td>
<td>Bandmaster</td>
<td>19523</td>
<td>VIC (UK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horace John Stevens</td>
<td>Bandsman</td>
<td>21511</td>
<td>TAS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles Desmond Tyler</td>
<td>Bandsman</td>
<td>22622</td>
<td>VIC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vincent Warren</td>
<td>Bandsman</td>
<td>22985</td>
<td>VIC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There are little surviving ephemera like concert programs and photographs of the band because most of these documents went down with the ship. The most comprehensive surviving documents are naval communications held at the National Archives of Australia (NAA) and the Australian War Memorial (AWM). The following research is based on these documents.

Photo 1. The band on board ship, source: AWM.

One of the best available pictures of the Sydney Band shows it standing beneath the turrets of the rear facing guns, leading the crew in hymns during a church service. The band and crew are in their informal service uniforms and crewmembers are singing from hymnbooks. This photograph is one of a number of images taken from this vantage point at different functions.

---

1 The majority of these documents were marked 'unclassified,' indicating that they had not been viewed by previous researchers.

2 Permission to reproduce this and other photos in this publication has been secured from the Australian War Memorial.
Other photos show the crew in the same position, in formal dress uniforms being addressed by the Captain. In these photographs the band are also in formal dress and accompanied by two unnamed, informal band members, known as Seaman Drummers. Seaman Drummers were regular members of the crew with training in military drumming. They played with the band when a larger percussion section was needed\(^3\). On ships without bands, Seaman Drummers and their counterparts, Seaman Buglers, would provide music and signals for military ceremonies.

On commissioning, the *Sydney* was supplied with sheet music by the British Royal Naval School of Music (RNSM). This included a collection of “National Anthems, Salutes and Official Navy Marches for use in H.M. Navy” and “Naval Ceremonial Music Cards”, both published by the British Admiralty. (RAN 1934-36) The band also purchased “100 selected numbers for library music”. (RAN 1934-36) for £7/5s/9d. (RAN 1935-40) Although there is no record of the nature of these pieces, a similar purchase for HMAS *Cerberus*’ band in 1918 included marches, arrangements of classical and popular pieces and patriotic songs with titles like “Royal Australian Navy”, “Gallipoli” and “Australian Lighthorse”. (RAN 1818-27)

**Recruiting difficulties**

Launched in 1934, (Olson 2002, 3) the *Sydney*’s first voyage commenced in September 1935, taking her from Britain to Australia. Her crew was waiting to meet her, having been sent from Australia on HMAS *Brisbane*. With the rapid expansion of bands after the commissioning of a number of new ships, there were no existing band recruits available for transfer to the new ship. (RAN 1938)

The first recruitment advertisements appeared in August 1934 with the hope that the band could start basic training in January 1935. (RAN 1934-36) They could then board the *Brisbane* on 1 April, and meet the *Sydney* in England in September. By December, one month before the start of training, the RAN had not recruited a single musician, and now required 14 recruits for the twelve-man band. (RAN 1934-36) The extra two musicians were to be added to the ‘wastage pool’ at FND. This new system provided extra musicians at bases, allowing band members to be rotated to shore duty regularly to spend time with family. There was also no one within the RAN qualified to be advanced to Bandmaster, and no mechanisms in place to provide such training. (RAN 1934-36)

Basic training began as scheduled in January 1935, with the band still short a Bandmaster, one Band Corporal, one Bandsman and two wastage. Recruiting continued throughout basic

---

\(^3\) A sailor’s status as Seaman Drummer was not usually mentioned in their military records, making them difficult to identify.
training, with the last Bandsman appointed a week before HMAS Brisbane departed (RAN 1934-36). This Bandsman presumably received little basic training. The Bandmaster’s position was harder to fill, with a British Royal Marines Bandmaster eventually being seconded into the RAN. When the band left to meet Sydney in England, the wastage pool was still short two members, but this would not become an issue until the ship returned to Australia.

Positions in modern military bands are valued as one of most stable, full time, performing jobs available to musicians. The band for the Sydney was recruited during the depression, when work was at a premium, so why was it so hard to find recruits? The RAN was asking for musicians who could double on string and wind instruments, allowing 12 musicians to perform as three ensembles, a ceremonial (wind) band, an orchestral (string) band and a dance band. Figure 2 shows the RAN’s musician recruiting categories for HMAS Sydney. Some categories, such as Bb and A clarinet, doubling on alto saxophone, were relatively common, but others were harder to find. Then, as now, musicians who could play saxophone and violin; tenor cornet, violin and piano; or euphonium and ‘cello were uncommon. The RAN took their categories from the British Royal Navy (RN), however they were not RN recruiting requirements but training requirements (Trendall 1978, 49). RN band recruits undertook training at the RNSM. These categories determined which instrument a new recruit should be allocated as a second study. For example, a tuba player was automatically taught double bass during his training.

**Figure 2. Recruitment Categories, HMAS Sydney (RAN 1934-36)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Musicians</th>
<th>Ceremonial Band</th>
<th>Orchestral Band</th>
<th>Dance Band</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Conductor</td>
<td>Conductor</td>
<td>Conductor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Solo Bb Clarinet</td>
<td>A Clarinet</td>
<td>Eb Alto Saxophone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Solo Bb Clarinet</td>
<td>A Clarinet</td>
<td>Eb Alto Saxophone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Bb Tenor Saxophone</td>
<td>Violin</td>
<td>Bb Tenor Saxophone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Solo Bb Cornet</td>
<td>Solo Bb Cornet</td>
<td>Solo Bb Cornet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Solo Bb Cornet</td>
<td>Viola</td>
<td>Bb Cornet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Bb Cornet</td>
<td>Violin</td>
<td>xxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Eb Tenor Cornet</td>
<td>Violin</td>
<td>Piano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Trombone</td>
<td>Trombone</td>
<td>Trombone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Euphonium</td>
<td>‘Cello</td>
<td>xxx</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
With three months between the start of basic training and the departure of the *Brisbane*, the RAN had no time to teach recruits to play their second study, nor did it have the facilities. While a school of music did exist at FND, it could only help musicians brush up on skills specific to military music including marching and duty calls. In 1935 it did not even have a dedicated music classroom. (RAN 1939-40)

There were also non-musical requirements making recruiting musicians more difficult. Recruits had to be male, aged 17 to 35 and medically and dentally fit. They had to be willing to sign up for a minimum of 12 years, to serve on board ship for long periods of time and work for below minimum wage, with little chance for advancement or pay raise. The average pay raise was 11 pence over 12 years of service. (RAN 1921-39)

Service onboard ship made naval service less appealing to musicians than other branches of the military. Royal Australian Air Force (RAAF) musicians served part time from home bases in Sydney and Melbourne. They were popular with working musicians, especially after the outbreak of war, because they could serve with little risk of being deployed overseas. Band service in the Australian Imperial Force (AIF, now the Australian Regular Army) appealed to the large group of amateur musicians who were members of the Salvation Army. AIF bands were traditionally brass bands as were Salvation Army Bands. The non-musical duties of AIF Bandsmen as medics and stretcher-bearers appealed to the sense of Christian duty encouraged in the church. (Cox 2003, 4-5)

In contrast, RAN musicians saw active duty onboard warships. Their non-musical duties were in fire fighting and in the transmitting station. The dangers involved in fire fighting are obvious, but many band casualties occurred in transmitting stations. They were well below deck, meaning that if a ship was sunk, there was little chance of escape. If orders were given to abandon ship, signalers were required to transmit distress calls as long as possible, giving the ship the best possible chance of rescue. Bandsman Jack Griffith [retired] recalls regularly being locked into his action station from outside, to ensure that he and his colleagues could not leave their posts in the event of the ship being sunk. The British Royal Marine Bands, who had the same duties as their RAN counterparts, lost one in four of their members during World War II, the highest casualty rate of any corps. (Fox 1967, 22)
If the RAN wanted to meet its goal of increasing the size of its band service along with the size of its fleet, it needed to find a way to encourage more musicians to join the navy.

**Long-term Solutions**

Archival documents show that RAN musicians knew about the problems with the navy’s band policy. (RAN 1921-39) With the help of the Lower Deck Welfare Committee (LDWC) musicians had been lobbying for better pay and conditions since 1921. They requested two changes: a decrease in the minimum sign up periods from 12 to five years and an increase in pay rates and rank to make them ‘artisans’. Other ‘artisans’ included carpenters, plumbers and engineers who received extra pay in recognition of their qualifications. Musicians received similar pay rates as untrained cooks and stokers. These requests were denied on the grounds that becoming a skilled musician did not take as much training as becoming a plumber. As an unnamed officer stated in the minutes of a 1930 Department of Defense inquiry, the ability to “play one instrument - cannot be compared with the five year trade apprenticeship”. (RAN 1921-39) This attitude was often repeated by pre-war members of the RAN hierarchy and demonstrates a lack of understanding for the role of bandsmen. They did not refer to ‘being a musician’ as a trade, instead discussing the ‘ability to play an instrument’ as the required skill, ignoring the fact that RAN musicians had to be proficient on multiple instruments, musically literate, able to play in various genres and on the march. It also overlooked skills like conducting, teaching, instrument repair, composing and arranging.

When their original requests were denied on the grounds that being a musician was not a skilled occupation, the LDWC tried another tack. They demonstrated a difference in skill level between musicians, suggesting that in lieu of promotions in rank, regular pay increases would give musicians a career structure and encourage them to not only join the navy, but to stay after their original service period expired. They requested all musicians sit an efficiency test after 6 months, with successful candidates receiving a pay rise, and incremental pay rises every three years for the first 12 years of service. (RAN 1921-39) This request was granted in 1930, nine years after lobbying began, but was not implemented in the way the musicians had expected. Instead of raising pay rates for anyone who had passed the test, they lowered it by 5 shillings a week for anyone who had not passed. Since the test was yet to be devised, let alone implemented, the entire band corps was suddenly demoted. Unsurprisingly there were immediate calls from musicians and their captains to implement the test, allowing qualified musicians to resume their former pay rates. A test was eventually devised that included a
minimum six months service, the ability to pass an exam on two instruments, or one as a soloist and knowledge of fire control instruments. (RAN 1921-39)

Recruited in 1934-5, musicians on the Sydney became some of the first recruits under this new system. Although the test was hurriedly put together, it eventually became the basis for the modern Australian military musician qualification system, whereby musicians are given ‘trade tests’ at regular intervals, the successful completion of which qualifies them for an increase in pay.

Although the HMAS Sydney band did not survive the war, it and other RAN bands proved so popular with sailors during World War II that when the service was reduced in number due to demobbing at the end of the conflict, many ships’ captains actively lobbied to maintain their bands. (RAN 1945-46) The captains’ recognition of the importance of music in maintaining morale on crowded ships during long voyages echoes Radano and Bohlman’s findings that in “its transcendence, music could amplify points of contact within and without social groups; it reinforced group and (later) ‘national’ boundedness”. (Radano and Bohlman 2000, 15)

Pieslak made similar findings working with US soldiers in the Iraq war, finding that music “is a means of establishing the identity of the group and supports the feeling of togetherness.” (Pieslak 2009, 55)

The work of the Sydney band and other RAN bands during World War II highlighted the importance of music in maintaining morale and building group identity in sailors during wartime. Professional bands onboard became the norm, instead of being reserved for flagships. By 1950, less than a decade after the sinking of the Sydney, the recruiting and training policy for RAN bands had been modernized. Minimum service lengths were reduced from 12 to five years, the RAN School of Music had a new, standardized curriculum, and musicians were provided with a formal career structure bringing the RAN bands in line with British forces.

References


Chapter 16. The notion of home: The Scottish Kennedy family’s concert tours in the late nineteenth century to Australia. Ruth Martin.

Finding oneself may be equated with finding ‘home’. Home, a house, a family, a locus of belonging as mobile as it is static, a phantom, perhaps, or an imagined community. (Basu 2004, 28)

The word home is seemingly a simple one conjuring up ideas of security and comfort and yet there is an extraordinary underlying complexity to this word that can be as broad as a far-off homeland, real and imagined, as narrow as the physicality of a bed-sit in the suburbs of Canberra, or it may be an emotional response – a feeling of belonging. Home can mean many things to many people, and indeed each individual will themselves have many notions of what signifies home depending on circumstance and context. Home is not only a physical place – a dwelling, a city, or a country – it is also an imagined space, much like Benedict Anderson’s concept of the imagined community of the nation state. (Anderson, 2001) Home is constructed from a web of social interactions and relationships that evoke feelings and emotions (that can be both positive, or negative). A sense of home may move beyond the stability of a fixed place, and it is argued, the notion of home is generated in a mobile society “in a routine of practice, in repetition of habitual social interactions”. (Rapport and Dawson 1998, 27) In other words home does not have to be based in fixity, it can be generated in movement through day-to-day rituals and routines, and by maintaining cultural ideas, values, and traditions.1

Perhaps one of the most powerful ideas of home is the way in which it engenders a sense of belonging, of being an intrinsic and integral part of something larger than the self. Paradoxically, this sense of belonging may be to a home that can never be attained, an imagined home that stirs strong memories and emotions.

In speaking of a performance of the song “Home, Sweet Home” at the Colonial and Indian Exhibition in London in 1886, Alison Blunt makes this precise point:

---

1 Interestingly enough, David Kennedy expressed a similar notion in the preface to his book Singing around the world when he stated that “The charm to us of these wanderings consisted in the fact that, journeying as a family, we could as it were carry with us ‘our ain fireside’” (Kennedy 1887, 12).
The words of the song suggest that the clearest and fondest imaginings of home are often located at a distance of forced exile or voluntary roaming. Home is imagined as a unique and distant place that can neither be discovered nor reproduced elsewhere and thus remains a site of continual desire and irretrievable loss. (Blunt 1999, 421)

In this paper I’d like to explore the way in which notions of home, and by extension homeland, were expressed through two concert tours taken by the Scottish Kennedy family in Australia in the latter part of the nineteenth century. The home that was constructed by these concerts was complex and multilayered and, as this paper will show, had wide appeal that went far beyond the numerous Scottish migrant communities that were spread throughout the land. While it is true that large numbers of migrant Scots attended the concerts, they also attracted a broad cross section of the local communities, and large venues were filled to capacity night after night with enthusiastic audiences.

The Kennedy family’s tours to Australia were, according to newspaper reports of the day, outstanding successes. Numerous reviews, even amongst non-Scots reviewers, were almost without exception positive and often glowing. What was it that gave these concerts such broad appeal despite their focus on repertoire of a particularly Scottish character (with the inclusion in the second concert series of a very large number of traditional Scots Gaelic songs unintelligible for many in the large audiences)? As this paper will demonstrate I believe that three major themes associated with the idea of home and belonging, and encapsulating profound cultural tropes of the age were expressed through these concerts: a sense of Scottish nationalism and identity; Victorian ideals of home, family and respectability; and a fascination with the Celtic ‘Other’.

In 1872, singer David Kennedy set out on an extensive four-year concert tour that began in Australia and went on to New Zealand, the USA, Canada, South Africa, and India. (Kennedy 1887, 9-11) His large family (including his daughter Marjory Kennedy-Fraser) was indefatigable travelers and they came with him bringing their aptly named concert series “Twa Hours at Hame” (Two Hours at Home) to audiences around the globe. According to Marjory Kennedy-Fraser’s autobiography *A Life of Song*, her father’s God-given mission was

---

2 Examples are too numerous to mention, however for a small sample of the reviews see the *Argus*, 19 September 1872, 6, the *Brisbane courier*, 23 July 1873, 2; the *Mercury*, 28 December 1874, 2 and *Sydney Morning Herald*, 5 June 1875, 7.
to “sing the songs of Scotland to the exiled Scots scattered through the world”. (Kennedy-Fraser 1929, 4) The family gave their first concert “Twa Hours at Hame” in the New Temperance Hall in Russell Street, Melbourne. The reviewer for the Argus acknowledged that while the concerts had definite appeal to the Scots, they had broader appeal as well, as they were homely and unpretentious. Their entertainment is entitled on the bills, issued by them, “Twa Hours at Hame”. This motto gives a distinct clue to their performance, which is of a very homely and agreeable kind. It has a distinct character, being in the main addressed to those whose sympathies are most strongly awakened at the sound of that which for want of a better term we call broad Scotch…To a wholly Scottish audience, Mr Kennedy can appeal in such a manner that his hearers become highly excited, frequently to laughter – sometimes to tears: but for ourselves, without being moved to either of these extremes, we confess a placid enjoyment of a very respectable entertainment. (July 3, 1872)

The nightly program consisted of Kennedy Senior taking the spotlight in the first half of the concert and singing well-known and popular Scots songs. In the second half of the program his children, performing Scottish songs in solos and quartets, joined him. It is not insignificant that this concert, and every other concert thereafter, finished up with everyone - audience included - singing a rousing rendition of “Auld Lang Syne”.

The Kennedy family had additional appeal: the piano (so reminiscent of the home parlour); the father giving full voice to the songs surrounded by his loving children who also took their turn; the whole conjuring up images of cozy domesticity and respectability. The concerts were viewed as homely and in good taste. A review from the Maitland Mercury and Hunter River General Advertiser made the following observations:

Apart altogether from the merit of the singing, these concerts are peculiarly attractive for they exhibit a home influence which has been strong enough to bind together a family of three sons and two daughters, so that the songs and glees in which their youthful voices blended around the home fireside many years ago are now the delight of crowded audiences. (December 12, 1874)

The Kennedy family often performed five, or six concerts a week at the same venue, so they varied their programs in order to attract repeat audiences. “Twa Hours at Hame” was the staple and appears most frequently in the advertisements. Other popular themes were “A Nicht wi’ Burns”, and “Burns and his Contemporaries”. There was also “A Nicht wi’ the
Jacobites” (*Argus*, August 10, 1872), and the idealized and sentimental Burns’ poem “The Cottar’s Saturday Night”. (*Sydney Morning Herald*, June 21, 1873)

There is no doubt that the music performed at these concerts, so overtly Scottish in nature, would have appealed to the large numbers of Scots in the colonies not only fostering a sense of nationalist identity, but also maintaining memories of home land. Music is a potent force in the lives of migrant people not only evoking shared and personal histories, memories, and experiences, but also strongly evoking place — physical and imagined. As Martin Stokes observes:

> Place, for many migrant communities, is something which is constructed through music with an intensity not found elsewhere in their social lives. (Stokes 1994, 114)

These concerts can be perceived as a kind of temporal sonic ‘homecoming’. Both Lowland Scots songs, and Gaelic songs are steeped in the imagery of place (although each expressed quite differently), demonstrating an intimate and profound connection to the land. Much then is carried on song — and not just in the text — for much is carried on the tunes themselves: in the peculiarities of the melodies, the phrasing, the rhythms, the timbres, and the textures. For the Scots who attended these concerts strong emotions would have been stirred – joy, pride, and for many, a profound sense of loss, along with a very real sense of being part of a larger Scottish community within an Australian context. As Paul Basu says:

> Recent definition of diaspora recognizes not only reasons for displacement but also how essential the ‘myth’ of homeland is in maintaining sense of common identity among such populations. (Basu 2001, 336)

The Kennedy family stayed in and around Melbourne for nine months giving numerous concerts until in mid March 1873 they set off overland for Sydney by coach and buggy. (Kennedy-Fraser, M., in Kennedy 1876, 52) They made concert appearances in centres large and small as they slowly made their way north. The journey was hot, tiring, uncomfortable and monotonous. The trip took six weeks to accomplish. (Kennedy-Fraser 1929, 21)

Everywhere they stopped the family would give a concert – not always in ideal conditions. David Kennedy Junior recollects one of the concerts giving not only a flavour of concert life

---

3 Paul Basu in his book *Highland Homecomings* talks of the circumstances of separation of the Scots migrant as being exile and banishment, or emigration and expansion. It is worth noting here that the ‘Scottishness’ of these concerts had multiple meanings contingent upon individual meanings of ‘homeland’, and varying with things such as circumstances of separation from the homeland. (Basu 2007, 188)
in the Australian bush, but also the importance of such concerts to small and isolated communities.

At Branxholme, a small village, we gave a concert; but the only place we could get to sing in was a little wooden school-room that stood solitary some 300 yards away in the bush...It was not till eight o’clock, when the shades of evening had set in, the people began to assemble. Here and there figures passed and re-passed through the trees...on all sides we could hear the soft thud of horses’ hooves on the grass and the jolting rumble of carts...The room was soon filled to over-crowding; but upon the doorkeeper jocosely announcing to those outside that they could go “Up the chimney for a shilling!” some half-dozen people rushed in and immediately took up position in a large capacious fire-place while the rest swarmed noisily outside, and looked in at numberless holes and broken windows. At ten o’clock the concert concluded, and the audience slowly dispersed among the trees, with cart-rumbles, hoof-falls, and phantom flittings as before. (Kennedy 1876, 51-52)

On arrival in Sydney the Kennedy family repeated the concerts they had had so much success with in Melbourne. One of the advertising angles used was to make the entertainment seem so respectable that even an “elder o’ the kirk” would have no problem in going along to a concert themselves. (Mercury, December 25, 1874) This first Australian leg of the tour was remarkable for its length (almost two years), for the number of towns and cities visited along the way, and for the sheer number of performances often running to five, or even six, per week.

The Kennedy family came back to Australia in 1883. This concert series was somewhat unusual as by then it reflected the growing interest of Marjory Kennedy-Fraser in Scots Gaelic songs. Despite these songs being potentially a more difficult genre to successfully promote to Australian audiences, the family advertised them widely and in great detail. One of their first venues for this concert series was at the Protestant Hall, Castlereagh Street, Sydney. The full advertised program is long, but three Gaelic songs are mentioned by name in the advertising. In Brisbane at the Albert Hall just a few weeks later the Gaelic content is now even more substantial, for these songs now take up half the advertised programme
The Misses Kennedy will sing (in Gaelic) a number of GAELIC AIRS Specially arranged for them as Vocal Trios:- “GU MA SLAN A CHI MI” (Happy May I See Thee). “MAIRI LAGHACH” (Lovely Mary). “MO RUN GEAL DILEAS” (My Faithful Fair One). “FIONN AIRIDH” (Farewell to Fiunary) “FHIR A BHATA” (The Boatman). “HO RO MO NIGHEAN DONN BHOIDHEACH” (My Nut Brown Maiden). “MAIGHDEAN MHUILE” (The Maiden of Mull). “MOLADH NA LANNDAIH” (The Praise of Islay)... (Brisbane Courier August 16, 1883)

The reviews of this concert series were positive, the Gaelic songs being received with a great deal of interest. The reviewer for The Argus said:

The young ladies...have introduced a complete novelty in their rendering of some sweetly harmonized Gaelic trios, with the titles of which we will not trouble our readers...The Gaelic trios are sweetly sung by these young ladies, and to all who are properly curious in music their archaic harmonies have a most lively interest. To hear music built upon an old world oriental scale repeated by sweet young girl singers, who were themselves first taught in the modern scale and Western civilization shows that the singers have made research, and that, perhaps not quite
consciously, they are greater illustrators of music art than they at present give themselves credit for being. Irrespective of oriental and occidental scale in music, the trios by the Misses Kennedy were so fresh in effect that they were enjoyed with positive liking by the whole of the large audience present. (May 7, 1883)

The inclusion of Gaelic repertoire in the second concert series also drew on the fascination of the time with the ‘exotic’ and the ‘noble Celtic savage’.

In 1760 James Macpherson, a middle-class Highlander, who spoke both Gaelic and English, had published a ‘translation’ of an ancient epic cycle of poems based on the mythological hero Fingal and supposedly written by Ossian. This work was hailed as a Celtic classic, although it was entirely constructed by the author from fragments of ancient Gaelic poetry. Through its significant popularity, however, it had a profound impact upon the way in which Highland Scots were viewed. Matthew Gelbart states in his book *The Invention of “Folk Music” and “Art Music”* that Ossian became the way for Europeans to look northward to find the savage in their midst and Macpherson made sure that the savage that they found was a noble one. (Gelbart 2007, 62)

The Scottish Highlands, therefore, became characterized as a place containing a strong, potent Other — the Gaelic speaking Highlander — in the midst of civilization, and the inclusion of a large number of Gaelic songs in the repertoire of the Kennedy concerts tapped into this trope.4

These concerts embodied more than nationalistic fervour, or nostalgic longing for a Scottish Homeland, for they were complex sites that contained narratives of geographic and gendered place, as well as mythological, sociological, ideological, political, romanticized constructed spaces. These concerts were the locus for transformation of a foreign space into home: even though the audience members were in a new country and in a public venue. The concerts reinforced the idea of home on many levels, and evoked strong feelings and emotions associated with ideas of home.

“Twa’ Hours of Hame” was a home that had definite appeal to the large body of migrant Scots through the use of Scottish themes, songs and stories, but it also was a home with a more universal appeal that drew on deeply embedded ideals of the time of domesticity and

---

4 For reading on the idea of ‘the Other’ from a postcolonial theory perspective see Edward Said’s 1978 book Orientalism. For a more psychoanalytic account, Julia Kristeva’s 1982 book *The powers of horror: essays on abjection* may be of interest.
the warmth, comfort and conviviality of ‘home fires’. The Kennedy family had a significant advantage simply because they were a family. On stage the genial father figure, embodied in David Kennedy senior, was the main star of the show conjuring up powerful images of the Victorian domestic space — the idea of the sacrosanct home. This gave a significant extra dimension to the concerts. The kind of sentiment about home can be summed up in the following poem of the time:

Make your home beautiful;
Tender joys throng
Fireside made holier.
Dearer, with song
(Queenslander, May 4, 1872)

Another part of the success of the Kennedy’s concert series was in David Kennedy Senior’s ability as a showman to give context and background to the songs, and judging by the reviews this was done in a very engaging and humorous manner. Rather tellingly, the newspaper review from the Brisbane Courier stated that:

They [the songs] are pointed, humorous, and given with such a degree of appropriate action that the full meaning of the Gaelic in the song to follow is easily grasped by everyone, and the explanation and anecdote are often more enjoyed than the song itself…the true spirit of Scottish life and character is only to be fully understood in their songs, and when they are rendered with pathos, humour or such other effect…nothing could be more delightful or enjoyable. (August 22, 1883)

Most of the concerts, according to the newspapers of the day, were sell-out concerts that left few seats in some very large venues and many concerts so crowded that audience members were left standing for the duration of the concert, or squeezed into aisles and even chimneys. These concerts created a harmonious space in which many complex themes and places coexisted.

The Kennedy family capitalized on these tropes of the time and, as the title of their concerts suggest, brought to the early settlers a couple of hours of home that through its very complexity had very wide appeal. The fact that this word home is so elusive, fluid, indefinable, as much imagined as real, as much individual as communal, was, whether consciously or not, something they capitalized upon. These concerts attracted, and were enjoyed by, the general Australian populace of the time eager for entertainment that was
wholesome and congenial, and accorded with ideals of family life and the home parlour, as well as migrant nostalgic and nationalistic Scots eager for a sense of homeland, if only for two hours. The concerts also reinforced a feeling of community through the shared experience and the feelings engendered. Add to this potent mix a good sprinkling of romanticized ‘Other’ in the programming, and the Kennedy family had a winning combination that, for the time, was both endearing and enduring.

References


This paper assesses the success of the career of John Wilson, the Scottish tenor (Photo 1), particularly during the 1840s when Wilson built on his experiences as an international opera and concert singer to develop entertainments based on Scottish national song. A case study of Wilson’s publication of the song “Woo’d and married and a’” will be investigated as an example of the type of song which Wilson promoted for performance in middle class public and domestic settings.

Photo 1. “Mr. Wilson” by J. M. Barclay, no date. (c) Folger Shakespeare Library. Shelfmark: ART File W750 no.1 (size XS). http://www.folger.edu

“The Death of John Wilson, Esq., the Scottish Vocalist, who died in America, on the 9th July, 1849” was celebrated in a Scots broadside ballad called “Scotia’s Dirge” by William Jamie, dated 7 August 1849:

AULD Scotia now may sigh aloud,
Her tears in torrents fa’,
Her sweetest harp now hangs unstrung,
Since WILSON’s ta’en awa.

A few days later, an “Impromptu” poem by “G” appeared in The Musical World:

Alas, poor WILSON! rest thy soul in peace
Thou sweetest Minstrel! Death hath bade thee cease.

Harps and minstrels, mentioned in these poems about Wilson, were common images used to signify authenticity of Celtic music in the nineteenth century. (McAulay 2009 17, 41)
Wilson performed and published Scottish folk songs with piano accompaniment to great success. His death was noted in many parts of the English-speaking world, showing his widespread influence. (Gilfillan 1850; “Oxonian” 1849; “Urban” 1849; “Recent Deaths of Notable Persons” 1849; Mitchison [1851]) His reputation as a vocal star and composer of Scottish song persisted for a considerable time. (Anderson 1867; Baptie 1883; Baptie 1894; Farmer 1947; B.B.C. Music Library 1966)

Some biographical background will help put the success of Wilson’s career in context. “The celebrated Scottish vocalist” (Mitchison [1851], v-xiv) was born in 1800 in Edinburgh. In the 1820s Wilson sang as a precentor in Edinburgh churches and taught singing. Wilson was influenced by scholarly discourses and collections of Scottish songs, for example those by Alexander Campbell (1764-1824) and Wilson’s Edinburgh singing teacher and contemporary, Finlay Dun (1795-1853). (Dun 1838; Gelbart 2007, 132-148) Wilson then studied in London with the Italian singing teachers Lanza and Crivelli and appeared as principal tenor in London and the British provinces in the 1830s in productions including Bishop’s Guy Mannering, Rooke’s Amilie and as Donald in Barnett’s The Mountain Sylph. Wilson’s experience in both Scottish and operatic music helped prepare him for his subsequent entrepreneurial activities. He gave a lecture-recital about Scottish music for the London Mechanics’ Institution in 1838 and performed Scottish songs on his first financially rewarding tour of North America as a star in operas and concerts with Jane Shirreff from 1838 to 1840. (Preston 2001, 83-96, 391) Back in London, Wilson participated in the failed “Balfe’s English Opera Company speculation at the Lyceum”. (“Oxonian” 1849, 257-258) After this failure, he turned to more portable and profitable small business activities.

Between 1841 and 1848 he performed at least fourteen different two-hour long “Scottish Entertainments” on themes such as Nicht wi’ Burns and Mary Queen of Scots. (Wilson 1848, Wilson [1849]) Whether he used costume or gesture is unclear. The lecture-recital format perhaps reflected the Highland Scottish Ceilidh tradition of evening entertainments of concerts interspersed with stories and anecdotes. (Boehme pers. comm. 2010) Wilson occasionally included English and German songs sung in English. (Wilson 1841-1846)

In 1842 his popularity led to a performance for Queen Victoria at Taymouth in Scotland (Mitchison [1851], xii). On 26 May 1844, The Era from London reported on Wilson’s “new entertainment” “at the Music-hall, Store-street”:

His selection was principally from Burns, and the illustrations were intermixed with lively and well-told anecdotes. He exhibited
his usual sweet taste, and touchingly sang the much-admired “Auld Robin Gray,” which was the “gem” of the evening.

He toured many other British towns and cities including Bristol, Exeter, Newcastle and Edinburgh. Wilson’s fame spread as far as Britain’s Australian colonies. (“Advantages of Railways” 1845; Boehme 2008)

In this period, audiences, critics and performers in Britain and other English-speaking countries did not distinguish between art, folk and popular/commercial styles of music as much as we do today. (Gelbart 2007, 1-10, 266-270; Preston 2001, 316-317) However, there were competing ideas in national song between antiquarian preservation, need for improvement, cultural nationalism and individual achievement. (McAulay 2009, 2-3, 12)

Supposedly authentic Scottish songs were crossed with melodies and lyrics from England and Ireland, or were newly written or rewritten. (Crawford 1979, 6)

In 1842 Wilson promoted his performing career by publication of the first of eight elaborate books in Wilson’s Edition of the Songs of Scotland, dedicated to Queen Victoria. Wilson aimed to make songs in his publications appear authentic while also attracting the growing middle class who wanted songs that were easy to sing and had manageable piano accompaniments (Wilson [1842], Preface):

In this Edition of THE SONGS OF SCOTLAND, I have taken great pains to get the most correct sets of the airs, as well as the most approved versions of the words. Notwithstanding the many editions of the Scottish Songs that have already appeared, I hope that the present may be found acceptable to those who wish to sing the songs with an accompaniment, that shall not interfere with the flow of the melody or the feeling of the singer.

Wilson did not often acknowledge whether he or others were responsible for creative work in his performances or publications of Scottish song. On the sea voyage before his first American tour, he wrote the words for “Farewell Awhile My Native Isle, Song Written and Sung by Mr. Wilson, Composed by Mr. Austin Phillips” (Wilson [1838]). Some musical arrangements were advertised as either by Wilson or by James Maeder, his pianist in New York. (Preston 2001 83-84) Wilson’s accompanists in Britain included Edward Land and Mr. Jolly. (“Oxonian” 1849, 258) Land may have written piano arrangements for Wilson (The Bristol Mercury, 24 June 1843) and published pieces as vocal duets. (Land [1846])

The diarist, artist and musician, Georgiana McCrae (1804-1890), who migrated to Melbourne in 1841, transcribed many Scottish songs and dance tunes in her manuscript music.
collections. One of McCrae’s rare references to a named source is found at the end of a music book dated provisionally 1840 – 1856 (Richards 2005, 24) where McCrae wrote out the words for “Woo’d & Married &c— by Joanna Baillie” attributing them to “Book IIId of Wilson’s Edtn. of the Songs of Scotland”. (Figure 1)

Figure 1. “Autograph manuscript by Georgiana McCrae: ‘Georgiana’s Music Book,’” reverse 245. (c) University of Sydney. Harry F. Chaplin Collection, McCrae Papers, Section 1, No.10, RB 1164.9.

There were opposing English and Scottish claims to the tune of “Woo’d and married and a’”. 
It was used in the mid-eighteenth century for a Scottish country-dance. A similar tune was sung by Mr Beard in the song, “I made love to Kate”, which he introduced into an English ballad opera, *The Jovial Crew*, in 1760. (Chappell 1859, 723-724; Colonial Music Institute 2002; Glen 1900, 53-54, 62; McAulay 2009, 265) A version of the words was attributed to a schoolmaster, Alexander Ross, who died in 1783. (Glen 1900, 53-54, 62; Crawford 1979, 180) James Johnson published “Woo’d and married an a’” with melody, figured bass and words, often mistakenly attributed to Robert Burns, in the *Scots Musical Museum*, Volume 1 in 1787. (Low 1991; National Burns Collection [2003-2009]) Finlay Dun and John Thomson included the song in the fourth volume of *Vocal Melodies of Scotland* in 1840. Affected by changes in class-consciousness and behaviour, Wilson chose acceptable versions of words for songs he performed and published, which contributed to his career’s financial success. Wilson preferred the genteel verses for “Woo’d and married and a’” by Joanna Baillie (1752-1861) to some more earthy previous versions. (Wilson [1842], III, 115-118, Figure 2) Figure 2. John Wilson. [1842]. “Woo’d and married and a.”* Wilson’s Edition of the Songs of Scotland*, Book III, 116. (c) The British Library Board. Shelfmark: H.1371.a.
The song deals with pitfalls of impending marriage (Wilson [1842], III, 118):

And is she na’ very well aff,
To be woo’d and married and a’?

Joanna Baillie wrote her version of “Woo’d and married and a’” in 1822 for George Thomson’s *The Select Melodies of Scotland, Interspersed with Those of Ireland and Wales.* (Slagle 1999, Volume 1, 132-134) Baillie republished her poem in 1840 in *Fugitive Verses* and again in 1851 in her *Collected Works.* (Baillie 1840, 267-270; Baillie 1976, 817; Bugajski 2004, 253) Baillie considered that her version suited Wilson’s audience: (Slagle 1999, Vol 1, 149)

I am very much flattered to hear that Mr Wilson approves of my modified versions of the old songs. They are at least more fitted for his polite & more refined hearers than they were.

Wilson agreed with Baillie and other critics: (Gilroy and Hanley 2002, 307-308, 338-339; Smith 1823-1824, 80; Wilson [1842], III, 118)

This capital song was written by Miss JOANNA BAILLIE, in imitation of the old lyric of the same title, which, though it contains a humorous and graphic depiction of ancient manners, is somewhat too rough in its expressions to allow of its being introduced at a modern fireside.

While associating his musical taste with middle class gentility, Wilson maintained his Scottish identification. He provided a glossary of Lowland Scots words translated into standard English and commented on Scottish modal melodic traits: (Wilson [1842], III, 118)

The tune is peculiar, and like many of the old Scotch airs, ends on the sixth of the key, the relative minor; the fifth must, however, not be raised as in the modern minor key, but remain a full tone from the concluding note, in conformity with the ancient construction of the tune.

Wilson’s *Edition of the Songs of Scotland* and his performances in Britain were commercially and professionally rewarding. After eight years, he aspired to repeat his earlier American triumphs, perhaps because of money troubles due to stock market speculation and family obligations. (“Urban” 1849) On 27 September 1848, the *Dundee Courier* reported on Wilson’s performance:
His beautiful entertainment on Sir Walter Scott’s *The Lady of the Lake*… was listened to with breathless attention, and applauded to the echo.

Mr Wilson is about to pay a visit to America.


Wilson then proceeded to Quebec City, which was important to British control of its Canadian provinces. A sizeable Scottish and pro-British sector kept up with British fashions.

The 1849 summer season at St George’s Hotel began with concerts by a tenor, Mr Arthurson, followed by a Tyrolese troupe, the Hauser family, and “Wyman’s Exhibition of Ventriloquism Magic and the Italian Fantocini.” “Mr. Wilson’s Scottish Entertainments” was the fourth attraction. An art exhibition by “Italian Masters” including Titian finished the season. In its review on Saturday 7 July 1849, the Quebec *Morning Chronicle* admired Wilson’s performances on 2, 4 and 6 July 1849:

> Mr Wilson has given three of his unique entertainments during this week, in the St George's Hotel, and on each occasion has been attended by the largest and most fashionable audiences that have been drawn together for a long period in Quebec...Mr Wilson invests all his songs with a deep interest - listening to him is not merely to have the ear tickled with a pretty tune: we have a drama or picture of the most exciting nature presented before us at the same time.

On Monday, 9th July 1849, the *Morning Chronicle* reported Wilson’s sudden death after a recreational outing. Edinburgh’s *Caledonian Mercury* on 26 July 1849 was shocked by the news:
The present mail communicates an event which has caused a deep and general sense of regret. We allude to the death of our townsman, John Wilson, from an attack of cholera; indeed it may be questioned if any tidings from the other side of the Atlantic for a considerable period have flown so rapidly over our city.

Wilson continued to have influence after his death. His former pianist, Edward Land, was advertised as “conductor of the late Mr Wilson’s Scottish Entertainments” (“Chelmsford” 1849) and became the accompanist for Wilson’s principal successor as a performer of “Scottish Entertainments,” the Scottish tenor, David Kennedy (1825-1886) who later toured extensively with his family troupe. (Kennedy [1888]; Kennedy-Fraser 1887; Ahlander 2008, 2009, 2010; Martin 2010) Wilson’s biographers, Mitchison and Baptie, were keen to acknowledge Wilson’s creative contribution as a composer and arranger. (Mitchison [1851], xiii, 2-3, 202-203; Baptie 1894, 201) Mitchison claimed (Mitchison [1851], v):

The name of John Wilson will be long associated with the songs of Scotland, just as that of Burns belongs to our poetry, or that of Nathaniel Gow is linked with our liveliest strains of national music.

A memorial was erected to Wilson in Quebec. A bronze relief in honour of three Scottish singers, Wilson, John Templeton (1802-1886) and Kennedy, was created by the Scottish artist, William Grant Stevenson, and placed on Calton Hill in Edinburgh in 1894. (Adams pers. comm. 2010; Ahlander pers. comm. 2010; Canmore [2011]; Day 2003; Flickr KWG73 2008) In 1947, Henry Farmer, the author of A History of Music in Scotland, wrote that Wilson’s Songs of Scotland was one of “the most esteemed collections” and that Wilson was “almost as great an artist” as the famous Scottish vocalist, John Sinclair (1791-1857). (Farmer 1970, 357, 361, 415, 443-444)

John Wilson had a successful career when measured by profitability, geographical reach and influence. He built on his operatic experience with a business based on his “Scottish Entertainments”. Many Scots were inspired by his activities and migration helped provide him with an audience. His performances and publications contributed to the spread of Scottish song far afield.

Distinction between art, folk and popular music may lead modern critics to differ in their assessment of Wilson and his ilk. Wilson’s publications could be examined for interplay of musical and textual elements in the construction of a ‘Scottish’ sound. Further research could determine the extent of Wilson’s creative contribution, explore his performance practice and
judge how much his promotion of a separate Scottish identity was part of a cultural trend or driven more by desire for personal financial gain.

References

Ahlander, Per G. L. 2010 (a). Personal communication.


———. 1894. “Wilson, John.” Musical Scotland, past and present, being a dictionary of Scottish musicians from about 1400 till the present time to which is added a bibliography of musical publications connected with Scotland from 1611. Compiled and edited by David


———. 2010. Personal communication.


Kennedy, David. [1888?]. *Kennedy’s handbook of Scottish song, Containing 141 standard Scottish songs, as given in his entertainments on the songs of Scotland, during his tour around the World.* Melbourne: Mason, Firth and McCutcheon. State Library of New South Wales, M DSM 042 P18; National Library of Australia, JAFp BIBLIO F11095.


McCrae, Georgiana. [1840-1856]. “Autograph manuscript by Georgiana McCrae: ‘Georgiana’s Music Book.’” Section 1, No.10, RB 1164.9 [“Chaplin Music Book”]. University of Sydney Rare Books Collection, Fisher Library, Harry F. Chaplin Collection, McCrae Papers, University of Sydney, NSW, Australia.

Mitchison, William. [1851]. *Hand-book of the songs of Scotland with music.* Edited by William Mitchison. To which is added a biographical sketch of the life of the late John Wilson, the celebrated Scottish vocalist. London: John Joseph Griffin & Co; Glasgow: Richard Griffin; Glasgow: John Cameron.


Wilson, John. [1838]. “On board the Great Western Steam Ship on her voyage from Bristol to New York…Farewell awhile my native isle. Song written and sung by Mr. Wilson, composed by Mr. Austin Phillips, and with permission most respectfully dedicated to the Directors of the Great Western Steamship Company.” <https://jscholarship.library.jdu.edu> Accessed 5 July 2010.


Chapter 18. Overwhelming love: A case study of memory construction through Ogasawara hula activities. Masaya Shishikura.

Introduction

This paper investigates a process of memory construction through a case study of Ogasawara hula activities. It explores how a dance form borrowed from Hawai‘i functions in remembrance of a small island society. Hula practices provide cohesion and unity for the people by allowing them to share memories and sentiments as a community. Since French sociologist Maurice Halbwachs introduced the concept of “collective memory” in the first half of the twentieth century, issues of social remembering and forgetting have been explored in various aspects and contexts. For the study of dance and movement cultures, British sociologist Paul Connerton proposes an insightful theory. In How Societies Remember (1989), he suggests the significance of “bodily practices,” as well as “commemorative ceremonies,” in social remembrance:

“If there is such a thing as social memory... we are likely to find it in commemorative ceremonies; but commemorative ceremonies prove to be commemorative only in so far as they are performative. (4-5)

As claimed in this theory, Ogasawara people produce a ritualistic ceremony of a hula festival entitled ‘Ohana, meaning “extended family” in Hawaiian, for their memory construction. In this case study, I further demonstrate the significance of sentiments by utilizing field video: an expressive medium for a “re-vision” in ethnographic research. With visual images, this study illustrates the extraordinary experience of the community—that can be summarized as “overwhelming love.”

---

1 See On Collective Memory (Halbwachs 1992) for the fundamental theory. German Egyptologist Jan Assmann (1995) distinguishes “cultural memory” in comparison with “communicative” or “everyday memory,” and French historian Pierre Nora (1996) signifies the role of realms or sites in memory construction. Many others have also investigated memory issues based on area or case studies, including Sturken 1997; Fujitani, White and Yoneyama 2001 and Morris-Suzuki 2005.

2 Bourdieu 1977, Foster 1995 and Sklar 2001 also indicate the significance of the body and its practices for the study of a culture or society.

3 I provide transcriptions of the videos in this printed version of the conference paper.
Background
Ogasawara is a generic term for a cluster of archipelagos including islands around Muko Jima, Chichi Jima, Haha Jima and Iwo To, as well as some the isolated islands of Nishi-no Shima, Minami-tori Shima and Okino-tori Shima; the latter two represent the eastern/southernmost territories of Japan respectively.⁴

Figure 1. Map of the Ogasawara Islands

These islands, located along the western rim of the Pacific Ocean, were uninhabited until 1830 when five Caucasians along with some 20 people from Hawai‘i migrated to one of the islands of Chichi Jima. These early settlers sustained a small community, yet in the 1870s the Japanese government began sending a large wave of immigrants to establish its occupation of the islands. Later in the early twentieth century, the government extended its colonialism to the Nanyō [South Pacific] region of Japan. On the islands in-between, cross-cultural musical activities flourished, including taiko drumming introduced from the Hachijō Islands of Japan and a dance called dojin odori [“kanaka” dance] borrowed from Micronesia. However they were abandoned during the Pacific War (1941-1945), and disappeared when the US Navy segregated the islands with small numbers of Caucasian relatives after the war.⁵ In 1968, the islands were returned to Japan after more than 20 years of American rule. Since then the

---

⁴ In English, the Ogasawara Islands are also recognized as the Bonin Islands, and the island of Iwo To is better known as Iwo Jima after one of the fiercest battles of the Pacific War.
⁵ During this period, the US Navy deployed nuclear weapons on the islands of Chichi Jima and Iwo To, and allowed only Caucasian relatives to return to Ogasawara (Norris, Arkin and Burr 2000, 11-13). There were only about 290 people on Chichi Jima, including US Navy officers and their families (Nishimuta 2008, 203).
newly established Ogasawara village has improved its infrastructure, but life in this remote place is still challenging. For example: public access to mainland Japan requires a 25.5-hour boat trip; most daily commodities are delivered by this boat, which arrives only once a week; and there are very limited job opportunities with tourism as the only major industry. Accordingly the community remains small with less than 2,500 people, many of whom are transient—leaving the islands after only a few years.6

Music and Dance of Ogasawara

Even in such a small community far away, there exist dynamic musical activities. On Chichi Jima, the primary focus of this case study, the people perform choral singing, steel pan orchestra, rock music, swing jazz, as well as the previously mentioned taiko drumming and dance originated in Micronesia.7 Some of these art forms were revived from past practices, yet most of them were introduced after the reversion of 1968. Amongst these musical activities, hula is the most popular and influential performing art in Ogasawara today. About fifteen years ago, a worker at the Ogasawara Marine Centre, Yamaguchi Manami, began teaching the dance after her hula experience in Hawai‘i.8 It seems that the people appreciate hula very much in Ogasawara, so that today more than 300 people are involved in hula activities.

‘Ohana: The Hula Festival of Ogasawara

The islanders dance hula at various events and occasions all the year around, yet the highlight is the annual festival ‘Ohana, in which all the members of the group participate as dancers and/or musicians, if they are available. However, in recent years, it particularly features high school seniors, who are about to leave the island after graduation—to seek higher education or job training on mainland Japan.9

At the festival of 2009, the year I conducted my fieldwork, I found that eight students had been extensively involved in hula activities since childhood. The hula teacher Manami told me about a plan to provide those graduates a newly composed piece to dance in the festival. One of the mothers of those seniors, Tamura Midori,10 wrote a piece about high school life on the island. The practice sessions became confidential in April, although the festival was to be

---

6 Currently there are two residential islands in Ogasawara: Chichi Jima and Haha Jima, which comprise approximately 2,000 and 440 residents respectively.
7 The dance is called Nanyō odori [South Pacific dance] in the present-day, avoiding the derogatory word dojin [kanaka].
8 After graduating from a high school in Japan, Manami received her college education in Hawai‘i.
9 There is no college education or job training system in Ogasawara, so almost all high school students leave the island after graduation.
10 She is also a principal singer of the hula band.
held in late August—“It should be presented with a big surprise,” Manami said. I was not allowed to attend the practice sessions, yet was still able to observe some processes towards the festival. I recognized that the adults had high expectations of the students and applied extraordinary pressure, while the students were pre-occupied with other obligations including preparations for their prospective life on the mainland. The process seemed to truly overwhelm them. One student complained: “I liked to hula, but not anymore. I actually hate it now.” Nevertheless in the festival, they performed the song with expressions of sincere gratitude for the island and its people as described in the song lyrics.

**Re-vision: Visualizing Sentiments**

An issue arises here in ethnographic research: how to evaluate such sentiments and emotions in academic study. Sociologist Edgar Morin indicates the potential of ethnographic film in the following paragraph:

> There is the rest, the most difficult, the most moving, the most secret; wherever human feelings are involved, wherever the individual is directly concerned, wherever there are interpersonal relationships of authority, subordination, comradeship, love, hate—in other words, everything connected with the emotive fabric of human existence. There lies the great terra incognita of the sociological or ethnological cinema, of cinematographic truth. There lies its promised land. (1988, 102)

In the following example, I use video as a medium to convey something that cannot be illustrated with written documents or verbal presentations. Visual images possibly provide a “re-vision” in ethnography, and allow the researchers to fully explore sentiments and emotions in academic study.

**Video Transcription 1. The Last Dance**

Manami, as the master of ceremonies of the festival, introduces the last dance: “Eight high school seniors, who have danced with us since childhood, are graduating…” Tears fill her eyes. The music begins and the lyrics state:

> At sunset, an orange road appears on the surface of the ocean… Embraced by the starry sky, I close my eyes… Cheerleading, Bīde [school] festival… I remember each event… There, numerous smiles are overflowing in my mind… Farewell the scenery I see everyday… Farewell the colour of the ocean I have always known… Farewell my friends just in front of us… Just for a while,
yet farewell… Thank you here I am now (and we are all here now)… Thank you for rearing us (thank you)… Till yesterday and from now on too… Thank you for your overwhelming love…

Camera flashes sparkle throughout the performance. Towards the end of the song the female dancers begin to cry. “Thank you for the overwhelming love…” along with this last verse, the dancers drop their heads for the ovation. Manami enters the stage and hugs each student as she puts a lei around her/his neck. The applause appears endless.

Photo 1. ‘Ohana Hula Festival 2009

A Collective Memory Embedded

Manami and the senior students prepared the dance in secret to make this rite of passage the most impressive and memorable. The video demonstrates these emotive interactions amongst the community. I argue that this celebrated moment was a “commemorative ceremony”—an intended ritualistic practice of remembrance for the island community. The song lyrics, corresponding to the dance movements, describe the unique high school life of Ogasawara, and affirm the strong affiliation of the students with the island and its people. Repeated phrases of “farewell” and “thank you” in the lyrics, along with the dancers’ facial and bodily expressions, invoke an extraordinary sense of affection—overflowing in this ritualistic space. As the result of the overwhelming process, performance and emotion, the dance was strongly embedded into the hearts of the people and remains as a collective memory of the community.

Video Transcription 2. Interviews

After the festival, I conducted video interviews with Manami and the senior students. In these interviews, they indicate how hula is an important medium to share experiences and memories on the Ogasawara Islands. The following are transcriptions of the video interviews:
scene one involves male students and adult member Imazeki Mari; and scene two involves female students, Yamaguchi Manami and Imazeki Mari.

1. Student A: I still remember when I was playing with him [Student B], his mother Midori [the composer of the graduation song] suddenly came in and said: “Why don’t you do hula?”

Student B: That’s compulsory. Student A: I answered: “Ye… yes,” it can’t be helped. Yeah, it was something like that [when I began hula in childhood]. But anyway, I am very grateful (both Students A and B nod and smile). Student A: Like the hula festival, you cannot have such an experience (Mari is almost crying by hearing the words of gratitude). I could have such an extraordinary experience with hula, so I feel very grateful.

2. Student C: I became close to junior students and adult members, so it was fun [to do hula]. It’s great that we became very close to each other. Student D: Yeah, if there were no hula, Manami would just be a worker at the Marine Centre for us. Mari: If so, only said: “Hi,” when seeing her on the road, and that would just be it.

Others: No way (laugh)! Manami: It’s true, I was just a worker at the Marine Centre [for you all]… And that’s it, if there were no hula, I don’t know what I would be doing… Student E: Yeah, we extended our human relationships [through hula], and I appreciated that. Manami: Look at that sky, it’s beautiful (everyone looks at the sky). Manami: But how do you express that? Just say: “It’s beautiful…” (everyone laughs), and that’s it? Maybe hula has potential to illustrate such a beauty. Look, beautiful leis around her [Student D]. But they become meaningful because she wears them. It’s the same with the dance. It becomes meaningful if there are people who dance. And also, we need subject matters to dance. It is good to dance, a medium to express something, like a language…

---

11 Imazeki Mari is another hula teacher of the group, and also performs for the hula band as a singer and ukulele player.
Dance within the Island

There are several key words and phrases in these interviews: gratitude towards the community, unique experience within the island, extension of human association, and dance to the beautiful landscape. I believe that this dance borrowed from Hawai‘i is well accommodated in Ogasawara. Hawaiian Kumu Hula [the title of master/teacher of hula] Maiki Aiu Lake states: “Hula is the art of Hawaiian dance expressing all we see, hear, smell, taste, touch and feel.” She continues:

Hawai‘i is hula and hula is Hawai‘i. This is as true today as it was hundreds of years ago. The history, the culture, biographies of the people, descriptions of the islands, chronicles of events, messages of love and thanks—or scoldings—all this and more is told in the hula that were danced long ago and that are danced today. (Quoted in Ariyoshi 1998, 75)

Ogasawara people appreciate such a potential of hula to embody landscape and human customs, yet within their own island settings. Hula creates extraordinary human relationships by allowing the people to share the time and space through the unique bodily experience to dance the island and its community. In the performance of the senior students, emotions and sentiments overflowed, because they realized that Ogasawara hula is filled with the overwhelming love of the island people.

Video Transcription 3. Farewell

On 12 March 2010, I left the Ogasawara Islands with some of those graduates for mainland Japan. The following scenes, which I filmed at the port, again demonstrate the love overflowing amongst the island community.

Many people gather around the port to send off the graduates: they greet and hug each other, give leis and snacks for the long voyage, and take numerous photos. Manami is searching around the graduates holding several leis. “See you again, come back to ‘Ohana, if possible,” she says while embracing one of her hula students, who cries and answers: “Yes, I will…” After a while, each graduate leaving the island makes a speech to the people. One says sobbing: “I’m glad that I was born and raised on the island… thank you so much.” The sound of farewell taiko drumming signals the time for departure. “Ogasawara is the greatest,” one graduate declares with his best smile before boarding. The graduates join the other passengers and gather around on deck—waving their hands. The boat slowly sets off from the pier, yet some people follow it riding on a sightseeing or fishing boat, as they wish to extend the time they are together.
**Conclusion**

The collective remembrances of Ogasawara hula activities appear to be both “commemorative ceremonies” and “bodily practices,” as suggested in Paul Connerton’s theory. The annual hula festival ‘Ohana provides a ritual for the inevitable separation within this remote island life, and the locally choreographed dance embodies Ogasawara through bodily practices. The combination of the event and performance is a powerful medium to “remember the island,” and creates a collective memory of the community. I would further argue the significance of sentiments inscribed in these activities—the commemorative ceremony and bodily practices lose senses without human emotions behind them. Ogasawara hula becomes fully meaningful with the sentiments of the people living in this isolated place, in light of its historical and social contexts. Colonial and postcolonial politics have distressed the islanders for more than a century. As past musical cultures on the islands disappeared, the memories of Ogasawara people were alienated without shared social experiences and practices. However in this century, the people began to re-construct new collective memories through music and dance. In remembrance of this island community, hula takes a significant role, not only because of its popularity, but also its potential to illustrate the Ogasawara landscape, people and their customs through bodily practices. They sing and dance together as collective experiences in this small community, and remember the island and its people by embracing “overwhelming love.”
Photo 3. Leaving on the Boat

References


Nishimuta, Yasushi. 2008. *Dare mo Kokkyō wo Shiranai* [No one knows the border]. Tokyo: Jōhō Sentā Shuppan-kyoku.


Part 4: Re-visioning cultural identity

Introduction

This paper discusses the representation of Aboriginality in the music of a selection of films that feature Aboriginal characters, stories or places. By exploring a number of examples I shall investigate the processes used in representation of Aboriginal people in music. The particular films have been selected to illustrate concepts of representation and because they hold a prominent place in the history of Australian cinema. The article will serve as an introduction to the methodology—more comprehensive analyses will be the subject of future articles.

The films of this period were made without much regard for cultural sensitivity, and there was little or no creative engagement with Aboriginal people in the making of the films. It would not be until the 1990s when Aboriginal people were able to take up ‘above the line’ production roles such as composer or director for feature-length dramatic films.

The period in focus corresponds with greatly reduced production of feature films in Australia, following the introduction of sound into cinema with its subsequent costs, (Pike and Cooper 1998, 150) the aggressive block-booking of Hollywood films into Australian cinemas (Shirley and Adams 1989, 75) and the general economic effects of the Great Depression. Of that reduced film production, only a small proportion dealt in any part with Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander people or their culture. It was not until the late 1960s that feature film production would begin to climb towards the level seen in the first two decades of the twentieth century. (Pike and Cooper 1998, 234)

Many writers have described the ability of music in film to shape our perception of the narrative. The music is hidden, or “unheard”, (Gorbman 1987, 1) with a greater potential to have a subtle or covert impact on the spectator than the images. In the compact time span of a

\(^1\) The term ‘Aborigine’ when applied in the Australian mainland or surrounding islands, signifies peoples of dramatically diverse environments, languages and culture. Many films of the period in discussion give little consideration to such diversity. Marcia Langton warns us to avoid making “… the assumption of the undifferentiated ‘Other’. More specifically, the assumption … that all Aborigines are alike and equally understand each other, without regard to cultural variation, history, gender, sexual preference, and so on.” (Langton 1993, 27) In fact, Shaw, et al (2006, 268) point out that “in Australia, Indigenous peoples have universally rejected the term ‘Aborigine’ in favor of specific kin or language group identifications”. Despite the inadequacy of the descriptor, yet because of the absence of a suitable term to replace it, I shall continue its use in this article, apologizing in advance for any unintended offense the use of the term may incur.
film, stereotypes or well worn clichés are often called upon to represent people, objects, places, emotions and situations. (Flinn 1992, 7) The most enduring element of traditional Aboriginal music that has been incorporated into non-Indigenous contexts is the instrument the *didjeridu*, either directly or by emulation on Western instruments. The focus on the didjeridu as a representation of all Aboriginal people in non-Indigenous cultural artifacts does not give regard to the instrument’s provenance in the narrow strip across the far north of Australia from the Kimberley to East Arnhem Land and Groote Eylandt. (Yunupiŋu 1997, vii) The instrument has become widely, although not universally, accepted by both the Indigenous and non-Indigenous community as an instrument representing the Indigenous people of the whole continent and surrounding islands. Other elements of Aboriginal music that have been variously incorporated include the use or emulation of clap-sticks and of a falling melodic contour.

**Jindyworobakism**

*Jindyworobakism* had its origins in the idealisation of the noble savage of the eighteenth to late nineteenth century Europe and North America by writers such as Jean-Jacques Rousseau, François-René de Chateaubriand and Henry Longfellow. In Australia, it began as a literary movement seeking a primitivist connection for non-Indigenous Australians to the local environment through the agency of elements of Aboriginal culture, language and mythology. The term *Jindyworobak* was coined by poet Rex Ingamells in the late 1930s and is derived from a *Woiwurrung* word for “to join”. Composers who have been identified as drawing from the influence of Jindyworobak thought include John Antill, Clive Douglas, Alfred Hill, Mirrie Hill, James Penberthy, Peter Sculthorpe and Margaret Sutherland. Jindyworobakism in music has been defined as:

- the attempt by various composers to establish a uniquely Australian identity through the evocation of the Australian landscape and environment and through the use of Aboriginal elements, in their music, texts or subjects. (Symons 2002, 33)

The exclusively non-Indigenous Jindyworobaks seem from our perspective less concerned to engage with Aboriginal people in the making of literature or music than to create their own filtered view of Aboriginality as a source of influence to colour or exoticize non-Indigenous processes of creation in new works. The integration of Aboriginal culture into these works

---

2 *Woiwurrung* is an Indigenous language spoken by the *Wurundjeri* people of central Victoria.
usually amounted to the use of Aboriginal words for titles, often spuriously associated\(^3\), or stories passed through a filter of non-Indigenous sensibilities\(^4\). This appropriation of elements of culture was conducted without consideration of their original context, which might have held secret or sacred significance within the source communities.

Film score composition offered the mid-twentieth century Australian composer an opportunity to develop skills in orchestration and to gain some income in a time when serious commissions for Australian composers were few and far between. Nevertheless, because of the reduced output of feature films during the 1940s and 1950s alluded to above, the vast majority of film scoring work was for documentary films, and for most the inclusion of elements of Aboriginality would not have suited the focus of the film. John Antill, the most visible of the Jindyworobak cohort due to the success of his symphonic ballet *Corroboree* (1946), wrote a considerable number of documentary film scores, but none have yet been identified that incorporate elements of Aboriginal culture to any significant extent.

By contrast, other Australian composers of the time did not actively seek to forge a unique Australian voice but to continue the nineteenth century Western traditions of composition. While not described as such in their time, we can retrospectively consider them *neo-Romantic*. Such composers are Lindley Evans and Isador Goodman.

I will now discuss the score for four films of the period that feature Aboriginal people and culture—three feature-length dramas and a documentary. Two films are neo-Romantic in style; another is by a Jindyworobak composer, and a fourth by British composers Ralph Vaughan Williams and Ernest Irving.

**Uncivilized (1936) – director Charles Chauvel, composer Lindley Evans**

Charles Chauvel, having recently studied contemporary filmmaking practice in Hollywood, was keen to create a movie with potential for international success. The storyline patched together many established character stereotypes, each intended to broaden the appeal of the film. The film enjoyed a reasonable level of success and critics at the time were enthusiastic about the neo-Romantic-influenced score, praising its “barbaric beauty”. (Hoorn 2005) The story is heavily influenced by Edgar Rice Burrough’s novel *Tarzan of the Apes*, first appearing in film in 1918. In this Australianized version of the story, the main character Mara, “king” of an Aboriginal “tribe”, sings in an operatic baritone, bursting into song at

\(^3\) Mistranslations of words from Aboriginal languages could have quite amusing results, as evidenced by the controversy over the true meaning of *Moomba* as applied to an annual festival in Melbourne, Victoria held each year since 1955. [http://www.snopes.com/language/misxlate/moomba.asp](http://www.snopes.com/language/misxlate/moomba.asp) accessed 26th February 2012.

various times throughout the film. Although the story is set in the Kimberley region in northern Western Australia, the actors used to portray the Aboriginal people were brought in from Palm Island\(^5\), off the north coast of Queensland, and filming was done in Queensland and on a studio set in Sydney, New South Wales. The costumes and choreography appear to be an amalgam of different regions of Australia, probably sourced from early films and photographs taken on anthropological expeditions, such as those of Herbert Basedow\(^6\).

There is some use of recordings of unknown provenance of Aboriginal traditional music in the film soundtrack, including an early use of didjeridu in film. However, it would seem that no elements of traditional Aboriginal music have been incorporated into the musical score. Instead, the primary reference for representation in the musical score would appear to be the techniques that Max Steiner first introduced into Hollywood sound film scores to portray ‘primitive’ or non-Western peoples in the film *King Kong* (1932). (Slobin 2008, 8-18) Slobin describes five characteristic factors that Max Steiner employed:

1. a large orchestral ensemble to accompany a narrative set in an isolated, remote location
2. repetitive drum patterns, despite the almost total absence of membranophones in traditional Aboriginal music.
3. simple pentatonic scales to imply a simple people.
4. chromaticism to represent particular ethnic groups, in this case Afghans, as well as femininity, deviousness, and seduction — examples of all of these are heard in this film.
5. the association of instrumentation with particular events or emotional states, for example flute and harp accompanying images of (Western) feminine beauty, compared with the more brutal use of brass and drums for Aboriginal dance ceremonies.

All of these factors are evident in Evans’ score to *Uncivilized*.

**Aborigines of the Sea Coast (1948) – director C. P. Mountford, composer Mirrie Hill**

This film, produced by the Commonwealth Film Unit and directed by self-styled ethnologist Charles P Mountford, was part of a trio of films resulting from the 1948 *American Australian Scientific Expedition to Arnhem Land (AASEAL)*. Alfred and Mirrie Hill scored the three films, Aborigines of the Seacoast, Birds and Billabongs, and Arnhem Land. Mirrie wrote the score to the first, and her husband Alfred to the second and third. To inform the process of the writing, Mountford supplied Mirrie Hill with a collection of recordings of traditional

---

\(^5\) The circumstances of the involvement of the Palm Islanders in the making of this film is unknown, but other instances of the involvement of Aboriginal people in the making of films in Australia have certainly not been beneficial to the peoples themselves. For an account of the treatment of Aboriginal people during the making of the film *Bitter Springs*, see Verhoeven (2007: 231)

Aboriginal song on 78rpm records made during the AASEAL expedition by Colin Simpson and Ray Giles of the Australian Broadcasting Commission (ABC), and by himself. Mirrie Hill’s score is especially interesting as being derived almost entirely from these recordings of traditional song. Performed by Western style instruments and rendered in a pastoral style, the melodies can be linked directly to traditional song. However, this was done without consultation with the traditional owners of the cultural materials or consideration of the secret or sacred nature of some of the songs. This is most likely the first instance of such an extensive use of traditional Aboriginal song and is unique even amongst the Jindyworobak cohort. For example, John Antill’s *Corroboree* uses no direct elements of Aboriginal music, only echoes from the memory of a ceremony that he witnessed as a boy, further informed by the writings of anthropologists. While other more recent films have incorporated Aboriginal song into the narrative of the film, I am not aware of any others that meld Aboriginal song with non-Indigenous scoring to the extent that this film does. Mirrie Hill would later write a number of pieces deriving from these songs, including her Symphony in A (*Arnhem Land*) of 1954. In the publishing of these works, Mirrie Hill chose to acknowledge Mountford as a co-composer rather than to recognize the traditional owners of the music. This would have been in keeping with the times, when Aboriginal people were wards of the state and their cultural products considered to be the property of the wider community of Australia.

*Bitter Springs* (1950) – director Ralph Smart, composers Ralph Vaughan Williams and Ernest Irving

During the late 1940s and '50s, the Ealing Studios of the United Kingdom produced a number of feature films in Australia in an attempt to broaden their market and to strengthen imperial ties with Australia in the face of the hegemony of Hollywood cinema. (Limbrick 2010, 106) *Bitter Springs* (1950) directed by Ralph Smart and with a score composed by British composers Ralph Vaughan Williams and Ernest Irving, tells the story of a white settler family moving onto Aboriginal country and displacing the traditional owners from the life-giving waterhole. While the director saw this film as an opportunity to bring such displacements to the public eye and intended to end the story with a massacre of the white settlers, the studio

---

7 There are pages of notes that Antill has made seemingly from his readings of anthropological studies in the Antill collection at the National Library of Australia.

8 A more extensive interrogation of Mirrie Hill’s use of these musical materials is the subject of an article currently in preparation.

9 Letters to Mirrie Hill from Mountford held in the Hill Collection at the NSW State Library thank her for her granting to him of co-composing credits as a public acknowledgement of his ‘important’ work in recording the songs.
insisted on a more positive ending, with the less-believable integration of the Aboriginal people happily taking up their part as workers on the new sheep farm. (Verhoeven 2007, 183-284) The Australian Prime Minister of the day, Robert Menzies, heartily approved of the positive assimilationist message portrayed in the ending. (Verhoeven 2007, 277) Apart from the character Blackjack who travels with the settler family, the Aboriginal people in the film are never more than a nameless mass, and the dispute is thus rendered simply as a mathematical problem of too many people for one waterhole. (Verhoeven 2007, 194) The score, developed by Irving from thirty-eight bars sketched by Vaughan Williams (Kennedy 2006), is rich and colourful, but shows no connection to Aboriginal people or culture. The point of view established is neither of the settlers nor of the Aboriginal people but the audience, for whom the score is the vehicle to a comforting affiliation with the alien environment portrayed in the film. (Kassabian 2001, 2) Traditional Aboriginal chanting is used in the film but not incorporated into the music score. It is possible that the Aboriginal actors, brought in from the Ooldea mission on the fringe of the Nullabor plain in South Australia, recorded the traditional chants and dances. There is no use of didjeridu in the score, consistent with traditional song from the catchment of the Ooldea mission. While in the main the musical score does not draw on the Hollywood stereotypes exemplified by Max Steiner, regular timpani beats are heard underneath the cues associated with Aboriginal people. Whereas the story of *Uncivilized* is derived from Tarzan, the mythical African archetype, *Bitter Springs* is closer to the genre of the Hollywood Western.

**Jedda (1955) – director Charles Chauvel, composer Isador Goodman**

*Jedda* was Chauvel’s last feature film, but the one in his career that achieved the greatest international success. It was the first all-Australian production made in colour, and the first to feature Aboriginal actors as primary characters. Chauvel had intended for the score to be written by John Antill, but eventually the score came to be written by Isador Goodman10 a composer and concert pianist. He was a renowned interpreter of Chopin and his compositions draw influence from Chopin’s flourishing pianistic style.

The orphaned Jedda is adopted as a young child by a white woman who attempts to raise the child isolated from her traditional culture. Unlike any of the previous film scores discussed, Goodman avoids the use of a simple modal melody in the representation of the Aboriginal characters, composing a lush, passionate Romantic theme to represent Jedda’s

---

10 Isador Goodman was a close friend of Lindley Evans. Both men came to Australia from South Africa and were teachers at the NSW Conservatorium of Music. As Goodman had not composed for film before, it is likely that he was offered the opportunity to write the score for Jedda on Evans’ recommendation.
scarcely suppressed Aboriginal spirit. At various points in the film we hear recorded traditional Aboriginal music including the use of didjeridu, clap sticks, body percussion and chanting.

In her 1983 biography, Goodman’s wife Virginia relates how the composer had intended to integrate elements of Aboriginal instruments and music into the film score but that Chauvel’s wife Elsa had quashed the idea, considering it “too modern”. Elsa then replaced those cues with what Virginia Goodman refers to as “silent movie hurry music”. (Goodman 1983, 126) The biography also recounts how an attempt was made in the 1980s to reconstruct the score for the film but that notes and sketches used by the composer had apparently been discarded by the production company. (Goodman 1983, 126) It is hoped that further research might be able to turn up ephemera relating to the score. The music is certainly interesting in its own right and quite atypical of other films of the period dealing with Aboriginal characters or stories.

Despite the foregrounding of Aboriginal actors in this film, the race relations advocated for in the film are somewhat repugnant, strongly reinforcing the concept of assimilation that was long-standing and openly stated federal and state government policy.

Ultimately, the film reinforces the concept that Aboriginal cultures and customs will not be able to survive in the white world, embracing the dominant policy of the time of "smoothing the pillow of a dying race". (Senzani 2007)

**Conclusion**

Each of the above films presents a different approach to musical representation and the use of established stereotypes. Mirrie Hill’s score, derived almost entirely from Western-style orchestral arrangements of Aboriginal songs, is a dramatic change from the past—but it appears to be an isolated case. A deeper and more comprehensive sampling of films would be necessary to draw definitive conclusions on changes in the use of stereotypes in the representation of Aboriginality in Australian film music.

On the whole what is most striking about the representation of Aboriginal culture in Australian film before the 1990s is its almost complete absence. The films selected in this survey represent a small sampling of films, but in fact there are very few to choose from. It is only in the last couple of decades that filmmakers, both non-Indigenous and Indigenous, have been active in presenting Aboriginal stories and Aboriginal characters to the wider community in Australia and to the world. By comparison, a similar survey conducted by Gorbman (2000) tracing the history of musical representation of First Nations people of North America in Hollywood film scores dating from 1940 to 1980 is able to demonstrate a
clear progression away from the Steiner model of stereotypical representation as both the film-makers and the audience gain a greater appreciation and understanding of the cultures represented.

Michael V. Pisani, in his recent history of the interaction of Native American and non-indigenous North American culture in music argues that it is critical to acknowledge musical stereotypes used in the representation of an indigenous culture. He concludes:

Censoring a stereotype – even one based in sound – does not make it disappear. But putting a frame around it, consciously acknowledging its borders, and addressing its history at least helps us to understand why such stereotypes exist in the first place, and perhaps even to recognise, when we next encounter them, their effects on us and on society as a whole. (Pisani 2005, 332)

Film music, by its covert nature, is able to wield a powerful influence on shaping perceptions. Exposing the stereotypes used in the portrayal of cultures in film music disempowers those stereotypes, allowing us to conduct a dialogue with these historical artefacts and gain insights into the societal attitudes that engendered them.

References


<http://www.thefreelibrary.com/White+lubra%2Fwhite+savage%3A+Pituri+and+colonialist+


Langton, Marcia. 1993, ‘Well, I heard it on the radio and I saw it on the television’: An essay for the Australian Film Commission on the politics and aesthetics of filmmaking by and about Aboriginal people and things, North Sydney, Australian Film Commission.


McCarthy, James. 1999, *Film music of the 1960s: From the Film Australia Collection*. Canberra, Canberra School of Music, CD, CSM:36.


To a leaf player, a Yellow Box is like a Stradivarius violin – why not call it the ‘Stradileaf’? (Philip Elwood)

Introduction

In the mid-1990s, Australian leafist Philip Elwood (b. 1970) introduced a metaphorical comparison between a simple ribbon-reed aerophone (arguably the world’s cheapest instrument), and the prestigious Stradivarius violin. Odd as this comparison may seem, the sound of the Australian ‘gumleaf’ instrument has, on more than one occasion, been mistaken for violin music. Elwood’s local application of the Stradivarius concept of instrumental excellence only served to inspire competitive leafists to greater heights, for to be called the Stradivari of any field is to be deemed the finest there is.


Gunai-Kurnai Elder Herbert Patten (b. 1943) of Melbourne, Victoria, and Gumbainggir Elder Roseina Boston (b. 1935), of the Nambucca Valley, New South Wales (NSW) vitally inform ongoing research by reinforcing the gumleaf’s role as a medium for transmitting aspects of the environmental, social and spiritual principles of Aboriginal culture. Together with his

---

1 Well-known as a six-times national birdcall champion, Elwood won the Australian Gumleaf Playing Championship in 1996.
2 See, for example, Cheng (1997).
3 Australians use the misnomer ‘gumtree’ to designate all eucalypts, whilst foresters reserve the term ‘gums’ for smoothbarks only. Gumleaf instruments derive from the first three of the remaining five bark groupings of eucalypts: boxes, ironbarks, stringybarks, bloodwoods and peppermints. All leaves possess the same natural acoustic functions, but variations in their size, shape and texture necessitate minor changes in technique as they couple with the human organs of lips, tongue and soft palate.
4 See, for example, Vroland (1951). Gumleaves have also been mistaken for various wind instruments, the female voice, human whistling, and the chirping of insects (Ryan 1999, 215).
5 Wakin (2012) is the most recently published article to scrutinize the long-running debate over whether the enormous worth of the Stradivarius is rooted in myth or merit. See http://www.nytimes.com/2012/01/29/sunday-review/the-value-of-valuable-violins.html.
6 Patten (1999) demonstrates how leaf playing is mastered through the accumulation of aural and physical experience, his musical journey having begun when he observed his great-uncle blowing leaves in the bush at
CD/booklet (1999) and MA thesis (2007), Patten’s television and YouTube appearances have widely projected the leaf as a referent for indigenous culture.

Based on what is already known from old and new sources, the aim of the current paper is to re-orientate previous research to the evolving discipline of ecomusicology. Allen, in The Grove Dictionary of American Music (forthcoming 2013) defines the subfield of ecomusicology (or ecocritical musicology) as

the study of music, culture, and nature in all the complexities of those terms. Ecomusicology considers musical and sonic issues, both textual and performative, related to ecology and the natural environment.7

Scholars including Feld (1990; 2001) and Titon (2011) have conceptualized music cultures functioning as ecological systems, or ecosystems, indeed Feld’s holistic work on the interlocking, layered soundscape experienced by the Kaluli people in the Bosavi rainforest, Papua New Guinea extends back to the mid-1970s. Cultural ecology, according to Feld, (2001, 104) orients to the processes by which societies adapt to environments.

Accordingly, I interpret the indigenous Australian’s ‘green music-making’8 to be a reflection of their deep understanding of - and resonance with - their natural environment. Following this, I present my work on the usefulness (or otherwise) of testing leaf species to discover a superior ‘instrument’. I conclude by suggesting future directions for research and strategies for safeguarding and sustaining this minor yet iconic cultural fringe-tradition.

Leaf-Music-as-Environment

The first strand in this paper features vignettes of leaf-music-as-environment, (after Westerkamp 2001, 146)9 including the production of leaf birdcalls (a form of mimesis).

Gumleaf playing, I argue, is a most basic way for a musician to fit into the natural world. The leaf does not just evoke landscape, it is part of landscape, hence listening to leaf music...
becomes an exercise in learning to hear ‘place’. For that matter Rothenberg (2001, 6) noted that

Any music that fits into its place is an environmental music, one
that is enhanced by its surroundings and not fighting against them
as it plays. (2001, 6)

Take, for instance, the rustic sight, from 1838, of Lutheran refugee immigrants blowing leaf hymns under a riverside ‘gumtree’ in Hahndorf, South Australia (Brauer 1938, 73); or the ethical harmony between a young Aboriginal dancer and the natural surroundings of a waterhole in far west Queensland, where, on August 4 1876, she exhibited her musical skill by playing on a leaf held between her lips, and modulated by a blade of grass in the fashion of a Jew’s harp. (Hodgkinson (1877, 17)\(^{10}\)

Mid-twentieth-century boomerang-thrower Bill Onus created a popular sound and sight show at his art shop in the Dandenong Ranges, Victoria by inviting local indigenous people to perform corroborees, songs, and instrumental combinations including gumleaves, to entertain tourists. Enhanced by the ambience of bush, ferns and hills on a stage with a stream flowing beneath it, the music fitted into its place. (Ryan 1992, 33) It was as though Onus anticipated Ecotourism Australia’s twenty-first-century focus on “natural areas that foster environmental and cultural understanding, appreciation and conservation… including respect and acknowledgement of the region’s indigenous history”. (Eastwood 2009, 77-78)

Indigenous performances of Western tunes on gumleaves over at least six generations came to be regarded as desiderata, (things that are wanted or needed). James Goorie Dungay (b. 1958) of Kempsey, NSW calls the gumleaf by its traditional Dainggatti name of yili. He visualizes his ancestors playing yili for their own personal enjoyment because it “stirs the soul to make the unique, beautiful sounds of the bush… and it doesn’t come second to any other instrument”. Dungay relates yili to his culture as he plays over taped bird music.\(^{11}\)

By the late-twentieth-century the indigenous practice of blowing leaves to imitate animals and birds in hunting contexts (Ryan 1999, 41-42) had functionally transposed to a celebration of natural bush soundscapes. The spiritual resonance of leaf birdcalls serves memory, description and amusement by naming and sounding the voices of place including landscapes from which leafists have become spatio-temporally dislocated. The adoption of avifaunal musicalities has enabled Patten and Boston to reclaim cultural/political space, reinforce clan affiliation, and spiritually reconnect to country. A metaphysical pastime of Patten’s is to ‘play

\(^{10}\) For a fuller description, see Ryan (2011, 106).

\(^{11}\) Robin Ryan Collection (RRC Tape 14, 1997).
back to a tree’, often without detaching its leaves, in order to feel the spirit of the bush through
the tree.

Patten copies the female *Brinjeri* (Eastern Whipbird) with a human tongue roll or by a trill on a
leaf; and simulates *Guniyaruk* (Gippsland Black Swan) honks on Gippsland Mahogany leaves.12

Another inclusive form of musicianship that invokes the ‘calling of the land’ sees Boston
‘shivering’ the chuckling sounds of her personal totem, the *Gaagum* (Laughing Kookaburra)
on a Brittle Gum (*E. mannifera*) leaf.13 It could be said that avifaunal leaf sounds have been
objectified, i.e. made into a heritage with imagined reference to the past. (Coplan 1991, 37)

**The State-of-Preference Test**

The second strand in this paper is based on the premise that a performer’s informed
understanding of the discrete physical qualities of flexible leaf material might advantage
competitive performance because the music produced is a direct product of - and restrained
by - the physical and biological properties of individual leaves.

Over five consecutive years (1993-1997), I documented performers’ hands-on knowledge of the
music leaves that they transported to the Australian Gumleaf Playing Championship (a contest
that operated from 1977-1997 in Maryborough, Victoria). Patten favoured Yellow Box (*E.
melliodora*) and Gippsland Mahogany (*E. botryoides*). Boston performed on Ghost Gum (*E.
papuana*); Dungay on Forest Red Gum (*E. tereticornis*). Virgil Reutens (b. 1939) selected
Yellow Box leaves from Mt Eliza, Victoria; and Philip Elwood Red Ironbark (*E. sideroxylon*)
leaves from his ‘busking tree’ in Melbourne’s Bourke Street Mall.14

In consultation with eucalyptologist Neil Hallam, I explored the hypothesis that certain
eucalypt leaves have superior playability because melodic range and timbre is species
dependent. I purposed to find the competition’s ‘Stradileaf’ by devising a State-of-Preference
Test in which Elwood, Patten and Reutens independently performed on sets of undisclosed
leaves, and commented on their musical suitability.15

---

12 RRC Tape 4, 1998. In 1994, soundscape artist Sheree Delys piped Patten’s recorded gumleaf mimicry through
the leaves of her *Experimenta Plant Sculpture*. The exhibition was installed at the Royal Botanic Gardens, Sydney
and Melbourne, the Adelaide Festival of Arts, and various venues around Europe.

13 Boston will often talk seriously to a bird (*biijin*) or tree (*bigwrr*); birds ‘speak’ back to her, and she purports
to protect them. Once, on noticing boys preparing to shoot parrots on the Nandock River, she plucked a leaf from
the nearest Spotted Gum (*E. maculata*) and simulated a bird-of-prey, the silvery-toned *garrirri* (Square-tailed Kite).
The parrots scattered for cover in the bush (RRC Tape 7, 1995).

14 Elwood also plays indoor plants in restaurants. Preserving all leaves, he enjoys the faint rustling sound emitted
by the other leaves as he plays.

15 The tests underwent improved development between 30 May 1994 and 1 June 1995, including the introduction of
a plastic leaf standard against which to compare the relative parameters of pitch, timbre and volume (Ryan 1999,
274-85).
Although Patten awarded Red Ironbark a high mark for its strong trumpet-like timbre, all three subjects ultimately selected a mellow-toned leaf from the durable timbered Yellow Box, Australia’s top honey-producing tree.\textsuperscript{16} \textit{E. melliodora} now found itself valued for the sweetness of sounds blown across leaves that transformed directly from sprig to instrument. With facile handling, the lanceolate-shaped leaves provided perfect mouth-shaped curves on their opposite extremes against which the performers could couple their mouths. Although matching the softness of paper in consistency, they do not fray during transport and can service 3-4 tunes.

Hallam razor-cut sections of relevant leaves for light microscope analysis. Findings indicated that low cineol content contributes to Yellow Box palatability, a large number of air spaces to lightness, and thin texture to elasticity and dependability in the upper pitch range. Further tests indicated the capacity of Yellow Box to permit wide-ranging tunes, with most 4 cm length leaves spanning Middle C# to Bb\textsuperscript{#}. Although similar tests conducted with the lusher rainforest leaves of Queensland would elicit entirely different preferences, it was nevertheless concluded that general principles of leaf selection hold fast. (\textbf{Figure 1}) The leaf specimens used were sized, pressed and tabulated, and each subject’s results were plotted. (\textbf{Figures 2 and 3}) In reflexive criticism of the test, methodology was constrained by the fact that new sets of leaves had to be used for each performer, besides which, even if plucked from the same plant, leaf instruments are prone to enormous variability in age, shape and size between the stages of old- and new-growth. I defer, moreover, to Allen’s (2012) article on Stradivari’s violins and the musical trees of the Paneveggio in the Italian Province of Trentino.

\textbf{Figure 1. General Principles of Music Leaf Selection}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age:</th>
<th>an intermediate leaf</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Morphology:</td>
<td>mouth-shaped and isobilateral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blade condition:</td>
<td>clean and smooth (unnotched)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texture:</td>
<td>neither too thick nor too thin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venation:</td>
<td>controls leaf rigidity and durability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuticle composition:</td>
<td>thick enough to hold a vibrating leaf intact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moisture content:</td>
<td>a factor affecting vibration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of oil glands:</td>
<td>fewer for palatability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{16} The greyish-blue crowned Yellow Box of Victoria and NSW grows in open forest and savannah woodland.
Figure 2. State-of-Preference Test 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Eucalypt Species</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Rating (scale of 10)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Plastic Leaf Standard: good range of high notes</td>
<td>PL</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lemon-scented Gum (E. citriodora): thin ‘emergency leaf’ for ‘blue’ notes; a nice tone</td>
<td>LS</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yellow Box (E. melliodora): flexible, pliable and durable (lasts 3-4 songs); a mild taste</td>
<td>YB</td>
<td>9½</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Mahogany (E. triantha): emergency leaf only; requires too much pressure on lips</td>
<td>WM</td>
<td>4½</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red Ironbark (E. sideroxylon): excellent leaf; a strong, trumpet-like sound</td>
<td>RI</td>
<td>9½</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red-flowering Gum (E. ficifolia): thick, sturdy (requires extra pressure); the ‘tuba of leaves’</td>
<td>RFG</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flooded Gum (Moitch; E. rudis): flaws show up in membrane; Subject C wouldn’t use it</td>
<td>FG</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sydney Blue Gum (E. saligna): very brittle, splits easily; play rounded part</td>
<td>SBG</td>
<td>7½</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Snow Gum (E. pauciflora): not an ideal leaf; splits easily; trumpety timbre</td>
<td>SG</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grey Box (E. microcarpa): thick, round birdcall leaf of ‘tuba’ category; high range limited</td>
<td>GB</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bushy Yate (E. lehmannii): powdery white mallee sapling; thin, flexible; could split</td>
<td>BYM</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yellow Mallee (E. incrassata): play juvenile leaves within first few hours of picking</td>
<td>YM</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3. Graph of State-of-Preference Test 3

Method: Use industrial plastic cut to the shape of a leaf (roughly the shape of the lips) as a standard, and compare its sound (10/10) to that of selected eucalypt leaves. All plastic ‘leaves’ of the same size, cut from the same sheet, can be regarded as standard, unlike natural leaves. Find the lowest and highest notes on the plastic leaf, and record a tune on it. Test each eucalypt leaf in the same way, comparing each to the plastic leaf. Plot results on a graph.
Allen (2012, 313) points out how, since at least 1817, interested parties have conducted blind sound trials in which experts attempt to determine which of a number of instruments is the ‘Strad’. Most, Allen adds, have not provided much more than the insights of chance. Informed by Appadurai’s socialized view of commodities (1986), Allen points out that it has been tastemakers, dealers and performers who have driven and generated respect for the ‘Strad’. Most recently, Wakin (2012) maintains that all have an interest in maintaining the reputation of the instrument as a source of both wealth and prestige.

By the same token, the value we now ascribe to the Yellow Box leaf might lie akin to what Allen (2012, 314) discerns (for the ‘Strad’) as “its process of becoming, its life history”.

18 Result: Although weighted equally, Yellow Box had a distinct edge over Red Ironbark. The relative performance rating for eucalypt leaves is represented more clearly in Figure 3, using the leaf codes above.
Yellow Box has become desiderata through the manifestation of musical preferences at leaf contests. Conditioned via adjudication, these are quickly shared and perpetuated among competitors.

Leaf playing in Aboriginal Australia takes on a different slant. Informed by alfresco hereditary culture, Patten emulates the deep, full notes that his Great-uncle Lindsay Thomas produced; his strong ‘resonance leaves’ Turpentine (Syncarpia glomulifera)\(^{19}\) and River Red Gum (E. camaldulensis) can be heard at a distance of 500 metres through thick mountain scrub. Nevertheless, in its process of ‘becoming’, the leaf is the most ephemeral instrument of all, which begs the question: will stressed eucalypt landscapes be able to withstand the impacts of climate change? Yellow Box, yili, janggwrr and other ‘music leaves’ are, of course, finite musical resources subject not only to the clearing of huge acres of Australian native landscape for agricultural and residential development, but also to the laws of nature. Australia’s dry, temperate, sub-tropical and tropical climates have fluctuated during the past few million years and plant distributions have waxed and waned accordingly. Scientists are now in a strong position to monitor and predict the impacts of climate change on the direction of floristic change.

Texture, as shown in Figure 1, bears on the selection of music leaves; hence the relevance of evidence mounting to indicate that eucalypts in a high carbon dioxide environment will produce thicker leaves (Macquarie University 2007). Although eucalypts generally adapt to stress, many have specific needs that will see them respond individualistically to temperature change of a few degrees. An ecotonal change is likely to occur, for example, as the Queensland rainforest expands at the expense of eucalypt forest. (Hughes 2003, 433)

**Conclusion**

Gumleaf music reflects on the relationship between nature and culture in musical behaviour, thinking and sound that is remote from the practice of mainstream music. Leafists themselves have shared some similar environments but not always the same cultural definitions.

Since Australia’s foliaceous ecosystems vary enormously, there is no one Stradileaf. A State-of-Preference Test projected the musical superiority of Yellow Box for mid-1990s national competitors in Victoria only. Understanding of leaf physiology can benefit those striving to master this difficult instrument, however performers may need to adapt to new plant species in

---

\(^{19}\) Resilient Turpentine leaves can be trusted to reach all the notes that Patten needs (Patten 2007, 18). The natural resonance pattern of a leaf is relative to its shape, size and organic material as determined by the number of harmonics present in its sound and their relative strengths to each other. This in turn depends on the player’s vocal tract, the leaf’s sound excitation by means of breath pressure, the amount of breath used, and the angle of the direction of breath used in the leaf’s sound excitation.
the future. Further research could be conducted into a science-based method of performance, bearing in mind that only a rare artist can make a leaf ‘sing’. Circular breathing has yet to be tested as a means for leafists to achieve greater breath control, and the characteristics of a rich gumleaf timbre could be more closely examined through a power spectrum.

The future of gumleaf music research could lie in the innovative approaches of ecomusicology. There remains a huge databank of indigenous knowledge to draw on as we work towards interpreting the leaf music ecosystem in relation to Australia’s unique biodiversity. The record of flora and fauna is a crucial key to understanding how past leafists have worked in harmony with the elements of the natural environment, given the indigenous concept that each and every leaf has a voice of its own. Patten has cultivated dingo howls and frog croaks in addition to birdecalls but it is possible that the variety of sounds that can be produced on countless species of leaves may approximate the huge variety of sounds made by human voices.

Research into ergonomic connections existing between proven ‘music leaves’ and working environments in Aboriginal Australia could be fruitful, including the ecocritical approach of re-visioning the role of leaf instruments in landscapes impacted by human forces over time. Climate change may affect ecosystem integrity, but it is also true that the supply and variety of leaf sound makers has always been subject to the richness or harshness of local habitats.

Could the future of gumleaf music in Australia be comparable to that of China’s “tree leaf”, which Cheng (1997, 30) suggested could be used in many kinds of music in the late-twentieth-century and beyond? Scope remains, for example, for leaf mimesis to be sensitively incorporated into ecologically sustainable tourism. The unique timbres of gumleaves afford audiences an imaginative exercise in hearing the vibrations – and smelling the fragrance - of the bush.

For some, green music making might ‘mess’ with a conventional view of music because leaf instruments are devoid of economic concerns. “For, while we are created from nature”, notes Rothenberg, (2001, 5) “we are somehow cast out by our wily, civilized ways”. This paper has shown, to the contrary, that acoustic sounds teased out of leaf material are capable of defining an indigenous performer’s artistic cultural survival on a daily basis, driven by what Rothenberg (2001, 5) so eloquently describes as a “perennial aesthetic pull of the earthy, the natural, the green, the living”.

Acknowledgements
Appreciation is extended to the many leafists who collaborated in this study. I gratefully acknowledge the support of Margaret Kartomi and Neil Hallam. More recently, Aaron Allen provided rigorous guidance on the ecomusicological issues that inform this paper.

References


Macquarie University. 2007. “Speed of climate change puts trees at risk.”
Vroland, Anna. 1951. Their music has roots. Autograph in Melbourne University Library.

Introduction
This paper attempts to re-vision our understanding of both the practice of informal music making as well as the social context in which Indigenous1 and non-Indigenous community singers perform together. The paper will firstly consider the *a cappella* scene’s practice, aesthetics and representation. It will briefly examine the community singing movement that has emerged from that scene and the influence of Indigenous music on repertory, before returning to the intercultural examples of community singing. This investigation will then endeavour to reveal how cross-cultural understandings of aesthetics and representation are negotiated within the practice of ‘singing in between’. ‘Singing in between’ occurs in a physical, metaphorical and constructed space that symbolizes an ideal of reconciliation. The notion draws upon Bhabha’s

'in-between' spaces [which] provide the terrain for elaborating strategies of selfhood - singular and communal - that initiate new signs of identity, and innovative sites of collaboration, and contestation, in the act of defining the idea of society itself. (1994, 2)

The Australian *a cappella* scene and community singing movement
In the mid to late 1980s, Australian *a cappella* emerged and soon became a vibrant music scene that sought to democratize singing. (Downie 1995, 1996; Rickwood 1997, 1998; Backhouse 2003; Smith 2005) “Everyone can sing” was its mantra, and the scene made that seem possible. It deliberately refashioned the landscape of community choral singing by creating an open, informal approach that operated independently of institutionalized choral traditions. The scene created a sense of itself as alternative - a contemporary hip engagement with unaccompanied harmony singing. (Downie 1996) Consequently, community choirs quickly materialized.

As previously noted by Downie (1995, 1996), Smith (2005) and Rickwood (1997, 1998) the *a cappella* scene engaged strongly with the multicultural movement of the 1980s-1990s and

---

1 The Indigenous population of Australia includes Aborigines and Torres Strait Islanders. I use the term Indigenous when referring to the population group as a whole. Accordingly, the term Aboriginal is used for that specific group within the Indigenous population. It should be noted that many Indigenous people identify primarily with their language group, which I adopt in this article.
embraced world music, as a cosmopolitan representation of itself. Importantly, the *a cappella* scene united with the folk movement. Both the repertoire and practice of *a cappella* singing mirrored the folk movement’s sense of authenticity, shared the same left-liberal activism, and despite a similar predilection for the causes of the oppressed, its participants were also predominantly middle-class. (Rickwood 1997; 1998; Smith 2003, 286-288 cited in Homan and Mitchell 2008, 6; 2005; 2009)

The result of these social and musical influences was to create an eclectic repertory that embraced global musics and could express, if desired, political concerns or empathy with the struggle of others. (Rickwood 1998, 71) Traditional or folk music from Europe, the UK, Africa and the Pacific, world music, contemporary pop, gospel, barbershop and doowop were among the myriad of possible musical selections. (Rickwood 1997, 1998) Particular styles became popular because of the accessibility of the music and/or the preferences of the musicians from both overseas and within Australia who worked with community choirs. The *a cappella* scene enthusiastically nurtured the community singing movement which is now far more pervasive. As has been argued elsewhere, (Rickwood 2010) this has normalized community singing, losing the alternative nature of the *a cappella* scene. However, similar to the scene, the community singing movement promotes cultural vibrancy and social harmony.

**Indigenous influence**

Interestingly, Australian Indigenous songs were not strongly represented in the early *a cappella* repertory although the independent nature and breadth of community choirs makes this difficult to determine definitively. Nonetheless, it was clear that the repertoire of a number of women’s community choirs was influenced by the Melbourne based group, Tiddas. Gibson and Dunbar-Hall (2008, 265) suggest that Tiddas members were reluctant to see their creativity in terms of any given agenda, however, their repertoire contributed to feminist and Aboriginal politics which appealed to the *a cappella* scene at the time. Women’s community choirs performed such songs as *Inanay*², *Tiddas*³ and *Happy Earth* in the mid 1990s. Singer-songwriter Joe Geia’s *Yil Lull*⁴ also featured.

While recognition of the power of traditional music in Aboriginal communities is well established, (see, for instance, Stubington 2007), Gibson and Dunbar-Hall (2008) have noted that contemporary Indigenous music makes important statements: about health and

---

² A popularly recognized Yorta Yorta children’s song - the Yorta-Yorta nation is situated in the state of Victoria. *Inanay* became well known when used by ABC TV for promotional purposes.
³ *Yorta Yorta* for “sisters”.
⁴ “Sing” in Guugu Yimithirr, a language group based in far north Queensland.
wellbeing, language reclamation and strengthening, and personal and group relationships to country, especially within the framework of Aboriginal cosmology.

Since the 1970s, Indigenous arts and issues have been increasingly embraced by mainstream Australia. From a musical perspective, recorded Indigenous contemporary music has been commercially promoted to mainstream Australia since the late 1980s-1990s. (see, for instance, Dunbar-Hall and Gibson 2004, Gibson and Dunbar-Hall 2008) The Folk Movement has been instrumental in the transfer of Indigenous artistic expressions from silence to celebration. (Neuenfeldt 2002, cited in Smith 2005, 70) At the same time, there has been increasing intercultural collaborations by professional musicians in a variety of genres. These shifts are reflected in the repertory of the community singing movement which has seen a rising Indigenous influence over the last decade. Some traditional and contemporary Indigenous songs are commonly performed. These include the previously mentioned Inanay and Yil Lull, My Island Home by Neil Murray, and Baba Waiar by Miseron Levi. They are performed by many community choirs and are included in singing workshops or in choral events throughout the country, no matter the cultural background of their members. They represent the Australian Indigenous elements of what could be regarded as a community choral canon.

This canon is grounded in the a cappella scene which placed world music and black gospel material musically and ideologically central. The inclusion of Indigenous musics fits within this schema because it likewise provokes investment of great social and personal significance. It is

the direct somatic and emotional address of the music [which] may give performers access to a transformative experience with a complex relationship to the material’s manifest cultural and political context. (Smith 2005, 153)

Within localized intercultural collaborations of community singing Indigenous musics play a highly significant role on the practice, aesthetics and representations that are produced. Invariably, where there is intent to bring Indigenous and non-Indigenous people together to sing, there is also intent to create a repertoire that both embraces Indigenous musics and addresses contemporary social and cultural issues, particularly in adopting an agenda of reconciliation.

**Intercultural collaborations**

---

5 “Father we ask” in Kala Lagaw Ya language of the Western Torres Strait. The Torres Strait is north of mainland Australia, between the state of Queensland and Papua New Guinea.
Madjitil Moorna, which is Noongar\(^6\) for “Magical Sounds of the Bush”, is based in Perth, Western Australia. The choir regularly performs \textit{Sorry Song} by singer-songwriter Kerry Fletcher, a musical apology to The Stolen Generations. The most notable performance was in the city of Perth at the time of the Rudd Apology in 2008\(^7\). It was originally written in 1998 and subsequent to the Rudd Apology changes were made to the ostinato and an additional verse and chorus written to express the changes brought about by the Apology.

Madjitil Moorna’s repertoire also includes children’s songs such as \textit{Inanay} and \textit{Serra Ray}\(^8\); popular material such as \textit{My Island Home} and \textit{Yil Lull; Down in the Kitchen}\(^9\); the iconic \textit{I Am Australian} by Bruce Woodley and Dobe Newton; and originals by the Musical Directors that use language such as \textit{Ngank Boodjak}\(^{10}\) by Della Rea Morrison and Jessie Lloyd and the WAMI award-winning \textit{Raining in Djiilba}\(^{11}\) by its latest Musical Director, George Walley. These songs capture some of the essence of Indigenous music identified by Gibson and Dunbar-Hall (2008) referred to earlier.

Madjitil Moorna’s endeavour is to use singing and song as means for reconciliation and healing and it attempts an ambitious program of public performances, engagement with local communities, and outreach projects with, for example, the Halls Creek community, in the East Kimberley. In a report on the Halls Creek project Randell saw the project’s objectives as being “to sing and play with as many people as possible, pass on some skills and generally build confidence and community pride”. (Randell 2010) The choir aims to demonstrate to the wider community a socially equitable, harmonious and joyous representation of a reconciled Australia.

Madjitil Moorna was conceived by Jo Randell, a community music leader and arts activist, and was initially directed by Morrison and Lloyd, Indigenous musicians and community singing leaders, in order to perform at the 2006 Zig Zag Community Festival. Choir members

\(^6\) It should be noted that Noongar is the common dialect of a number of a language groups in South West Western Australia. “Magical sounds of the bush” is a translation that has been surrounded in some debate but is beyond the scope of this article to discuss in detail.

\(^7\) On 13 February 2008, the then newly elected Prime Minister of Australia, Kevin Rudd, said ‘sorry’ to the Indigenous peoples of the country. It was a significant historical and symbolic moment. The Apology to the Stolen Generations, those Indigenous people forcibly removed from their families, communities, country, was for many Australians a long time coming. The previous Government, led by John Howard, had refused to formally apologies, despite increasing pressure since “Sorry Day” in 1998. It is beyond the scope of this article to discuss in further detail. (See, for example, Auguste 2010).

\(^8\) Torres Strait Creole for “Seagull”

\(^9\) A Mission song from the 1930s

\(^10\) Noongar for “Mother Earth”

\(^11\) Djiilba is Noongar for the Mandurah Estuary and also one of six Noongar seasons.
are committed to gaining a better understanding of Noongar and other Indigenous cultures. The Indigenous musical directors and members lead cultural learning projects. Both the Indigenous and non-Indigenous members of Madjitil Moorna have predominantly urban backgrounds and were familiar with popular, folk and/or a cappella music and so the ‘natural’ vocal aesthetic of the community singing movement was notable. Indigenous influences were made apparent in the specific repertoire selected with its prioritizing of Indigenous songs and singing in language, and also in the use of guitar and clap stick accompaniment as opposed to purely a cappella.

Intercultural collaborations in Central Australia are differently practiced. Based in Alice Springs in the Northern Territory is Asante Sana (“thank you very much” in Swahili). Asante Sana began in 2006, when Morris and Barb Stuart created a community group to sing at a bend in Trephina Gorge – a natural amphitheatre near Alice Springs as part of the Alice Desert Festival. Since that time Asante Sana has created a significant local profile and continues to perform at the Alice Desert Festival, as well as singing at various community events.

Morris Stuart, the Musical Director, is also a pastor, theologian, social scientist and teacher. Born in Guyana of African heritage, he was educated in London before migrating to Australia with his Australian born wife. Stuart’s enterprise is to “draw in people from different cultures and ages to community arts through singing” (Stuart 2008).

African freedom and gospel songs feature strongly in the repertoire. Stuart believes this music can be a strong political force for inspiring people because, he says,

it’s about justice and freedom and hope and I think it’s an abiding message and a particularly important message for this time in Australia’s history. (cited in Lee 2008a)

Unlike Madjitil Moorna, Asante Sana currently has no Indigenous members. Typical of many community choirs, its membership is predominantly female and middle-class. In fact, Stuart soon realized that the choir itself was not one that might attract Indigenous membership. However, through a range of activities Asante Sana has, to quote, “stepped across the Aboriginal/non Aboriginal divide”. (Stuart 2008) Stuart has placed Asante Sana within an extensive inter-choir community in the Alice Springs region that includes Aboriginal
women’s choirs from Areyonga\textsuperscript{12}, Titjikala\textsuperscript{13} and Alice Springs. These collaborations, he claims, show that

[s]inging is one of the best ways to promote harmony in the community ...[and] the community will ... reap the benefits of this music (sic) contribution to reconciliation. (Stuart 2010)

Peta Boon, the non-Indigenous Manager of the Alice Springs Aboriginal Program at the Salvation Army facilitates one of these choirs, Tnantjama Ngkatja Ntjarrala, \textit{Arrernte}\textsuperscript{14} for “Praise in Many Languages”. Noreen Hudson who, together with her two sisters, was taught three part harmonies by her parents (Hudson 2010) generally leads the singing sessions. Most members have been brought up in the Lutheran missionary tradition at Hermannsburg and have strong musical backgrounds. Some of the women have performed with the Ntaria (Hermannsburg) Choir. The choir primarily sings hymns in \textit{Arrernte} and occasionally \textit{Pitjantjatjara, Luritja} or \textit{Walpiri}\textsuperscript{15}.

Over the last few years, Tnantjama Ngkatja Ntjarrala has linked with Asante Sana and the other two Aboriginal women’s choirs for performances in the Desert Voice Concert at the Alice Desert Festival. All four choirs perform songs from their individual repertoires. The festival event also provides an opportunity to create a combined Central Australian Aboriginal Women’s Choir which performs popularly recognized songs such as \textit{Yampi Matilda}\textsuperscript{16} and \textit{Encarta Pita}\textsuperscript{17}. Noreen Hudson recognizes the value of these collaborations:

\begin{quote}
We can sing together and then they can sing their own songs and we can sing our own songs. That’s ... really nice. We doing, we sharing. (Hudson 2010)
\end{quote}

The three Aboriginal women’s choirs also join with Asante Sana to sing songs that symbolically represent their intercultural collaboration such as the South African gospel song \textit{Vuma}\textsuperscript{18}, which draws on expressions of Christian spirituality (and which is understood to be shared at some level), and expressions of unity such as the anthemic and inclusive \textit{Why We Sing} by Greg Gilpin. The Desert Voice Concert, and a range of opportunities to sing together

\textsuperscript{12} Areyonga is situated in a beautiful narrow valley approximately 220 kilometres west of Alice Springs. The community of about 200 people refers to their home as “Utju”.

\textsuperscript{13} Titjikala is a similar sized community, located about 107 kilometres south of Alice Springs, on the edge of the Simpson Desert, in the former cattle station of Maryvale.

\textsuperscript{14} The \textit{Arrernte} people are based in Central Australia in the Northern Territory, in and around Alice Springs.

\textsuperscript{15} These are neighbouring Central Australian Aboriginal languages.

\textsuperscript{16} \textit{Waltzing Matilda} in \textit{Pitjantjatjara} translated by Daphne Puntjnai Burton.

\textsuperscript{17} \textit{Kumbaya} in \textit{Arrernte} translated by L. Moketarinja.

\textsuperscript{18} “Believe” in Swahili
over the months prior to it, therefore provides access to repertoire outside of the Aboriginal choirs’ Lutheran traditions.

Unlike Madjitil Moorna’s urbanized representation of intercultural collaboration these Central Australian collaborations reveal starker cultural differences in musical knowledge and aesthetics.

The Aboriginal singers have strong musical traditions, learning harmonies while at church, in school and in the casual singing sessions that were often held in the afternoons or the evenings. (Lee 2008b) Many of the women regard singing as very much a part of both their culture and their Christianity. Original material had been composed by a few of them, contemporary songs of praise that, according to Hudson, drew on Lutheran musical traditions and Aboriginal understandings of song composition. (Hudson 2010) Their approach to singing together was more fluid and fewer directives: someone would begin and others would join in, bringing the harmonies with them. The tonal quality was evocative of traditional aesthetics. As Rose (2003) has recognised:

This is a unique musical language only made possible when the traditional and emotive vocal lines of Central Australian voices are applied to Lutheran hymnal music. The sound comes from the throat and nose with little portamento glides from pitch to pitch and an organic sense of rhythm.

Many of the non-Indigenous singers in Central Australia were generally urban based and most from interstate. Many singers had learnt music informally through community choirs and some were highly dependent on the musical direction that gave starting notes and clear indication of rhythm and changes in melodic lines for each part. Repetition was necessary to embody the material. Others were from musical families, or were in school or church choirs, or had formal musical training.

On the occasions when the non-Indigenous singers sang the Aboriginal choirs’ repertoire, they attempted the tonal quality as well as language. Likewise, when the a cappella repertoire was attempted, the Aboriginal singers aimed to achieve the desired timbre. Ultimately though, a unique blend often resulted.

“Singing in between” and reconciliation

Indicative of the community music movement’s assumptions of the universality, connectivity and transformative qualities of music, intercultural community music-making operates on the belief that singing is safe action. Singing is regarded as a softer form of communication that brings people together.
With this understanding, these sites of singing in between in both Western Australian and the Northern Territory are exploring ways to affect reconciliation outside institutional frameworks by creating a musical space that both bridges and bonds cultural difference. They are sites where Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians share songs and stories in order to sing with “other selves”; (Rose 2007) they are opportunities for the “cultural interrelatedness” that Langton (1993) argues is necessary in order for Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians to overcome the assumption of the undifferentiated other.

As Mick Dodson has recognized many Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians are unaware of each others’ values and ways of life. Consequently, our commonalities and divergences are unknown. (Dodson 2009) Singing in between exposes this lack of awareness. The lived experience of intercultural collaboration brings the realities of Australia’s colonial legacy into sharp focus, as well as the commonalities grounded in music making.

Some non-Indigenous singers were knowingly engaging with Indigenous Australians for the first time. For others, who have lived or worked in communities with Indigenous people, it is an opportunity to associate in an often-different context. For the Indigenous singers, it likewise provides a unique engagement with non-Indigenous Australians. And for urban-based Indigenous singers, these were the first opportunities to unite with Indigenous Australians from remote areas, whose culture seemed to them to be more continuous, whose ways of life were different to their urban experiences.

Undoubtedly, the repertoire of these intercultural collaborations celebrates Aboriginal culture and experience. This practice can be seen to encourage Aboriginal involvement through its preference to respond to their choral traditions or musical expressions. At the same time, these musical representations are valued and valuable to its practice. Songs are also chosen to reflect the perceived shared values of the group. They are representative of music’s capacity to bring diverse people together. The repertoire seeks to capture a spirit of reconciliation. The often-fruited politics of reconciliation are absent. (see, for instance, Young 2000; Short 2003; Ingamells 2010; Auguste 2010 and Altman and Hinkson (eds) 2007 and 2010) Instead these community singers enact reconciliation in their own fashion: non-Indigenous singers facilitating and participating in community singing that made connections with Indigenous singers who were keen to share their culture, their songs, their stories.

Cross-cultural experiences of colonial history and musicality framed the practice but the shared endeavour of singing for and with each other enabled negotiations about aesthetics and representation.
The participatory discrepancies (Keil and Feld 1994, Keil 1995) of singing in between are experienced uniquely when, as one Aboriginal singer claimed, “Both Anangu” and white people are living, eating, singing in harmony”. (Hore 2010) The negotiations are made possible because of structures and processes that are familiar to both and bounded within a shared love of singing, a familiarity with singing in harmony, an eagerness to learn new repertoire, and the desire to cross cultural and musical experiences.

**Conclusion**
Intercultural collaborations re-vision the practice of community singing and its social context. In these intercultural collaborations the community singers sought, discovered and expressed a new sense of harmony; one that represented a sense of place and history that embraced Indigenous experiences and the notion of human unity; and one that was both musical and metaphorical. What is striking about the harmony created in intercultural collaborations is its powerful affect. Tears are not uncommon when singing in between is performed.

**Acknowledgements**
Thank you to the generosity, kindness and spirit of Madjitil Moorna, Asante Sana, Tnaptjama Ngkatja Ntjarrala, the women’s choirs from Titjikala and Areyonga, and all the singers at ‘The Big Sing in the Desert’ in 2010. I would also like to thank the members of MSA and NZMS for their keen observations on my conference paper. Special thanks needs to be given to the MSA Awards Committee members and the reviewers for their incisive comments on the first renderings of this paper. My appreciation goes also to Howard Morphy, Ruth Lee Martin and Sarah Scott for their ongoing supervisory support.

**References**

19 “(Aboriginal) person”; found in a number of Western and Central Desert languages.


Dodson, Michael. 2009. “How well do we know each other?” *ANU Reconciliation Lecture* at the National Film and Sound Archive, June.


Gibson, Chris and Peter Dunbar-Hall. 2008. “Contemporary Aboriginal music”, in *Sounds of then, sounds of now*, Shane Homan & Tony Mitchell (eds), Hobart (ACYS), 253-270.


Hore, Rachel. 2010. personal communication

Hudson, Noreen. 2010. personal conversation (unstructured interview)


Langton, Marcia. 1993, ‘Well I heard it on the radio and I saw it on the television.’ An essay for the Australian Film Commission on the politics and aesthetics of filmmaking by and about Aboriginal people and things. Sydney: Australian Film Commission.
Randell, Jo. 2010, personal communication
———. 2010, personal communication
Part 5. Collaboration
Chapter 22. Re-Viewing history through sound – fact or fiction? Helen English.

Introduction
The 20th century philosopher Paul Ricoeur said: “conflict is a function of man’s most primordial constitution”. (1986, 132) This conflict – between one’s self and one’s others, between character and personality, between feelings and thinking makes us restless and in our restlessness we are driven to create a history for ourselves. The topic of this paper is the validity of soundscapes that draw on history and whose purpose is to project a specific time and place – a temporality. This is a rich topic, which can be broken down into a number of key areas. For the purposes of this paper I will look at the following key areas: Narrative, Phenomenology, History and Memory and Representation through technology.

Narrative
Paul Ricoeur argues that it is through narrative that we make sense of the world. We interpret our lives as if they were narratives or, to put it another way, through the work of interpreting our lives we turn them into narratives. Narrative deals with actions, specifically human actions, and Ricoeur follows Aristotle’s definition of the term mimesis as the imitation of action. Ricoeur divides mimesis into three types: Mimesis$_1$, which is preconfiguration, Mimesis$_2$, configuration and Mimesis$_3$ or reconfiguration. Mimesis$_1$ refers to the knowledge and history we bring to the narrative, Mimesis$_2$ concerns the unfolding of the plot – or ‘emplotment’ as Ricoeur names it. In Ricoeur’s words, plot grasps “together and integrates into one whole multiple and scattered events”. (1984, x) Without emplotment we would have a series of unconnected events – a list. Mimesis$_3$ is the knowledge we gain from the narrative – the “intersection of the world of the text and the world of the hearer or reader”. (1984, 91) Ricoeur argues that it is through the created narrative that we can understand our lives better. Narratives draw on and mimic real life but at the same time inform our understanding of real life. This circular repetition of being informed and then bringing that new knowledge to our next encounter with narrative Ricoeur sees as a spiral of increasing understanding.

Phenomenology
Phenomenology is a philosophy developed by Edmund Husserl (1859-1938) in the early 20th century. This is the interaction with things, the world, and ideas through the senses. For instance, when I interact with a tree through my consciousness I don’t analyse the tree, measure it or speculate about its composition but rather I observe its shape, the movement of
its leaves in the wind, its changing colours as the light changes. (Simms 2003, 11) Husserl states that to do this I suspend judgement and concentrate on how the tree appears to me. At the same time, I can also perceive my own perception - I am interacting with my own consciousness. I am self-conscious.

**History and Memory**

History exists in past time and is carried to the present through memory. To understand our relationship to history we need first to examine our relationship to time. In the fourth century St Augustine of Hippo asked, “what is time” and postulated that time cannot be a series of “nows” or instants (as proposed by Aristotle) because as soon as we say “now” that “now” is gone. Our perception of time is always just behind time itself. Instead, he theorized that in everyday life we mediate time in a present where the past exists in our minds as memory and the future as expectation. (397-398AD Book XI, Ch. XX) To negotiate the present our mind must be stretched or distended across a threefold present. This process is a kind of presencing (a term coined by Heidegger) where the continuous present is mediated by our memory of the past and expectation of the future. This distending is a quality of the thinking mind. The ‘now’ of any history is also gone and cannot be recovered; neither can its memory of its own past and its expectations of a future. Therefore, Ricoeur argues, historians in establishing another time period (temporality) must project themselves into another present using a kind of imagining, a temporal imagination. (1965, 28)

Ricoeur argues that history is also a form of narrative. The imperative of the historian is, however, different to the fictional author. The historian seeks to explain events, pointing out connections and causes. For the historian, writing history is a form of inquiry. “Historians are in the situation of a judge … they attempt to prove that one explanation is better than another”. (1984, 175) Rather than constructing the past, historians can only reconstruct the past because, as another reality and time, it is no longer available to us, no longer here. So the historian looks for traces of the past to reconstruct its narrative. Traces might be documents, artefacts, witness accounts et cetera. But to construct a meaningful narrative from these historical traces the historian must fill in the gaps, interpreting and judging what is important, what is to be privileged, what omitted.

In music we have a relatively recent and highly charged historical reconstruction movement. Sometimes called the Early Music Movement, the Historical Music Performance Movement (HMPM) of the 20th century provides an interesting source of insights into this question of reconstruction and its validity. The movement had access to traces in the form of original instruments, treatises and music manuscripts. It did not have access to recorded sound, an
active performance practice, or the realities of a way of life constrained by candles and travel by animal or foot. At first, 20th century practitioners in the movement were convinced that if enough research and practice were done, the past could be recreated as a true authentic past – this also meant that other reconstructions were deemed wrong, inauthentic, untrue or false. In the 1980s writers like Taruskin pointed out that a 20th century musician’s reality made such a reconstruction impossible. Taruskin postulated instead that the HMPM was actually a modernist movement because the “filling-in” of detail was informed by modernist assumptions and attitudes that were inherent to the constructors. (1995, 102) He applauded the movement as authentic to its own times and for breathing new life into the performance of “old” music. There are clear resonances between the idea of authenticity as being true to one’s own time whilst reconstructing a past and Ricoeur’s ideas of presencing and temporal imagination.

Representation and music technology

In his book *Sound Theory: Sound Practice*, Rick Altman states:

> The real can never be represented; representation alone can be represented, the real must be known, and knowledge is always already a form of representation. (1992, 46)

This statement sits well with Ricoeur’s ideas of *mimesis* and the spiral of narrative and real life. So how does this relate to sonic art?

The electro-acoustic environment opens up entirely new patterns of communication to the composer, which can bridge space and time, create new relationships and new sounds. (Truax 2001, 13) It gives the composer enormous freedom to organise at both the macro level (placing sounds, creating layers, structuring, mixing) and the micro (changing the envelope of the sounds themselves, transforming waves, getting in at what Truax terms the granular level).

Like the historian, the sound artist can draw on historical traces such as documents and music manuscripts, which then need to be recorded (as Altman states, a form of representation in itself). The use of primary sources lends the work a certain authenticity and truth. The soundscape artist can then draw on a huge range of techniques in order to create narrative and represent another temporality. This applies to many areas but especially to the experience of time, which can be manipulated through techniques such as overlapping, reverberation, repetition, stretching and compressing sound files.

In summary, narrative is the means by which we understand our world. History is another kind of narrative in which the time of the historian, who is engaged in reconstruction, must
interact with the imagined time of the past. If the soundscape is to be any kind of historical
reconstruction, it should employ the same techniques of collection and evaluation of trace
documents. At the same time it has recourse to limitless possibilities to place, manipulate and
juxtapose sound through music technology.

**Meaning and the soundscape**

Narrative, phenomenology, history and memory and music technology come into play in the
creation of meaning. We are programmed to look for narrative, both in real life, as we have
seen, and in creative works. The listener is always negotiating meaning through the memories
that he or she brings to the work. The “intersection of the world of the text and the world of
the hearer or reader” (*Mimesis*3) implies a phenomenological interaction. In the act of
listening, or configuration (*Mimesis*2), the listener will privilege information or aspects of the
perceived work, in the same way as the author-creator or historian has, to construct their own
meaning and interpretation. If we accept that we understand our lives and the world beyond
the specificity of ourselves through creating and interpreting narratives, then we accept that
creativity is at the root of understanding and that same creativity and narrative tendency can
be used to understand our past. Indeed, we could argue that different narratives and
perspectives could contribute to a greater understanding of historical subjects such as those
discussed below.

Meaning in the soundscape is conveyed through sound – the medium through which we
communicate and interact socially. Sound reaches out to us and demands interaction.
(Shepherd 1987, 157) Response to sound is deeply embedded in our make-up, our survival
may depend on recognizing key sounds, intonations in voices, direction of sounds, and
changes in sounds. This explains why we are so discerning about sound and its attributes and
why the soundscape is such a potent medium for the creation of meaning.

**Techniques and my own approach**

Encounters with history have been the motivation for me to create a piece of sonic art that
deals with a specific time and place. The first soundscape I created was inspired by Mark
Twain’s visit to Newcastle in December 1895. The soundscape was part of an exhibition
shown in New York1. In investigating the sonic, and particularly the musical landscape of
December 1895, I gathered contemporary accounts from the leading newspaper of the time:
the *Newcastle Morning Herald and Miner’s Advocate*. Concerts at this time were often
advertised with the whole programme. I recorded selections of these programmes as well as

---

readings from the newspapers. These, together with sounds of the period, such as a steam train (by which Twain arrived) made up my "musical" material.

In a second soundscape, *Margery’s Times: Margery Through the Looking Glass*, the subject was the English mystic Margery Kempe, as revealed through her book, *The Book of Margery Kempe* (c. 1436). Here the raw materials were recordings of the book in modern and Middle English read by a number of different speakers, chosen for their diverse timbral qualities, as well as their different pronunciations. The other main sources of material were recordings made in the 60s and 70s when the HMPM was in its heyday. In doing this I was deliberately including another temporality. As Barry Truax pointed out, with the invention of sound recording the linearity of time is broken. What we hear as present is not of the present. Truax describes it instead as “embedded time”. (2001, 128) So the listener has to negotiate their present time, the time suggested by the clues given to the time period of the book (Middle English, the text itself and the musical works included) as well as the time of these “historical” recordings.

**Some music technology techniques**

Our sensitivity to sound embraces a multiplicity of aspects such as frequency, direction, duration, movement, timbre, proportions of direct and reflected sound, sound envelope and decay. The following are some of the techniques that the sound artist has at their disposal: reverberation, panning, layering, keynote sounds or ambient sounds, scenes, cutting up texts, sonic association, narrative guidance, massing of voices or montage and structural association.

I will now look at four techniques from the list and give examples from my work:

**Reverberation**

Adding reverberation to any sound affects our perception of distance from the sound and the space in which the sound occurs. A speaking voice with little or no reverb is perceived as speaking in a small space and close by, whereas a voice with a lot of reverb seems to come from a great distance or to be lost in a great space. This can metaphorically stand for a voice from the past or a dream experience of a voice. The effect is used frequently in *Margery’s Times*, especially at the start where different levels of reverb are applied to one male voice and these layered over each other.

**Panning**

This is where the sound moves from one speaker to another. Panning can give an immediate sense of physical movement as well as a sense of a sequence of events and movement through time. In *The New Adventures of Mark Twain* there are a number of layers, which
move across the listener’s auditory space – voices, music and ambient sounds, such as the train that through panning seems to move past us.

**Layering**

Our ears are adept at privileging what we perceive as important sounds from the background ones. Truax identifies three ways of listening: listening-in-search, listening-in-readiness and background listening. (2001, 21) Layers in soundscapes are used to create a complex sonic environment for which any or all of these kinds of listening will come into play. They may also be used to create the effect of voices rising out of the layers to the foreground and then being absorbed again. This can then be a metaphor for voices rising out of the past and vanishing again.

In *The New Adventures of Mark Twain* we hear a reader from the newspaper layered over the rendition of a song from a programme printed in the same newspaper. The mix is further complicated by a section of the song running backwards and forwards at the same time and then overlapping itself – a metaphor for travel back in time.

**Structural association**

Here, meaning is reinforced by the way text is structured and manipulated (Lane 2006, 6). In *Margery’s Times* a conceit was used from the Ars Nova movement. In isorhythmic motets a slow moving and steady tenor is used, which gives the work unity through its recurrence and omnipresence. The recurrence aspect with its unifying feature was used in order to reinforce the idea of the multiple temporal aspects of the work. The narrative of Margery’s book is itself non-linear for a number of reasons. Margery herself states that the book is not written in order and this phrase recurs throughout the soundscape.

**Conclusion**

In asking the question, “can a soundscape be some kind of historical representation and mediate between our times and another?” I have drawn on the philosophical work of Ricoeur and the electro acoustic theory of Truax, Chion and Altman. I have used Ricoeur’s meticulous unpicking of the themes of narrative, mimesis and history to begin creating a framework for understanding how a creative work can fit (or not) with historical representation. I have touched on ways such a work might have integrity and add to our knowledge, whilst drawing on the rich possibilities of a sonic medium. Sound has the capacity to draw in the listener, who, engaging with it, creates his/her own meaning. Thus another turn is completed in what Ricoeur describes as the healthy hermeneutic circle, in which each turn brings a higher level of understanding. (1984, 3)
References


St Mark’s basilica in Venice has long been recognized as a fine exemplar of an architectural space that has directly influenced musical composition, as composers sought to capitalize on the unique acoustical properties that the building afforded. The antiphonal effects possible through placement of choirs of voices and/or instruments to the sides of the arches and domes of the cruciform basilica were exploited in cori spezzati (divided choirs) works from at least the early sixteenth century with the appointment of Adrian Willaert as maestro di capella in 1527. The cori spezzati style, possibly derived from antiphonal psalm singing, was gaining popularity during this period in Rome, Germany and other regions as well as in Venice. (Buelow 2004, 17-18) By the end of the century and into the early seventeenth century, with the compositions of Andrea and Giovanni Gabrieli and Claudio Monteverdi (maestro di capella 1613-43), St. Mark’s achieved renown throughout Europe for its polychoral tradition and the extraordinary stereophonic effects that could be conjured from the space. The almost square cruciform shape, with its five rounded domes, was built in the eleventh century and modeled on the Church of the Apostles in Constantinople. The high vaulted ceilings are distinguished by individual mosaic-lined domes spanning the centre and on each arm of the cross, providing large areas for localized reverberation that, in combination, result in a particularly live acoustic. The interior of St Mark’s offered numerous possibilities for placement of separated groups of singers and instrumentalists for polychoral works; galleries (pergoli) were erected in the sixteenth century seemingly for this purpose, allowing groups to be separated across the chancel. (Howard and Moretti 2009, 36-7) Recent experiments with the positioning of singers in St Mark’s which were conducted with the St John’s College choir in 2007, have shown that the sound reverberated in each group’s own semi-contained performance space, allowing the directionality to be clearly perceived by audience members located in the chancel. (Howard and Moretti 2009, 39)

While we generally associate St. Mark’s Venice with polychoral composition, this technique was almost certainly reserved for festal occasions, and consequently chant and imitative polyphony would have been formed the core repertory. Records indicate that the most usual placement of singers in the sixteenth century was in the bigonzo, the large octagonal pulpit raised on marble pillars standing to the right of the rood screen that divides the chancel from the nave. (Barbier 2003, 96) While this position would intuitively appear better for
projection of the sound throughout the church, it must be borne in mind that throughout this period and during Lotti’s tenure the acoustics were exploited, not for the congregation in the body of the church, but rather for the benefit of the Doge and his guests and the church officials who were seated on the other side of the rood screen. The singers in the bigonzo therefore faced back towards the chancel and the sound could reverberate to great effect in the dome above the chancel. (Howard and Moretti 2009, 41)

A century later the acoustics of the building had not changed, but the flowering of the Baroque had brought significant changes in the techniques and textures of musical composition, in sacred, as in secular music. In a great deal of Baroque music, the musical style alone does not enable differentiation between sacred and secular works, even within the confines of a given composer’s output. Yet although he was highly successful as an operatic composer, Antonio Lotti (c1667-1740), demonstrably well versed in both the dramatic techniques of opera seria and the emerging galant style, chose a far more conservative idiom for much of his sacred composition.

For over thirty years Antonio Lotti held the esteemed position of first organist at St Mark's basilica in Venice and enjoyed an international reputation both as a composer of opera and of sacred choral music. He had studied with Legrenzi in Venice and was first associated with St Mark’s as an alto falsettist from 1687, then gained the position of second organist. From 1704 to 1736 Lotti was first organist and then was appointed maestro di capella – a position that he held until his death. During his tenure as first organist Lotti composed approximately thirty operas, many staged in Venice and elsewhere in Italy, and between 1717 and 1719 he was on leave in Dresden composing operas. Lotti also taught at the famous Venetian Ospedale degli Incurabili (probably in the 1720s) composing choral works and oratorios for the famous female choir there (Hansell and Termini 2010), and also composed for the Church of Spirito Santo, where he held a position for a number of years. (Selfridge-Field 1985, 272)

Lotti’s output includes a significant body of multi-movement works for choir, soloists and orchestra in High Baroque concerted style, some intended for Dresden, others for the Ospedale. These include his Dixit Dominus, Laudate pueri and settings of individual movements of the Mass, such as his Gloria in D. Most of Lotti’s sacred choral works, however, are scored for a capella SATB or TTBB, sometimes with basso continuo accompaniment (whether intended for rehearsal or performance) and these works were composed for use at St Mark’s. They include mass settings, psalm settings, antiphons and motets composed in stile antico - a restrained conservative idiom tonally (occasionally modally) based, with smoothly contoured melodic lines and drawing upon the tradition of
Renaissance counterpoint. Looking back to the eminent example of Palestrina, stile antico persisted as a prominent and sanctioned idiom in composition for Roman Catholic worship well into the eighteenth century, (Hill 2005, 414) and Lotti produced numerous choral works that sit comfortably within this aesthetic framework. These stile antico works exhibit a good deal of homorhythmic writing and when imitative polyphony is employed it is rarely sustained, as may be heard in the Agnus Dei of his Missa del Sesto Tuono (for example Lotti Chamber Choir Hungaraton 32042). This restraint in the employment of imitative polyphony could conceivably be in deference to the lengthy reverberation time of the performance venue that could easily result in the blurring of the entries and integrity of the overlapping lines, not to mention the negative effect on the intelligibility of the text.

The work, however, for which Lotti is most widely known, is an eight-voice setting of the Crucifixus. This is a self-contained movement drawn from a setting of the Credo of the Mass:

Crucifixus etiam pro nobis sub Pontio Pilato passus et sepultus est
(He was crucified also for us under Pontius Pilate. He suffered and was buried.)

In response to the emotive nature of this text, Lotti refashioned the idiom of stile antico polyphony to feature interlinked suspensions, unprepared, shifting and exquisitely sustained dissonances - devices more associated with seconda prattica. His recourse in the Crucifixus to chromatic and dissonant writing is the intensification of a traditional mode of expression designed to deliberately underscore principal words. The window that this work opens to the transcendent, with its profound emotional and visceral impact on performers and listeners alike, is the key to its continued appeal. Venue notwithstanding, even the medium of a CD recording can allow entry into that realm, as is apparent from the recent recording of the eight-voice Lotti Crucifixus conducted by Philip Ledger. (Choir of King’s College Cambridge HMV A503450)

In setting this text Lotti would have been cognisant of the long tradition of representational and rhetorical devices invoked by other composers in response to this assertion of the sacrifice of the incarnate Christ, his torture, humiliation and death on the cross. As has been previously recognized, (Cameron 2006, 57-61) there are some prominent musical gestures in the tradition: the cross-shaped opening motif which Lotti uses in the opening of this setting, a drawing out of the word “passus” to depict the Christ’s sustained suffering and the use of chromaticism to depict anguish.
Two other settings of this text by Lotti, which have found their place in the choral repertory as independent works, are for six and ten voices respectively.

While the six-voice setting (Figure 1) does not contain the cruciform motif, expressive use of dissonance is invoked from the beginning of the fourth bar, as the Soprano D is suspended and resolves on the further dissonance of a diminished 7th chord on F#, beginning the unfolding of exquisite waves of musical tension. The text “Etiam pro nobis” is treated imitatively, but the notes on “passus” are the longest in the work, sustained for two or more bars in each voice, following another of the rhetorical hallmarks of the “Crucifixus” tradition.

Figure 1. Antonio Lotti Crucifixus a 6 bars 1-5
A similar treatment of the word “passus” is also to be found in Lotti’s ten-voice setting, but this work explores new levels of intensification of the musical tension and representation of the expressive anguish even from the outset with its relentless building of entries at ever higher pitches. The number of voices in this setting might suggest *cori spezzati* as the division of the voices into two choirs could work effectively at the opening, but from bar 15 the groupings of the voices make this option for the placement of the singers musically unsustainable.

**Figure 2. Antonio Lotti *Crucifixus a 10* bars 1-8**

Thus it would seem that this work like the other two *Crucifixus* settings, was intended to be performed by a group in a single acoustic space.

The choir at St Mark’s Venice in the early eighteenth century had access to 36 singers for major feast days, with castrati and falsettists singing the soprano and alto parts. (Barbier 2003, 95) While this was too large a group for the *bigonzo*, a subgroup of ten to sixteen singers would have certainly been possible, or the singers could have been placed on one of
the pergoli. Today the Capella Marciana usually sing from the left balcony near the organ with their sound projecting directly into the chancel. As my hearing of the Capella Marciana’s singing of a Lotti motet in March 2009 reveals, the reverberation provided by the domes intensifies the aural effect of even simple homophonic writing. Dissonances are sustained over their resolution by echoes, and the dissonances of overtones heighten those of the sung pitches. Lotti’s familiarity with the acoustics of St Mark’s is unquestionable – he, like many before him, was deliberately exploiting the building’s sonic peculiarities to extract a passionate intensity for his musical meditation upon the crucifixion.

**Figure 3. Antonio Lotti *Miserere* bars 160-9**

As Figure 3 shows, similar harmonic devices are also to be found in Lotti’s two SATB settings of the *Miserere* for the Maundy Thursday liturgy; works that were intended for and performed in St Mark’s during Lotti’s lifetime and, in the case of the *Miserere* in d, enjoyed a continuous performance tradition there into the nineteenth century. (Hansell and Termini 2010 n.p.)
Lotti’s intensification of the *stile antico* idiom, with its piling up of suspensions combined with the effects of the reverberant acoustic of the intended performance space, bring a rather worldly sensuality to the musical depiction of these texts of religious suffering. Lotti’s operatic and dramatic experience may have been the spur for his heightened idiom, but there is no evidence that this was deemed either inappropriate or excessive by church authorities, although the music matched to these particularly emotive texts is far removed from the usual harmonic realm of his composition for St Mark’s.

What then was the religious aesthetic that caused Lotti to set the texts in this way? Certainly one in which the spiritual could be heightened by the senses, and invoking the legacy of ecstatic experiences of the Italian Catholic mystics such as St. Catherine of Siena and St Catherine of Genoa. (King 2004, 40-2) Certainly the extreme sensuality of Bernini’s mid seventeenth-century sculpture of *The Ecstasy of St Teresa* depicts a very human manifestation of ecstasy. This entwining of sacred and profane gives the sculpture even more power to move the emotions and that was certainly the primary aim of the Baroque aesthetic. Furthermore there is evidence that Bernini’s encounters with Jesuit meditative practices influenced his sculpture. (Harbison 2000, 21-2) While Lotti’s extensive experience as a church musician was based in Venice, not Rome, he would certainly have been exposed to current theological thought and to the ideas of the Jesuits who, although banned from Venice in the early seventeenth century, had re-established themselves after 1656 and by the turn of the century were increasingly influential. In addition there is clear evidence from accounts of the period that Jesuits were preaching at St Mark’s in the 1720s, during Lotti’s tenure. (Barbier 2003, 93)

Central to Jesuit spirituality and practices of this period were *The Spiritual Exercises of St Ignatius*, a set of directed meditations on the life of Christ that formed the basic training of the Jesuits and the focus of spiritual retreats for the laity. These meditations required the application of all of the senses to the episode being contemplated – to see the scene in the imagination, to hear what the figures might say, to smell and taste “the infinite sweetness of the divinity” and to apply the sense of touch, embracing the figures of the imagined scene or kissing the place where they should stand or be seated. (Puhl 1963, 54-5) The ultimate aim was experiential transcendence, not for its own sake, but for the lessons (‘the fruit’) that it could bear. Lotti’s invocation of the senses through musical means can be seen as a parallel to this intent - a response to the passion of Christ that enlivens and humanizes the scene and moves the emotions – the heart and the mind.
Lotti’s *Crucifixus* and *Miserere* settings, particularly when performed in the acoustic for which they were intended, can provide an aural and physical experience for both performers and listeners that can be truly transcendent, providing another dimension to meditation on the meaning and physicality of the crucifixion through a musical manifestation of profound religious spirituality.

**Acknowledgements**

Transcriptions of Lotti’s *Crucifixus a 6* and *Crucifixus a 10* have been prepared from manuscript GB-Ob MS Tenbury 746 and included by kind permission of The Bodleian Library, University of Oxford. The transcription of Lotti’s *Miserere* in d has been prepared from manuscript D-Bsb MS Am.B. 355 and included with the kind permission of the Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin - Preußicher Kulturbesitz, Musikabteilung mit Mendelssohn-Archiv.

**References**


Introduction

The contemporary Australian feature film soundtrack is the collaborative product of numerous specialized film and sound personnel. This paper explores the way in which one of these, the composer contributes to the soundtrack. While articles such as Atherton’s 2004, ‘The Composer as Alchemist’ explored the processes and technicalities of a composer producing a soundtrack score, this paper places more emphasis on the interactions of the composer with other feature film personnel – the collaboration process. These interactions are vital in determining a sense of place for the composer in the Australian feature film industry. Hannan and Madgee (1998) in their study of one Australian composer, Martin Armiger and his work, examine composer interaction and collaboration. Armiger raised issues including communication and collaboration as well as technology and processes. Composers interviewed for this paper raised similar issues. This paper will focus on the process of collaboration with other feature film personnel along with the impact of technology, work availability and the actual specialized process of film composition.

Collaborators

This paper is grounded in primary research in the form of five interviews with composers based in Australia or New Zealand. These composers included Australian composers Amanda Brown, Guy Gross and Antony Partos and New Zealand composers Glenda Keam and Victoria Kelly. Interviews were based on an initial set of open-ended questions that encouraged free discussion and broad answers. Interviews were recorded and later transcribed by the author. The results of these interviews are explored in a preliminary sense and will be further examined to form a chapter in my PhD thesis. As well as the five in-depth interviews with composers, information from a Macquarie University lecture by sound designer Andrew Plain (2010) and the Screen Music Futures Seminar (2010) has also been

1 Composers were selected according to their work on contemporary Australian or New Zealand feature films or their industry association.

2 For further information on composers interviewed for this paper, please refer to the appendix.
used. In total the primary information collated for this paper takes into account the perspectives of eight composers.

**Collaborating...**

The work of composers is still largely an unknown process which is often not understood by other film personnel collaborating with the director. Given the collaborative nature of film production, good communication is a vital component of the composers skill set, as composer Victoria Kelly attested,

> My first task is as collaborator, to work with other people who have made the film, normally the director, but often other people as well. To try and find out what the film is trying to do and try and reflect that musically. (interview 2009)

The director’s vision unites all such personnel collaborating on the film project. However, the level of influence which the composer has upon this creative vision varies between projects, “Generally the director is the key person who has some kind of vision for the music. Sometimes they don’t and they give you complete free-reign” (Amanda Brown interview 2010). While the level of artistic freedom varies, most composers working in Australian and New Zealand feature film production are put in charge of music budgets, thus having far greater level of control over how the scored musical component of the soundtrack is created.

**...with the Director**

All composers interviewed say that the director is the most important relationship they can have when collaborating on a feature film. Realizing the director’s vision is the main job of the composer (Guy Gross interview 2010) hence good communication with the director is a vital part of the composers’ working environment. However, even if this communication is clear, directors will often make changes to the film right up until the last minute. Such changes are made without consultation with the composer. The working reality for many composers is that they need to be able to deal with changes right up until the very last minute. Many composers feel this adds significant pressure to their work. While in Australia, such

---

3 The composers in discussion at this event included: Martin Armiger, Christopher Gordon, Amanda Brown and Guy Gross. Industry representatives also participated in the event, including Michelle O’Donnell from APRA and composer Clive Harrison from the Australian Guild of Screen Composers.

4 To avoid ambiguity in this area of “the unknown” directors will collaborate with particular composers on multiple projects. Working with the same sound personnel results in known expectations between collaborators. Gaining such an understanding can be a significant advantage to both the composer and director, saving much time (Amanda Brown interview 2010).
changes to the score are the responsibility of the composer, in the USA it is the responsibility of the music editor. (Guy Gross interview 2010)

...with the sound designer

Working with other personnel, such as the sound designer can be problematic, particularly where sound design and music are closely interlinked. Noted sound designer Andrew Plain said, “My worst enemy now is the composer, they’re the nightmare that ruins my life”. (lecture 2010) The reason that such a conflict occurs between the sound designer and composer is that they often will work within the same tonal ranges, resulting in an aural clash. Due to this, composer Victoria Kelly maintains it is important to have a strong relationship with the sound designer from the start. (interview 2009) Similarly, Amanda Brown highlighted the importance of an open dialogue from the beginning of production. (interview 2010) The increasingly blended nature of film soundtracks means that such relationships between composers and sound designers have become progressively more important. The close relationship between the sound designer and composer often begins at the personnel selection process. Both sound designers and composers have recommended colleagues to the director to create a more intuitive working relationship on the film soundtrack. (Antony Partos interview 2010)

...with the music supervisor

The music supervisor’s role includes sourcing and licensing any pre-recorded music into the film. Some music supervisors also recommend composers to directors or, like Norman Parkhill who represents composer Amanda Brown, have them as a stable of composers. Antony Partos confirmed that communication and collaboration with the music supervisor was needed to produce a cohesive soundtrack,

I’m in fairly close contact with them about the choice of music;
but also the score will often have to work into the sourced tracks,
so I’ll have to know what keys and tempo and everything like that.
(interview 2010)

As Martin Armiger attested, music supervisors can also act as the communicator between the composer and director,

---

5 Certainly with the business model where a number of sound personnel work together this is more likely to occur and can be seen as a competitive advantage for both the composer and sound designer. Businesses like Sydney-based ‘Sandcastle’ have a number of composers and sound personnel within the same location, making it much more convenient for producers and directors.
The music supervisors are a conduit between the studio and the composers – they get to be the ones who do that interplay that directors and producers seem incapable of doing. (Screen Music Futures Seminar 2010)

The ability of music supervisors to talk about the music processes in terms that both the director and composer can understand, smooths the process of soundtrack creation. Despite this, some composers feel that music supervisors have a negative impact on their work. This negativity can be attributed to licensed tracks which can diminish the amount of score that the composer needs to produce.

...with the producer

Interview subjects did not raise the subject of collaboration with the producer on feature film scores. Collaboration with the producer is important as it is the producer who controls the budget on a feature film. Many variables play a part in cost determination (composers experience, the type of score needed (orchestral or synthesizer), the amount of score needed etc). The budget also needs to cover elements such as session musicians, studio hire and production facility hire which are often left out, as composer Antony Partos explained,

Most producers I have worked with have no understanding of how much, [to budget, and] what are the line items that go into the music budget. Predominately, everyone I’ve worked with had no understanding. I try and educate them, this is the breakdown of the last...this is where the money went. (interview 2010)

Such an issue highlights the necessary area of education for those working in film production, so an understanding of what components need to be accounted for in the budget. It can be speculated that funding bodies should also have a good understanding of such costs so that when producers submit budgets, particularly low allocations should be queried. In a recent seminar involving composers in Sydney, Lynn Gailey, who was once head of film development at the Australian Film Commission (now Screen Australia) agrees that education is a critical factor,

I think that the most important thing is, it goes back to education...

There needs to be a dialogue with the Screen Producers Association to get some genuine rigor back into the way productions are budgeted. (Screen Music Futures Seminar 2010)

---

6 The Screen Music Futures panel was held in conjunction with the Australian Guild of Screen Composers on September 22nd 2010.
Quantifying budgets for film is a difficult area as film soundtracks can be as diverse as the film for which they are being written. Many variables result in a problematic situation for the producer, as Guy Gross explained,

Producers don’t understand what their money is buying them, if we can try and quantify what a composer should get – it would be much easier to calculate how much a score is worth. (interview 2010)

The specialized process of film composition

All composers interviewed for this research believed that their work as a film composer was different to their work as a composer for other mediums. Certainly, composers can work in many different formats, from creating music for film to composing a commissioned performance piece. (Atherton 2004, 229) The diversity of the film composers’ “job description” centres on complex and varied collaboration requirements. This can be attributed to the relationships which have been discussed earlier in this paper, with the director, producer, music supervisor and sound designer, to name a few. In order to deliver the specified requirements for the film, film composers need to perform various tasks outside of pure composition. Tight time frames and irregular work hours are an area which was highlighted as a concern by all film composers interviewed. The decisions made by the director, producer or editor can result in days of rewriting or restructuring for the composer. (Glenda Keam interview 2009)

McJobs

Of the composers interviewed for this project, all but one (Guy Gross) needed to work in other areas to sustain themselves financially. This inability to work full-time within their artistic practice has been documented by Throsby. (2003, 36) Even composers who were employed as a full-time composer acknowledge that there is always the possibility that they will need to go out and find another job. (Victoria Kelly interview 2009) Time between film

---

7 In order to attempt to budget for this component, certain variables need to be examined, for instance, the experience of the composer, the style of score, whether the composer retains the publishing rights, whether the film is it being licensed just in Australia or beyond and finally whether the score is synthetic or recorded with real musicians.

8 Guy Gross is currently working with the Australian Guild of Screen composers to create a document which both producers and composers can use to help budget for film.

9 Such multi-skilling can be a blessing and a curse. Amanda Brown (interview 2010) notes that Australian sound crews are favoured overseas due to their ability to work in different areas, being multi-skilled also provides composers with a sound understanding of their craft so that when their budgets do allow them to hire additional crew members to assist them with their work, for example an orchestrator.
compositional work is highly varied and for this reason, some composers choose to also work in the area of composing for advertising, “The majority of artists have other jobs, I call them McJobs.” (Amanda Brown, Screen Music Futures Seminar, 2010)

The impact of technology
Throughout interviews, technology arose as a contributing factor to changes in, not only how film composers work, but also how they are compensated for their work. Music publishing royalties form a significant portion of the film composers’ pay, with composers often accepting a lower fee for their work in the knowledge that future royalties will arise. (Amanda Brown interview 2010) Issues surrounding copyright and piracy of films and music also affect the composers’ income from royalties. (Michelle O’Donnell, Screen Music Futures Seminar 2010)

All composers interviewed for this paper either personally own a studio and compositional equipment or were part of an ownership collective. Advances in technology have resulted in lower investment costs for composers, meaning it is easier and cheaper to set up as a screen composer. (Michelle O’Donnell, Screen Music Futures Seminar 2010) Easier access to programs such as “GarageBand” means that many more people can create music than in the past, but this has also effectively devalued the creativity of the film composer. (Guy Gross, Screen Music Futures Seminar 2010)

While most composers interviewed feel that their creative process has changed little due to technology, the changes to collaboration and the speed at which they are expected to produce results have, “Things are expedited now. You don’t have to send a courier. It’s instantaneous. In that sense the communication is made easier.” (Antony Partos interview 2010)

Impact on soundtrack
The composer’s impact on the film soundtrack continues to be significant, despite the rise in production and licensed music. Certainly in Australia, the composer actively realizes the director’s creative vision but uses methods and processes, which are very much within their control. The composer is often a “one-stop-shop” managing the music budget, employing musicians, composing the music, engineering and even mixing in some cases. (Amanda Brown interview 2010) Directors recognize the influence the composer has on the emotions portrayed in the film. Quentin Tarantino admitted, “I’m a little nervous about the idea of working with a composer because I don’t like giving up that much control”. (Romney and Wootton 1995, 127) Collaborations between other film and sound personnel influence the

10 Antony Partos is one such composer, he and his company Sonar work on both film, advertising and television – depending on what work is available (Antony Partos interview 2010).
composer’s final contribution to the project. In order for the intentions and expectations of collaborating personnel to be successfully incorporated into the soundtrack, training and development is needed for both the composer and “other personnel in the filmmaking team”. (Hannan & Madgee 1998, 197) As Atherton confirms, “Too many producers and directors still want the commodity and not the intelligence of the composer”. (2003, 29) This will continue to the case, until other film personnel understand the processes and collaboration that the composer undertakes.

Biographical details of composers interviewed for this paper
Amanda Brown: Composer, musician, singer and songwriter, renowned for her role as the violinist from the band The Go-Betweens. Her scoring credits include: Kings of Mykonos (Peter Andrikidis, 2010), Son of a Lion (Benjamin Gilmour, 2008) and Monkey Puzzle (Mark Forstmann, 2007).
Guy Gross: One of Australia's leading film and television composers his scoring credits include: A Heart Beat Away (Gale Edwards, 2010), Hey Hey It’s Esther Blueburger (Cathy Randall, 2007) and The Adventures of Priscilla, Queen of the Desert (Stephan Elliot, 1994).
Glenda Keam: President of the composers association of New Zealand and a composer.
Victoria Kelly: Composer, arranger, performer and producer. Her scoring credits include: Under the Mountain (Jonathan King, 2009), The Lovely Bones (Peter Jackson, 2009) and Out of the Blue (Robert Sarkies, 2006).
Antony Partos: An internationally awarded composer who specializes in blending acoustic and electronic elements in his scores. His credits include: Animal Kingdom (David Michôd, 2010), Disgrace (Steve Jacobs, 2008) and Garage Days (Alex Proyas, 2002).

References

**Interviews, Seminars and Lectures**


If Beethoven’s Sixth Symphony were composed today, it would be an embarrassment – unless it were done ironically to show that the composer was aware of where music both is and has been. John Barth The Literature of Exhaustion, 1967. (quoted in Lucy, 1999)

Parody Versus Quotation
The silent film medium provides a vehicle for modern composers to reinterpret early films through music, bringing them “up-to-date for modern audiences”. (Severin, 2009) Composers can play on audiences’ preconceived notions of silent film music as well as their vast and extensive exposure to cinematic musical codes and practices by incorporating stylistic quotation, culturally specific music, musical exaggeration and parody. Throughout my original score for Ménilmontant (1926) I have used quotation and parody to comment on the sentiments associated with the 1920s jazz age by using the audiences’ prior knowledge and through the use of three parodic procedures mapping, troping and reversal. Musical exaggeration and stylistic parody highlight aspects of the film’s plot and setting to the audience and bring implied elements of Kirsanoff’s film to the fore. Hutcheon states that parody is often confused with “pastiche, burlesque, travesty, plagiarism, quotation, allusion and especially satire” (1985, 25). Kiremidjia outlines the structural characteristics of parody as “a kind of literary mimicry which retains the form or stylistic character of the primary work, but substitutes alien subject matter or content”. (1960, 232)

It is often difficult to make a critical distinction between parody and quotation. Rose defines parody as “the critical quotation of performed literary language with comic effect”. (1979, 59) Hutcheon argues that the distancing that defines parody is not necessarily suggested in the idea of quotation, even though repetition is a feature of parody “…quotation, in other words, while itself fundamentally different from parody in some ways, is also structurally and pragmatically close enough that what in fact happens is that quotation becomes a form of parody”. (Hutcheon 1985, 41)

Within Ménilmontant’s score the distinction between parody and quotation has largely to do with context. Quotation is used sparingly to evoke a sense of time and place – this aspect relies heavily on the audible quality of the musical reproduction, rather than on specific pieces of music. An example of this can be found at 17’ 32’’ when a penny player piano
recording of *The Daring Young Man on the Flying Trapeze* (Layburn and Lyle, 1867) is used to evoke the time period. Jazz music on the other hand is used for parodic effect as it is used to comment on specific plot points and events as well as the sentiments associated with 1920s jazz music.

**Ménilmontant**

Dimitri Kirsanoff’s 38-minute silent film is a classic of the French impressionist cinema movement, which is characterised by an emphasis on the transformative power of imagination and the ambiguous rendering of material reality. *Ménilmontant* contains many of the traits associated with impressionist films such as the use of non-linear narrative structures, the fusion of objective and subjective imagery, graphic, rhythmic and associative forms of representation and special effects techniques such as slow motion and superimposition. (Abel 1984, 396) The film follows the lives of two young sisters who witness the brutal murder of their parents in the family home. Fleeing to Ménilmontant Paris, the sisters struggle to survive.

*Ménilmontant* is an exploration into the darker aspects of urban life – homelessness, prostitution, and crime, and is shot almost entirely on location, which was at that time a rarity. Kirsanoff’s poetic vision of Paris derives much of its potency from its locations – creating a strong focus to enhance and extend the audiences’ experience of the film’s setting through music.

For the performance of my score, I created the Annexia Ensemble. The 19-piece ensemble is made up of acoustic instruments, prerecorded electronics and live foley sound.1 Annexia performed *Ménilmontant* on 8 August 2009 at the Astor Theatre, Perth Western Australia.

**Parody and Extension: a definition of terms**

There are several instances within *Ménilmontant*’s score where early jazz music and classic Hollywood music of the 1930s are referenced and distorted for parodic effect – three techniques are employed in their parody. Everett presents these parodic procedures in his discussion of György Ligeti’s *Le Grand Macabre*: mapping, troping, and reversal. (Everett 2009) These terms are borrowed to discuss elements of parody in the score to *Ménilmontant*.

---

1 Foley is a term that describes the process of live recording of sound effects that are created by a Foley artist, which are added in postproduction to enhance the quality of audio for films, television, video, video games and radio. "Foley" gets its name from Jack Donovan Foley (1891-1967), a sound editor at Universal Studios in the 1950s who became famous for his advancements in synchronized sound effects.
**Mapping** is a procedure whereby a character or situation correlates with a distinctive stylistic type or topic; **troping** involves juxtaposing or superimposing incongruous topics and types for creative synthesis; and **reversal** nullifies the topical referent of a given quotation through distorting its fundamental attributes.

**Extension** in cinema is a phenomenon where sound extends the boundaries of the film screen by allowing the audience to hear sounds whose sources are not visually present. (Chion 1994, 86) Chion proposes extension uses sound to suggest a larger world than can be provided by vision alone.

Music can also aid in extending the visible world of a film. Chion refers to this phenomenon as **added value** (1994, 5) I will refer to it as **musical-visual association**. Like parody, musical-visual association depends on the audiences’ identification of a given musical association. The pairing of a strong musical association with onscreen action creates a different type of extension. Whereas Chion’s extension relies on sounds that are perceived as emanating from within the visual field, extension via musical-visual association plays on the audiences’ prior exposure to the music being referenced – the extension is largely projected onto the visual field by the audience members themselves. A clear example of a musical visual association is the use of musical minimalism to enhance and extend Kirsanoff’s bustling city montage.

When the two sisters first move to the busy city of Paris, musical minimalism is used to create a “soundtrack of the Machine Age”. (MacDonald 2003) This aural augmentation of Kirsanoff’s montage of city traffic, trains, and pedestrian shots is achieved through the audiences’ recognition of repetition as a mechanical technique. (Film Stills 1 and Figure 1) This music aligns itself heavily with the genre through the driving and continuous chordal piano and accordion accompaniment, its incorporation of polyrhythms and its close synchronization with the fast paced montage.\(^2\) This is an example of how stylistic reference can augment and extend the screen’s vision via the audiences’ musical-visual association, the intensity of the association in this case relies on the audiences’ memory and experience of culture. Although connections will most certainly be made between repetition and mechanical reproduction the extent of its power to widen the boundaries of the screen will vary from person to person.

**Film Stills 1.** Kirsanoff’s city montage [4’ 37”] (overleaf)

---

\(^2\) American composer George Antheil’s (1900-1959) score to *Ballet Mecanique* [Léger, 1924] is an early example of the use of repetition to accompany vision of mechanized industry.
Mapping, Troping, and Reversal

Much of the audiences’ emotive reaction to *Ménilmontant* is achieved by making a statement on the sentiments associated with the “jazz age”.\(^3\) 1920s jazz originated from styles of popular music that were blended to satisfy social dancers (Gridley 2000, 32) and could been seen to represent the exciting carefree aspects of the time. However, in *Ménilmontant*, jazz music underscores the dark urban aspects of Kirsanoff’s vision, providing Paris with a menacing voice through various parodic procedures. My score has taken many of the typical stylistic aspects of Dixieland music and exaggerated them, helping to highlight the sisters’ relationship to their new urban home. A parallel can be found in György Ligeti’s only opera

\(^3\) Writer F. Scott Fitzgerald coined the term “jazz age” to describe the flamboyant “anything goes” era that emerged in America after World War I (Smith, 2002).
Le Grand Macabre (1977). Ligeti’s opera has been labelled an “anti-opera” by Richard Troop (1999, p. 163) and is filled with quotations and references to opera and other pre-existing musical genres. Le Grand Macabre is largely a parody on opera itself rather than a specific operatic work. Parallels can be drawn between it and Ménilmontant in that the use of parody in Ménilmontant is targeted towards the 1920s time period and not on a specific jazz work.

A scene in Ménilmontant that demonstrates mapping⁴ utilizes a solo trumpet to parody the sexual freedoms of 1920s Paris. This scene involves the male protagonist luring Sibirskaja back to his apartment for a sexual encounter. The music accompanying this scene (found at 11’ 16’’) features a solo trumpet playing in an early jazz style that incorporates a growling tone mixed with the ‘wah-wah’ effect of a plunger mute, which has been used to reference the sexual milieu associated with early jazz music. The music begins with a chordal vamp played by the piano with jazz style bass and drum accompaniment. The trumpet player then enters taking many liberties with the phrasing and rhythmic nature of the melody incorporating a plethora of bends, growls, and other decorations to exaggerate the early playing styles of trumpeters such as Louis Armstrong (USA, 1901 – 1971) and Bix Beiderbecke (USA, 1903 – 1931). The texture of the music builds to its first climax by slowly incorporating the entire ensemble.

The music featured throughout this scene is designed to add poignancy to the less than admirable intentions of the male protagonist. Early jazz music has traditionally been used “as entertainment to set a mood of cheer and frivolity” (Gridley 2000, 85) and was characterized by fairly simple, tonal chord progressions and improvised solos. In this context, those aspects of jazz music have been exaggerated (trumpet solo) and distorted (uncharacteristically dissonant chords and a non-standard chord progression) to do just the opposite. The grotesque overstated trumpet music has been ‘mapped’ to the male character and the seduction sequences in Ménilmontant, turning them into a grotesque farce.

In a second seduction scene, between the male protagonist and Sibirskaja’s sister, a recording of a Max Steiner love theme, featured in the film Since You Went Away (Cromwell, USA, 1944) is used via the live gramophone player. Max Steiner (1888-1971) was a Vienna-born American composer of theatre and film music credited with helping to solidify the orchestral style of the classic Hollywood film scores of the 1930s. (Prendergast, 1977, 39) The use of his music is an example of troping, which, as stated earlier, involves juxtaposing or

---

⁴ Mapping is a procedure whereby a character or situation correlates with a distinctive stylistic type or topic.
superimposing incongruous topics and types for creative synthesis. In this scene (22’ 17’’) a
grand Hollywood musical statement is juxtaposed over dissonant sustained chords played by
the live ensemble.

The grand sweeping string melodies of Steiner’s main title music create a jarring effect when
juxtaposed over the live ensemble. As Sibirskaja’s sister and the male protagonist pause on
the street before walking up to his apartment, an ensemble member activates the gramophone
player. (Film Stills 2) Underneath Steiner’s love theme, the vibraphonist begins playing
dissonant sustained rising triplet figures; woodwind instruments are slowly introduced
followed by the entire string section. The music in this scene creates a sense of irony as the
romantic music emanating from the live gramophone player highlights the fact that the
circumstances depicted on screen are far from romantic. This is evident by the low moral
color character of the male protagonist as portrayed by Kirsanoff as well as the structure of the love
scene itself, where the over-dramatized embraces are interjected with the distraught reactions
of Sibirskaja who looks on from outside. Irony is a major rhetorical strategy deployed by the
parodic genre and is “central to the functioning of both parody and satire”. (Hutcheon, p. 25)

In the context of Kirsanoff’s film Steiner’s theme is acting in both an ironic way and a
parodic way. A parodic effect is also occurring in that the juxtaposition of classic Hollywood
film music against the dissonant music played by the live ensemble seeks to turn clichéd
Hollywood romance into a hideous nightmare. The strength of this scene relies on the
audiences’ prior exposure to a filmic coded language that incorporates vision and ‘romantic’

music to portray a sense of romance. The use of Steiner’s music is technically a quotation,
but through the juxtaposition of the gramophone record with the live ensemble it becomes
part of a parodic statement.

Film Stills 2. A passionate embrace turned into farce via ‘classic’ Hollywood music [22’
23’’]
Reversal can be found in my additional use of the gramophone player and an original lathe-cut vinyl recording. Reversal involves nullifying, the relevant attributes of a given quotation through distorting its fundamental attributes. In this case Dixieland music has been exaggerated and distorted in order to make a direct statement about the two sisters’ degraded urban surroundings. Two original Dixieland influenced compositions were recorded and cut to an eight-inch vinyl record for use within the live ensemble. The aural quality of the recordings is a deliberate attempt to accurately recreate the timbre of early sound recordings. The composition, entitled BAL (Paris Nightlife), uses rough sounds by way of mutes and a growling woodwind timbre (Figure 2 bar 1) combined with a very fast tempo to warp attributes associated with Dixieland for parodic effect. Further reversal is found in the use of dissonant chords and jerking accents and the offbeat quirky angular melodic lines featured throughout the piece, which are far more ambitious from a rhythmic and harmonic point of view than typical Dixieland jazz.
Figure 2. music score (BAL (Paris Nightlife) – the parodic procedure of reversal is used to distort fundamental attributes associated with early jazz music)
The recorded quality of this music, the physical reproduction of it (via the gramophone player) as well as the exaggerated tempo, rhythmic accentuations and harmonic make-up all combine with Kirsanoff’s vision to create a poignant and stirring musical statement about the sentiments associated with early jazz. Distorting fundamental attribute associated with early jazz reverses the jubilant and emotionally upbeat aspect of the music. An example of how
this reversal affects the film can be seen at 25’ 59’. As Sibirskaia rouses from her contemplation of suicide, mournful strings accompany distorted baby cries – a bizarre sequence featuring superimposed city traffic over a homeless and wandering Sibirskaia then takes place. During this scene the strings build in intensity over which an ensemble member activates the gramophone player playing BAL (Paris Nightlife). The effect this creates opposes Gridley’s view of early jazz and reinforces Kirsanoff’s statement that the city is not the exhilarating place the sisters first thought it was and creates a menacing and downtrodden effect. The caricatured jazz-laden voice of the city crashes down on Sibirskaia, mocking her desperate plight.

Conclusion
My score for Ménilmontant attempts to extend the dramatic context by relating the film’s plot and characters to locations and time periods. The use of stylistic and cultural reference can aid in extending the visible world of a film by playing on the audiences’ prior experience and exposure to the culture being referenced through the creation of musical-visual associations. The use of parody in Ménilmontant has been a powerful tool in conveying plot points to the audience as well as bringing implied elements of Kirsanoff’s film to the fore. Through the use of mapping, troping and reversal the audience is encouraged to view the carefree attitudes of the jazz age in a different way. The use of quotation and parody has helped create an exciting and engaging sonic cradle to a film that was originally mute. The result is an aural extension of Kirsanoff’s original cinematic vision.

References


Chapter 26. Family memories: Rebecca West and music.

Susan Erickson.

Introduction

Rebecca West (1892-1983), novelist, critic and journalist, feminist and socialist, enjoyed a career that spanned most of the twentieth century, with an output both eclectic and prolific. Music plays an important role in many of her novels, particularly *Harriet Hume* (1929) and the autobiographical novel *The Fountain Overflows* (1956), along with its posthumously published sequels *This Real Night* (1985) and *Cousin Rosamund* (1986), the so-called Aubrey trilogy. West’s descriptions of music are detailed and accurate, and their importance to structure and character development is reminiscent of E. M. Forster (1910) and Thomas Mann (1947).

While not a practicing musician herself, West was descended from a number of professional musicians and her uncle, the composer Alexander Mackenzie, director of the Royal Academy of Music in London from 1888 to 1924, was a strong proponent of Robert Schumann, whose music features prominently in *The Fountain Overflows*.

West’s autobiographical *Family Memories* (posthumously published in 1987) abounds with references to specific musical works and personages. This family history takes us back to the gold rush era of Australia, where West’s mother, the pianist Isabella Mackenzie, emigrated from Edinburgh and played with an itinerant band in Melbourne.

**Biography of West**

Rebecca West was born Cicely Isabel Fairfield on December 21, 1892, in London, to Isabella Mackenzie, an accomplished pianist of Scottish origin, and Charles Fairfield, a brilliant Anglo-Irish journalist whose disastrous handling of finances ultimately led to his deserting the family when Cicely was just eight years old. After the family moved to Edinburgh, Cicely attended George Watson’s Ladies College, where she had piano lessons with a Dr. Ross. After leaving school at the age of 16, she worked as a journalist, adopting the name Rebecca West from a strong-willed character in a play of Ibsen’s, *Rosmersholm*, in which she had acted. Her definition of feminism was contained in an article she wrote for the *Clarion*:

(October 24, 1913)

---

1 The present paper is part of a larger study on the significance of music in the writings of Rebecca West. For a detailed account of the role of music in the Aubrey trilogy, see Erickson and Blodgett 2009.
I myself have never been able to figure out precisely what feminism is: I only know that people call me a feminist whenever I express sentiments that differentiate me from a doormat or a prostitute. (West 1982, 219)

Her critical study of Henry James, published in 1916, was the first of a long and varied output, both non-fiction and fiction. In 1947 Time magazine called her “indisputably the world’s number one woman writer” (Books: Circles of Perdition 1947) and in 1959 she was created a Dame Commander, Order of the British Empire. She died on March 15, 1983, at the age of ninety.

Since the founding of the International Rebecca West Society in 2003, West’s writings have become a focus of interest for scholars working in the field of modernism. Her critical study _The Strange Necessity_ of 1928 incorporates what Laura Heffernan describes as “a personal, almost fictional essay on [James] Joyce”. (2007, 134) Heffernan also declares that in challenging T. S. Eliot as a critic, West “prefigures the work of later critics like Sandra Gilbert and Susan Gubar”. (129).

**Previous Work on West and Music**

The importance of music in West’s writings has been noted by virtually all of her biographers and critics. Victoria Glendinning may have summed it up best of all in this passage from the introduction to her biography _Rebecca West: A Life_:

> Music, the first of all the arts, is one possible metaphor for Rebecca West’s life and work, as it was for her best-known novel, _The Fountain Overflows_. She had the gift, in her writing, of making frightening situations a little ridiculous, and ridiculous situations more than a little frightening. This is one way to look at the drama of her life. She wrote in _Black Lamb and Grey Falcon_ (1941): ‘I remembered that when Mozart wrote _The Magic Flute_ in exploitation of our love for the crypto-cavern and the solemn symbol, he and his librettist had finally to turn their backs on the unresolved plot and go home whistling with their hands in their pockets.’ Rebecca West lived her life operatically, and tinkered endlessly with the story line, the score and the libretto. The plot remains unresolved. (1987, xvii)

In West’s novel _This Real Night_ the character Mamma says to her children,
Unmusical people often try to please musicians by talking about music just as people who have no children try to please people who have by talking about children and in each case what they say usually falls wide of the mark. (1985, 79)

*The Fountain Overflows* is clearly autobiographical, as noted by all the critics and acknowledged by West herself. The mother in the story, Clare Aubrey, a talented pianist who has enjoyed a performing career before her marriage, is modeled on West’s mother, Isabella Mackenzie. The father, Piers, is a brilliant journalist, but feckless in his handling of money. Like Rebecca’s own father Charles Fairfield, he deserts the family while the children are still young. The mother Clare is training her twin daughters, Rose and Mary, to become concert pianists. Their sister Cordelia (modeled most unflatteringly after West’s oldest sister, Letitia), though lacking in musical talent and taste, is encouraged by her eccentric violin teacher Miss Beevor to pursue a musical career, with disastrous results. A son, Richard Quin, who represents goodness, plays the flute. As the story is told through the eyes of Rose, this is West herself speaking. Some critics have argued that Rose and Mary are two sides of West’s own persona. Their choices of composers in which to specialize (Beethoven and Scriabin for Mary, Mozart and Stravinsky for Rose) are indicative of this duality.

In *The Fountain Overflows*, during one of her practice sessions Rose has embarked upon Beethoven’s Sonata in D major, Opus 10, no. 3, to this harsh criticism from her mother Clare:

> [When] I got to the twenty-second measure of the first movement, she cried ‘Rose, you are a musical half-wit. You have forgotten what I told you, you must supply the high F sharp there though it is not written. Beethoven did not write it because it was not in the compass of the piano as he knew it, but he heard it, he heard it inside his head, and you cannot have understood one note of what you have been playing if you do not know that that is what he heard.’ (West 1956, 175)

Throughout the Aubrey trilogy there are references to Paderewski, Teresa Carreño (to whom the mother Clare is compared in *This Real Night*), Chaminade, the Dolmetsches, Wanda Landowska, Busoni, and Pachmann. But West’s musical sympathies would seem to be with the standard repertoire and not with the ‘new music’ of her day. In *Cousin Rosamund*, the composer Oliver describes the earlier music of the Swiss composer Jasperl as “cheap and nasty experiments in atonality.” When Miss Beevor asks why he continues his friendship with the man, Oliver replies, “Because just about this time he began to write good music. He
threw overboard his nationality,” to which Miss Beevor replies, “Ah, he found his keys”.
(West 1986, 147, 148)

**Family Memories**

*Family Memories*, Rebecca West’s fascinatingly detailed, if sometimes fanciful, account of her ancestry was published posthumously in 1987. She had worked on it over the last two decades of her life and it was left unfinished, along with the novels *Sunflower* and *Cousin Rosamund*. The narrative reads like one of her novels and indeed, some of the material may be, if not exactly fabricated, then conflated with actual occurrences from real life, as editor Faith Evans notes in her introduction. (1987, 10) In writing about her uncle Alexander Mackenzie, West did rely on Mackenzie’s autobiography, *A Musician’s Narrative*, which was published in 1927. But West’s account here deals only with Uncle Alick’s earlier life, when he would have had the most impact on the Mackenzie family as a whole, particularly on West’s mother Isabella.

Upon reading *Family Memories*, one is struck throughout by the continual references to music: particular compositions, composers, performers and musical events in general. This is because the entire family, on West’s mother’s side at least, was musical. West’s grandfather, also named Alexander Mackenzie (1819-1857), was a violinist, writer of popular songs and an editor. He wrote an operetta in 1852, and was Leader of the Theatre Royal Orchestra in 1845. He died at thirty-seven, leaving West’s grandmother Janet with six children to raise. Of the four Mackenzie siblings who pursued musical careers, the two most distinguished were West’s uncle, the younger Alexander Mackenzie, and Isabella, her mother. While both Alick and Isabella showed extraordinary musical gifts, the different courses that the brother and sister followed were influenced by the differing opportunities given to them based on gender and the conventional expectations of the society in which they lived.

**Alexander Mackenzie (1847-1935)**

Rebecca West’s uncle, Alexander Mackenzie the younger, later Sir Alexander (he was knighted in 1895), showed promise at an early age as a musician and was sent to Schwarzburg-Sondershausen in Germany to study music when he was just ten. There he studied violin and theory and played second violin in the Sondershausen orchestra, performing some of the most advanced music of the day—Liszt, Berlioz and Wagner. Upon returning to Edinburgh, he taught and performed. According to West, he “set chamber music on its feet again” in Edinburgh, which “had declined as a musical centre”. (1987, 33)

While West evidently admires her uncle for his professional achievements (and much of her information may have come from his autobiography), she clearly despises him as a person,
describing him as “repulsive in his coldness”. (246) She resents the fact that he had opportunities not available to Isabella. She says, “My mother was a brilliant pianist, but she was denied by her sex the understanding of the whole field of music that her brothers had, for the reason that she could not play in an orchestra, or undergo any of the rough-and-tumble training that Alick had got for the asking between the ages of ten and eighteen”. (31) West was aware that music history contains examples of talented sisters who do not have the same opportunities as their brothers, and reportedly spoke elsewhere of the case of Fanny Mendelssohn, who did not receive the recognition she deserved. (Glendinning 1987, 240) She also feels that Alick abandoned the family upon his marriage to Mary Ironside. The accounts of his leaving the family home in Edinburgh are chilling (West 1987, 48) and even more saddening is the resulting breach between Alick and Isabella. The two siblings had been united by what the Scots call sibship, a word denoting a special bond between the brother and sister—a blending of sibling and kinship. This special bond between Alick and Isabella centered on a devotion to the music of Robert Schumann, manifested in different ways. While Alick was devoted to Schumann’s chamber music, and pioneered performances of the quartets and quintet in Edinburgh, Isabella delighted in the study and performance of Kinderszenen and Carnaval. This special sibship came to an end when Alick moved out of the family home in 1874. Alick and Isabella both continued to teach at the same Ladies’ College but no longer spoke to each other in the corridors. (West 1987, 55)

In his liner notes to the Hyperion recording of Mackenzie’s Scottish Concerto, John Purser shows more sympathy to Alick’s side to the argument. The Concerto makes use of traditional Scottish songs, one of which is The Reel of Tulloch, which recalls the saga of the MacGregors, one of whom eloped with Iseabail Dhubh Thulach, incurring familial displeasure. The couple escaped the family’s brutal reaction. Purser speculates that, Perhaps there was a personal meaning in this for Mackenzie, for his own marriage was deeply resented by his family (as bitterly and snobbishly recounted by his niece, Rebecca West, in her Family Memories). Mackenzie won, but he was free of base sentiments. (Purser 1997, 6)

Alexander Mackenzie went on to have a highly successful career. While he didn’t continue his career as a violinist, his early training in that instrument is evident in much of his writing, particularly the Violin Concerto in C-sharp Minor, Op. 32 (1885), which is frankly reminiscent of Mendelssohn and Bruch, and in Pibroch, Suite for Violin and Orchestra, Op. 42 (1889). West does not mention any of his compositions by name, though she
acknowledges that he was “a gifted violinist and a more gifted composer than is generally allowed”. (1987, 19) This is a curious comment, as it would seem that Mackenzie’s compositions enjoyed a fair bit of success during his lifetime. The Violin Concerto was premiered by Sarasate (after Joachim had turned it down) and the Piano Concerto, the Scottish Concerto in G major, Op. 55 (1897), was premiered by Paderewski and then taken up by Busoni, who performed and promoted the work.

**Isabella Mackenzie (1854-1921)**

Rebecca West’s mother, Isabella Mackenzie, may well have had a musical talent equal to her brother’s. She was by all accounts a gifted pianist and performed frequently in her native Edinburgh. West says this about her mother, “she was a remarkable pianist. I have never heard anybody play Schumann better than she did, particularly *Carnaval*”. (1987, 24) Both Isabella and her cousin Jessie Watson Campbell were sent to Germany to study, Jessie to Hamburg and Isabella to Düsseldorf. In the absence of any written account similar to Alexander’s autobiography, we can only speculate as to what this study abroad might have entailed.

But we do know that Isabella’s time abroad was shorter and more curtailed than was Alick’s. As her family had fallen upon hard times, Isabella upon her return home was reduced to serving in the role of “musical governess” for the Heinemanns, a German banker and his American wife. (109)

In the end, Isabella’s travels took her much further afield than Alick’s did. When it was decided that Isabella should go to Australia in search of her brother Johnnie, she sailed to Melbourne. She was reunited with Johnnie, a violinist who had set up a traveling company to entertain the miners. Isabella stayed at a hotel in St. Kilda, where she played Schumann, and it was here that she continued her friendship with Charles Fairfield, whom she had met on the ship going over. They were married there and then returned to London.

**Conclusion**

Rebecca West said,

> Music is part of human life and partakes of the human tragedy. 
> There is much more music in the world than is allowed to change into heard sounds and prove its point. Music partakes also of the human mystery”. (1987, 219)

Earlier studies (see Erickson and Blodgett 2009 and Glendinning 1987) have affirmed not just the importance of music in Rebecca West’s fiction, but also the significance of particular composers and their compositions, most notably Schumann’s *Carnaval* with its implications...
of duality in the development of character in the Aubrey trilogy. West’s descriptions of
music, at least in those writings which she herself edited for publication, are unfailingly
accurate in their detail, and always integral to the story and characterization.
The careers of Isabella and Alexander Mackenzie influenced Rebecca West’s attitude to life
for better or for worse, and by extension gave her writing a depth that still invites exploration.

Acknowledgements
I would like to acknowledge with gratitude the contribution of my friend and colleague
Professor Emerita Harriet Blodgett, with whom I began an interdisciplinary study of Rebecca
West and Music. Her insights as a scholar of British women’s literature were invaluable in
our initial joint undertaking, which has inspired me to continue this study. I also owe a debt
of gratitude to Professor Emeritus Robert Bloch, who provided me with materials on
Alexander Mackenzie and who has been helpful in all ways as I worked on this project. I
would also like to thank Lawrence Snyder of Davis for alerting me to further Mackenzie
sources and for his interest in my work. Finally, I thank Professor Julia Bloch of Bard
College for providing me with sources pertaining to the importance of Rebecca West in
contemporary modernist studies.

References
http://www.time.com/time/subscriber/article/0,33009,934181,00.html 8 of 9.
Erickson, Susan, and Harriet Blodgett. 2009. “Rebecca West’s resonant music in the Aubrey
Trilogy.” *Interdisciplinary Humanities* 26 (2): 89-100.
Hefferman, Laura. 2007. “Bad Form: Modernist criticism and the cultural life of the aesthetic,


**Sound Recordings**


Chapter 27. A State of Bliss: Peter Carey’s novel as re-visioned through Ray Lawrence’s film and Brett Dean’s opera. Michael Halliwell.

The operatic adaptation of fiction usually follows the trajectory from novel into libretto into opera. Occasionally, a novel might be transformed into a spoken drama, which later undergoes musical adaptation. What has become more common recently is the process whereby a celebrated novel or play undergoes an equally significant film adaptation which then strongly influences the subsequent operatic version. This paper investigates this process in regard to the operatic adaptation by Brett Dean and Amanda Holden of Peter Carey’s seminal novel, Bliss (1981), which had been made into a highly successful film by Ray Lawrence (1985). What emerges is a striking operatic re-visioning of Carey’s novel and Lawrence’s film through the creative use of implicit thematic material in the novel and film, particularly the referencing in the opera of Dante’s Divine Comedy.

Joshua Smith (1998), commenting on the film version of Bliss, maintains that history has shown that films which attempt to emulate works of literature in such a fashion as to remain totally faithful to the source, often fail both critically and commercially. The sheer and, to a certain extent, uncontrollable limitations of the cinematic medium mean that attempts made at upholding a large degree of fidelity will only succeed if cinema’s virtues are employed. Ray Lawrence’s Bliss (1985) provides a textbook example of how transposition adaptations can fail, while a less literal, more visual interpretation of the work can succeed. The initial lack of success of the film led to re-cutting and re-mixing which resulted in a greater focus on the central character and a film which respects the informing characteristics of the genre. It went on to win three Australian Film Institute Awards for Best Picture, Best Direction and Best Adapted Screenplay. Significantly, the screenplay was co-written by Lawrence and Carey himself.

Carey’s novel is narrated by a seemingly conventional omniscient, third-person narrator, but this literary device is finally undercut when it emerges that the story has been told by “us, the children of Honey Barbara and Harry Joy”. (Carey 1991, 296) The omniscient narrative mode achieves a sense of complicity between author and reader difficult to achieve to the same extent in intermedial transposition. Don Anderson (1986, 15) observes that the reader “is blatantly placed in a position of superiority with respect to Harry. This gives the reader a
certain power.” Only at the end of the film do we discover that the voice-over narration has been Harry Joy himself.

Just as in film adaptation, an opera adaptor must make choices informed by generic imperatives at the outset of the process. The libretto is the first major stage in this process where important interpretive decisions are taken. A sprawling, convoluted novel such as Bliss requires even more substantial condensation and distillation than the screenplay (the screenplay and libretto are both quasi ‘literary’ forms which have a lot in common), and while librettist Amanda Holden has retained much of the narrative trajectory of the novel, she has re-visioned several of the novel’s thematic concerns. Where the scenic structure of the novel lent itself to the large number of scenes of the film, the operatic adaptation has a particularly tightly wrought palindromic structure:

ACT ONE
Scene 1 Death and Transfiguration
Scene 2 Limbo
Scene 3 The Joys of Home
Scene 4 Man about Town
Scene 5 Family Secrets

ACT TWO
The Heart-throb Hotel

ACT THREE
Scene 1 Bedlam
Scene 2 Dissolution
Scene 3 Woman about Town
Scene 4 Heartbreak House
Scene 5 In Elysium

While there are surreal elements in the operatic adaptation, this medium does perhaps not allow the same range of vivid and kaleidoscopic visual effects that Lawrence achieves in his film despite the operatic genre itself being inherently anti-naturalistic. However, one can argue that the operatic form can achieve an intensity and audience empathy for the characters that the film perhaps does not attempt. Harry might be seen in the novel as a ‘satiric device’ rather than a figure for whom we feel great empathy. (Anderson 1986, 11) The film, by means of the visual immediacy of the medium, appears to bring us closer to the characters than in the novel, but this apparent empathy is often deliberately undercut by its sustained surreal vision.
While, in broad terms, film as a genre is generally objective in the sense that we observe a digital representation of characters and events, the novel is essentially subjective in that we ‘construct’ characters and events in our minds from marks on a page; opera at its best can be a combination of both these perspectives. We are confronted in the theatre by the physical and, particularly, vocal embodiment of the novelistic characters who are made manifest before our eyes, and ears. Music in opera can suggest something of the complex inner life of novelistic characters, but meaning in music is a notoriously elusive element and interiority and depth can only be suggested, often tangentially and imprecisely. In addition, the complexity and variety of the narrative mode of a novel such as Bliss, which comprises a combination of modernist, postmodernist, metafictional and postcolonial elements, cannot really be effectively represented in all its narrative richness on the opera stage. With these considerations in mind, there need to be compelling reasons why composer and librettist should turn to a particular literary source; the fundamental issue is whether they have something new to say about the work regardless of any notions of fidelity to the source. One could argue that it is the larger mythical elements implicit in the novel which have attracted the operatic adaptors and which they have expanded in the operatic form.

One of the early critical reactions to the novel observed that it was “a collection of thematically very disparate short stories, yoked together by an inadequate narrative structure”. (Tranter 1981, 27) However, this seeming lack of cohesion translates effectively in the opera into a series of almost ‘traditional’ operatic set pieces and lends itself to the structure of the opera. In the film adaptation many of the novel’s scenes are transferred more or less directly. The novel has a unifying narrative frame which we only fully comprehend at the end, and Carey’s strategy of employing an intrusive and knowing omniscient narrative voice finds a limited filmic equivalent in the voice-over narrations which effect a similar form of narrative intimacy and complicity with the audience. There are a mixture of the stories that Harry tells as well as commentary on the events of the narrative itself, but it is only revealed very late in the film that the narrations are, in fact, those of Harry, with the final closure of the story presented through the voice and presence of the daughter of Harry and Honey Barbara.

Naturally, it difficult to achieve this narrative variety with equal specificity in opera; however, if one accepts the analogy of the orchestra providing a similar, if less precise, commentating voice, then the impression of a surprisingly sophisticated and, indeed, omniscient narrative mode can be achieved. The control and power of the narrator in the novel, in which all the characters emerge out of this all-encompassing narrative voice, can be
seen to have a loose equivalent in the control exerted by the orchestra. The operatic characters are given their existence through the narrating voice of the orchestra – these characters only exist as part of the orchestral web – they are given embodiment and, indeed, life, through the music that surrounds them, much as novelistic characters exist only in words on a page. If we accept this analogy then the orchestra has a similar power compared with that of an omniscient narrator in a novel. This is, of course, a much more complex and holistic process than the use of music in film however effective that may be in creating mood and atmosphere. We gain insight into operatic characters’ inner lives as much through their own utterances and actions as represented on stage as through the orchestral commentary surrounding them. Opera could therefore be seen more as musical novel than musical drama, and perhaps one could argue that on one level all opera occurs in the third person, omniscient mode as a result of the narrative strategies of the genre!

While Ray Lawrence’s film turns the novel into a surreal nightmare, Brett Dean’s opera recasts it as a mythical quest narrative interrogating aspects of national identity. Amanda Holden has constructed the trajectory of the narrative in an analogous way to Dante’s protagonist in the *Divine Comedy*, moving through the nine different stages of the journey through Hell (where the unrepentant sinners are), and then through Purgatory (where those who have recognized their sins are situated, and who are attempting to become free from their sins), and on to Heaven. The sustained referencing of Dante’s *Divine Comedy* has a two-fold purpose with Dante’s poem providing a structural analogue while at the same time, in true operatic fashion, lending the characters mythical status. Holden’s narrative is analogous to Dante’s protagonist moving through the different stages of the journey – the titles of several individual scenes in the opera makes this plain. Dante’s poem acts as a framing device for the opera, giving it both a structure and trajectory. Just as in Dante, Harry’s journey is one of enlightenment and fulfillment achieved through the love of a woman, with the characters of Harry and Honey achieving a mythical status at the end of the journey. Carey has indicated that the celebratory tone of the ending of the novel was deliberate, but, perhaps unsurprisingly, the seemingly happy ending of the novel was seen as something of a failure of imagination by some critics but is essential to its meaning. In this, the opera follows the novel very closely in symbolic intention, but through the power of music there is a further sense of transcendence that distinguishes it from the novel and the film and is a thematic expansion of its source. Importantly, there is no framing of the narrative by the children of Harry and Honey Barbara which lends the novel and film closure of a sort, but the ending of the opera has more of a sense of open-endedness and expansion onto an epic level. The
opera’s final moments are set in a mythical Elysium, described as “a heavenly verdant landscape” where “Harry and Honey are living together in her forest home.” (Libretto 38) This final scene has Harry alone onstage, but we are aware of the offstage voice of Honey echoing musical phrases sung by Harry, and she finally joins him onstage as he plants trees for the ecstatic conclusion to their duet. This final section is described as a Sonnet and the text is structured in the form of a 14-line sonnet.

At evening mortal memory takes its course
and settles in time’s capsule, neatly locked;
and yet the stings of sorrow and remorse remain, reminders of a past that shocked.

With my existence humbled by the trees,
contented here, I toil for my queen
to nurture perfumed blossoms for her bees
until the day I vanish from the scene.

And when at last I take that final breath
and disappear eternally above,
it will be just a passing breeze, this death
that carries me away from my true love

If you would seek salvation, remember this:
a life in Hell can still aspire to BLISS. (Libretto 48)

Like all the text in Holden’s outstanding libretto, it is original, but one can see the imaginative reworking of the source in the novel:

He did not wish to return to his body and instead he spread himself thinner, and thinner, as thin as a gas, and when he had made himself thin enough he sighed, and the trees, those tough-barked giants exchanging one gas for another, pumping water, making food, were not too busy to take this sigh back in through their leaves (it took only an instant) and they made no great fuss, no echoing sigh, no whispering of branches, simply took the sigh into themselves so that, in time, it became part of their tough old heart
wood and there are those in Bog Onion who insist you can see it there, on the thirty-fifth ring or thereabouts of the trees he planted: a fine blue line, they insist, that even a city person could see. (Carey 296)

The opera does not depict Harry’s death, but this moment is reminiscent of its description in the novel and its representation in the film, suggesting that Harry will remain present in the land in the breath that will be just a “passing breeze” even after his final death. While there is something of an epic quality to the ending of the novel this is further expanded in the opera through musical means.

“Elysium” suggests that both Harry and Honey are in a metaphoric sense already dead to the society that surrounds them having renounced the outside world’s materialism and rampant consumerism, and having successfully completed their journey of purification. While the distancing effect of the narrative frame of both novel and film, which results in a sense of closure, is not attempted in the opera, the redemptive, elegiac mood established in this final operatic scene achieves an analogous perspective. This ending is not unproblematic, but in operatic terms it is left to the music to establish a particular interpretation. The gentle, essentially ethereal music accompanying Harry calmly planting trees is an under-stated yet transcendent ending eschewing any grand final rhetorical statement.

Neither of these adaptations of Bliss attempts a straightforward realism, but both offer a vivid and distinctive representation of Australian society in the latter half of the twentieth century. In Harry Joy, Carey has created a character in accordance with what Graeme Turner (1986, 49) describes as one of “the basic myths of existence in Australian narrative - ones which allow the central individual a kind of spiritual revelation as a compensation for isolation and personal failure.”

Conclusion

Music has the capacity to lend an epic quality to situation and character while suggesting empathy for the protagonists. Indeed, in opera the human becomes the universal through music, and the universal is made human. What the audience experiences through the complex development of the music of the opera Bliss is the story of Harry assuming mythical status; the ending of the opera does not undercut the apparent intentions of Carey, but further opens up the possibilities for a multi-valent interpretation. This surely is the raison d’être for any successful musical adaptation of a literary source? The final moments of Dean’s opera convey a sense of history opening up with Harry becoming the subject of stories just as he has been a storyteller during his life. Harry, an explorer in his own time and fashion, is a
contemporary equivalent of the earlier explorers central to Australia’s mythology, and he becomes part of the epic mosaic of the construction of national identity.

 References

Music is a symbolic language. The notation of music symbolizes the types of sounds a composer intends performers to make with their voices or their instruments. While composers are mainly concerned with creating patterns of sound, they also spend much time grappling with how best to represent that sound in notated form. I would suggest that composers, and probably musicologists as well, often listen to music in two distinctly different ways: first, as sound that creates emotions and other responses, and second, as a music score scrolling along in their mind’s eye. Therefore, it is not surprising that the symbolic language of music notation is used to create other layers of symbolism. We should not be surprised, for example, that Bach has a key signature of one sharp in the opening of *St Matthew Passion*, and that the German word for sharp is the same as for cross, *kreuz*. Such symbolic synergies between music notation and the meaning of the composition are interesting and add another layer to the work, a layer which is not audible but is none the less real for those who wish to know the work better. Likewise, the D-S-C-H motif that runs through some of Shostakovich’s later works is used to symbolize the composer himself. How we interpret each particular occurrence of this motif depends on the context of the music. Nonetheless, the association with the person of the composer is real, and provides another layer of meaning. Symbolism has played an important role in my work since the early 1990s. I have aimed to create a coherent symbolic language in my music, so I could convey specific meanings as well as emotions. In this paper I will present examples of symbolism in my three symphonies where it plays an important role both in terms of the programmatic elements and the psychological journey. Sometimes symbols are representational; that is, the musical idea sounds similar to what it is aiming to represent. Most symbols are not audible, however, and carefully planned to have a purely musical function as well. The creation of satisfying musical structures is also important in these symphonies, but technical aspects of the music are always subservient to the main purpose: to transform the listener emotionally, and to convey deeper messages.

Symphony No.1 “Boum” (1993)\(^1\) was inspired by E.M. Forster’s novel *A Passage to India*, which is concerned with many major issues, including life and death, and the Hindu concept.

---

\(^1\) Symphony No.1 was premiered by The Southern Sinfonia in 1994, and recorded on CD by The Christchurch Symphony Orchestra, Kiwi-Pacific Records, CD SLD-115.
of reincarnation. It also suggests that the Western European view of man’s relationship to God is ridiculously self-important, and that we are in fact very small in the Universe. Ideas such as reincarnation, and the extinction of the self or ego, were what I wanted to express in my symphony. Reincarnation or *samsara*, can be closely aligned to a principle of symphonic form: that of organic growth and the recycling of materials. My musical ideas are closely interconnected, to reflect the idea of reincarnation. For example, a theme recurs in all four movements, and it has a certain Asian quality, brought about through reference to the Indonesian *pelog* scale:

**Figure 1. Occurrences of the cyclic theme in Symphony No.1 ‘Boum’**

---

2 The Sanskrit word *samsara* literally means “continuous flow” but is used in Hinduism (and other religions) to describe the cycle of birth, life, death, and reincarnation.

3 The *pelog* scale comprises 7 pitches (which can vary between ensembles), and is one of two main scales used in Indonesian gamelan music. The pitches outlined in figure 1 are approximations only.
The presenting of the same theme in different movements of a symphony was commonplace in the 19th century. However, thematic connections are taken further than the surface level. Elements of the main cyclic theme saturate many textures of the symphony’s four movements, at an intervallic level. One of the fundamental, recurring elements is the interval of a rising second, which becomes a type of Grundgestalt (basic shape) in the symphony:

**Figure 2. Symphony No.1 “Boum”, opening chord progression**

G minor tonality is established at the start but is immediately blurred by a move to a C chord with an added 4th, F. This symbolizes the blurring of certainty that is represented by the tonic chord. At the end of the symphony this progression returns, as a sign that the cycle of life will repeat. G is the overall tonic but the symphony ends on the blurred C chord, leaving the tonality ambiguous and open-ended.

This idea of blurring brings us to the central sound image of the symphony: a stroke on the tam tam, from which the symphony gets its subtitle ‘boum’. This sound punctuates the symphony at strategically planned points, acting as both as a unifying device and a symbol. To explain the symbolism I must refer to a crucial scene from *A Passage to India*, where the central characters make an excursion to the Marabar caves, in India. The caves appear to be nothing special, but have an extraordinary echo, which sounds like an ominous rumble. In the novel the rumbling echo comes to represent the undermining of human values. To quote: “If one had spoken vileness in that place, or quoted lofty poetry, the comment would have been the same – ‘ou-boum’.” (Forster, 1924, 146) One of the characters, Mrs Moore, panics and has to fight her way out of the cave through the crowd to recover. When she sits down to recover she finds her grip on life loosened, and she suffers a terrible depressive episode where her self-belief and belief in God is crushed by the ‘boum’. The message is this: we are a speck in the universe, and coming to terms with our smallness can be terrifying. The “boum” on the tam tam seemed the best way to symbolize this blurring of certainty, and the extinction of the self. Its resemblance to a rumbling echo makes it a representational symbol, or a symbol that can be audibly recognized, as opposed to abstract symbols.

---

4 See, for example, Cesar Franck’s Symphony or Tchaikovsky’s Symphony No.5, both composed in 1888.
If the boum on the tam tam symbolizes the extinction of life, then the brittle rhythms on the log drum in the second movement symbolize the opposite: the power of the life-force. The log drum is associated with the sound world of the Pacific, and its use in this highly rhythmic movement is intended to suggest the uninhibited pleasure of dancing. The sound of the log drum decays quickly, the opposite of the long reverberation of the tam tam. Moreover, themes and harmonies are developed over a backdrop of regular pulse, which is continuous throughout the movement. All the themes grow from the opening rhythmic motifs, labeled x and y below. This reinforces the idea of constant recycling and connections, which was referred to in the first movement also:

**Figure 3. Rhythmic motifs and developments in Symphony No.1, movement 2.**

Symphony No.2 was composed in 2000 and adopts a millennium theme\(^5\). It draws on the poem by W.B. Yeats entitled *The Second Coming* for initial inspiration. (Yeats, 99) This famous poem was written in the 1930s at a time of great uncertainty in the Europe and Asia. The second coming is, of course, a reference to the return of the Messiah, following Christ’s initial appearance 2000 years earlier. Yeats suggests in his poem that the second coming may not be as wonderful as the first, and that messianic leaders of today are frightening – ‘rough beasts’ as he describes them. “Mere anarchy is loosed on the world”, and indeed it must have seemed like that at that time. The title of my Symphony is *The Widening Gyre*, which is taken from an image in the poem, the gyre being a wheel or circle. In the context of the poem, the gyre refers to the circle of history. This idea informs the Symphony, which is in three movements, the first movement representing the past, the second representing the present,\(^5\)

\(^5\) Symphony No.2 (2000) was premiered by The Auckland Philharmonia at the International Festival of the Arts, Wellington, 2000, and recorded on CD by The Christchurch Symphony Orchestra, Kiwi-Pacific Records, CD SLD-115.
and the third the future. The movements are connected by a recurring gyre motif, rather like the ‘boum’ in the 1st Symphony. This time, however, the gyre motif is created by a special sound effect on the bass drum: a rubber ball is rubbed against a bass drum, creating an eerie, whining sound. It is combined with a roll on the timpani, which constantly slides in pitch. However, whereas the boum motif occurred frequently in Symphony No.1, the ‘gyre’ motif occurs only four times in Symphony No.2, each time symbolizing an important turning point in history.

The opening of the Symphony is shown in Figure 4, the gyre motif being joined by a pedal note E (the tonic) and a theme on clarinets. The interval of a minor 3rd is an important element of the theme, both musically and symbolically. I associate this interval with cradlesongs, and here it is used to symbolize the birth of Christ, the starting point of the millennium. As the melody grows, it attempts to climb upwards but falls back in twisting motions, a pattern that is repeated throughout the opening section.

**Figure 4. Symphony No.2, opening theme**

![Symphony No.2 - opening theme](image)

The music builds to a noisy climax with a loud stroke on an anvil symbolizing the crucifixion of Christ. As with the boum motif, a special percussive sound is used as a representational symbol, the anvil sound being similar to that of nails being hammered. Therefore, the introduction of this symphony represents the millennium past, beginning with Christ’s birth and death. This sets the blueprint for the rest of the symphony, which is concerned with a history that is unfortunately littered with violence and upheavals.

The main theme is extensively developed and allowed to saturate the rest of the symphony. Its character is transformed in many ways, and used to represent different aspects of history. **Figure 5** demonstrates two examples of this process. In the first extract, the cradle theme is turned into a war cry, in a later section in the first movement that depicts the battle of Kosovo of 1389. The second extract is from the coda of the third movement, where the theme is
transformed into a defiant chorale, symbolizing hopes for the future, but tempered with realism:

**Figure 5. Symphony No.2 – two versions of the main theme from movement 1**

In contrast to its predecessors, Symphony No.3 (2010)\(^6\) is more personal and psychological in character, rather than the historical or literary. Nonetheless, it develops an extensive symbolic language, based on recurring themes, motifs and other more abstract devices. The work is in two movements, an unusual number for a symphony. The number two suggests duality, and this is a theme I have explored in several works since 2000. In Symphony No.3 two sides of human personality are presented, which are symbolized by two large movements: ‘Up’ and ‘Down’. These movements depict the struggle to find a balance between the positive and negative elements in one’s life. ‘Up’ is frenetic and vibrant in mood, often verging on hyperactive in character. Musical themes and motifs emphasize upward thrusting progressions, coupled with bright orchestral colours.

**Figure 6. Symphony No.3, movement 1, upward thrusting themes**

---

\(^6\) Symphony No.3 was premiered and recorded for Radio NZ Concert by the Southern Sinfonia at the Otago festival of Arts in October 2010. It was recorded for CD the NZ Symphony Orchestra under Tecwyn Evans, for release by Atoll Records in 2012.
By contrast, “Down” is melancholic, slow and mournful in mood. There are also flashes of anger and frustration in the music, which eventually reaches an emotional catharsis near the end of the work. A subdued coda follows, symbolizing the attainment of a musical and psychological balance.

The theme of duality is also suggested by the subtitle of the symphony, Janus, who was a 2-faced god in Roman mythology, with the faces pointing in opposite directions. Janus is used to symbolize change from one condition to another, or from one mood to another. This is exemplified in dramatic fashion at the climax of the first movement, where a very loud climax is suddenly replaced by quiet, static chords on the strings, along with distant fragments of themes on solo instruments. Here the symbolism is intended to be representational; hyperactivity is replaced by numbed depression.

**Figure 7. climax from Symphony No.3, movement 1**

The second movement contains a reference to Durer’s famous woodcut, *Melencolia I*.\(^7\) Thematic material is based on a magic square that appears in Durer’s woodcut, with numbers being transformed into notes through a special compositional process, a device I have used in several works since 2001. This is an example of a compositional device that also assumes symbolic meaning; in this case, the melancholic character of Durer’s woodcut pervades the character of the second movement of this symphony. The main theme of the second movement is derived from the magic square, and displays a melancholic character through the use of dark-sounding modes and melodic lines that predominantly descend. This theme also connects with the cluster chord beneath that outlines the same notes as the melody, transposed: A-E-D-C-B flat. Three of these notes, A, B flat and E, are a transposition of the

---

\(^7\) *Melencolia I* (Melancholy) by Albrecht Durer is an engraving dating from 1514.
fundamental motif of the symphony, which is D - E flat - A. This motif outlines the letters D-S-A (using German letter names), and these letters have an important personal symbolism for the composer.

**Figure 8. Symphony No.3, movement 2, theme 1**

Cluster chords are generally associated with melancholy in my music, as can be seen in the third movement of Symphony No.1. In Symphony No.3 clusters and other pitch collections often appear in conglomerates of two, separated by the interval of a tone (plus octave displacements). In figure 8 above, the C modal cluster is also sounding a 9th above. This type of bi-tonality is used to symbolize duality in the music. The same bi-modality appears in the second main theme of the 1st movement, where the clusters are now opened out into 3-note chords (C-D flat-G and D-E flat-A). Bi-tonality is also present in Symphony No.1 ‘Boum’ (see figure 1) where it is used to symbolize the duality of good and evil.

**Conclusion**

This paper has given a brief insight into some of the symbolism in these three symphonies. Symbolism plays a more extensive role in the 3rd symphony than the previous two, and this is indicative of a general trend in my work over the last 10 years. Some symbolism is representational; that is, the musical gesture is suggestive of what is being represented. It is more common, however, for the symbolism to be working at a more abstract level, as with the use of themes based on magic squares. While any piece of music should be able to be understood and enjoyed simply for the sounds themselves, it is also possible to appreciate extra layers of meaning in a composition. These layers can add richness and complexity to music, and offers more for listeners on repeated hearings.

**References**

